

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
March 7, 2018 – 3:00 P.M.
Multi-Purpose Room, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Chair, Harris Oswalt, called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. Paige Largue, MHDC Staff, called the roll as follows:
Members Present: Harris Oswalt, John Ruzic, Nick Holmes III, Steve Stone, Craig Roberts, and Kim Harden.
Members Absent: Robert Brown, Robert Allen, David Barr, Catarina Echols, Carolyn Hassler, and Jim Wagoner.
Staff Members Present: Bridget Daniel, Marion McElroy, and Paige Largue.
2. Mr. Stone moved to approve the minutes from January 3, 2018. The motion received a second and was unanimously approved.
3. Mr. Stone moved to approve the Midmonths. Ms. Largue noted the midmonth pertaining to 1055Elmira Street had an error and this had been rectified. The motion received a second and was approved unanimously.

B. MIDMONTH APPROVALS: APPROVED.

- 1. Applicant: Follies Fun House**
 - a. Property Address: 250 St. Anthony Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/25/2018
 - c. Project: Remove later portion of stuccoed concrete block fence along western perimeter of lot. Relocate Iron Gate to southeast corner of fence. Remove portion of concrete block wall located on northeast portion of lot. Expand existing brick patio in rear.
- 2. Applicant: John Stimpson**
 - a. Property Address: 959 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/26/2018
 - c. Project: Repair/replace rotten wood. Repaint in white or tan.
- 3. Applicant: Derek Thomas of Thomas Industries, Inc.**
 - a. Property Address: 6 St. Joseph Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/26/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof to match existing flat roof.
- 4. Applicant: Jerry Graham of Jerry Graham Roofing**
 - a. Property Address: 1415 Brown Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/29/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles.
- 5. Applicant: Christopher Deas of SouthCoast Woodworks**
 - a. Property Address: 1558 Blair Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/29/2018
 - c. Project: Repair asbestos siding to match in dimension and profile. If removal of asbestos siding necessary, replace with wooden lapsiding. Repaint in approved color scheme. Repair and reglaze existing windows. Replace two wooden windows to match in dimension, profile, and material. Install 5V crimp metal roof.

- 6. Applicant: Sean Porter**
- a. Property Address: 117 Houston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/29/2018
 - c. Project: Extend existing 6' wooden privacy fence to front plane of house. Lower to 3' wooden fence beyond front plane. Resurface driveway.
- 7. Applicant: Richard and Diane Felis**
- a. Property Address: 1007 Church Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/30/2018
 - c. Project: Remove asbestos shingles and reroof with architectural shingles in slate.
- 8. Applicant: Jim Alston of Alston Fences on behalf of Erica Onagbola**
- a. Property Address: 106 Parker Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/31/2018
 - c. Project: Install 6' wooden dogeared fence along east and west perimeter of lot not to exceed front plane of house.
- 9. Applicant: Lee Wilson of Turner-Wilson Fence Company**
- a. Property Address: 405 Chatham Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/1/2018
 - c. Project: Construct 6' wooden fence on portion of southern perimeter of lot perpendicular to existing fencing.
- 10. Applicant: Linda Steele on behalf of the First Church of Christ, Scientist**
- a. Property Address: 944 Conti Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/1/2018
 - c. Project: Repaint white.
- 11. Applicant: Heyer Enterprises DBD GoPro on behalf of Brian and Elizabeth Blanche**
- a. Property Address: 1464 Church Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/2/2018
 - c. Project: Install columns on brick plinth bases to match existing in dimension and profile.
- 12. Applicant: Heyer Enterprises DBA Go Pro**
- a. Property Address: 258 Stocking Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/2/2018
 - c. Project: Reconstruct five columns to match historical photograph. Repair porch decking to match existing.
- 13. Applicant: William Coulson of Coulson Sheet Metal and Roofing, Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 217 Lanier Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/5/2018
 - c. Project: Repair tile roof to match existing.
- 14. Applicant: Michael Robertson on behalf of Neshawndra Henderson**
- a. Property Address: 1017 Old Shell Road
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/5/2018
 - c. Project: Construct 6' dogeared fence along south and west perimeter. Install vehicular gate along rear section of west perimeter.
- 15. Applicant: Carlton Dortch of Dortch, Figures and Son Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 56 S. Lafayette Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/5/2018
 - c. Project: Mothball and secure property. Paint boards to match existing house.
- 16. Applicant: Carlton Dortch of Dortch, Figures and Son Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 1005 Texas Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/5/2018
 - c. Project: Mothball and secure property. Paint boards to match existing house.

