

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
June 15, 2022 – 3:00 P.M.
Multi-Purpose Room, Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Vice Chair, Jim Wagoner, called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. Christine Dawson, Historic Development staff, called the roll as follows.

Members Present: Janelle Adams (alternate), Bob Allen, Cart Blackwell (alternate), Craig Roberts, Joseph Rodrigues, Gypsie Van Antwerp and Jim Wagoner

Members Absent: Abby Davis, Catarina Echols, Kimberly Harden, Kathleen Huffman (alternate), Karrie Maurin and Andre Rathle

Staff Members Present: Annie Allen, Bridget Daniel, Christine Dawson, Chris Kern, Marion McElroy, and John Sledge

2. Mr. Blackwell moved to approve the minutes from the May 18, 2022 meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Rodrigues and approved unanimously.
3. Mr. Roberts moved to approve the Mid-Month COAs granted by Staff. The motion was seconded by Ms. Van Antwerp and approved unanimously.

MID-MONTH APPROVALS - APPROVED

1. Applicant: Professional Roofing & Construction LLC

- a. Property Address: 52 North Reed Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 5/10/2022
- c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in charcoal color.

2. Applicant: Donna Flowers

- a. Property Address: 308 Michigan Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 5/10/2022
- c. Project: 1.) Remove flaking paint on one window; sand, prime, and paint wood Sherwin Williams West Highland White.
2.) Paint front door Sherwin Williams Spanish Toile.
3.) Restore metal railings to front porch steps and return them to original white color. Railings to be painted Sherwin Williams West Highland White. Project involves removal of old layers of paint, repair of metal, conditioning of metal, priming, and painting.

3. Applicant: Walcott Adams Verneuille Architects, Inc.

- a. Property Address: 5 North Royal Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
- c. Project: 1. Install two (2) signs in door glass (vinyl, 2'-1"x5'-1"); one showing hours of operation, one showing business name and logo.
2. Install one sign in transom (vinyl, 3'-10 1/4"x2'-0"); "Merchants & Marine Bank".

4. Applicant: Walcott Adams Verneuille Architects, Inc.

- a. Property Address: 5 North Royal Street

- b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Install one (1) 1'-9"x2'-0" aluminum hanging blade sign to south of business entrance. "Merchants & Marine Bank".
- 5. Applicant: Walcott Adams Verneuille Architects, Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 9 North Royal Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Install one (1) 5'-2"x8" aluminum wall sign over ATM; "Merchants & Marine Bank".
- 6. Applicant: Walcott Adams Verneuille Architects, Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 9 North Royal Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Install one (1) 21"x21" metal-coated HDU sign on north side of parking lot entrance. "Formerly at this location: Constantine's, Mobile's finest restaurant; This site is the former location of Constantine's, a beloved Greek restaurant founded by Constantine Nicholas Panayiotou in the early 1930's [sic]. Merchants & Marine Bank".
- 7. Applicant: Mack Lewis Contractor Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 1208 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Remove existing damaged front porch flooring. Repair/replace any damaged joists. Install new 5/4 x 4" KDAT T&G flooring to match existing. Paint to match existing color.
- 8. Applicant: Farris Properties**
- a. Property Address: 1138 Montauk Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Repair/replace existing 6' wood privacy fence in back yard.
- 9. Applicant: Data Capture Consultants, Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 505 Church Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/12/2022
 - c. Project: Repair/replace rotten wood on front porch and side of building. Clapboards to be of wood and of same dimension and profile as existing; beaded board in porch ceiling to match existing; replace rotten porch railing with MHDC stock design, 1" square balusters as per drawing.
- 10. Applicant: Keven Shaw**
- a. Property Address: 106 South Georgia Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/13/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in charcoal color.
- 11. Applicant: The Construction Expert LLC d/b/a Mobile Roofing & Construction**
- a. Property Address: 950 Charleston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/16/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with black shingles.
- 12. Applicant: Melissa Callier**
- a. Property Address: 1561 Eslava Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/17/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with shingles in charcoal black.
- 13. Applicant: Derek & Torry May Mitchell**
- a. Property Address: 1019 Caroline Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/18/2022
 - c. Project: Replace windows and doors; repair/replace lap siding, eaves as necessary to match existing, repaint to match.

- 14. Applicant: Gulf Construction & Roofing**
 - a. Property Address: 1559 Monterey Place
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/18/2022
 - c. Project: Patch roof in-kind.
- 15. Applicant: Damon Lett Roofing**
 - a. Property Address: 262 Marine Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/19/2022
 - c. Project: Re-roof in-kind, using architectural shingles in black.
- 16. Applicant: Christopher/ Laurel Thomas**
 - a. Property Address: 1205 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/19/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with composition shingles in gray.
- 17. Applicant: Leonard E. Dunning A**
 - a. Property Address: 367 West Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/19/2022
 - c. Project: Paint wood elements white to match existing.
- 18. Applicant: Kay Spencer**
 - a. Property Address: 1608 Monterey Place
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/20/2022
 - c. Project: Low pressure wash, repaint in-kind to match existing colors.
- 19. Applicant: Ethos General Contractors LLC**
 - a. Property Address: 150 South Monterey Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/23/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with timberline hdz in weathered wood color.
- 20. Applicant: Cynthia Kirksey Johnson**
 - a. Property Address: 115 North Catherine Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/23/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in grey.
- 21. Applicant: Mark Alan Saffle**
 - a. Property Address: 22 South Reed Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/24/2022
 - c. Project: Install 10'x20' pool in rear yard.
- 22. Applicant: GoPro Home Services**
 - a. Property Address: 104 South Catherine Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/24/2022
 - c. Project: Replace cracked or damaged siding boards to match existing in material, profile, and dimension, and paint house to match.
- 23. Applicant: JD Titan, LLC**
 - a. Property Address: 104 South Catherine Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/24/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof with asphalt laminated shingles in Weathered Wood color
- 24. Applicant: Thomas Industries Inc.**
 - a. Property Address: 451 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/24/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof the steep slope portion of the roof with dimensional shingles in color to match existing.
- 25. Applicant: Joseph Hughey, Hughey Electrical**
 - a. Property Address: 952 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/24/2022 (reissue of COA originally issued 6/18/2020)
 - c. Project: 1. Remove existing shed-roofed addition on rear (north) elevation (the second addition) and construct 10'x10' master bath addition.

2. Replace front door with a wood door with one large light in the upper half.
3. Replace porch flooring and repair columns with in-kind materials.
4. Paint tin roof silver.
5. Replace siding in-kind where needed and paint.
6. Install framed lattice around crawl space.
7. Install brick patio in rear yard immediately behind the new rear wall of the house.
8. Repair existing pair of fixed wood six-light windows on east elevation of first addition to rear (north) side of house.
9. Replace window in south elevation of east wing with six-over-six wood type to match the existing.
10. Move window on north elevation of east wing to the east to restore its functionality, as it currently is partially blocked by the first addition to the house (the laundry area).

26. Applicant: Thomas Industries Inc.

- a. Property Address: 1114 Caroline Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 5/25/2022
- c. Project: 1. Reconstruct a front façade (South) elevation porch.
 - a. The porch will maintain the existing roofline and floor height.
 - b. Repair and rebuild existing brick piers using brick to match appropriate mortar.
 - c. Framed wood lattice in between piers will be employed.
 - d. Construct porch deck.
 - e. Deck will be constructed of wooden tongue and groove.
 - f. Construct a set of brick steps to access porch.
 - g. Install simple iron railing on steps.
 - h. Install six equidistant (three on either side of door) eight inch square wooden columns.
 - i. Columns will be feature a recessed panel and boxed.
2. Conduct in-kind repairs.
 - a. Repair and replace deteriorated wood such as siding to match existing in dimension, profile and material.
 - b. Repair existing wood windows to match in dimension, profile and material.
 - c. Repaint body of house white with black shutters.

