



Agenda Item #4

Application 2026-58-CA

DETAILS

Location:

960 Dauphin Street

Summary of Request:

Fence

Applicant (as applicable):

Robert Brown

Property Owner:

Same

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The existing fences proposed for removal are not original to the property and have been in place for less than fifty years.
- The proposed new fence uses approvable materials in a configuration that is comparable to other fences at adjacent contributing properties.
- The fence would exceed the 48-inch maximum height allowed for front-yard fences. It should be noted that the *Guidelines* are inconsistent regarding the appropriate height of a metal front-yard fence and unclear on whether a brick coping should count toward the overall height of an aluminum front-yard fence.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	3
Staff Analysis	4
Attachments	5

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The two-story, wood-frame, side-hall house with rear service wing was constructed c. 1860. The 1878 Hopkins map shows the original side-hall plan with offset rear service wing and one outbuilding located at the northwest corner of the property. The 1904 Sanborn map shows the historic footprint of the house with a porch wrapping the east and north elevations of the service wing. Four outbuildings were present. Representations on the 1925 and 1956 Sanborn maps are identical. The historic porches along the east and north elevations were removed and a rear addition constructed sometime after 1956. The property is protected by a façade easement held by the Mobile Historic Development Commission, who approved the changes proposed in this application on May 6, 2024.

According to Historic Development Department files, this property has appeared five times previously before the Architectural Review Board (ARB).

In 2003, the ARB approved the addition of a screened porch at the northwest corner of the house, the enclosure with glass of the existing two-story gallery on the east elevation of the rear service wing, installation of a 6' privacy fence, and the construction of a porte-cochere. It appears the screened porch and porte-cochere were never constructed. In November 2020 and April 2021, the ARB approved two similar applications to make significant alterations, including construction of a free-standing garage, construction of a two-story porch on the 20th-century rear addition, fenestration changes, and construction of a driveway gate. These projects were stalled during the selective demolition phase and never completed.

In May 2024, the Board approved the construction of a two-story porch and a deck on the east side elevation of a 19th-century addition, minor changes to the fenestration pattern, and wholesale replacement of existing windows. In November 2024, the Board agreed to amend the previous approval to allow the applicant to alter window sizes to allow installation of stock instead of custom windows. At the same time, the Board approved replacing the wood siding on sides and rear with fiber cement siding and some minor alterations to the design of the previously approved two-story side porch. In May 2026, the Board heard an after-the-fact application to remove and replace the original Italianate door and surround with modern French doors. The Board required that the applicant return with an alternative scope of work. In June 2026, the Board approved an amended application to replicate the original door and restore the original sidelights and transom.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Remove existing iron fence along south (street-facing) property line.
2. Remove existing wire fences along east and west property lines.
3. Install new metal fencing with brick coping and brick piers along south, west, and east property lines.
 - a. Materials: Aluminum fencing set on brick coping with brick piers
 - b. Total Fence Height: 4'-6" to 5'-0"
 - i. Height of brick coping: 1'-6"
 - ii. Height of metal fencing: 3'-0"
 - iii. Height of brick piers: 5'-0"
 - c. Bricks piers will be spaced at regular intervals between 8 and 10 feet apart.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

