



Agenda Item #1

Certified Record 2025-57-CA

DETAILS

Location:

12 S Julia St

Summary of Request:

- Repair damaged materials to match existing.
- Enclose section of porch on south and west elevations
- Install new custom French doors on the south and west elevations.
- Install French casement windows on the gables of the south and north elevations.

Summary of Analysis:

- The proposal to enclose the porch on the south and west elevation would be consistent with the *Guidelines* as the materials and design used will match existing.
- Installation of the new custom French doors and French casement windows would align with the Guidelines call to incorporate design elements of original windows and doors.

Applicant (as applicable):

Darrel J Williams Associates

Property Owner:

Daniel McGhee- Dan Van Nostrand

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Report Contents

[DETAILS](#).....1

[PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY](#).....2

[SCOPE OF WORK](#).....2

[APPLICABLE STANDARDS \(*DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES FOR MOBILE’S HISTORIC DISTRICT*\)](#).....4

[STAFF ANALYSIS](#).....7



PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The property at 12 S Julia Street is a 1 ½ story Queen Anne frame cottage that was built for John W Hanlein on July 21, 1899. Character defining features of the home include: a steeply pitched hipped roof, patterned masonry chimney, the façade also has a cross gable with a single hung ribbon window and arched window, central dormer above a gabled entry, shingled tower, and asymmetrical porch that features turned spindles and columns.

Sanborn maps from 1925 show a single-story secondary structure on the same plot as the subject residence. The 1956 Sanborn map shows that the secondary structure from 1925 was demolished and replaced by a two-story structure identified as an apartment at 16 S Julia Street. The building identified as an apartment was later separated from the shared plot and was later demolished in 2021 due to damage sustained from a fire. Both Sanborn maps show that the footprint of the subject residence has largely been unmodified. However, sometime after 1956 portions of the northwest section of the porch were enclosed and can be seen as the shingled section of the rear elevation.

The property has not appeared before the Architectural Review Board.

SCOPE OF WORK

All Elevations:

1. Repair damaged materials to match existing, including architectural details.
2. Re-roof with architectural shingles
3. Repaint exterior in approved colors

Porch enclosure/alteration:

1. Enclose a portion of the south (side) porch that measures 14’4 L x 7’4” W
Original porch posts will be incorporated into the design of the exterior wall to maintain the appearance of the porch design.
2. Enclose west section of the porch that measures approximately 5’11” L x 14’9” W
3. Porch will be enclosed with wood lap siding to match existing
4. Construct new steps the length of the enclosed porch on the west (rear) elevation to match front steps in finish, material, and detail

Fenestrations Alterations:

East Façade:

1. 1st floor
 - a. Refurbish all existing windows on this elevation
 - b. Refurbish the existing wood French door
2. 2nd floor
 - a. Refurbish existing windows



South elevation (from west to east):

1. 1st floor
 - a. Install two double-hung wood one-over-one windows that measure 3' W x 6'H (or reuse existing if possible). Windows would be centered on the projecting rear porch bay.
 - b. Install one double hung window that measures 2'6" W x 4'0" H on west end of the main block's elevation which will match existing windows in material and profile
 - c. Install one new louvered shutter to match existing in material and profile. Shutter would be located adjacent to the above window
 - d. Remove two existing triple hung windows
 - e. Install custom French doors between present location of triple hung windows. The 2 French doors which will measure 2'6" W x 9' H each and will emulate the proportions and design of the removed windows.
 - f. Install new louvered shutters to match existing which will flank the French doors
2. 2nd floor
 - a. Remove existing gable vents
 - b. Replace gable vents with wood French casement windows to meet egress
 - i. The windows will measure 2' W x 3'H
 - ii. The windows to match existing sash size
 - iii. Trim and architectural details to match existing

West elevation (from north to south):

1. Remove 1 existing window on north end of elevation. Infill opening with wood lap siding to match existing
2. Install 2 new windows measuring 3' W x 6'H to match existing
3. Fenestration changes on enclosed porch
 - a. Install 2 full glass French doors measuring 2'6"W x approximately 9'0" H across enclosed porch wall
 - b. Install 3 new door/window units that will measure 2'6" W x 9'H
 - c. Construct new steps the length of the enclosed porch to match front steps in finish, material, and detail