- 17.Applicant: Patrick Welk of Optera Creative/ Identity Signs**
- a. Property Address: 150 Government Street Suite 1000
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/6/2018
 - c. Project: Install 2'6"W x 3'H hanging blade sign composed of painted metal composite.
- 18.Applicant: Diane Day**
- a. Property Address: 1307 Old Shell Road
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/6/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles.
- 19.Applicant: LAMBYAK, LLC**
- a. Property Address: 704 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/8/2018
 - c. Project: Construct 12' wide by 4' high metal gate on northern perimeter of lot at vehicular entrance. Connect to 6' wooden dogeared fence on eastern and western perimeter of lot.
- 20.Applicant: Steve and Pamela Coffman**
- a. Property Address: 262 Stocking Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/6/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles. Repaint to match existing. Repair wood siding and trim to match existing in dimension, profile, and material.
- 21.Applicant: Alver and Dixie Carlson**
- a. Property Address: 1653 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/6/2018
 - c. Project: (Renewal of certificate dated 2-3-17) Repaint house in existing color scheme. Repair and replace deteriorated woodwork to match existing in material, profile and dimension. Reroof rear porch to asphalt or architectural shingles in autumn brown.
- 22.Applicant: Therese Morris**
- a. Property Address: 64 Bradford Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/14/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with GAF weatherwood architectural shingles.
- 23.Applicant: Paul Morris**
- a. Property Address: 123 Houston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/14/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with GAF weatherwood architectural shingles.
- 24.Applicant: Leroy Anderson**
- a. Property Address: 1055 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/15/2108
 - c. Project: Repair brick piers, replacing brick where necessary and using appropriate mortar mix. Type O mortar is appropriate for softer brick. Repair and replace sills.
- 25.Applicant: Larry Scott of Lit Cigar Lounge, Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 258 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/19/2018
 - c. Project: Allow one temporary banner a size of 12' in width and 3' in height.
- 26.Applicant: William Dueitt of Robert Dueitt Construction, LLC**
- a. Property Address: 106 Beverly Court
 - b. Date of Approval: 2/19/2018
 - c. Project: Repair and Replace to match existing Cedar Shakes. Match in dimension, profile and materials. Repair to match existing.

27.Applicant: Douglas B. Kearley of DBK, Inc.

- a. Property Address: 700 Government Street
- b. Date of Approval: 2/19/2018
- c. Project: Repair and replace deteriorated wood including columns, wood siding, and trim to match existing in profile, dimension, and material. Repair and replace metal and wood vents as needed. Repair and replace windows to match existing. In a later addition (sunroom) allow for aluminum clad windows if existing can not be repaired. Repair brick foundation joints with appropriate mortar on steps and ADA ramp. Install storm windows with pre-finished frames. Install metal striped awning on West elevation based on historic photograph.

28.Applicant: Jason Fowler

- a. Property Address: 30 S. Lafayette Street
- b. Date of Approval: 2/20/2018
- c. Project: Remove existing sidewalk and driveway materials. Install french drain and approved stone pavers/tiles to fit in footprint of previous sidewalk and driveway.

29.Applicant: John Rand of Rand Renovations and Rentals

- a. Property Address: 161-165 Houston Street
- b. Date of Approval: 2/21/2018
- c. Project: Repaint house in painter's gray. Porch deck will be intellectual gray. Repaint front door in seabreeze. Repair windows. Install new aluminum clad windows in sunroom located on rear northeast corner of house. Build shared 10' x 12' deck behind house. Repair existing driveways and install gravel parking pad in rear. Replace unoriginal doors to be appropriate in dimension and profile. Metal, wood or aluminum clad is an appropriate replacement material for doors. Relocate two HVAC units in the rear of duplex. Repair roof to match. On rear elevation, alter an existing window to a door. Alteration is not visible from public view.

30.Applicant: John Rand of Rand Renovations and Rentals on behalf of Sharyn Bohannon

- a. Property Address: 201 S. Georgia Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 2/21/2018
- c. Project: Replace tongue and groove deck and repaint to match.

