



Agenda Item #3

Application 2024-22-CA

DETAILS

Location:

1159 Old Shell Road

Summary of Request:

Restore Craftsman-style front porch columns and roof. Restore exterior of house including siding, trim, cornice, and windows. Construct an addition at the rear. Reroof house with dimensional shingles. Install gravel driveway utilizing existing curb cut.

Applicant (as applicable):

Douglas Kearley

Property Owner:

Chris and Jodi Turner

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The front porch would be restored to match a previous, historic front porch.
- All proposed repairs and replacements to the existing structure would be in-kind.
- The placement, massing, and scale of the proposed addition aligns with the *Guidelines*.
- All materials proposed for the addition are approved by the *Guidelines* for additions to historic structures.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History 2
 Scope of Work 2
 Applicable Standards 3
 Staff Analysis 5
 Attachments7

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The property at 1159 Old Shell Road was constructed in 1900 for Lorenzo Hardy, who acquired the lot in May 1900 and is first listed residing at what was then 129 Springhill Shell Road in 1901. The 1902 City Directory lists the address as 127 Old Shell Road, and the 1904 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map shows a frame dwelling with a similar footprint to the existing structure at this address. The overall form of the existing structure - with its complex roof structure, asymmetrical façade, and protruding end bay – is typical of a turn-of-the-century Queen Anne Style cottage. The form closely parallels that of the neighboring dwelling immediately to the east, suggesting the two may have once been identical sister houses. Originally 1159 Old Shell Road likely had a wood-frame porch with turned columns and decorative woodwork similar to that seen at 1157 Old Shell Road. This porch was removed at an unknown date and replaced with a Craftsman style brick porch with battered wood columns, as seen in a photograph taken in October 1983. Stylistic evidence suggests this alteration was made sometime between 1920 and 1930, though this has not been confirmed. The porch roof and battered columns were demolished without approval in 2008. At the time, the Historic Development Department (HDD) staff issued a stop work order. The brick stairs, platform, and column plinths remain intact.

According to HDD files, this property has never appeared before the Architectural Review Board (ARB).

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Restore the front porch.
 - a. Construct new front porch roof structure and cornice to match those photos in a 1983 photograph. The hipped roof would be clad in dimensional asphalt shingles.
 - b. Install three (3) new tapered columns with caps that resemble previous porch columns pictured in a 1983 photo. The new columns would sit on existing brick plinths.
 - c. Clean existing brick column plinths, knee wall, and steps.
 - d. Repoint brick foundation piers.
2. Conduct exterior restoration and repairs.
 - a. Repair/replace in-kind, sand, and repaint all wood clapboard siding, where needed.
 - b. Repair all existing wood windows.
 - c. Install a salvaged wood panel door and single-light transom to fit existing openings in front doorway.
 - d. Repair existing cornice where needed.
 - e. Repair existing wood shingles and wood louvered vent in front projecting gable.
 - f. Repair and repaint existing brick foundation piers and install new framed wood lattice infill screens.
 - g. Reroof existing roof in dimensional shingles.
3. Construct a rear addition.
 - a. Remove a projecting partial wall on the south end of the east elevation.
 - b. Construct an addition that would extend off the south (rear) elevation.
 - c. The addition would extend 34'-0" feet across the existing south elevation which measures approximately 38'-11" wide. Depths would range between 6'-4" and 25'-4".
 - d. Wood siding, corner boards and cornices would match the existing structure in materials and profile.
 - e. Fenestration would consist of one-over-one aluminum-clad windows, each measuring 2'-8" wide by 5'-6" high, and a 3'-0" wide by 6'-8" high wood pane-and-panel entry door with single-light transom.
 - f. The proposed foundation would sit on masonry piers with framed wood lattice infill screens, all to match those on the existing structure. The proposed foundation height of approximately 3'-4" would be equivalent to the historic dwelling.

- g. Finished floor to top of plate would measure 9'-4".
- h. The addition would be topped by a roof of alternating forms and would be clad in dimensional shingles.
- i. The addition would consist of (from west to east) a bedroom/sitting room portion, a small back porch, and a bath/closet portion. Each are described as follows:

Bedroom/sitting room

- The west elevation of the bedroom/sitting room portion of the addition would be set back approximately 4'-11" in from the southwest corner of the existing house. It would measure 14'-0" wide by 23'-4" deep.
- This portion would be topped by a hipped roof.

