



Agenda Item #1

Application 2023-52-CA

DETAILS

Location:

363 West Street

Summary of Request:

New Construction: one-story single-family residence

Applicant (as applicable):

Kimberley Knowles

Property Owner:

Kimberley Knowles

Historic District:

Leinkauf

Classification:

Vacant

Summary of Analysis:

- The proposed new construction is a brick-veneered one-story single-family residence.
- The proposed placement, orientation, and massing of the structure is compatible with the *Guidelines*.
- The scale, design elements and some materials as planned, are not compatible with the district.
- The proposed driveway conforms with the provisions laid out in the *Guidelines*. However other site considerations, as planned, are not in conformance.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	3
Staff Analysis	6
Attachments	8

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Leinkauf Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1987 under Criteria A and C for significant architecture and community planning; the district was expanded in 2009. The neighborhood was settled in the early 20th century as a streetcar suburb adjacent to Government Street and surrounding Leinkauf School (1904). Housing forms and styles in the district reflect the range of styles and forms popular from 1900 through 1955.

363 West Street is currently a vacant lot. The 1925 Sanborn map shows the subject lot as part of the adjacent lot at 361 West Street. It appears that there has never been a standing structure present on this plot of land. Surrounded mainly by smaller craftsman cottages and minimal traditional dwellings, this part of West Street is also populated with small contemporary homes constructed within the last 25 years.

According to Historic Development files, this property has never before appeared before the Architectural Review Board.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Construct a one-story single-family home.
 - a. The proposed structure would be rectangular in shape and would measure 29'-6" wide by 48'-0" deep, with a total footprint of 1416 square feet. Ceiling heights would measure 9'-0" high.
 - b. The structure would be located on the lot such that the front wall plane would sit 25'-0" back from the west (front) property line. The north and south side yards will measure approximately 8'-6" and 12'-0" respectively.
 - c. Elevations would appear as follows:
 - 1) West Façade (from north to south)
The four-bay facade would appear as follows (from north to south): The first two bays would each consist of a nine-over-nine window. The third and fourth bays would consist of an entry door and nine-over-nine window, respectively. A recessed front porch measuring 13'-5" wide by 4'-6" deep would span the third and fourth bays and would be supported by one rectangular brick column and one square brick column. A tri-part shed roof dormer would be centered on the west face of the roof.
 - 2) East Elevation (from south to north)
The rear elevation would also consist of a recessed porch on its south end, which would measure 11'-11" wide by 5'-6" deep and would be supported by a single square brick column on the southeast corner.
 - 3) North Elevation (from east to west)
Three (3) nine-over-nine windows regularly distributed across the elevation.
 - 4) South Elevation (from west to east)
Brick column; three (3) nine-over-nine windows regularly distributed across the elevation; brick column.
 - d. The proposed structure would be topped by a hipped roof clad in shingles.
 - e. The proposed structure would be clad in running course brick with a soldier course running just under the cornice. Fascia board and cornice would be vinyl. Vinyl siding would be installed on the north and south sides of the proposed dormer.
 - f. Fenestration would be as follows: A total of nine (9) nine-over-nine vinyl would measure 3'-0" wide by 6'-0" high. Three (3) four-over-four vinyl windows would be installed in the shed roof dormer. Two entry doors, one on the facade and one on the west elevation would each measure 3'-0" wide by 6'-8" high. Proposed materials for the entry doors are either wood or fiberglass.
 - g. The foundation would be slab-on-grade concrete.

2. Proposed site improvements include a concrete driveway measuring approximately 45'-0" long and 12'-0" wide. The driveway would be accessed on the southwest end of lot and run eastward, parallel to the house's south elevation.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

1. **6.34** Maintain the visual line created by the fronts of buildings along a street.
 - Where front yard setbacks are uniform, place a new structure in general alignment with its neighbors.
 - Where front yard setbacks vary, place a new structure within the established range of front yard setbacks on a block.
2. **6.35** Maintain the side yard spacing pattern on the block.
 - Locate a structure to preserve the side yard spacing pattern on the block as seen from the street.
 - Provide sufficient side setbacks for property maintenance.
 - Provide sufficient side setbacks to allow needed parking to occur behind the front wall of the house.
3. **6.36** Design the massing of new construction to appear similar to that of historic buildings in the district.
 - Choose the massing and shape of the new structure to maintain a rhythm of massing along the street.
 - Match the proportions of the front elevations of a new structure with those in the surrounding district.
4. **6.37** Design the scale of new construction to appear similar to that of historic buildings in the district.
 - Use a building height in front that is compatible with adjacent contributing properties.
 - Size foundation and floor heights to appear similar to those of nearby historic buildings
 - Match the scale of a porch to the main building and reflect the scale of porches of nearby historic buildings.
5. **6.38** Design exterior building walls to reflect traditional development patterns of nearby historic buildings.
 - Use a ratio of solid to void that is similar in proportion to those of nearby historic buildings.
 - Reflect the rhythm of windows and doors in a similar fashion on all exterior building walls. The ARB will consider all building walls; however, building walls facing streets may face increased scrutiny.
 - Use steps and balustrades in a similar fashion as nearby historic structures.
 - Design building elements on exterior building walls to be compatible with those on nearby historic buildings. These elements include, but are not limited to:
 - Balconies
 - Chimneys
 - Dormers
6. **6.39** Use exterior materials and finishes that complement the character of the surrounding district.
 - Use material, ornamentation or a color scheme that blends with the historic district rather than making the building stand out.
 - If an alternative material is used that represents an evolution of a traditional material, suggest the finish of the original historic material from which it evolved.
 - Use a material with proven durability in the Mobile climate and that is similar in scale, character and finish to those used on nearby historic buildings.