31.Applicant: Uhn Kilson

- a. Property Address: 1511 Government Street
- b. Date of Approval: 2/22/2018
- c. Project: Replace old sign as existing-51.3 square feet wall sign.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2018-05-CA: 453 Dauphin Street

- a. Applicant: Mr. Douglas Kearley of DBK, Inc. on behalf of Mr. Hunter Adams
- b. Project: Construct gallery and alter fenestration.

APPROVED: CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED.

2. 2018-06-CA: 4-10 St. Emanuel Street

- a. Applicant: Mr. Paul Davis of PCDA on behalf of Ms. Kelly Arcenaux
- b. Project: Rehabilitation Related: Construct and install new storefront; Construct gallery; Repair historic fabric.

APPROVED AS AMENDED: CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

MS. LARGUE ANNOUNCED THE NEXT MEETING OF THE ARB WILL BE HELD ON MARCH 21, 2018.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

2018-05-CA: 453 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Mr. Douglas Kearley of DBK, Inc. on behalf of Mr. Hunter Adams
Received: 2/7/18
Meeting: 3/7/18

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: T5.1
Project: Construct gallery and alter fenestration.

BUILDING HISTORY

This building was completed in 1855. Then neighboring building at 451 Dauphin Street was completed contemporaneously.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property has last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on January 6, 2010 according to the MHDC vertical files. At that time, the applicants were granted a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to previously approved plans.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. Design it to reflect the time period of the historic structure.”
 - 2. “When reconstructing a porch, pay particular attention to matching the handrails, lower rails, balusters, decking, posts/ columns, proportions, and decorative details.”
 - 3. “Use construction that results in screening that respects the historic character of the building.”
 - 4. “Maintain the relationship of solids and voids (windows and doors) in an exterior wall as established by the historic building.”
 - 5. “Design a door and doorway to be compatible with the historic building.”

6. “Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.”
7. “In instances where there is a request to replace a building’s windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.”
8. “Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.”

C. Scope of Work (per submitted site plan):

1. North (façade) elevation
 - a. Construct a gallery.
 1. The gallery will be 7’4” in depth by 28’6” in width.
 2. A sequence of four round columnar posts will be employed to structurally support the upstairs deck.
 3. The upstairs deck will be wooden tongue and groove.
 4. Above the entablature a 42” metal railing will be employed.
 5. A *garde de fries* will be installed on the western end only.
 6. A set of wooden French doors will be installed in an existing window opening to access the balcony.
 - a. Doors will be located on the western inner bay.
 - b. Replace an existing door with new wooden door, frame, and transom on the first floor easternmost bay.
 - c. Repair existing wooden windows.
2. South (rear) Elevation
 - a. Install aluminum clad windows to match existing in dimension and profile.
 - b. Remove existing brick headers to install steel angles. Reinstall brick.
3. Install new metal gutter.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This building has been altered over the course of the 20th century. The 1901 Sanborn maps show that a wooden gallery fronted this property. In 2008, the construction of a gallery was approved. The proposed plans were revised in 2010 to exclude the construction of a balcony. The proposed location of the gallery would be on the front façade of the building. The construction of the gallery is responsive to the historical and architectural character of the building (See B1-2).

Fenestration changes called for by the proposed gallery are minimal. One window will be changed into a set of French doors and maintain the rhythm of second story fenestration (See B1-4). The door would be responsive to those accessing balconies (See B1-5). Windows on the front elevation would be repaired (See B1-6). Windows on the South (rear) elevation will be replaced with aluminum clad windows to match in dimension, profile, and configuration. Historic brick headers will be retained (See B1-8).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1-1), Staff does not believe the application will impair either the architectural or the historical character of the properties or district. Staff recommends approval of the application in full.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Douglas Kearley, representative for the applicant, was present to discuss the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion took place concurrently with the public testimony.

Mr. Oswalt welcomed the applicant's representative and asked if there were any comments, clarifications or questions he would like to make. Mr. Douglas stated the garde de fris would be installed on the western end of the gallery.

No further discussion from the Board ensued.

Mr. Oswalt opened the application to public comment. With no one to speak either for or against the application, Mr. Oswalt closed the period of public comment.

FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Roberts moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public testimony, the Board finds the facts in the Staff report, as written.