Covered walkway/porch

- The walkway would abut the east elevation of the bedroom/sitting and would measure 4'-0" wide by 8'-0" deep.
- The walkway would be topped by part of the L-shaped hipped roof on the elevation, which would be supported by an 8" square column.
- Five (5) wood steps would access the south end of the walkway. A wood handrail would flank the east side of the steps and run along the east side of the porch.
- A pane-and-panel door with single-light transom would access the rear (south) elevation of the house.

Bathroom/Closet

- The bathroom/closet portion would measure 16'-0" wide by 6'-4" deep and would be topped by the continuation of the L-shaped roof also covering the porch.

- j. Elevations would appear as follows:

West elevation

One-over-one window approximately centered on the elevation; corner board

South elevation

Corner board; a pair of one-over-one windows centered on the projected bay; corner board; pane-and-panel door; column; corner board

East elevation

Corner board; one-over-one window; column; corner board

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

1. **5.4** Preserve original building materials.
 - Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the material.
 - Remove only those materials which are deteriorated, and beyond reasonable repair.
 - Do not remove original materials that are in good condition.
2. **5.6** Use original materials to replace damaged materials on primary surfaces where possible.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged building materials on a primary façade if possible. If the original material is wood clapboard, for example, then the replacement material should be a material that matches the original in finish, size and the amount of exposed lap. If the original material is not available from the site, use a replacement material that is visually comparable with the original material.
 - Replace only the amount of material required. If a few boards are damaged beyond repair, for example, then only they should be replaced, rather than the entire wall.
 - Do not replace building materials on the primary façade, such as wood siding and masonry, with alternative or imitation materials unless it cannot be avoided.
 - Wholesale replacement of exterior finishes is generally not allowed.
3. **5.7** When replacing materials on a non-primary façade or elevation, match the original material in composition, scale and finish.

- Use original materials to replace damaged materials on a non-primary façade when possible.
4. **5.17** Preserve historic stylistic and architectural details and ornamentation.
 - Repair historic details and ornamentation that are deteriorated.
 5. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
 6. **6.5** Repair a porch in a way that maintains the original character.
 7. **6.9** Place an addition so that it is subordinate to the historic residential structure.
 - Place and design an addition to the rear or side of the historic building wherever possible.
 - Place a vertical addition in the rear so it is not visible from the street.
 8. **6.10** Design an addition to be compatible in massing and scale with the original historic structure.
 - Design the massing of an addition to appear subordinate to the historic building.
 - Where feasible, use a lower-scale connecting element to join an addition to a historic structure.
 - Where possible, match the foundation and floor heights of an addition to those of the historic building.
 9. **6.11** Design the exterior walls of an addition to be compatible in scale and rhythm with the original historic structure.
 - Design the height of an addition to be proportionate with the historic building, paying particular attention to the foundation and other horizontal elements.
 - Design the addition to express floor heights on the exterior of the addition in a fashion that reflects floor heights of the original historic building.
 10. **6.12** Clearly differentiate the exterior walls of an addition from the original historic structure.
 - Use a physical break or setback from the original exterior wall to visually separate the old from new.
 - Use an alteration in the roofline to create a visual break between the original and new, but ensure that the pitches generally match.
 11. **6.13** Use exterior materials and finishes that are comparable to those of the original historic residential structure in profile, dimension and composition. Modern building materials will be evaluated for appropriateness or compatibility with the original historic structure on an individual basis, with the objective of ensuring the materials are similar in their profile, dimension, and composition to those of the original historic structure.
 - Utilize an alternative material for siding as necessary, such as cement-based fiber board, provided that it matches the siding of the historic building in profile, character and finish.
 - Use a material with proven durability.
 - Use a material with a similar appearance in profile, texture and composition to those on the original building.
 - Choose a color and finish that matches or blends with those of the historic building.
 - Do not use a material with a composition that will impair the structural integrity and visual character of the building.
 - Do not use a faux stucco application.
 12. **6.14** Design a roof of an addition to be compatible with the existing historic building.
 - Design a roof shape, pitch, material and level of complexity to be similar to those of the existing historic building.
 - Incorporate overhanging exposed rafters, soffits, cornices, fascias, frieze boards, moldings or other elements into an addition that are generally similar to those of the historic building.