ACCEPTABLE MATERIALS

Materials that are compatible in character, scale, and finish to those used on nearby historic buildings are acceptable. These often include:

- Stucco
- Brick
- Stone
- Wood (lap siding, shingles, board and batten)
- Concrete siding
- Cement fiber board siding

- Skim stucco coat

UNACCEPTABLE MATERIALS

Materials that are incompatible in character, scale and finish to those used on nearby historic buildings are unacceptable. These often include:

- Metal siding
 - Vinyl siding
 - Unfinished concrete block
 - Plywood
 - Masonite
 - Vinyl coatings
 - Ceramic coatings
 - Exterior insulation and finishing system (EIFS) wall systems
7. **6.40** Design a roof on new construction to be compatible with those on adjacent historic buildings.
- Design the roof shape, height, pitch, and overall complexity to be similar to those on nearby historic buildings.
 - Use materials that appear similar in character, scale, texture, and color range to those on nearby historic buildings.
 - New materials that have proven durability may be used.

ACCEPTABLE ROOF MATERIALS

Materials that are similar in character, scale, texture, and color range to those used on nearby historic buildings are acceptable. These often include:

- Asphalt dimensional or multi-tab shingles
 - Wood shake or shingle
 - Standing seam metal
 - Metal shingles
 - 5-V crimp metal
 - Clay tile
 - Imitation clay tile or slate
8. **6.41** Design a new door and doorway on new construction to be compatible with the historic district.
- Place and size a door to establish a solid-to-void ratio similar to that of nearby historic buildings.
 - Place a door in a fashion that contributes to the traditional rhythm of the district as seen in nearby historic buildings.
 - Incorporate a door casement and trim similar to those seen on nearby historic buildings.
 - Place and size a special feature, including a transom, sidelight or decorative framing element, to complement those seen in nearby historic buildings.
 - Use a door material that blends well with surrounding historic buildings. Wood is preferred. Paneled doors with or without glass are generally appropriate.
9. **6.42** Design a porch to be compatible with the neighborhood.
- Include a front porch as part of new construction if it is contextual and feasible.
 - When designing a porch, consider porch location, proportion, rhythm, roof form, supports, steps, balustrades and ornamentation relative to the main building and porches in the district.
 - Design the elements of a porch to be at a scale proportional to the main building.
 - Where a rhythm of porches exists on a street or block, design a porch that continues this historic rhythm.
 - Design a rear or side porch that is visible from the public right-of-way to be subordinate in character to the front porch.
10. **6.43** Design piers, a foundation and foundation infill to be compatible with those of nearby historic properties.

- Use raised, pier foundations.
- If raised foundations are not feasible, use a simulated raised foundation.
- Do not use slab-on-grade construction. This is not appropriate for Mobile's historic neighborhoods. If a raised slab is required, use water tables, exaggerated bases, faux piers or other methods to simulate a raised foundation.
- Do not use raw concrete block or exposed slabs.
- If foundation infill must be used, ensure that it is compatible with the neighborhood.
- If solid infill is used, recess it and screen it with landscaping.
- If lattice is used, hang it below the floor framing and between the piers. Finish it with trim.
- Do not secure lattice to the face of the building or foundation.
- Do not use landscaping to disguise inappropriate foundation design.

ACCEPTABLE FOUNDATION MATERIALS

Materials that are similar in character, texture and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are acceptable. These often include:

- Brick piers
- Brick infill
- Wood (vertical pickets)
- Framed lattice infill

UNACCEPTABLE FOUNDATION MATERIALS

Materials that are not similar in character, texture, and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are unacceptable. These often include:

Mineral board panels

Concrete block infill

- Metal infill
- Plywood panel infill
- Plastic sheeting infill
- Vinyl sheeting infill