- 10.2 Design a fence to be compatible with the architectural style of the house and existing fences in the neighborhood.
 - Install a painted wood picket fence.
 - Install a simple wood or wire fence. Heights of wooden picket fences are ordinarily restricted to 36". Consideration for up to 48," depending on the location of the fence, shall be given. A variance might be required. Staff can advise and assist applicants with regard to a variance. If combined with a wall, the total vertical dimension of the wall and fence collectively should not exceed 36," or in some cases 48".
 - Install a simple wood-and-wire fence, provided that it is appropriate to the style of the house and does not exceed 48" in height as measured from grade. If combined with a wall, the total vertical dimension of the wall and fence collectively should not exceed 48".
 - Install a cast-iron or other metal fence not exceeding 36" in height if located in the front yard. 48" shall be considered under certain circumstances. Coping walls located below cast-iron fencing may be appropriate in certain locations and do not count toward the total height.
 - For surface parking areas associated with commercial uses, size a perimeter parking area fence to not exceed 48" in height.
 - Install a cast-iron or other metal fence not exceeding 48" in height if located in the front yard.
 - Install a fence that uses alternative materials that have a very similar look and feel to wood, proven durability, matte finish and an accurate scale and proportion of components.
 - Face the finished side of a fence toward the public right-of-way. Based on the chosen fence material, use proportions, heights, elements and levels of opacity similar to those of similar material and style seen in the historic district.
 - REAR AND NON-CORNER SIDE FENCES (LOCATED BEHIND THE FRONT BUILDING PLANE)
 - ♣ Design a fence located behind the front building plane to not exceed 72" in height. If the subject property abuts a multi-family residential or commercial property, a fence up to 96" will be considered.
 - ♣ An alternative fence material with proven durability, matte finish and an accurate scale and proportion of components is acceptable. A simple wood-and-wire fence is acceptable provided it is appropriate to the style of the house.
- ACCEPTABLE FENCE MATERIALS
 - Materials that have a similar character, durability and finish to those of fences of historic properties in the district are acceptable. These often include:
 - ♣ Wood picket
 - ♣ Wood slat
 - ♣ Wood lattice
 - ♣ Iron or steel
 - ♣ Historically appropriate wire fences
 - ♣ Aluminum that appears similar to iron
- UNACCEPTABLE FENCE MATERIALS
 - Materials that do not have a similar character, durability and finish to those of fences of historic properties in the district are unacceptable. These often include:
 - ♣ Chain link
 - ♣ Stockade
 - ♣ Post and rail
 - ♣ Masonite
 - ♣ PVC
 - ♣ Plywood or asbestos paneling
 - ♣ Razor wire
 - ♣ Barbed wire

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing structure to the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review proposes removing an existing fencing and constructing with a new brick and metal fence that exceeds the max 48-inch height that the *Guidelines* allows for front-yard fences. The existing fence is not historic, and the new fencing would be in keeping with similar fences along Dauphin Street. The existing *Design Guidelines* are inconsistent on which height (36" or 48") is appropriate for front-yard fences and on whether a brick coping wall counts toward the overall height of a fence.

The *Design Guidelines* state that "historically significant" cast iron fences should be maintained (10.1). The *Guidelines* state that new fences should be "compatible with the architectural style of the house and existing fences in the neighborhood" (10.2). The *Guidelines* are unclear and self-contradictory when it comes to the allowable height of new front-yard fences. Simple "wood or wire" fences are "ordinarily restricted to 36 inches" but a height of 48 inches may be allowed "depending on the location of the fence." However, a simple "wood-and-wire fence," is allowed a max height up to 48 inches. The *Guidelines* state on page 118 that "a cast-iron or other metal fence" should not exceed 36 inches but add that "48 inches shall be considered under certain circumstances." However, on the following page, the *Guidelines* state outright that a cast-iron or other metal fence may be 48 inches in height.

Likewise, the *Guidelines* are unclear as to whether a brick coping wall does or does not count toward the overall height of a fence. For wood, wire, and wood-and-wire fences, the *Guidelines* state that the coping should be calculated in the overall height of the fence. For cast-iron fencing, the *Guidelines* state that the coping should not be calculated in the overall height. The *Guidelines* do not state whether the coping should be calculated as part of the overall height of an aluminum fence (10.2).

The existing iron fence at 960 Dauphin Street does not appear in survey photographs taken in the 1980s. The fence is therefore not original to the structure and has been in place less than 50 years. Removal of the existing fence will therefore not result in the loss of historic architectural material. The proposed replacement fence pulls inspiration from an existing brick-and-metal fence located across the street at 1001 Dauphin Street. The proposed fence is also in keeping with the style and period of the subject property.

