

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
May 17, 2023 – 3:00 P.M.
Auditorium, Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Chair, Ms. Catarina Echols, called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm. Christine Dawson, Historic Development staff, called the roll as follows.

Members Present: Cart Blackwell (alternate), Catarina Echols, Karrie Maurin, Craig Roberts, Joseph Rodrigues, and Gyspie Van Antwerp

Members Absent: Janelle Adams (alternate), Bob Allen, Abby Davis, Kimberly Harden, Kathleen Huffman (alternate), Andre Rathle, and Jim Wagoner

Staff Members Present: Annie Allen, Christine Dawson, Marion McElroy, John Sledge, Kim Thomas, and Meredith Wilson

2. Mr. Roberts moved to approve the minutes from the May 3, 2023 meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Van Antwerp and approved unanimously.
3. Mr. Roberts moved to approve the Mid-Month COAs granted by Staff. The motion was seconded by Ms. Van Antwerp and approved unanimously.

B. MID-MONTH APPROVALS - APPROVED

1. Applicant: Timothy Maness

- a. Property Address: 260 Michigan Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 04/24/2023
- c. Project: Install (2) 9-foot sections of horizontal slat fence to enclose side yard, each running from the north elevation of the building to existing privacy fence on northern property line.

2. Applicant: Sheri Fisher

- a. Property Address: 262 South Broad Street
- b. Date of Approval: 04/26/2023
- c. Project: 1) Reroof residence and storage structure in-kind with matching color.
2) Repair and replace damaged wood on roof, soffit, and upper porch railing with in-kind materials to match existing design/profiles.
3) Repaint exterior in colors to match existing as follows: Palmetto Street bronze; Savannah Street dark brown (for porch columns and upper balcony railings); Devoe Thornwood (for smooth stones) and Devoe haze green (for rough stones).

3. Applicant: Pro Roofing Solutions, Inc.

- a. Property Address: 216 South Catherine Street
- b. Date of Approval: 04/27/2023
- c. Project: Reroof in-kind with Tamko Titan XT architectural shingles in Shadow Grey

4. Applicant: Pro Roofing Solutions, Inc.

- a. Property Address: 212 South Catherine Street
- b. Date of Approval: 04/27/2023

- c. Project: Reroof in-kind with Tamko Titan XT architectural shingles in Shadow Grey
- 5. Applicant: Zito/Russell Architects**
- a. Property Address: 1255 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 04/28/2023
 - c. Project: 1) Expand existing parking lot located on north side of Caroline St.
 - a) Remove concrete and asphalt at NW corner of Caroline St. and S. Georgia (behind fence). Resurface, install new curb and gutter, and restripe parking spots.
 - b) Remove concrete along east side of driveway (former S. Georgia Ave. ROW). Install new concrete curbs and concrete paving.
 - c) Remove 70' of existing curb and gutter at north end of driveway (former S. Georgia Ave. ROW). Install new concrete curbs and paving.
 - d) Remove existing curb and grass island at west side of drive. Install concrete to match existing grade.
 - 2) Relocate existing pedestrian light pole, add two new area lights mounted to building (to match existing), and install two new area lights mounted on a single pole, per submitted plans.
- 6. Applicant: Cato Services LLC**
- a. Property Address: 358 Breamwood Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/02/2023
 - c. Project: 1) Paint exterior: siding - Chatham Street Blue; wood trim - white
 - 2) Remove existing chain link fence, and replace with 36" tall wood picket fence, increasing to 6 feet behind the front plane of the house.
- 7. Applicant: Rata Investments LLC**
- a. Property Address: 755 Monroe Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/03/2023
 - c. Project: Install a walk-in cooler (8'x8') adjacent to east wall of existing structure, per submitted plans.
- 8. Applicant: Mitchell Construction LLC**
- a. Property Address: 309 West Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/03/2023
 - c. Project: Termite damage repair to include:
 - 1) Detach and reset window at east end of south elevation, 2nd floor.
 - 2) Detach and reset 2 windows at south end of east elevation, 2nd floor.
 - 3) Detach and reset window at north end of east elevation, 2nd floor.
 - 4) Detach and reset two (2) windows at south end of east elevation, 1st floor.
 - 5) Tile roof repair to match existing on east elevation.
- 9. Applicant: Bayside Roofing**
- a. Property Address: 12 North Monterey Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/03/2023
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with shingles in Weathered Wood color.
- 10. Applicant: Integrity Maintenance LLC (BLD)**
- a. Property Address: 114 North Julia Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/04/2023
 - c. Project: 1) Repair eaves/ceiling of front porch in-kind.
 - 2) Repaint (all colors Valspar): Body and porch floor-gray; trim & accents-beige
- 11. Applicant: Robert Allen**
- a. Property Address: 957 Augusta Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 05/04/2023

- c. Project: 1) Repair westernmost front porch support in-kind.
2) Repaint front of house in same colors.