27. Applicant: Carson Cole

- a. Property Address: 1302 Virginia Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/25/2022
- c. Project: Reroof in-kind. Repaint brick veneer facade and masonry east and west elevations. Install metal or wood paneled door at east end of south elevation.

28. Applicant: Nik Budney

- a. Property Address: 1563 Government Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
- c. Project: Reroof non-historic tile roof--mixed barrel and flat tile--with a Terra Cotta Cleo Barrel Tile from Roser.

29. Applicant: Branch Communications

- a. Property Address: 103 Dauphin Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
- c. Project: Remove existing rooftop cellular equipment; replace in-kind.

- 30. Applicant: Godwin Construction LLC**
- a. Property Address: 1569 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
 - c. Project: Termite damage repair to include wood siding repair and repainting to match existing.
- 31. Applicant: Wayne Askew**
- a. Property Address: 1212 Palmetto Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with shingles in charcoal gray, reflash chimney, repair fascia as needed to match.
- 32. Applicant: Langan Construction**
- a. Property Address: 50 St. Emanuel Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
 - c. Project: Replace two exterior windows with custom-made wood to match existing, exact fit, repaint to match.
- 33. Applicant: Langan Construction**
- a. Property Address: 352 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/26/2022
 - c. Project: Rebuild parapet wall per existing; remove awning to repair interior damage, then reset awning; repair/replace termite damage between floors. Repaint all to match.
- 34. Applicant: Pigeons on the Roof LLC**
- a. Property Address: 358 Michigan Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in charcoal..
- 35. Applicant: David T. McConnell**
- a. Property Address: 109 Levert Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Repair rotten wood at exposed soffit - remove roof shingles and decking above damaged area. Remove 4 square feet of rotten wood and replace in kind. Paint to match existing. Reinstall roof shingles.
- 36. Applicant: David T. McConnell**
- a. Property Address: 155 Levert Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Repair rotten wood at fascia and soffit with built-in gutter. Remove rotten wood and replace in-kind. Paint to match existing.
- 37. Applicant: B&M Roofing & Construction LLC**
- a. Property Address: 554 Eslava Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in Pewter Grey color.
- 38. Applicant: Superior Fence & Rail of Pensacols LLC**
- a. Property Address: 58 S. Julia Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Install 70 LF of new 4' high white open picket French gothic wood fence and two pedestrian gates.
- 39. Applicant: David T. McConnell**
- a. Property Address: 150 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/27/2022
 - c. Project: Replace structural pipe column at gallery porch at southeast corner. Stucco and paint to match existing. Repair stucco, replicating fluting to match existing, at adjacent pipe column and paint to match existing.

- 40. Applicant: The Ben Murphy Co. Inc.**
- a. Property Address: 66 Etheridge Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/31/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with shingles (Atlas Pinnacle Pristine Morning Harvest).
- 41. Applicant: Daniel Wheeler**
- a. Property Address: 12 N. Monterey Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 5/31/2022
 - c. Project: Termite damage repair to include:
 - 1. Reroof in-kind with composition shingles in color to match existing.
 - 2. On south elevation, remove and replace in-kind T&G siding; seal and paint in-kind; remove and replace in-kind trim; prime and paint soffit to match existing; remove and replace in-kind fascia; prime and paint fascia to match existing.
- 42. Applicant: Michael Seals**
- a. Property Address: 954 Savannah Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 6/1/2022
 - c. Project:
 - 1. Construct an addition to the north (rear) elevation.
 - 2. Create a front porch extending the width of the south (front) façade.
 - 3. Fenestration changes to west elevation
 - 4. Changes to integrated structure
- 43. Applicant: David T. McConnell**
- a. Property Address: 713 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 6/2/2022
 - c. Project: Replace 4 non-historic six-over-six wood windows (3 on façade, 1 on rear elevation). Replacement windows will be aluminum-clad six-over-six to fit existing openings. Repaint to match existing.
- 44. Applicant: Daryl Gomien**
- a. Property Address: 1410 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 6/3/2022
 - c. Project: Install 40'x20' gunite pool on west side of house.
- 45. Applicant: Valerie Sheaffer**
- a. Property Address: 312 S. Monterey Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 6/3/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with shingles in Weatherwood color.
- 46. Applicant: Robert Dueitt Construction LLC**
- a. Property Address: 117 N. Lafayette Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/2022
 - c. Project: Reroof in-kind with architectural shingles in Driftwood color.
Clean and paint all wood with Sherwin Williams Duration white paint (house body and trim).

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2022-31-CA:1258 Texas Street

- a. Applicant: Jeffrey Winter
- b. Project: Replace 5 wood windows with vinyl-clad

APPROVED

-

CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED

2. 2022-32-CA: 518 Dauphin Street

- a. Applicant: Matthew LeMond
- b. Project: After-the-Fact Approval: installation of wood plank doors at storefront

DENIED

-

CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED

D. OTHER BUSINESS

1. The next ARB meeting is scheduled for July 6, 2022.

Public comment regarding items on this agenda will be accepted via e-mail (christine.dawson@cityofmobile.org) or USPS (Mobile Historic Development Commission, P.O. Box 1827, Mobile, AL 36633) until 5PM on Tuesday, June 14, 2022. Please include your name, home address, and the item number about which you are writing.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

ADDRESS	1258 Texas Street	APPLICATION NO.	2022-31-CA
SUMMARY OF REQUEST	Window replacement		
APPLICANT	Jeff Winter	OWNER, IF OTHER	
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Oakleigh Garden	MEETING DATE	6/15/2022
CLASSIFICATION	Contributing	REVIEWER	A. Allen

DISTRICT/PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Oakleigh Garden Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1972 under Criteria A (historic significance) and C (architectural significance) for its local significance in the areas of architecture, landscape architecture, and planning and development. The district is significant for its high concentration of 19th- and 20th-century architectural types and styles and significant in the area of landscape architecture for its canopies of live oaks planted from 1850 to 1910. The district is significant in the area of planning and development as the location of Washington Square, one of only two antebellum public parks remaining in Mobile. The district was expanded in 1984, and an updated nomination was approved in 2016.

The frame two-story house which sits at 1258 Texas Street was built c. 1906 for Charles Wheeler. The house is Victorian in style and form. A restrained Neo-classical influence is demonstrated through decorative elements concentrated on the south (front) façade including four square Doric columns supporting a first story porch which spans the eastern three bays and three like columns supporting a second story inset porch which spans two bays. Both porches are balustraded. A simple decorative motif surrounds the entry door with a two-light transom and sidelights. The 1904 Sanborn Map shows a vacant lot at this location. The 1925 Sanborn Map depicts a structure on the property similar in shape and dimension to the existing structure. A small one-story addition on the north (rear) elevation was constructed at an unknown date, and appears to be an enclosed porch.

This property has appeared previously before the Architectural Review Board (ARB) four times. In March 1981 a request to close fence openings along the sides and rear of the property was approved, while action was deferred on a request to build a garage. An application for exterior repairs and alterations was approved in June 1990. In July 1990 a request to paint the exterior and repair the residence was approved. In February 1992 a request to construct a 2-car garage was approved.

SCOPE OF WORK (per submitted application)

1. Replace five (5) windows on north (rear) addition which are severely rotted. Three (3) windows to be replaced are the first three from east to west on north (rear) elevation. Two (2) windows to be replaced are on the east side of the rear addition, adjacent to rear entry door.
 - a. All five (5) existing nine-over-nine windows would be replaced with Anderson 400 series vinyl-clad one-over-one windows.
 - b. The replacement windows would fit the existing window openings.