The motion received a second and was unanimously approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Roberts moved that, based upon the facts as approved by the Board, the application does not impair the historic integrity of the building and the district and that a Certificate of Appropriateness be issued.

The motion received a second and was approved unanimously.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD.

2018-06-CA: 4-10 St. Emanuel Street

Applicant: Paul Davis of PCDA on behalf of Ms. Kelly Arcenaux

Received: 2/19/218

Meeting: 3/7/18

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Commercial District

Classification: Contributing

Zoning: T5.2

Project: Restoration Related: Construct and install new storefront; Construct gallery;
Repair a historic fabric.

BUILDING HISTORY

This three story building at 10 St. Emanuel Street dates to circa 1907 and is known as the Lowenthal Building. Its neighboring property at 4-8 St. Emanuel, the Meyer Building, was constructed in 1869, but was heavily altered around the turn of the century and 1930. Alterations included changes to fenestration and surface treatment.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. 4-6 St. Emanuel last appeared before the Architectural Review Board in June 26, 2007 according to the MHDC vertical files. At that time plans were approved for the repair and replacement of existing windows on the upper stories. 10 St. Emanuel last appeared before the Architectural Review Board in February 19, 2014 according to the MHDC vertical files. At that time plans were approved to renovate the ground floor, replace upper story fenestration, and the install balconies.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “Upgrade existing materials using recognized preservation methods whenever possible.”
 - 2. “Removing original material diminishes the integrity of a historic property by reducing the percentage of building fabric that remains from the period of historic significance. Retaining the original material is always preferred. If this is not feasible, alternative materials may be considered.”
 - 3. “Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the material.”
 - 4. “Replace exterior finishes to match original in profile, dimension and materials.”
 - 5. “Remove only those materials which are deteriorated, and beyond reasonable repair.”
 - 6. “Use materials that are consistent with the architectural style of the structure.”

7. “Replacements should reflect the age and style of the building.”
8. “Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.”
9. “A doubled-paned or clad wood window may be considered as a replacement alternative only if the replacement matches the configuration, dimensions, and profiles of original windows.”
10. “Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include: wood sash and aluminum clad.”
11. “Historically accurate light patterns shall be employed. Use photographic, physical, and/or documentary evidence for the design.”
12. “Maintain the relationship of solids and voids (windows and doors) in an exterior wall as established by the historic building.”
13. “Retain the original openings, building material and proportions.”
14. “If required, replace original historic windows to be compatible with the windows on the original historic building.”
15. “Use a tempered glass window if required by the building code.”
16. “When restoring a building, use photographic evidence wherever possible.”
17. “Design a door and doorway to be compatible with the historic building.”
18. “The Architectural Review Board encourages the construction of contemporary buildings and additions that do not impair the integrity of Mobile’s historic neighborhoods or historic buildings.”
19. “Locate a new storefront in the same plane as it was historically.”
20. “Screen service panels and trash containers that must be attached to an exterior building wall.”
21. “If a modern doorway is created, use metal with anodized or painted finish or varnished or painted wood.”
22. “Replace a historic balcony or gallery where documentation exists of its previous existence.”
23. “Design a replacement balcony or gallery to reflect the design of the original building. The ARB will consider modern balconies.”
24. “Minimize the visual impact of metal bars or grills on a historic building.”
25. “Every reasonable effort should be made to protect and preserve the existing historic landscape features referenced in the various district nominations.”
26. “Design lighting that is in character with the building.”
27. “Softly illuminate an architectural feature if desired.”

C. Scope of Work (per submitted site plan):

1. Rehabilitate 10 St. Emanuel Street

- A. Renovate ground storefront located on the East elevation. .
 - i. Remove a later storefront system.
 - ii. Construct recessed storefront in center of elevation.
 - a. Pedestrian access will be located in the center and northern portion of the recessed storefront.
 - b. Doors will be glazed and paneled with sidelights and transom.
 - c. Southern portion will take the form of storefront system with paneled bulkhead, window, and transom above.
 - d. Doors and windows will be wood or aluminum clad.

- iii. Recessed portion will be flanked by wooden storefront system of paneled bulkhead, window and transom
 - B. Construct two story galleries on front façade.
 - i. First story gallery will be 13'0" in height.
 - ii. Second story gallery will be 26'0" in height.
 - iii. Gallery will be three bays and 6'1" in depth.
 - iv. Decks will be supported by 4" iron columns.
 - v. Wooden tongue and groove deck will be employed.
 - vi. Metal railing will be 3'6" in height and feature a decorative motif. Railing will be painted black.
 - C. Alter fenestration on East, West, and North elevations.
 - i. Construct a set of French doors with transom above in central bays of upper stories on East elevation.
 - ii. Windows on the East (façade) elevation will be changed to two-over-two true-divided light, double pane windows composed of wood or aluminum clad.
 - iii. Windows on third story of West (rear) elevation will be changed to two-over-two true-divided light, double pane windows composed of wood or aluminum clad.
 - iv. Garage roll up door on first floor West (rear) elevation will be infilled with brick. (A building directly abuts this portion of the elevation's first and second story).
 - v. Infill door and windows on second story West elevation with brick where building abuts elevation.
 - vi. Construct door opening second story of North (side) elevation. Door will be metal.
 - D. Clean, repair and repaint.
 - i. Paint will be approved at a later date on staff level.
 - ii. Clean and repair stucco to match existing.
 - E. Conduct additional site repairs and improvements.
 - i. Remove existing trees and lamp posts. Lamp posts will be returned to the City of Mobile.
 - ii. Replace existing gutter and downspout.
 - iii. Install LED strip lighting under architectural feature.
 - iv. Install LED deck lighting on East (façade) elevation above second story gallery.
- 2. *Rehabilitate 4-6 St. Emanuel Street*
 - A. Renovate ground storefront located on the East elevation. .
 - i. Remove a later storefront system.
 - ii. Construct pedestrian entrance taking the form of a double door with transom above. Door will be wood or aluminum clad.
 - iii. Construct a vehicular entrance south of pedestrian entrance using overhead paneled door with glass transoms above. Door will be wood or aluminum clad.
 - iv. Construct glazed and paneled storefront north of pedestrian entrance. Storefront will be wood or aluminum clad.
 - v. Outermost bays of ground floor will employ metal gate with metal grille above.
 - B. Construct two story galleries on front façade.
 - i. First story gallery will be 17'0" in height
 - ii. Second story gallery will be 30'0" in height.

- iii. Gallery will be five bays and 6'1" in depth.
 - iv. Decks will be supported by 6" iron columns.
 - v. Deck will be wooden tongue and groove.
 - vi. Metal railing will be 3'6" in height and feature with cable railings. Railing will be painted black.
- C. Alter fenestration on East and West elevations.
- i. Construct glazed and panel doors with transom above in upper story central bays
 - ii. Windows on East and West elevations will be changed to six-over-six true-divided light, double pane windows composed of wood or aluminum clad.
- D. Clean, repair and repaint.
- i. Clean and repair stucco to match existing.
 - ii. Paint to be approved at staff level.
- E. Conduct additional site repairs and improvements.
- v. Remove existing trees and lamp posts. Lamp posts will be returned to the City of Mobile.
 - vi. Install LED strip lighting under architectural feature.
 - vii. Install LED deck lighting on East (façade) elevation above second story gallery.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This application involves the rehabilitation, alteration of fenestration, addition of galleries, and site improvements for buildings located at 4-10 St. Emanuel Street. A similar version of the application was approved in February 19, 2014 for 10 St. Emanuel Street. Said approval also included the construction of new storefront and addition of balconies. The application up for review involves both properties.

With regard to the conservation and restoration of historic fabric, this project will address repair work. In accord with the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts, an overall policy of repair by patching and consolidation will be employed when and where possible (See B-3). Repairs and replacements would match as per profile, dimension and material (See B-4). Repairs would be consistent and reflective of the building (See B 3 & 4.).

This application calls for the alteration of fenestration. With regard to the windows in specific replacements will match the existing components (and in one instance whole) as per location, light configuration, detail, and material for historic materials (See B-11). 10 St. Emanuel does not possess any windows on the front façade. Photographic evidence provided guidance as to the light pattern of the proposed windows (B-11). In keeping with the Guidelines the proposed materials of aluminum clad and wood in a two-over-two light pattern is similar to the original (see B-10). 4-6 St. Emanuel has evidence of fenestration change in 1930 when six-over-three windows were removed and replaced by six-over-six windows. In 2007, a Certificate of Appropriateness was issued to repair or replace windows. The Design Review Guidelines state where historic windows are intact they should be repaired, rather than replaced (See B-8). Where windows are not in repairable condition replacements may be employed to match in dimension, profile, and material. However, aluminum clad or double paned wood can be considered if it appears similar to the original in texture, profile, dimension, finish and configuration. Based on photographic evidence and Certificate of Appropriateness issued, the amounts of historic windows intact are unknown (See B-9 and B-10). A recent site visit made showed evidence of minimal original sashes.