12. Applicant: Diversified Roofing Service Inc.

- a. Property Address: 150 Government Street
- b. Date of Approval: 05/05/2023
- c. Project: Reroof in-kind four sections of the gable roof (center sections) with GAF Timberline shingles. Color: Shakewood

13. Applicant: Sheri Fisher

- a. Property Address: 262 Broad Street
- b. Date of Approval: 05/08/2023
- c. Project: 1) Install a shotcrete/gunite plunge pool measuring 12' x 12'.
2) The pool will be surrounded by stone pavers on the north, east, and south sides. A bond wall with a water feature will border the west side (per submitted plans).

14. Applicant: Pro Roofing Solutions Inc.

- a. Property Address: 306 McDonald Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 05/08/2023
- c. Project: Reroof in-kind with Tamko Architectural Shingles. Color: Titan XT-Shadow Grey

15. Applicant: Amberley Dearmon

- a. Property Address: 208 South Ann Street
- b. Date of Approval: 05/08/2023
- c. Project: 1) Repaint body of home in one of the following colors (all Benjamin Moore): Kendall Charcoal, Raccoon Fur, or Witching Hour
2) Repaint trim, rafters, fascia, columns, and soffits in one of the following colors (all Sherwin Williams): Greek Villa or Origami White
3) Remove green paint from brick foundation, repair damaged areas to mortar, apply German Schmeer treatment
4) Remove non-historic shutters
5) Repair and refurbish front entry door to its original condition.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2023-27-CA: 1211 Selma Street

- a. Applicant: Douglas Kearley on behalf of Brent and Sally Ericson
- b. Project: Construct 1 ½ story guest house at rear of lot

APPROVED - CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED

2. 2023-28-CA: 114 N. Julia Street

- a. Applicant: Jason Carter
- b. Project: After-the-Fact Approval: Installation of vinyl windows on façade

APPROVED - CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED

D. OTHER BUSINESS

- 1. Design Guidelines Committee presentation to ARB
- 2. The next ARB meeting is scheduled for June 7, 2023.

Public comment regarding items on this agenda will be accepted via e-mail (mhdc@cityofmobile.org) or USPS (Mobile Historic Development Commission, P.O. Box 1827, Mobile, AL 36633) until 5PM on Tuesday, May 16, 2023. Please include your name, home address, and the item number about which you are writing.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

ADDRESS	1211 Selma Street	APPLICATION NO.	2023-27-CA
SUMMARY OF REQUEST	Construct 1 ½ story guest house at rear of lot		
APPLICANT	Douglas Kearley	OWNER, IF OTHER	Brent and Sally Ericson
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Oakleigh Garden	MEETING DATE	05/17/2023
CLASSIFICATION	Contributing	REVIEWER	Annie Allen

DISTRICT/PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Oakleigh Garden Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1972 under Criteria A (historic significance) and C (architectural significance) for its local significance in the areas of architecture, landscape architecture, and planning and development. The district is significant for its high concentration of 19th- and 20th-century architectural types and styles and significant in the area of landscape architecture for its canopies of live oaks planted from 1850 to 1910. The district is significant in the area of planning and development as the location of Washington Square, one of only two antebellum public parks remaining in Mobile. The district was expanded in 1984, and an updated nomination was approved in 2016.

The two-story structure at 1211 Selma Street is a frame Queen Anne residence with Free Classic detailing. According to MHDC records, it was constructed c. 1908. The building retains most of its original character with the addition of a front porch railing and a two-story rear addition.

This property has appeared before the Architectural Review Board three (3) times. In 2001, the Board approved the installation of a wood porch rail at the front porch and upper deck, along with the construction of a two-story rear addition. In 2003, a COA was granted for the construction of a rear addition. In 2006, a COA was granted to enclose the rear porch.