STAFF REPORT

A. Applicable standards from the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*

(Guidelines):

1. 5.21 “When historic windows are not in repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
 - In instances where there is a request to replace a building’s windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - ”
2. 5.7 “When replacing materials on a non-primary façade or elevation, match the original material in composition, scale and finish.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged materials on a non-primary façade when possible.
 - The ARB will consider the use of green building materials, such as those made with renewable and local resources to replace damaged materials on a nonprimary façade if they do not impact the integrity of the building or its key features.
 - Use alternative or imitation materials that match the style and detail of the original material to replace damaged non-primary building materials.
 - Replace exterior finishes to match original in profile, dimension and materials.”
3. 5.22 *ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS*
“Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:
 - Wood sash
 - Steel, if original to structure
 - Custom extruded aluminum
 - Aluminum clad wood
 - Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)”

B. Staff Analysis

This application includes the replacement of five (5) windows on the north (rear) addition of 1258 Texas Street. The proposed replacement windows follow the *Guidelines* in that they would match the existing windows in opening location, dimension and profile. However, the replacement windows do not match the light configuration of existing windows, which is also directed by the *Guidelines*. (A.1) The existing windows are nine-over-nine whereas the suggested replacements would be one-over-one. Although the replacements do not match the existing in light configuration, they would match the light configuration of the surrounding existing windows on the east and west elevations of the house.

The *Guidelines* mandate that replacement materials match the original materials in composition, scale and finish. This project’s proposal of vinyl clad windows to replace the existing windows is not in compliance with the *Guidelines*, as vinyl-clad is not the original window fabric and is listed as an ‘unacceptable window material’ (A.2,3). However, it should be taken into consideration that this proposal pertains to a rear addition which cannot be seen from the street and is not original to the house. Also pertinent are ongoing supply chain challenges which cause delays in obtaining windows of other materials, the unavailability of high quality or durable wood windows, the fact that the Architectural Review Board is

currently considering other high-quality alternative window materials, and that the proposed window (Anderson 400 series) is a high-quality vinyl-clad window.

C. Summary of Analysis

- The proposed five (5) window replacements for the north (rear) addition at 1258 Texas Street match the existing window openings, location, dimensions and profile.
- Although the replacement windows do not match the existing windows in light configuration, they do match the light configuration of the surrounding windows on the east and west elevations.
- The proposed material of the five (5) replacement windows (vinyl-clad) is not in conformance with the *Guidelines*; yet it is a high-quality variety which will be located on a rear addition not original to the house and will not impact the integrity of the historic structure.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on Section B above, Staff believes the proposed replacement of the existing nine-over-nine wood windows with vinyl-clad one-over-one windows would not impair the architectural or historic character of the existing historic structure and the surrounding district. Staff recommends approval of the application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Jeff Winter was present to discuss the application. He stated he had nothing to add.

No written comments regarding the application were received from the public; no one was physically present to comment on the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Blackwell inquired whether the surrounding windows are one-over-one. Ms. Allen stated that windows in the original portion of the house are one-over-one.

Mr. Roberts inquired whether there was a date for when the addition was added or enclosed. Ms. Allen stated that no date of construction or enclosure was able to be determined. Mr. Roberts inquired if the addition alone could be considered non-contributing. Ms. Dawson stated yes, citing an example.

Mr. Sledge presented the Board with the 1981 site plan of the property demonstrating that the addition in question was not extant at that time.

FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on evidence presented in the application, the Board find the facts in the Staff's report.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Roberts and approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Blackwell moved, based on the facts approved by the Board, the continuing Architectural Review Board discussion on materials for non-contributing portions of structures, and the fact that the addition cannot be seen from the street, the proposed window replacement would not impair the architectural or historic character of the historic structure or the surrounding district, and a Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

ADDRESS	518 Dauphin Street	APPLICATION NO.	2022-32-CA
SUMMARY OF REQUEST	After-the-Fact Approval: installation of wood plank doors at storefront		
APPLICANT	Matt LeMond	OWNER, IF OTHER	
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Lower Dauphin Street Commercial	MEETING DATE	6/15/2022
CLASSIFICATION	Contributing	REVIEWER	C. Dawson

DISTRICT/PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1979 under Criteria A (historic significance) and C (architectural significance) for its local significance in the areas of commerce and architecture. The district is significant for its unique character stemming from the high concentration of closely spaced two- and three-story brick buildings and as Mobile’s nineteenth century commercial thoroughfare. The district boundaries were expanded in 1982, 1995, 1998, and 2019.