At between 54 and 60 inches, the total height of the fence would exceed the 48-inch height allowed for front-yard fences in the *Design Guidelines*. As stated above, the *Guidelines* are inconsistent on whether the masonry coping should be counted in the overall height of the fence. Given this lack of clear guidance, the Board should consider the overall impact of the fence on the property, regardless of its height. The open nature of the proposed metal fence will not significantly alter views of the property from the public right-of-way. The increased height is unlikely to have a negative impact on the property or the surrounding district.

Site Location – 960 Dauphin Street

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
VICINITY MAP

The map shows a grid of streets including Old Shell Rd, Lebaron St, Dauphin St, and Common St. Various land uses are marked, including VAC LAND, MTG HALL, APTS, OFFICE, R, R2, GA, and GROUP QTR. The site is highlighted with a blue rectangle and labeled 'SITE'.

APPLICATION NUMBER	4	DATE	10/7/2026
APPLICANT	Robert Brown		
PROJECT	Install a fence		

N
NTS

Site Photos – 960 Dauphin Street



1. Primary (south) façade, looking north (1983)



2. South façade, looking north (April 2026)



3. Inspiration image (provided by applicant)



4. Comparable fence at 1001 Dauphin Street



City of Mobile · Historic Development
Architectural Review Board Application

08/28/26

Date of Application

Date Received

960 Dauphin Street Mobile, AL 36604

Address of Property

Does any party hold a façade easement on this property? ☐ No ☐ Yes

If yes, evidence of the easement holder's approval of the specific work outlined in this application must be provided prior to the consideration of this application by the ARB.

\$19,400.00

Fee Paid: ☐ \$ _____ Check # _____

Cost of Project (Required)

R & G Brown Properties, Inc.

Owner Name

Phone

Email

Address

Zip Code

If Owner is a legal entity such as a corporation, limited liability company, limited liability, partnership or similar, you should attach a copy of the formation documents for the Owner, showing the date of formation and that such have been filed and accepted by the Secretary of State.

Robert Brown

Owner's Representative Name

Phone

Email

Address

Zip Code

Describe the Proposed Work:

Replace and Install a 3-ft black aluminum fence with spear Point Tops, mounted above a 1'1/2-inch-high brick base wall, between 5-ft high columns. This design will run across the front of the home and down the left and right side, replacing the damaged fence to the left side (See Attached Photos) and replacing the Welded wire Garden Fence on the right side (See Attached Photos).

Does the work involve demolition of a structure? ☒ **No** ☐ **Yes** Please fill out demolition portion of application.

Does the proposed work involve signage? ☒ **No** ☐ **Yes**

Will the proposed work require the removal of any trees from the site? ☒ **No** ☐ **Yes**

If yes, attach a detailed site plan showing all trees and landscaping that will be removed and contact the Urban Forester at 208-7091 for Tree Permitting Requirements.

REQUIRED PLANS: If plans are required for the project, please attach the following:

- Attach two (2) sets of plans: one large scale set and one 11"x17" reproducible set,
- Also attach one set of photographs to the application.
- If available, electronic plans should also be submitted as a TIFF or PDF.
- A \$15 or \$5.00 application fee is due upon filing. Check should be made out to the City of Mobile.

Refer to the following checklist for requirements for specific work items to be performed. Refer to the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts (<https://www.buildmobile.org/architectural-review-board/>). Staff is available to assist with application preparation. For large projects, such as new construction or substantial additions or renovations, consultation with staff is strongly encouraged. Applications are reviewed in the order in which they are received, and if review by the Architectural Review Board is required, an application will be placed on the next available agenda. Any incomplete applications may be held until all information is submitted.

Staff Reports: The Historic Development Staff will review your application and generate a report that will be sent to you, along with the meeting agenda, via e-mail approximately one week before the meeting. The meeting agenda may be found at <https://www.buildmobile.org/architectural-review-board/>. Please examine these and be prepared to discuss any issues at the Board meetings. Questions before the meeting should be addressed to the staff of the Historic Development Department.

Alterations to Approved Plans: A new application must be submitted for changes to the approved plan. Minor alterations may be approvable by staff.