SCOPE OF WORK (per submitted application)

1. Construct a 1 ½ story guest house.
 - a. The structure would measure approximately 40’ wide by 24’ deep. It would sit south (behind) of the main structure, approximately 3’-0” off the rear (south) property line. Side yard setbacks on the east and west would measure 3’-0” and 7’-0” respectively.
 - b. A side-gabled roof clad in fiberglass/asphalt dimensional shingles would top the structure. The structure would measure approximately 21’-0” at the apex of the gable roof.
 - c. The structure would be of frame construction and would be clad in cementitious wood siding with a 5” reveal. Cornices and 4” corner boards would also be of cementitious wood.
 - d. The foundation would be an 8” cement slab on grade.
 - e. A 12’-0” wide shed roof cantilevered bump out would project 4’-0” from the center of the north façade, creating a porch below which would shield a pair of single light doors with transom above. The porch would be supported by four 8” square cementitious wood columns with caps.
 - f. Fenestration would be as follows:

All windows would be one-over-one aluminum clad wood; the pair of single light doors with transom would be aluminum clad wood; two panel doors (one on the east end of the north façade and one on the north end of the west elevation) would be fiberglass.

g. The elevations would appear as follows:

North façade (from east to west)

One (1) 3'-0" wide by 6'-8" high panel door would sit under a 4'-0" wide by 3'-0" deep wood canopy supported with two wood brackets; one (1) 4'-0" wide by 4'-0" deep concrete slab stoop accessing the panel door; one (1) paired window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high; pair of single-lite doors measuring 6'-0" wide by 8'-6" high with 6'-0" wide single-lite transom above; one (1) paired window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high. One (1) paired window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high centered on the second story bump out.

South elevation

No fenestration is proposed for this elevation.

East elevation (from south to north)

One (1) paired window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high would be centered on the second story gable end.

West elevation (from north to south)

One (1) 3'-0" wide by 6'-8" high panel door would sit under a 4'-0" wide by 3'-0" deep wood canopy supported with two wood brackets; one (1) 4'-0" wide by 4'-0" deep concrete slab stoop accessing the panel door; one (1) paired window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high; one (1) single window measuring 1'-6" wide by 3'-0" high.

One (1) double window unit measuring 6'-0" wide by 5'-6" high would be centered on the second story gable end.

STAFF REPORT

A. Applicable standards from the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts* (Guidelines):

1. 9.1 Design an accessory structure to be subordinate in scale to that of the primary structure.
 - If a proposed accessory structure is larger than the size of typical historic accessory structures in the district, break up the mass of the larger structure into smaller modules that reflect traditional accessory structures.
2. 9.2 Locate a new accessory structure in line with other visible accessory structures in the district.
 - These are traditionally located at the rear of a lot.

ACCEPTABLE ACCESSORY STRUCTURE MATERIALS Materials that are compatible with the historic district in scale and character are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood frame
- Masonry
- Cement-based fiber siding
- Installations (Pre-made store-bought sheds, provided they are minimally visible from public areas)

UNACCEPTABLE ACCESSORY STRUCTURE MATERIALS Materials that are not compatible with the historic district in scale and character are unacceptable. These often include:

- Metal (except for a greenhouse)
- Plastic (except for a greenhouse)
- Fiberglass (except for a greenhouse)

B. Staff Analysis

The application under review seeks approval for the construction of an office/guesthouse accessory structure.

In regard to scale, the *Guidelines* state that accessory structures be subordinate in size to the main structure (A.1). The proposed building would encompass 1008 square feet, making it less than half of that of the primary dwelling on the lot which is 2227 square feet. Also, subordinate is the projected footprint of the office/guesthouse which would be 960 square feet as opposed to the main home's 1825 square feet. The proposed one-and-a-half story structure would measure approximately 16'-0" to the top of the wall plate, making it inferior in height to the main two-story dwelling. At one-and-a-half stories, the structure would be taller than many historic accessory structures. However, there is evidence of several historic two-story ancillary buildings (designated as both 'automobile' and 'domestic' and some as mixed use) in the immediate vicinity. The 1925 Sanborn map presents examples of such structures extant on lots similar in size to the subject lot at 1206 Texas; 202, 302, and 310 S. Georgia, and 305 S. Ann Street.

The proposed traditional placement of the structure at the rear of the lot complies with the *Guidelines*' directives. (A.2)

In addition to these *Guidelines* specific to accessory structures, accessory structures are meant to adhere to guidelines set up for new residential construction in historic districts. Within this context, the proposed office/guesthouse complies with the *Guidelines* in all areas including placement and orientation, massing and scale, and materials and finishes.

C. Summary of Analysis

- The application proposes the construction of a one-and-a-half story office/guesthouse at 1211 Selma Street.
- The proposed design falls within the *Guidelines*' directives in regard to scale, location, design, ornamentation, and materials.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on Section B above, Staff believes that the construction of a one-and-a-half story office/guesthouse at 1211 Selma Street would not impair the architectural or historic character of the subject property or the surrounding district. Staff recommends approval of the application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Douglas Kearley was present to discuss the application. He stated that he had nothing to add.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Dawson addressed a zoning question that had been previously submitted by a Board member, stating that under the R-1 zoning code, a secondary structure including dining, bathing, and sleeping spaces are not allowed if the structure also includes a food cooking appliance like an oven or stove. She added that, per the drawings submitted, this building does not consist of a food preparation appliance, so would be allowed under the R-1 zoning code.