11. **6.44** Use details and ornamentation that help new construction integrate with the historic buildings in the district.
 - Use a decorative detail in a manner similar to those on nearby historic buildings. A modern interpretation of a historic detail or decoration is encouraged.
 - Do not use a decorative detail that overpowers or negatively impacts nearby historic buildings.
12. **6.45** Locate and design windows to be compatible with those in the district.
 - Locate and size a window to create a solid-to-void ratio similar to the ratios seen on nearby historic buildings.
 - Locate a window to create a traditional rhythm and a proportion of openings similar to that seen in nearby historic buildings.
 - Use a traditional window casement and trim similar to those seen in nearby historic buildings.
 - Place a window to match the height of the front doorway.
 - Place a window so that there is proportionate space between the window and the floor level.
 - Do not place a window to directly abut the fascia of a building.
 - Use a window material that is compatible with other building materials.
 - Do not use a reflective or tinted glass window.
 - Use a 1/1 window instead of window with false muntins. A double paned window may be acceptable if the interior dividers and dimensional muntins are used on multi-light windows. A double paned 1/1 window is acceptable.
 - Do not use false, interior muntins except as stated above.
 - Recess window openings on masonry buildings.
 - Use a window opening with a raised surround on a wood frame building.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are similar in character, profile, finish and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood
- Vinyl-clad wood
- Aluminum-clad customized wood
- Extruded Aluminum

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are not similar in character, profile, finish and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are unacceptable. These often include:

- Mill finish metal windows
 - Snap-in or artificial muntins
 - Vinyl
13. **10.5** Visually connect the street and building.
 - Maintain or install a walkway leading directly from the sidewalk to the main building entry.
 14. **10.6** Install a new sidewalk to be compatible with historic ones in the area.
 - Maintain the existing width of neighboring sidewalks.
 - Use a traditional sidewalk material as seen in the district if permitted by the City Code. Consult Staff if necessary.
 15. **10.7** Minimize the visual impact of parking.
 - Locate a parking area at the rear or to the side of a site whenever possible.
 - Use landscaping to screen a parking area.
 - Minimize the widths of a paved area or a curb cut.
 - If a curb cut is no longer in use, repair the curb. In some areas, granite curbs may be required.
 - Do not use paving in the front yard for a parking area. Paving stones might be acceptable in certain instances. Do not create a new driveway or garage that opens onto a primary street.
 - Do not create a new driveway or garage that opens onto a primary street.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The application under review proposes the construction of a one-story single-family residence on the vacant lot at 363 West Street. The submitted plans demonstrate that the proposed structure adheres to the *Guidelines'* directives regarding placement, massing, and exterior wall patterns. The front and side yard setbacks fall within the range and pattern that has been established on the block and provide for sufficient space for parking behind the front plane of the dwelling. The shape and massing maintain the rhythm of the street. Likewise, the design and the pattern of solid to void created by fenestration placement are similar to those of nearby structures. (6.34 -6.36, 6.38, 6.45) In regard to scale, the proposed plan does not conform with the *Guidelines'* call to use building height in front that is compatible with adjacent properties by matching foundation and floor heights to those of nearby historic buildings. A slab-on-grade foundation is not an acceptable foundation design for new construction within Mobile's historic district. (6.37, 6.43)

The brick veneer and shingles proposed for siding and roofing materials are compatible with those seen on the street and complement the character of the district. However, vinyl is not an approved material for trim or windows within the historic districts. (6.39, 6.40, 6.45) The placement and proposed material of wood for the entry door on the facade conforms with the guidelines. However, the door design presented on the plan is not compatible with surrounding historic buildings. The *Guidelines* direct that decorative elements and special features of a door on new construction complement those of nearby historic buildings. (6.41) Similarly, the inclusion of a front porch, its placement and proportion relative to the main building are acceptable under the *Guidelines*. Yet the ornamentation (or the lack of), relative to the design patterns seen on nearby contributing dwellings, is not compatible. Proposed elements such as columns with no form of capital or base, could be easily altered to better conform with building traditions of the district. (6.42)

The *Guidelines* call for new construction design to consist of details and ornamentation that help a new design integrate with the historic buildings within a district by implementing decorative detail in a manner visually consistent with those of adjacent and nearby historic structures. The subject plans do not seem to present a structure which achieves this objective. There appears to be a lack of design features, details, or ornamentation which adequately reflect or complement the traditions present in nearby contributing structures and which would serve to integrate the new structure with the surrounding historic buildings and the district. (6.44)

Proposed site considerations include a driveway and a walkway. The driveway meets with the *Guidelines'* instruction to locate parking to the side of a site. The proposed concrete material also conforms. There is no landscaping proposed in the submitted plans. (10.7) The proposed concrete walkway is inappropriately placed, as the guidelines instruct that a walkway be installed to connect the main building entry to the sidewalk. (10.5) Currently there is no sidewalk at the subject property, and the submitted plans do not currently include the installation of a new sidewalk. Guideline 10.6 states that a new sidewalk be installed which maintains the existing width of neighboring sidewalks.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER <u>1</u> DATE <u>10/18/2023</u>
APPLICANT <u>Knowles Development Group, Inc.</u>
PROJECT <u>New construction: one-story single-family residence</u>



Site Photos – 363 West Street



1. View northeast to vacant lot at 363 West Street



2. View east-southeast to vacant lot at 363 West



3. View south along West Street with subject lot at left



4. View southwest across lot to structures on west side of West Street.