Historic Markers: The Architectural Review Board examines applications based on its adopted guidelines for historic preservation. These are based on a minimal standard set by the City of Mobile and the State. Historic markers are awarded by the Mobile Historic Development Commission based on a higher standard of review. Approval by the ARB does not guarantee approval for a historic marker. If the desire is to qualify for a marker, please inform the Board and it will attempt to guide you toward the higher goal.

Conflicts of Interest: ARB members sit as a quasi-judicial body. All its deliberations must be made in an open meeting. It is illegal for a Board member to discuss an application outside of a meeting with anyone but staff. Conflicts of interest, if any, will be disclosed at the meeting.

Public Notice: A sign will be placed in a conspicuous location on the property prior to the Review Board meeting to notify surrounding property owners of a pending application. Attendance at the meeting is strongly advised in order for the applicant to respond to any questions.

Build Mobile, PO Box 1827, Mobile, Alabama 36633

For more information: www.BuildMobile.org | historicdevelopment@cityofmobile.org | 251.208.7281

Visit our help window: Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street, Third Floor South Tower

Revised August 2023

NOTE: INCOMPLETE APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE PLACED ON THE AGENDA

Use the Following Checklist to Ensure a Complete Application
Complete each box that applies:

NEW CONSTRUCTION, ADDITIONS, OR EXTENSIVE RENOVATION/REPAIR TO EXISTING STRUCTURES

1. **One large set and one 11 x 17 (reproducible) set of scaled drawings which shall include:**
 - a. ☐ A complete site plan illustrating the proposed construction, its location, with dimensions, required setbacks, landscaping and other site amenities;
 - b. ☐ Floor plans, with dimensions, as they impact the exterior of the building, including existing plan and proposed plan;
 - c. ☐ Square footage of the original building with square footage of all additions including the proposed addition;
 - d. ☐ A drawing, with dimensions, of all affected exterior elevations;
 - e. ☐ Notes describing all exterior materials (i.e. walls, roof, trim, cornice, windows, etc.) Sample materials may be required in some cases (consult with staff);
 - f. ☐ Detailed drawings or photographs of all decorative architectural details (i.e. columns, balustrades, modillions, etc.);
 - g. ☐ Paint samples and plan keyed to location of each color. (See below)
2. **Photographs of the subject property to be worked on and surrounding buildings are required.**
 - ☐ Subject Property photographs
 - ☐ Surrounding Buildings photographs

The Historic Development Office can provide sample plans for garages, carports, and outbuildings. These are generally acceptable for most domestic sites. Note: These are for design purposes only and are not suitable as construction drawings.

FOR MINOR RENOVATION OR REPAIR TO EXISTING BUILDINGS

For work which includes changes to the exterior of existing buildings, the following is required:

1. ☐ Elevation drawings with dimensions and material details
2. ☐ Floor plans
3. ☐ Photographs of each face of the building to be renovated with details of the areas of work.

EXTERIOR PAINTING

Period color schemes are encouraged. However, other colors may be acceptable. Submit name and color samples for:

<u>Factory Black & White</u>	<u>Manufacturer</u>
<u>White</u>	<u>main body color</u>
<u>Black</u>	<u>trim or decorative features</u>
<u>Match Existing (Black)</u>	<u>porch deck</u>
<u>Black & White</u>	<u>accent areas: lattice, shutters, etc.</u>
<u>Fence and Brick</u>	<u>other areas</u>

Build Mobile, PO Box 1827, Mobile, Alabama 36633

For more information: www.BuildMobile.org | historicdevelopment@cityofmobile.org | 251.208.7281

Visit our help window: Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street, Third Floor South Tower

Revised August 2023

FENCES, DRIVES AND GATES

1. ____ A drawing or photograph of the type of fence, wall or gate with the height noted.
2. ____ A site plan, with dimensions, showing the placement of any proposed change to the property as it relates to property boundaries and all other building or site facilities.
3. ____ A description of the materials to be used.
4. ____ Paint samples, if the fence, wall or gate is to be painted.

