



Agenda Item #4

Application 2023-60-CA

DETAILS

Location:

7 Hannon Avenue

Summary of Request:

Construct rear second half-story addition and porch.
Fenestration changes.

Applicant (as applicable):

Douglas Kearley

Property Owner:

Andrew and Abby Bradley

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The proposed second-floor addition will encompass the footprint of existing rear additions.
- The application proposes the construction of a new rear porch.
- The proposed addition is subordinate to the historic structure and compatible in massing and scale.
- All proposed materials match those of the existing, and all proposed details are compatible with the character of the original structure.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	2
Staff Analysis	4
Attachments	6

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

According to the National Register nomination, the house at 7 Hannon Avenue, a side-gabled centerhall plan dwelling, was constructed c. 1920. A gable-on-hip roof covers a porch centered on the façade, which expresses a neoclassical revival character with four columns supporting the porch roof and pilasters with capitals at each of the house’s front corners. The 1925 Sanborn map, republished in 1956, depicts the house as a one-story structure, square in form, with a shallow rear wing which does not quite span the entire east elevation. It is likely that this wing is an enclosed porch, or that it was later removed and replaced with a rear addition with a similar footprint. According to aerial photography and historic maps, the gable roof portion of the rear addition was constructed sometime between 1956 and 1967.

This property has appeared once before the Architectural Review Board. An application to partially demolish and renovate an existing garage received approval in 2021.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Construct rear second half-story addition and porch.
 - a. The proposed addition will incorporate the footprint of the existing rear wing and will include a new hipped roof back porch, which will measure 28’-6” wide by 10’-0” deep.
 - b. Construction of the proposed half-story rear addition will involve replacing the existing gable and flat roof with a 11:12 gable roof which will match the pitch of the historic side-gable roof.
 - c. Two (2) new one-over-one aluminum clad windows would be centered on the gable and over the proposed hipped porch roof. An existing louvered wood vent would be relocated to the proposed rear gable apex. The rear entry door and window extant on the rear elevation would remain in place.
 - d. The proposed rear porch’s hipped roof would be clad in shingles to match those of the existing structure.
 - e. Four (4) 8”x 8” wood columns with capitals would support the porch roof and be equally dispersed across the elevation.
 - f. Three (3) wood steps would be centered on the porch deck to provide access to the porch.
 - g. The proposed porch foundation would be raised on brick piers matching those of the existing structure. Framed wood lattice to match existing would be installed between piers. The foundation height would be 2’-5”.
2. Fenestration changes.
 - a. South elevation: Remove the existing small square second-story window located on the eastern end of the elevation. Matching siding to be feathered into the opening.
 - b. Raise the two existing six-over-six windows located on the eastern end of the north elevation by 6”.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*)

1. **6.9** Place an addition so that it is subordinate to the historic residential structure.
 - Place and design an addition to the rear or side of the historic building wherever possible.
 - Place a vertical addition in the rear so it is not visible from the street
2. **6.10** Design an addition to be compatible in massing and scale with the original historic structure.
 - Design the massing of an addition to appear subordinate to the historic building.
 - Where feasible, use a lower-scale connecting element to join an addition to a historic structure.
 - Where possible, match the foundation and floor heights of an addition to those of the historic building.

