



Agenda Item #3

Application 2023-44-CA

DETAILS

Location:

1212 New St. Francis Street

Summary of Request:

1. After-the-fact: Replace all windows with vinyl sash windows
2. Replace/Install new siding.

Applicant (as applicable):

Satsuma Rental

Property Owner:

Same

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The current windows match the original window openings and are of an appropriate light configuration.
- Vinyl is considered an unacceptable window material for Mobile's historic districts.
- The wood lap siding present on the building's façade appears to be in reparable condition.
- Wood lap siding is an appropriate replacement for all elevations of the building, with Hardie plank siding being an appropriate replacement material for all non-primary elevations.
- The Design Review Committee agreed on a modified scope of work.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	2
Staff Analysis	3
Attachments	5

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The dwelling at 1212 New Saint Francis Street is a two-bay frame one-story cottage with restrained Victorian detailing. According to MHDC vertical files, the structure was constructed c. 1900. The 1904, 1925, and 1956 Sanborn Insurance Map overlays depict a frame dwelling, matching the rectangular form of the current structure, and consisting of the same recessed front porch spanning the west bay. In 2007, a rear porch was added along with two gabled dormers on the east elevation.

According to Historic Development Department records, this property has appeared twice before the Architectural Review Board (ARB). In 2007, work at the property was approved which included adding two gabled dormers on the east elevation, construction of a rear porch, repairing damaged elements, and reroofing the structure. The current application initially appeared before the ARB on September 6, 2023 and was tabled for discussion at a Design Review Committee meeting.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. (After-the-fact) Replace all windows (and install where windows are missing) with Atrium single-hung vinyl windows to fit existing window openings.
2. Replace siding on all elevations with wood lap siding to match existing or Hardie plank lap siding.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

1. 5.4 Preserve original building materials.
 - Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the material.
 - Remove only those materials which are deteriorated, and beyond reasonable repair.
 - Do not remove original materials that are in good condition.
2. 5.7 When replacing materials on a non-primary façade or elevation, match the original material in composition, scale and finish.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged materials on a non-primary façade when possible.
 - The ARB will consider the use of green building materials, such as those made with renewable and local resources to replace damaged materials on a nonprimary façade if they do not impact the integrity of the building or its key features.
 - Use alternative or imitation materials that match the style and detail of the original material to replace damaged non-primary building materials.
 - Replace exterior finishes to match original in profile, dimension and materials.
3. 5.20 Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.

- For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
4. 5.21 When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
- In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.

5. ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing resource within the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review seeks after-the-fact approval of the installation of new vinyl windows which fit the existing window openings, and the proposal of new wood lap siding on the façade and Hardie plank lap siding on side and rear elevations.

The one-over-one vinyl windows were recently installed in all extant window openings on the structure. Photos show that prior to installation, window openings on the east elevation were covered with plywood. Earlier photographic evidence reveals deterioration and empty window openings on this elevation with extant wood windows on the south (façade) and west elevations. According to the applicant, these extant windows were in an extreme deteriorated state, and although there was evidence of inferior efforts to maintain the windows, the windows were not salvageable. Historic Development Department records show that two-over-two wood windows with true divided lights were approved for installation in the gables on the east elevation; however, it is unclear if these windows were ever installed. If they were installed, satellite imagery reveals that they were no longer extant by 2011.

The *Guidelines* recommend that historic windows that are intact and in repairable condition be retained and repaired, and those that are not repairable be replaced with new windows that are consistent with the existing in location, framing, and light configuration. (5.20, 5.21) The one-over-one vinyl replacement windows are compatible with existing window openings, and although photographs demonstrate evidence of a previous two-over-two light configuration, the one-over-one configuration is appropriate to the design and style of the building. The *Guidelines* further note that vinyl is not an acceptable window material for contributing properties within Mobile's historic districts. (5.21)

The *Guidelines* direct that original building materials be repaired rather than replaced, when possible, and that original materials that are in good condition remain in place. On non-primary elevations, the *Guidelines* allow for

the consideration of green materials that imitate the original in profile and dimension, such as Hardie plank, as acceptable replacement materials providing they sustain the integrity of the building. (5.4, 5.7) The wood lap siding extant on west bay of the façade appears to be in good or repairable shape. New wood lap siding that matches the existing in profile and dimensions would be a fitting and compliant replacement material for the east bay under the porch and around the entry door. The non-primary elevations currently have minimal siding and could be re-clad in either new wood lap siding or an appropriate Hardie plank material.

The subject application was tabled at the public meeting of the ARB on September 6th, in order that a Design Review Committee be formed to discuss and mitigate the application. The committee and the applicant consulted on September 18th and agreed on the following modifications:

1. Three (3) vinyl windows to be removed (one on the façade and the southernmost window on both the east and west elevations)
 - a. The removed windows are to be replaced with the wood two-over-two windows which are extant on the property.
 - b. All windows will be trimmed to match original window dimensions, including a 1"x 4" on each side and a 1"x 6" on top with a trim piece above.
2. Wood lap siding matching the existing is to be installed on the façade.
 - a. The secondary front door opening is to be filled with wood lap siding.
3. Hardie siding matching as closely as possible the dimensions of the existing siding on the facade is to be installed on all secondary elevations.
4. A wood handrail is to be installed on front porch.
 - a. The handrail will consist of a simple balustrade with turned posts which match the style of the house.
5. A new pane-and-panel front door matching the historic character of the house is to be installed.
 - a. The front door is of stain grade fiberglass with a simulated wood grain which is to be stained dark to be compatible with the character of the house.
 - b. The door would fit the existing door and transom opening.
6. The beadboard and louvered vent on the front gable is to be repaired and/or replaced in-kind.
7. The rear porch is to be finished out with approved materials.

Site Location – 1212 New St. Francis Street

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER 3 DATE 10/4/2023
APPLICANT Satsuma Rental
PROJECT Replace all windows with vinyl sash windows, replace south-facing front door, remove and side over opening for west-facing front door



Site Photos – 1212 New St. Francis Street



1. South (front) elevation



2. Southeast



3. East elevation



4. Replacement window



5. Southwest



6. South façade – east bay



7. wood sashes extant on property