SIGNAGE

Width of sign ____ feet ____ inches

Height of sign: ____ feet ____ inches

Single Face ____ Double Face ____

Height (from ground level to top of sign) ____ feet ____ inches

Height (from ground level to bottom of sign) ____ feet ____ inches

Total Square Footage of Signage: ____ square feet. (Both sides if double-faced)

General Description

Type of Sign: ☐ Monument ☐ Free Standing ☐ Projecting ☐ Wall ☐ Banner ☐ Sandwich Board

How will sign be mounted:

Sign Materials (sample materials may be requested by the Review

Board): _____

Describe type of lighting to be used: _____

Linear front footage of principle building: ____ feet ____ inches.

Square footage of Existing Signage: ____ feet ____ inches N/A ____

Include in Application:

____ Scaled colored renderings of the requested sign; or photographs with dimensions

____ Photographs of the building

____ A site plan or building elevation showing the location of the proposed signage For specific requirements, refer to *Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile's Historic District and Government Street*.

Build Mobile, PO Box 1827, Mobile, Alabama 36633

For more information: www.BuildMobile.org | historicdevelopment@cityofmobile.org | 251.208.7281

Visit our help window: Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street, Third Floor South Tower

Revised August 2023

DEMOLITION APPLICATION

Purchase Date: _____ Purchase Price: _____

Current appraised value of the property? _____ (N/A if Not Available)

Was the property occupied at time of purchase? _____ What was the property's condition? _____

What alternatives to demolition have you considered for this property?

Have you listed the property for sale or lease since your purchase? ☐ Yes ☐ No

If "Yes", what was your asking price? _____

How many offers did you receive? _____

List any options currently held for the purchase of the property, including the price received for such option, the conditions placed on such option and the date of expiration of such option:

Do you have construction plans ready to complete the replacement project? ☐ Yes ☐ No

If so, how much have you expended on the plans? _____

What are the dates of these expenditures? _____

In order to determine your ability to complete the replacement project, do you have the following:

Performance Bond ☐ Yes ☐ No

Letter of Credit ☐ Yes ☐ No

Trust for completion of improvements ☐ Yes ☐ No

Other evidence of financial ability ☐ Yes ☐ No

Letter of commitment from a financial institution ☐ Yes ☐ No

"In no event shall the Board entertain any application for the demolition or relocation of any Historic Property unless the applicant also presents at the same time the post-demolition or post-relocation plans for the site."

Ordinance #44-084

Build Mobile, PO Box 1827, Mobile, Alabama 36633

For more information: www.BuildMobile.org | historicdevelopment@cityofmobile.org | 251.208.7281

Visit our help window: Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street, Third Floor South Tower

Revised August 2023

An Architectural Review Board Application with supporting documentation and fee should accompany this request with the plans for development of the site. A sign will be placed in the front yard of the property prior to the Review Board meeting to notify surrounding property owners of a pending application. Attendance at the meeting is strongly advised in order for the applicant to respond to any questions.
SEE NEXT PAGE

CONFLICTS WITH OTHER CITY DEPARTMENTS

The Architectural Review Board examines applications solely on the basis of impairment to the historic character of a building or neighborhood. Approval by other City Departments may consider other aspects of a project such as safety. When multiple regulations are in conflict, generally the most restrictive applies. Also, though the staff and Review Board try to inform applicants of possible conflicts, they may not be aware of all the implications of a request. Therefore, the property owner should clear all requests with the appropriate departments.


Signature

08/28/2026

Date

Build Mobile, PO Box 1827, Mobile, Alabama 36633

For more information: www.BuildMobile.org | historicdevelopment@cityofmobile.org | 251.208.7281

Visit our help window: Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street, Third Floor South Tower

Revised August 2023



1st choice:

3-ft black aluminum fence with spear Point Tops, mounted above a 1'1/2-inch-high brick base wall, between 5-ft high columns. This design will run across the front of the home and down the left and right side, replacing the damaged fence to the left side (**See Attached Photos**) and replacing the Welded wire Garden Fence on the right side (**See Attached Photos**).



Current Left side damage Fence



Current Right side Welded Wire Garden Fence

Example Photo:

