

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES

January 20, 2016 – 3:00 P.M.

Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Chair, Bradford Ladd, called the meeting to order at 3:00. Cart Blackwell, MHDC Staff, called the roll as follows:
Members Present: Bob Allen, Robert Brown, Catarina Echols, Kim Harden, Carolyn Hasser, Nick Holmes II, Bradford Ladd, Harris Oswalt, and Steve Stone,
Members Absent: Carolyn Hasser and Craig Roberts.
Staff Members Present: Cartledge W. Blackwell and Melissa Mutert.
2. Mr. Stone moved to approve the minutes for the December 2, 2015 meeting. The motion received a second and was unanimously approval.
3. Mr. Stone moved to approve midmonth COA's granted by Staff. Following the correction of the address for midmonth no. 25 (from Selma to Savannah Streets) and clarification as to no. 15, the motion received a second and was unanimously approval.

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS: APPROVED.

1. **Applicant: Restore Mobile**
 - a. Property Address: 1107 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/5/16
 - c. Project: Renewal of a Certificate of Appropriateness dated 3 December 2015. The scope of work calls for the construction of a single family residence (per submitted plans).
2. **Applicant: Hedge Law Firm**
 - a. Property Address: 1206 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/4/15
 - c. Project: Construct a wooden monument sign. Said sign meets the size (less than 50 square feet), material, lighting (none), and material standards as outlined in the Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts.
3. **Applicant: Wrico Signs**
 - a. Property Address: 1 South Royal Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/17/15
 - c. Project: Install commercial storefront awning and approval of final components of an ATM.
4. **Applicant: Matt LeMond**
 - a. Property Address: 10 Houston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/19/15
 - c. Project: Remove and replace hardscaping in the drives and walkways (as well as sections of the right of way per consideration by the Office of Right of Way).
5. **Applicant: Constance Walton**
 - a. Property Address: 13 South Julia Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/30/15
 - c. Project: Install simple metal rail on front steps.
6. **Applicant: Jackie Yates**
 - a. Property Address: 61 LeMoyne Place
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/9/15

- c. Project: Install a 10' x 12' storage unit in the rear of the property per submitted designs. The installation will not be visible from the public view. Said installation will be located so to conform to setback restrictions
- 7. Applicant: Elizabeth Carnahan**
- a. Property Address: 103 Levert Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/23/15
 - c. Project: Remove deteriorated windows. Replace said windows to match the existing as per material, construction, and light configuration.
- 8. Applicant: Bobby Gipson (dba) for Adline Clarke**
- a. Property Address: 155 South Broad Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/30/15
 - c. Project: Replacing existing 3-tab 20 year composition roof with a 30 year dimensional asphalt roof. Will replace fascia board and decking as needed.
- 9. Applicant: Lon Smith**
- a. Property Address: 156 Houston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/30/15
 - c. Project: Replace Asphalt roof with Fiberglass shingles. Replace wood lap siding with same materials. Tear down old garage that has rotten and a canopy over a fire pit. Repaint house with Fort Conde Grey-Beige.
- 10. Applicant: Renee Paul**
- a. Property Address: 200 S. Monterey St.
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/4/15
 - c. Project: Reroof house with asphalt shingle, slate color.
- 11. Applicant: Tina Foy**
- a. Property Address: 300 Dexter Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/16/15
 - c. Project: Remove old roof. Replace roof to consist of base sheet and modified cap sheet. Replace heater vent. Replace metal cap around top of house.
- 12. Applicant: Alabama Contemporary Art Center**
- a. Property Address: 301 Conti Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/9/15
 - c. Project: Install banners per submitted dimensions, materials, and designs (variance obtained and previously reviewed).
- 13. Applicant: Ann Brutkiewicz**
- a. Property Address: 355 State Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/17/15
 - c. Project: Paint body white, trim gray, foundation dark green.
- 14. Applicant: Grady Dortch**
- a. Property Address: 460 George Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/1/15
 - c. Project: Demolish house, remove debris.
- 15. Applicant: Chip Noland**
- a. Property Address: 604 Eslava Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/14/15
 - c. Project: Renew an expired CoA calling for an addition.
- 16. Applicant: Consolidated Fence Company for the Historic Restoration Society**
- a. Property Address: 901 – 903 Dauphin Street and 2 – 14 South Broad Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/7/15
 - c. Project: Remove construction fencing from the aforementioned lots. Install a six foot aluminum fence per the approved designs on the location of the fencing removed.

- 17. Applicant: Macio Simao**
- a. Property Address: 961 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/4/16
 - c. Project: This COA updates that of May 7, 2014. Owner to repair and install period appropriate sash windows, install new six foot tall privacy fence, reroof with 5V metal.
- 18. Applicant: Randolph Wilson**
- a. Property Address: 1004 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/4/15
 - c. Project: This COA amends that of March 9, 2015. Body of house will be painted tan Trim will be with light tan trim.
- 19. Applicant: Melanie and Yves Stommel**
- a. Property Address: 1055 New Saint Francis Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/3/15
 - c. Project: Repair and when necessary replace deteriorated woodwork to match the existing as per profile, dimension, and material. Repaint per the existing color scheme. Install a four foot iron fence in the front yard.
- 20. Applicant: Melissa Kearley**
- a. Property Address: 1136 Montauk Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/1/15
 - c. Project: Remove last remains of an interior ridgeline chimney stack.
- 21. Applicant: Reginald Chambliss**
- a. Property Address: 1167 Texas Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/14/15
 - c. Project: Reroof, paint, and replace rotten wood as needed.
- 22. Applicant: Jaime and Sydney Betze**
- a. Property Address: 1210 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/14/15
 - c. Project: Following up on previously approved, but expired plans, remove interior ridgeline chimney stacks.
- 23. Applicant: Jennifer Lindall**
- a. Property Address: 1557 Blair Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 12/7/15
 - c. Project: Remove deteriorated woodwork to match existing in profile, dimension, and detail. Remove later porch screening. Paint house per existing color scheme. Reroof with asphalt shingles and repave driveway
- 24. Applicant: Jessica Kirkland of Alexander Shunnarah**
- a. Property Address: 150 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/8/16
 - c. Project: Install signage. Said signage (per submitted plans) meets historical and DDD Guidelines.
- 25. Applicant: Buzz Rummel**
- a. Property Address: 964 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 1/7/16
 - c. Project: Paint the building; body Sylph (pale pink); trim white; deck gray.

26. Applicant: Hedge Law Firm

- a. Property Address: 1206 Dauphin Street
- b. Date of Approval: 1/4/16
- c. Project: Construct a wooden monument sign. Said sign meets the size (less than 50 square feet), material, lighting (none), and material standards as outlined in the Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts.

27. Applicant: Alver Carlson

- a. Property Address: 1653 Dauphin Street
- b. Date of Approval: 1/8/16
- c. Project: Paint house, body Hotel Street St. Francis, the trim and accents Flaming Torch, shutters brown, columns and balustrade white. Repair/replace deteriorated woodwork to match existing in material, profile and dimension. Reroof to match the existing. Remove fretwork added in the 1980s.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2012-4-CA: 564 Dauphin Street

- a. Applicant: Patrick Tolbert and Allan Williams with Dagley Engineers for Matt LeMond
- b. Project: Renovation – Renovate a Mid Century Commercial Façade.
APPROVED AS AMMENDED. CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Historic Guidelines

Nore Winter and Brad Johnson of Winter & Company apprised the Board of progress of the of the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts and Conservation District Guidelines/Template. Mr. Ladd thanked Mr. Winter and Mr. Johnson for their efforts. He noted that his involvement with the Guidelines went back ten years. Other members dated the project back considerably earlier. The Board was informed to provide final comments no later than two weeks from the date of the present meeting. Mr. Blackwell said that he would compile all comments into one document which would be sent to Winter & Company no later than two weeks after the aforementioned Board cutoff date for final comments. The Board was informed that the final document would go before the MHDC in April or May for adoption.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

2016-01-CA: 564 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Patrick Tolbert and Allan Williams with Dagley Engineers for Matt LeMond
Received: 12/8/16 * Not reviewed by CRC until 1/7/16
Meeting: 1/20/16

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Commercial
Classification: Non-Contributing
Zoning: T5-1 (DDD)
Project: Renovation – Renovate a Mid Century Commercial Façade.

BUILDING HISTORY

This unit is one of a row of five storefront units constructed during the middle third of the 20th Century. Previously, a row of two-story brick commercial buildings occupied the site.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on November 21, 2012. At that time, the Board approved the painting of a mural on the west wall of the property’s westernmost unit. With this application, the applicant’s tenant proposes the renovation of one of the building’s easternmost unit. This application follows up on two rounds of review by the City of Mobile’s Certified Review Committee (CRC). The applicant enacted all of the recommendations CRC members made at the first meeting in an application that was approved on the property’s second appearance before said Committee (official approval on 7 January 2016).
- B. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Historic Rehabilitation and the Lower Dauphin Commercial District Guidelines state , in pertinent part:
 - 1. “New work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”
 - 2. “New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”
 - 3. “Maintaining recessed entries is also an important design element. The rhythm of recessed entrances on the street contributes to the visual continuity.”

C. Scope of Work (per submitted plans):

1. Remove plyboard panels and a window unit above the storefront unit's door.
2. Install/expose glass in the aforementioned two part transom.
3. Replace the existing double doors with new tempered glass doors.
4. Remove two large glass panels from the storefront window.
5. Install a retractable glass and metal door within the location of the aforementioned glass panels occupying the storefront window.
6. Place a counter and stools in advance of the envisioned storefront window area.
7. A narrow stucco surround will extend around the glazed opening.
8. Install a canvas awning that will extend the length of the facade.
9. Install three goose neck lamps on the facade.

CLARIFICATIONS/REQUESTS

1. Clarify the materials and construction of the counter (Will it be engaged to or independent of the bulkhead which it fronts?).

STAFF ANALYSIS

This application involves the renovation of one of five units comprising a single-story commercial terrace. The application was first reviewed by the Downtown Development District's (DDD) Certified Review Committee (CRC) in the Fall of 2015. The initial application called for the removal of the subject unit's angled bulkhead and the installation of a new storefront within the confines of a new storefront set parallel to Dauphin Street. Three of the five units feature angled entry sequences. The applicant was directed to find a solution that preserved the bulkhead and retained the openness of the storefront window. On January 7, 2016, the applicant and his design professionals received approval for plans that realized the CRC's requests. The solution calls for the use of rolling glazed opening atop the character defining angled bulkhead. The design was further enhanced by the applicant's amenability to the use of true stucco for the surround encasing the rolling glazed opening and the adjustment of the location of an awning.

The Secretary of Interior Standards state that new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment (See B-1.). In compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the proposed remodeling is respectful of the Mid-20th Century character and date of the building, while simultaneously "reading" as a later alteration. Additionally, the alterations are designed so if undertaken they can be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired (See B-3.). The design solution to the intended use, a side walk accessed dining counter, was successfully redesigned so to retain a recessed entry which is a defining feature of not only the individual unit, but also each unit of the whole building and the building as a whole (See B-3.).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1-3), Staff does not believe this application will impair either the architectural or the historical character of the Lower Dauphin Commercial Historic District. Staff recommends approval of this application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Matthew LeMond and Allen Williams were present to discuss the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion took place concurrently with the public testimony. Mr. Ladd welcomed the applicant and his representatives. He thanked Mr. LeMond for his successful efforts of revitalizing a swath of building on and the general feel of a section of Dauphin Street. Mr. Ladd then asked Mr. LeMond and Mr. Williams if they had any clarifications to address, questions to ask, or comments to make.

Mr. LeMond replied no, but he added he and his design professionals had worked closely with the Certified Review Committee (CRC) and the Staff of the Mobile Historic Development Commission (MHDC) to achieve a design that was distinctive, yet fully in keeping with the area's historic context.

Mr. Ladd asked his fellow Board members if they had any questions or concerns for the applicant and his representatives.

Mr. Stone asked for clarification as to the material requests listed at the close of the Staff Report, as well as the doors and the roll up window. He also asked for explanation as to the constructional nature of the roll up door. Mr. Williams addressed Mr. Stone's queries. He explained that counter would be made of concrete and chairs would be wood. As to the doors and window, Mr. Williams stated that the double door unit would be wooden and the window unit would be aluminum. Ms. Harden provided further clarification.

Mr. Ladd asked his fellow Board members if they had any additional questions for the applicant and his representative. No further questions or comments ensued from the Board.

Mr. Ladd asked if there was anyone from the audience who wished to speak either for or against the application. Upon hearing no response, Mr. Ladd closed the period of public comment.

FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Stone moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public testimony, the Board finds the facts in the Staff report, amending facts to note the following material clarifications:

Counter – concrete
Doors - wooden
Roll Up Window – aluminum
Chairs - wooden

The motion received a second and was unanimously approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Stone moved that, based upon the facts as amended by the Board, the application does not impair the historic integrity of the district or the building and that a Certificate of Appropriateness be issued.

The motion received a second and was unanimously approved.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 1/20/17.