



Agenda Item #2

Application 2023-58-CA

DETAILS

Location:

160 S. Dearborn Street

Summary of Request:

Demolish non-historic ancillary structure

Applicant (as applicable):

Chris Turner

Property Owner:

Same

Historic District:

Church Street East

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The subject shed structure is not original to the property, nor is it historic.
- The structure is in a deteriorated state.
- The applicant plans to install grass at the site, and to potentially construct a larger and more useful carport/storage structure in the near future.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History 2

Scope of Work 2

Applicable Standards 2

Staff Analysis 2

Attachments 4

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Church Street East Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1971 under Criteria A (historic significance) and C (architectural significance) for its local significance in the areas of architecture, education, and urban planning. The district is significant for its concentration of multiple 19th century architectural styles and because it encompasses the site of Mobile in the early 1700s. The district boundaries were expanded in 1984 and 2005.

The property at 160 S. Dearborn Street is a one-story gable roof frame house with an asymmetrical front porch spanning the southern bay of the façade and accessed by concrete steps with flanking cheek walls. The structure exhibits restrained architectural features, the most significant of which is a single tapered column with base and corbelled capital which supports the front porch on its southeast corner. According to Historic Development vertical files, historic maps, and photos, the houses at 160 and 158 S. Dearborn were built at the same time, around 1938, on a lot that previously fronted Monroe Street and was occupied by a single frame house and a small masonry building. Other than a porch addition to the rear elevation in the 1980s, the house at 160 S. Dearborn has been altered very little from its original form over the years. Between 1979 and 1982, the western (rear) boundary of the property shifted west to encompass the adjacent lot at 654 Monroe Street. The structure extant at 654 Monroe at this time was relocated to the neighboring lot to the west. This lot which had previously been 656 Monroe, was redesignated as 654 Monroe Street. This arrangement created a larger space to the rear of the dwellings at both 158 and 160 S. Dearborn Street. A COA to construct the shed at 160 S. Dearborn Street was issued in 1982.

This property has appeared once before the Architectural Review Board, when it received approval in 1982 to construct a shed, install a rear porch addition, and reroof the structure.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Demolish non-historic ancillary building.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

Demolition Guidelines (12.0)

1. Consider the current significance of a structure previously determined to be historic
2. Consider the condition of the structure in question. Demolition may be more appropriate when a building is deteriorated or in poor condition

Impact on the street

3. Consider whether the building is one of the last remaining positive examples of its kind in the neighborhood, county, or region.
4. Consider the impact that demolition will have on surrounding structures, including neighboring properties, properties on the same block or across the street or properties throughout the individual historic district.
5. Consider whether the building is part of an ensemble of historic buildings that create a neighborhood.

Nature of Proposed Development

6. Consider the future utilization of the site.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The *Guidelines* require that the following be considered when a demolition is proposed: the architectural significance of the building, the impact the demolition will have on the streetscape, and the nature of future utilization of the site.

Significance

The shed structure proposed for demolition is not original to the subject lot. It was constructed c. 1982, so is also not historic. It is a small rectangular frame structure which consists of restrained features such as a gable roof, exposed rafters, and a paneled door, which echo the character of the historic dwelling on the property. The

portion of the property on which the structure sits was originally part of an adjacent lot to the west, which was incorporated into the present lot between 1979 and 1982.

Condition

Presently, the entire structure is in a state of deterioration with possible foundation issues. The structure is leaning and bulging, and the entrance door cannot seal the opening due to an apparent shift in the foundation.

Impact on the Street and District

Due to its non-historic status and lack of architectural significance, the shed structure at 160 S. Dearborn does not contribute to the historic character or context of the property at 160 S. Dearborn, nor to that of the surrounding district. Further, the location of the structure is not visible from the street.

Nature of Proposed Development

The applicant would like to add grass to the rear of the lot and plans to construct a slightly larger ancillary structure within the next year, which would potentially consist of a covered carport and storage structure and would match the house in architectural character and color. No application for such a structure has been submitted to Historic Development, but the applicant will apply for a COA when the plans have been finalized.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER 2 DATE 12/6/2023
APPLICANT Christopher Turner & Jodi White
PROJECT Demolish non-historic ancillary structure





1. View of accessory structure looking north by northwest



2. View of façade



3. View of south elevation



4. View of rear of property and the shed in relation to the dwelling (looking north).