



Agenda Item #1

Application 2024-20-CA

DETAILS

Location:

260 N. Joachim Street

Summary of Request:

Replace windows on all elevations except for façade.

Applicant (as applicable):

Robert Dueitt Construction, LLC

Property Owner:

Turner Foundation

Historic District:

DeTonti Square

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The existing windows do not appear to be deteriorated beyond repair.
- The proposed replacement windows are of an approved alternative material.
- The proposed windows match the original in size and light configuration.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History 2

Scope of Work 2

Applicable Standards 2

Staff Analysis 3

Attachments4

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

DeTonti Square Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1972 under Criterion A for social and urban planning significance and Criterion C for significant architecture. The district was one of two historic districts created by a municipal ordinance in 1962 in an effort to halt the rapid demolition of historic buildings near the city's central business district. The district, named for the French explorer Henri DeTonti, contains a few structures surviving from the 1830s, but the majority were built in the 1850s as residences of the wealthy and influential cotton factors, merchants, and planters.

The property at 260 N. Joachim Street was constructed in 1904 by Rose McKay Harris. The historic structure is a two-story wood-frame side-hall dwelling with a gable-on-hip roof. A two-story porch runs the full width of the primary (west) elevation. A fully pedimented gable roof projects over the two south bays of the second-story porch. The north end of the second-story porch is uncovered. The dwelling features decorative woodwork typical of the early 20th-Century Queen Anne style, including paired turned porch columns, an elaborate door surround, and bands of spindle work below the second-story porch cornice. The period-appropriate porch railings with delicate turned balusters were installed in 1989. The existing one-over-one wood sash windows are typical of the period and are believed to be original, with one exception, as are the triple-hung boxhead windows that open out onto the first-floor porch.

According to Historic Development Department files, this property appeared three times before the Architectural Review Board (ARB). In October 1987, the ARB approved an application to restore the porch to its historic appearance using photographic evidence, to install one new double-hung window on the south elevation to match the existing windows, and alterations to the rear porch to make it more closely match the restored front porch. In February 1989, the ARB once again approved the restoration of the front porch as well as the construction of a screened parking area on the adjacent lot to the north of the subject property. In March 2012, the ARB approved improvements to an ADA-accessible ramp, installation of new signage, repairs to the side drive, removal of an existing rear deck, and construction of a new rear stoop.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Replace all windows on side and rear elevations.
 - Replacement windows would be aluminum clad one-over-one windows, which would match the existing windows in size, profile, and light configuration.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

1. **5.6** Use original materials to replace damaged materials on primary surfaces where possible.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged building materials on a primary façade if possible. If the original material is wood clapboard, for example, then the replacement material should be a material that matches the original in finish, size and the amount of exposed lap. If the original material is not available from the site, use a replacement material that is visually comparable with the original material.
 - Replace only the amount of material required. If a few boards are damaged beyond repair, for example, then only they should be replaced, rather than the entire wall.
 - Do not replace building materials on the primary façade, such as wood siding and masonry, with alternative or imitation materials unless it cannot be avoided.
 - Wholesale replacement of exterior finishes is generally not allowed.
2. **5.7** When replacing materials on a non-primary façade or elevation, match the original material in composition, scale and finish.

- Use original materials to replace damaged materials on a non-primary façade when possible.
 - The ARB will consider the use of green building materials, such as those made with renewable and local resources to replace damaged materials on a nonprimary façade if they do not impact the integrity of the building or its key features.
 - Use alternative or imitation materials that match the style and detail of the original material to replace damaged non-primary building materials.
 - Replace exterior finishes to match original in profile, dimension and materials.
3. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
- Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
4. **5.21** When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
- In instances where there is a request to replace a building’s windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable.

These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable.

These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing property in the DeTonti Square Historic District. The application under review proposes the wholesale replacement of original windows on the north, south, and rear elevations. Original windows on the façade would remain extant.

When considering replacement of materials on a historic structure, the *Guidelines* recommend replacing only materials that are damaged or missing. They additionally state that on non-primary elevations, alternative materials that match the style and detail of the original may be used. In regard to windows specifically, the *Guidelines* direct to preserve and repair windows that are in repairable condition; when they are not repairable, the replacement window should match the original.

The applicant completed a window survey, assessing the condition of the windows intended for replacement on the non-primary elevations at 260 N Joachim. The survey and visual inspection reveal that the existing windows are not in a deteriorated or unrepairable state. The proposed replacement windows would be an aluminum-clad wood window, which is an acceptable window material under the *Guidelines*. Further, the replacement windows' one-over-one light configuration would match that of the existing windows. (5.6, 5.7, 5.20, 5.21)

Site Location – 260 N. Joachim Street

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
VICINITY MAP**



APPLICATION NUMBER	1	DATE	5/15/2024
APPLICANT	Robert Dueitt Construction, LLC on behalf of Turner Foundation		
PROJECT	Replace all windows		



Site Photos – 260 N. Joachim Street



1. View of west façade (left) and south elevation (right)



2. View of west façade (right) and north elevation (left)



3. View of windows on north elevation.



4. View of rear elevation.