North elevation (from east to west beginning at cross gable):

1. 1st floor
 - c. Refurbish 3 existing windows
 - d. Install 1 new window, measuring 2'6" W x 5'6"H to match existing in material, profile, and configuration (or reuse existing window if possible)
2. 2nd floor
 - a. Remove existing gable vents
 - b. Install wood French casement windows to meet egress
 - i. They will both measure 2' W x 3' H?
 - ii. The windows will match existing sash size
 - iii. Trim and architectural details will match existing



APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES FOR MOBILE'S HISTORIC DISTRICT*)

1. **5.3** Preserve the key historic walls of a building.
 - Maintain significant historic façades in their original form.
 - Maintain historic façade elements.
 - Pay special attention to maintaining the historic appearance of building walls of corner buildings
2. **5.4** Preserve original building materials.
 - Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the material.
 - Remove only those materials which are deteriorated, and beyond reasonable repair.
 - Do not remove original materials that are in good condition.
3. **5.5** Preserve and restore the visibility of original historic materials.
 - Consider removing later covering materials that have not achieved historic significance.
 - Once a non-historic siding is removed, repair the original, underlying material.
 - Carefully remove a later stucco finish if the process does not damage the underlying original building material if possible.
 - Do not remove a later stucco covering if the process may damage the underlying original building material. Test the stucco to assure that the original material underneath will not be damaged.
 - Do not cover or obscure original building materials.
4. **5.6** Use original materials to replace damaged materials on primary surfaces where possible.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged building materials on a primary façade if possible. If the original material is wood clapboard, for example, then the replacement material should be a material that matches the original in finish, size and the amount of exposed lap. If the original material is not available from the site, use a replacement material that is visually comparable with the original material.
 - Replace only the amount of material required. If a few boards are damaged beyond repair, for example, then only they should be replaced, rather than the entire wall.
 - Do not replace building materials on the primary façade, such as wood siding and masonry, with alternative or imitation materials unless it cannot be avoided.
 - Wholesale replacement of exterior finishes is generally not allowed.
5. **5.7** When replacing materials on a non-primary façade or elevation, match the original material in composition, scale and finish.
 - Use original materials to replace damaged materials on a non-primary façade when possible.
 - The ARB will consider the use of green building materials, such as those made with renewable and local resources to replace damaged materials on a nonprimary façade if they do not impact the integrity of the building or its key features.
 - Use alternative or imitation materials that match the style and detail of the original material to replace damaged non-primary building materials.
 - Replace exterior finishes to match original in profile, dimension and materials.



6. **5.17** Preserve historic stylistic and architectural details and ornamentation.
 - Repair historic details and ornamentation that are deteriorated.
7. **5.19** Where repair is impossible, replace details and ornamentation accurately.
 - When replacing historic details, match the original in profile, dimension, and material.
 - A substitute material may be considered if it appears similar in character and finish to the original.
 - Do not apply architectural details that were not part of the original structure.
8. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
9. **5.21** When historic windows are not in repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
 - In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
 - Mill-finished aluminum
 - Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)
10. **6.4** Preserve an original porch or gallery on a house.
 - Maintain the height and pitch of a porch roof.
 11. **6.6** If replacement is required, design it to reflect the time period of the historic structure.
 - Replace a historic porch element to match the original.
 - Use replacement materials and elements that are appropriate to the style, texture, finish, composition and proportion of the historic structure.
 - Match the balustrade of a historic porch to the design and materials of the porch.