Regarding storefront, the design should be appropriate to the building (See B-7). The new storefront would be located in the same plane as historic examples (See B-19). Said composition of new storefront would be complementary to historic patterns and not remove any historic fabric. While composition responds to the historic nature of the building, modern materials of aluminum clad are available for use. Window openings will be altered to doors on the front elevation but in such a manner that the solid-to-void ratio remains (see B-12 and B-13).

In keeping the Design Review Guidelines, the addition of galleries is based off of earlier Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps (See B-22). The design for 10 St. Emanuel calls for a more decorative iron railing, while its neighboring property at 4-6 St. Emanuel calls for contemporary cable rail systems. While it is encouraged to employ galleries that reflect the historic nature of the building, modern galleries are considered (See B-23). Examples of modern umbrages include 20 Conception Street and 225 Dauphin Street.

Lamp posts and trees will be removed. Said lamp posts will be returned to the City of Mobile. LED strip lighting will be applied under existing architectural features (See B-27). A set of LED lamps will be installed over the second story gallery on both buildings. While the LED strip lighting is minimally obtrusive, the proposed lamps will be installed on façade and therefore more noticeable and not in keeping architecturally (See B-26).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B(1-26) and B(1-14 and 1-15) Staff believes the LED deck lighting for both properties and the wholesale replacement of windows for 4-6 St. Emanuel Street will impair either the architectural or the historical character of the properties or district. Staff does not recommend approval of the LED deck lighting. Regarding the windows, a minimal amount of the window elements remaining are original. Based on B(1-14) and B(1-15), staff recommends the approval of windows with impact rated or tempered glass wooden windows to match dimension and profile of existing.

Based on B (1-19), Staff does not believe the remainder of the application will impair either the architectural or the historical character of the properties or district. Staff recommends approval of the application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Paul Davis, representative for the applicant, and Ms. Kelly Arceneaux, owner, were present to discuss the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion took place concurrently with the public testimony.

Mr. Oswalt welcomed Mr. Davis and Ms. Arceneaux and asked if they had any questions, comments, or clarifications they would like to make. Mr. Davis commented the applicant would not have an issue leaving out the LED surface mounted lighting from the application.

Mr. Holmes inquired as to what the storefront would be composed of and if that would bring any issue with meeting wind resistant requirements. Mr. Davis stated the storefront at 10 St. Emanuel would be aluminum clad. He further explained the storefront at 4-6 St. Emanuel would be wood. Ms. Largue noted

aluminum clad storefront on the first floor of 4-6 St. Emanuel would be appropriate and within the guidelines. Mr. Davis stated he had leads on storefront doors and transoms which would meet code requirements.

Mr. Davis clarified for the Board that windows on 4-6 St. Emanuel will be wood. Ms. Largue noted that based on photographic evidence and the guidelines, double pane windows may be appropriate. Mr. Roberts commented storm windows can be installed on the interior to achieve more energy efficiency. Mr. Holmes suggested researching the availability of wood windows that would meet code requirements, and that if this could not be achieved to return to the Board with alternative option found. Mr. Stone noted manufacturers such as JELD-WEN manufacturer wooden windows that meet wind load requirements.

No further discussion from the Board ensued.

Mr. Oswalt opened the application to public comment. With no one to speak either for or against the application, Mr. Oswalt closed the period of public comment.

FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Roberts moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public testimony, the Board finds the facts in the Staff report, as amended, reflecting to exclude surface mounted LED lighting and to require wooden windows on 4-6 St. Emanuel Street.

The motion received a second and was unanimously approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Roberts moved that, based upon the facts as amended by the Board, the application does not impair the historic integrity of the building and the district and that a Certificate of Appropriateness be issued.

The motion received a second and was approved unanimously.