3. **6.11** Design the exterior walls of an addition to be compatible in scale and rhythm with the original historic structure.
 - Design the height of an addition to be proportionate with the historic building, paying particular attention to the foundation and other horizontal elements.
 - Design the addition to express floor heights on the exterior of the addition in a fashion that reflects floor heights of the original historic building.
4. **6.12** Clearly differentiate the exterior walls of an addition from the original historic structure.
 - Use a physical break or setback from the original exterior wall to visually separate the old from new.
 - Use an alteration in the roofline to create a visual break between the original and new, but ensure that the pitches generally match.
5. **6.13** Use exterior materials and finishes that are comparable to those of the original historic residential structure in profile, dimension and composition. Modern building materials will be evaluated for appropriateness or compatibility with the original historic structure on an individual basis, with the objective of ensuring the materials are similar in their profile, dimension, and composition to those of the original historic structure.
 - Utilize an alternative material for siding as necessary, such as cement-based fiber board, provided that it matches the siding of the historic building in profile, character and finish.
 - Use a material with proven durability.
 - Use a material with a similar appearance in profile, texture and composition to those on the original building.
 - Choose a color and finish that matches or blends with those of the historic building.
 - Do not use a material with a composition that will impair the structural integrity and visual character of the building.
 - Do not use a faux stucco application.
6. **6.14** Design a roof of an addition to be compatible with the existing historic building.
 - Design a roof shape, pitch, material and level of complexity to be similar to those of the existing historic building.
 - Incorporate overhanging exposed rafters, soffits, cornices, fascias, frieze boards, moldings or other elements into an addition that are generally similar to those of the historic building.
 - Use a roofing material for an addition that matches or is compatible with the original historic building and the district
7. **6.15** Design roofs such that the addition remains subordinate to the existing historic buildings in the district.
 - Where possible, locate a dormer or skylight on a new addition in an inconspicuous location.
 - In most cases, match a roof and window on a dormer to those of the original building.
8. **6.17** Design and place a new porch to maintain the visibility to and integrity of an original historic porch, as well as the overall historic building.
 - Do not expand an original historic front porch. Additions of new front porches or expansion of existing front porches are generally not appropriate.
 - Limit the height of a porch addition roofline so it does not interfere with second story elevations.
 - Replace a rear porch where a previously existing rear porch is lost or enclosed.
 - Design a rear porch so that its height and slopes are compatible with the original historic structure.
9. **6.18** Design a new porch to be compatible with the existing historic building.
 - Design the scale, proportion and character of a porch addition element, including columns, corner brackets, railings and pickets, to be compatible with the existing historic residential structure.
 - Match the foundation height of a porch addition to that of the existing historic structure.
 - Design a porch addition roofline to be compatible with the existing historic structure. However, a porch addition roofline need not match exactly that of the existing historic building. For example, a porch addition may have a shed roof.

- Use materials for a porch addition that are appropriate to the building.
 - Do not use a contemporary deck railing for a porch addition placed at a location visible from the public street.
 - Do not use cast concrete steps on façades or primary elevations.
10. **6.19** Design piers, foundations and foundation infill on a new addition to be compatible with those on the historic building.
- Match the foundation of an addition to that of the original.
 - Use a material that is similar to that of the historic foundation.
 - Match foundation height to that of the original historic building.
 - Use pier foundations if feasible and if consistent with the original building.
 - Do not use raw concrete block or wood posts on a foundation.
11. **6.20** Use details that are similar in character to those on the historic structure.
- Match a detail on an addition to match the original historic structure in profile, dimension and material.
 - Use ornamentation on an addition that is less elaborate than that on the original structure.
 - Use a material for details on an addition that match those of the original in quality and feel.
 - Match the proportions of details on an addition to match the proportions used on the original historic structure.
12. **6.21** Design a window on an addition to be compatible with the original historic building.
- Size, place and space a window for an addition to be in character with the original historic building.
 - If an aluminum window is used, use dimensions that are similar to the original windows of the house. An extruded custom aluminum window approved by the NPS or an aluminum clad wood window may be used, provided it has a profile, dimension and durability similar to a window in the historic building.
13. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
- Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The application under review proposes the construction of a half-story addition and a rear porch.

The addition would comprise the footprint of the existing rear addition which is approximately 15'-0" deep and slightly narrower than the original structure on either side. The height of the roof of the addition would match that of the original structure and would be compatible in pitch and shape. The addition's roof would not be visible from the street due to its placement behind the original side-gable roof. (6.14, 6.15) Therefore, the proposed addition complies the *Guidelines* in that it does not disrupt the existing massing and scale of the historic dwelling, would be compatible in rhythm and scale, and maintains an inferior status to that of the original structure. (6.9 - 6.11)

The *Guidelines* require that porch additions be placed in such a way to visually maintain the integrity of the historic building and that the addition be compatible in scale, proportion, and character with the existing structure. (6.17, 6.18) The proposed porch will project 10'-0" from the existing home's rear elevation and will not be visible from the street. Its 28'-6" width, which is slightly narrower than the existing rear elevation, and its 10'-4" ceiling height make this porch addition subordinate to the historic structure. The hipped roof design does not

impair the character of the existing building, and its height does not obstruct the second story elevations. The foundation height proposed for the porch would be equal to that of the existing house and also utilizes materials which are suitable to the historic building. (6.19)

All materials proposed for the addition are consistent and compatible with the original building, along with those used throughout the historic district. (6.13, 6.21) Likewise, details such as columns with capitals, brick foundation piers, and gable roof echo existing architectural elements and complement the character of the historic dwelling. (6.20)

The second-floor addition would be distinguished from the original structure by the use of Hardie board siding as cladding, which departs from the bead board and asbestos shingles present on the original portion of the house. (6.12) The proposed fenestration changes are minor and do not disrupt the established fenestration pattern of the historic building. (5.20)



1. View of rear (east) elevation, looking west.



2. View of rear elevation, looking northwest



3. View of south elevation, looking northwest