- Use a roofing material for an addition that matches or is compatible with the original historic building and the district.
13. **6.15** Design roofs such that the addition remains subordinate to the existing historic buildings in the district.
 - Where possible, locate a dormer or skylight on a new addition in an inconspicuous location.
 - In most cases, match a roof and window on a dormer to those of the original building
 14. **6.16** Design doors and doorways to an addition to be compatible with the existing historic building.
 - If a historic door is removed to accommodate the addition, consider reusing it on the addition.
 - Design a door and doorway to be compatible with the historic building.
 - Use a door material that is compatible with those of the historic building and the district.
 - Use a material with a dimensionality (thickness) and appearance similar to doors on the original historic building.
 - Design the scale of a doorway on an addition to be in keeping with the overall mass, scale and design of the addition as a whole.
 15. **6.19** Design piers, foundations and foundation infill on a new addition to be compatible with those on the historic building.
 - Match the foundation of an addition to that of the original.
 - Use a material that is similar to that of the historic foundation.
 - Match foundation height to that of the original historic building.
 - Use pier foundations if feasible and if consistent with the original building.
 - Do not use raw concrete block or wood posts on a foundation.
 16. **6.20** Use details that are similar in character to those on the historic structure.
 - Match a detail on an addition to match the original historic structure in profile, dimension and material.
 - Use ornamentation on an addition that is less elaborate than that on the original structure.
 - Use a material for details on an addition that match those of the original in quality and feel.
 - Match the proportions of details on an addition to match the proportions used on the original historic structure.
 17. **6.21** Design a window on an addition to be compatible with the original historic building.
 - Size, place and space a window for an addition to be in character with the original historic building.
 - If an aluminum window is used, use dimensions that are similar to the original windows of the house. An extruded custom aluminum window approved by the NPS or an aluminum clad wood window may be used, provided it has a profile, dimension and durability similar to a window in the historic building.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing structure to the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review proposes the restoration of the front porch and repairs to the original structure and the construction of a one-story addition on the south (rear) elevation.

The *Guidelines* call for an addition to an existing historic structure to be subordinate to and compatible with the main structure in placement, massing, scale, and rhythm. This application achieves these objectives with the placement of the one-story addition to the rear of the property, which does not disrupt the existing massing and scale of the property. The footprint, which would measure approximately 459 sf, would be roughly 28% of the footprint of the historic house. The roof proposed for the addition also sits subordinate to the height of the existing roof. Foundation and ceiling heights proposed for the addition match those of the existing house. (6.9 - 6.11, 6.15)


As directed by the *Guidelines*, the proposed addition is differentiated by the alternation in roofline and roof height. On the west elevation, the offset placement of the addition's west end wall and the retention of the original structure's south corner board on the east elevation would further distinguish the addition from the original structure. (6.12)

All exterior materials intended for the addition match the original historic structure or are approvable materials for additions to historic structures. These materials include wood siding, aluminum-clad wood windows, and wood trim, along with matching brick foundation piers and lattice infill panels. (6.13, 6.16, 6.19, 6.20, 6.21) Likewise, the alternating roof configuration planned for the addition complements the original complex roof plan. The new roof would be clad in a matching material and would adopt the same slope as the existing roof. (6.14)

Repairs and replacement work proposed for the existing building include repairs to siding, windows, roof, foundation piers and infill. All proposed replacement materials would match existing. The proposed work to the front porch, which would include the construction of a new porch roof and cornice, installation of tapered columns, and cleaning the brick knee wall, steps, and column plinths, are efforts to restore a later added historic Craftsman style porch, which adhere to the *Guidelines'* directives to preserve and repair historic details and ornamentation, and to maintain the historic character of a porch. (5.4 – 5.7, 5.10, 5.11,5.17, 5.20)

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER <u>3</u> DATE <u>5/15/2024</u>	 NTS
APPLICANT <u>Douglas Kearley on behalf of Luke Dunaway</u>	
PROJECT <u>Restore bungalow style front porch columns and roof. Restore exterior of house including siding, trim, cornice, windows. Construct an addition at the rear. Reroof house with dimensional shingles. Install gravel driveway utilizing existing curb cut</u>	

Site Photos - Submitted by applicant - 1159 Old Shell Road



1. View of façade, looking southeast



2. Façade, looking south



3. Rear (south) elevation. Partial wall to be removed can be seen on the east end.



4. Rear and east elevation, looking northwest



5. Rear elevation, looking northeast. Note partial wall to be removed.



6. West elevation, looking north.

1983 Photo from Historic Development Files – 1159 Old Shell Road



