



# Agenda Item #3

## Application 2023-59-CA

### DETAILS

---

**Location:**

154 S. Monterey Street

**Summary of Request:**

After-the-Fact: Replace windows on north, south, and west elevations with vinyl windows; replace windows on façade with aluminum-clad windows

**Applicant (as applicable):**

Tyler Pham

**Property Owner:**

Same

**Historic District:**

Old Dauphin Way

**Classification:**

Contributing

**Summary of Analysis:**

- One-over-one vinyl windows have replaced all wood Prairie style nine-over-one windows on the structure.
- Vinyl is considered an unacceptable window material for Mobile’s historic districts.
- The application proposes replacing the two (2) recently installed vinyl windows on the façade with Prairie style nine-over-one aluminum clad wood windows.
- The historic (non-original) metal windows extant in the arched openings on the façade have been repaired.
- The applicant met with a Design Review Committee to mitigate the relevant issues.

**Report Contents:**

Property and Application History ..... 2

Scope of Work ..... 2

Applicable Standards ..... 2

Staff Analysis ..... 3

Attachments ..... 4

## PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

---

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20<sup>th</sup>-century apartments.”

The property at 154 S. Monterey Street is a frame one-story Craftsman style bungalow with a gable roof and an enclosed brick front porch spanning the two northern bays of the façade. Although the exact construction date is unknown, probate records show that the area was surveyed for subdivision in 1907. The extant house is represented on the 1925 Sanborn map. Considering this evidence and the style of the building, it can be reasonably deduced to have been built c.1925. The form on the Sanborn map depicts a front porch spanning the northern half of the façade, the footprint of which matches that of the existing brick projection on the façade. Google Street View images show the porch was infilled and windows installed in the arched openings prior to 2007.

This property has appeared before the Architectural Review Board (ARB) twice. In June 2023, a COA was granted to demolish a garage structure at the rear of the property. An earlier iteration of the current application appeared before the ARB on December 6, 2023.

## SCOPE OF WORK

---

1. Replace windows on north, south, and west elevations with vinyl windows.
2. Replace windows on façade with aluminum-clad windows.

## APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*)

---

1. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
  - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
  - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
  - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
  - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
2. **5.21** When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
  - In instances where there is a request to replace a building’s windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
  - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.
3. **5.22** When a historic window is missing on a key character-defining wall, use a historically accurate replacement.
  - Historically accurate light patterns shall be employed. Use photographic, physical, and/or documentary evidence for the design.
  - A new window shall be installed in such a manner as to fit within the original window opening and match in depth and filling of the reveal.
  - A double-paned or clad wood window may be considered as a replacement alternative only if the replacement matches the configuration, dimensions, and profiles of the original windows.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

## STAFF ANALYSIS

---

The subject property is a contributing resource within the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review seeks after-the-fact approval to replace windows on north, south, and west elevations with one-over-one vinyl windows and approval to replace two existing new one-over-one vinyl windows on the façade with Prairie style nine-over-one aluminum-clad windows.

The one-over-one vinyl windows were recently installed in all extant window openings on the structure, with the exception of the arched window openings on the enclosed front porch. Photos show that prior to installation, the historic windows were wood with a Prairie style nine-over-one configuration. The *Guidelines* recommend that historic windows that are intact and in repairable condition be retained and repaired, and those that are not repairable be replaced with new windows that are consistent with the existing in location, framing, and light configuration. (5.20, 5.21) According to the applicant, prior to replacement, the historic wood windows were deemed unrepairable. Although the Prairie style nine-over-one configuration of the historic windows contributes significantly to the character of the historic bungalow, the one-over-one vinyl replacement windows are an acceptable configuration and are compatible with existing window openings with minor infill at the bottom. The *Guidelines* further note that vinyl is not an approved window material for contributing properties within Mobile's historic districts. (5.21) To mitigate this problem, the application seeks approval to replace the two vinyl windows which have been installed on the east façade with prairie-over-one aluminum clad windows. The applicant has provided sample drawings of the proposed windows. It is unclear if the samples provided would fit the historic window openings on the façade. It should be noted that the remaining vinyl windows, which are being proposed for retention, are not located on key character-defining walls such as the façade, whereas the two windows being proposed for replacement are located on the façade, which is a primary wall, thus character-defining. (5.22)

### UPDATE TO APPLICATION

On December 13<sup>th</sup>, the applicant met with a Design Review Committee which consisted of members of Staff and the Architectural Review Board to further review the subject application in an attempt to mitigate the non-compliant components of the project. At the meeting, it was agreed that the applicant would replace the two vinyl windows on the façade, along with the first two windows (from east to west) on the south elevation, with custom aluminum-clad nine-over-one windows from Ply Gem Windows, per the order form submitted with the original application.

# ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER 3 DATE 12/6/2023  
APPLICANT Tyler Pham  
PROJECT Replace windows on north, south, and west elevations with vinyl windows;  
replace windows on façade with aluminum-clad windows





Site Photos – 154 S. Monterey Street



1. East elevation, looking northwest



2. East elevation, looking southwest



3. Facade windows



4. North elevation



5. South elevation



6. Rear (west) elevation