Mr. Rodrigues asked if photos of the main residence were included in the application and presentation.

Mr. Kearley responded that they were.

FINDING FACTS

Mr. Roberts moved that, based on the evidence presented in the application, the Board finds the facts in the Staff's report.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Blackwell and approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on the facts approved by the Board, the application does not impair the architectural and historic character of the property or the district, and should be granted a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

ADDRESS	114 N. Julia Street	APPLICATION NO.	2023-28-CA
SUMMARY OF REQUEST	After-the-Fact: Replace four (6) wood windows and two (2) aluminum windows with vinyl windows on the west and north elevations		
APPLICANT	Jason Carter	OWNER, IF OTHER	
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Old Dauphin Way	MEETING DATE	05/17/2023
CLASSIFICATION	Non-Contributing	REVIEWER	Annie Allen

DISTRICT/PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The subject two-story, side-gabled concrete block structure was constructed c. 1945. It was originally a smaller square structure. The property has undergone several alterations to the main structure’s west-facing façade which include two modern additions and a front porch.

This property has never before appeared before the Architectural Review Board.

SCOPE OF WORK (per submitted application)

1. Remove eight (8) existing wood windows located on the north and west elevations.
2. Replace with simulated divided-light vinyl six-over-six windows, to match existing window openings.

STAFF REPORT

A. Applicable standards from the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts* (Guidelines):

1. **6.33** Design window alterations and windows on new additions to non-historic structures to be compatible with the neighborhood.
 - Use a material and window type that is similar to those seen historically in the neighborhood. Tempered glass will be considered when required by the Mobile Code of Ordinances.

B. Staff Analysis

This application seeks an after-the-fact approval for the replacement of eight (8) deteriorated six-over-six wood and aluminum windows with vinyl six-over-six windows. Windows which were replaced are on the west facing façade and the north elevation.

The subject house was constructed c. 1945. The structure is represented on the 1956 overlay of the Sanborn map as a square structure smaller in footprint than the existing. An aerial photo from 1952

demonstrates an additional small structure sitting forward of the existing, which is not shown on the 1956 Sanborn overlay. The existing façade consists of two additions. Aerial photography reveals that the northwest portion of the existing façade was extant c.1980. Therefore, the southwest portion and the current front porch are post-1980 additions.

The *Guidelines* advise, “Design window alterations...to non-historic structures to be compatible with the neighborhood.” (A.1) Although the vinyl six-over-six windows are not consistent in material with windows seen in the district, they do retain the lite pattern and size of the former windows. Additionally, in this case, the context of the subject structure should be taken into account. The building is a non-historic and non-contributing structure of no architectural significance. The numerous aforementioned alterations establish that this property will never be considered contributing to the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The improvements being implemented by the applicant will serve to maintain the existing historic development pattern on the street while providing housing options, rather than risk the disruption of the established rhythm with demolition followed by potentially less compatible infill construction or a vacant lot.

C. Summary of Analysis

- The house at 114 N Julia is a non-historic and non-contributing resource in the Old Dauphin Way historic district which has been heavily altered.
- The applicant has replaced eight (8) wood and aluminum six-over-six windows with vinyl six-over-six windows along the west and north elevations which fit the existing openings with minimal and visually insignificant fill along the tops of the openings.
- Vinyl is not considered an approved window material for Mobile’s historic districts.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on Section B above, Staff believes, given the permanent non-contributing status of the subject property, along with its heavily altered state and architectural insignificance, the proposed replacement of eight (8) existing six-over-six wood and aluminum windows with vinyl six-over-six windows does not impair the architectural or historic character of the surrounding district. Staff recommends approval of the application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Jason Carter was present to discuss the application. He stated that he had nothing to add.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had no comments

FINDING FACTS

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on the evidence presented in the application, the Board finds the facts in the Staff’s report.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Rodrigues and was passed with a 5 to 1 vote, with Ms. Van Antwerp opposed.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on the facts approved by the Board, and for reasons of the building’s non-historic and permanent non-contributing status, that the application would not impair the architectural and historic character of the surrounding district, and a Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted.

Mr. Rodrigues seconded the motion, and it was passed with a 5 to 1 vote, with Ms. Van Antwerp opposed.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

The Board discussed the finalized proposed revisions to the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts* in relation to windows.

The Board accepted the changes to the *Guidelines* as proposed by the Design Review Guidelines Committee.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:17pm.

These minutes were approved by the ARB on June 7, 2023.