The property was constructed c. 1960 and is considered Contributing to the district. The 1878 Hopkins map shows what appear to be brick rowhouses across most of the property composing what is now 508-518 Dauphin Street. The 1885 and 1891 Sanborn maps shows a row of four two-story brick dwellings with first-floor shops and three two-story commercial buildings on the site (including a druggist, a produce store, a tobacconist, and a barber). The footprints of the buildings on the site remained largely the same when the 1904 Sanborn map was published, though some of the businesses had changed to include a tin shop, a bicycle repair shop, and a restaurant. Twenty years later, most of the block was occupied by furniture stores, and the area of the subject property was occupied by a furniture store and small shops of unknown wares. The 1952 aerial shows about one-third of the streetfront of this block empty to the east of the subject property. By the 1955 aerial photograph, the streetfront of the block is full. At some point between 1967 and 1980, the building at the far east end of the block was removed.

This property has appeared once previously before the Architectural Review Board (ARB). In February 2021, a proposal for façade renovations including installation of new storefronts, repair of existing stucco, the installation of new awnings, the closing of two openings on the west elevation and one on the north elevation, and the creation of a doorway on the north elevation was approved.

SCOPE OF WORK (per submitted application)

1. Maintain wood plank doors in storefront, as installed.

STAFF REPORT

A. Applicable standards from the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts* (Guidelines):

1. “If necessary, replace a door in a fashion that is sensitive to the historic commercial character of the building.
 - Use doors with a high proportion of transparent glass.

- Consider using a transom in a replacement storefront where appropriate.
- Design a replacement doorway to emphasize the commercial entrance.” (7.11)

B. Staff Analysis

This application proposes maintaining wood plank doors installed in the course of construction that do not match the design approved by the Architectural Review Board in February 2021. The scope of work approved at that time stated, “Install a pair of wood pane-and-panel doors beneath a transom in the western half of the central third of the storefront.” The approved doors were in compliance with the *Guidelines*, which call for commercial doors to have a high proportion of transparent glass, maintained the existing transom, and emphasized the commercial entrance. (A.1) The wood plank doors installed at the property are not in compliance with the *Guidelines*, as they have no glass incorporated into them, let alone a high proportion, and do not emphasize the commercial entrance.

C. Summary of Analysis

- The existing wood plank doors do not include any glass, in contravention of the *Guidelines*.
- The existing wood plank doors do not emphasize the commercial entrance.
- The existing wood plank doors are not in compliance with the *Guidelines* and should be replaced with the design approved by the ARB in February 2021.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on Section B above, Staff believes the existing wood plank doors impair the architectural or historic character of the subject property and the surrounding district. Staff recommends denial of the application.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Matt LeMond, the owner, was present to discuss the application. He stated that there were no historic photos available to determine the original door material and design. He continued that previously Staff had recommended aluminum doors yet the ARB had approved wood. He added that the doors add ‘flair and interest’ to the property and that the transom was still in place. He also mentioned that the neighbors across the street like the doors.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Roberts stated that ARB members are obligated to enforce the guidelines and ordinances and that there are more strict regulations on contributing properties versus on non-contributing properties in historic districts. He suggested that the doors be used on the interior.

Mr. Blackwell inquired if there was a way to add moldings to the doors.

Mr. Roberts responded the doors still would not contain glass and that he would hate to see moldings on these particular doors.

FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Roberts moved that, based on the evidence presented in the application, the Board finds the facts in the Staff’s report, as written.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Rodrigues and approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Roberts moved that, based on the facts approved by the Board, the wood plank doors installed in the course of construction that do not match the design approved by the Architectural Review Board in February 2021 impair the architectural and historic character of the subject property and the surrounding district, and a Certificate of Appropriateness should not be granted.

Mr. Rodrigues seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

The application was denied.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:36 pm.