- Do not completely replace an entire porch or element unless absolutely necessary. Only replace the element or portion of an element that requires replacement.
12. **6.11** Design the exterior walls of an addition to be compatible in scale and rhythm with the original historic structure.
- Design the height of an addition to be proportionate with the historic building, paying particular attention to the foundation and other horizontal elements.
 - Design the addition to express floor heights on the exterior of the addition in a fashion that reflects floor heights of the original historic building.
13. **6.46** Design shutters and awnings to be compatible with the building.
- Use a shutter that fits the reveal of a window opening precisely.
 - Use an awning that fits proportionately over the window or door opening with an appropriate overlap at the side.
 - Use an awning with a simple design and material.
 - Use an awning with a color that is compatible with the overall building's color scheme. Canvas is preferred.
14. **6.47** Design shutters and awnings to be compatible with the district.
- Use operable blinds or shutter units hung with hinges.
 - When using artificial materials, use a blind or shutter unit that has a thickness, weight and design similar to wood. An artificial material shutter will be considered on a case-by-case basis.
 - Use an operable shutter where feasible.
 - Where a blind or shutter is fixed, hang them on a window casing in a manner to replicate an operable shutter.
 - If a synthetic awning is used, use one with a textured surface. Do not use an awning with a smooth vinyl surface.

ACCEPTABLE SHUTTER AND AWNING MATERIALS

- Materials that are similar in character, texture and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are acceptable. These often include:
- Louvered or solid panel wood (shutter)
- Louvered or solid panel composite
- Fabric (awning)

UNACCEPTABLE SHUTTER AND AWNING MATERIALS

- Materials that are not similar in character, texture and durability to those used on nearby historic buildings are unacceptable. These often include:
- Lightweight plastic (shutter)
- Metal (awning)



STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing structure to the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review proposes enclosing a section of the porch on the south and west elevations to create additional living space; in-kind repair or replacement of original materials and architectural details on all elevations; and fenestration alterations on the south, west, and north elevations. The proposal also includes: reroof with architectural shingles, and repainting exterior in approved color that has yet to be decided.

All Elevations

The *Guidelines* call for the preservation of original materials to the extent possible (5.4). The subject proposal includes repair to original exterior materials with replacement in-kind for materials found to be beyond reasonable repair. This aligns with guideline 5.6 that directs replacement of damaged materials on primary surfaces with original materials where possible, guideline 5.7 that says to “match the original material in composition, scale and finish”, and guideline 5.19 that states when repair is impossible, to replace details and ornamentation accurately. The subject project also includes the repair of architectural details such as the turned posts and handrails with spindles which follows guideline 5.17 that says to, “preserve historic stylistic and architectural details and ornamentation”.

Porch Enclosure/Alterations

The original layout of the porch as seen in the 1925 Sanborn map shows that it wrapped around the residence from the east elevation entrance to the northwest projection to the rear. The section of the porch on the northwest extension was enclosed sometime after 1956. The proposed porch enclosure would be located to the rear of the property and would have minimal visual impact on the architectural integrity of the structure.

The proposed enclosure of the porch on the south and west elevation includes the incorporation of the original turned columns and spindles, which aligns with guideline 5.5 which calls for the preservation of visible original features. Guideline 5.3 states that the design should, “maintain historic façade elements”. The turned columns and spindle handrails are character defining components of the Queen Anne design. By using the original porch ornamentation, the rhythm of the porch will be maintained and will ensure that the south elevation of the structure will read similar to its original expression.(6.11).

Fenestration Changes

The *Guidelines* say to, “preserve the functional and decorative features of a historic window” (5.20). The subject project includes the comprehensive refurbishment of the existing windows, with limited new windows and doors which will primarily be installed on the newly enclosed porch space on the south and west elevations, and in existing gable vent openings on the north and south elevations to meet egress. All new and replacement windows match the existing in material and are sympathetic to the original window designs. (5.21).

The triple hung window on the south elevation will be reused on the west elevation and the French doors that will be installed in the windows place will be designed to replicate the design of the window. The shutters that will be installed on the south elevation will match in material and design the existing shutters (6.46).



PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Darrell Williams with Darrel J Williams Associates presented the application to the Board.

Mr. Williams stated that the full residence will be restored by repairing all rotten wood or replacing with in-kind materials to also match profile. The alterations that are being proposed are predominantly on the south elevation. There are 2 full-height triple hung windows existing that will be removed and replaced with a pair of doors that will be in proportion to those windows. Shutters will also be installed on either side of the French doors to match style of existing shutters. The porch along the rear of the structure (south and west elevations) will be enclosed. The existing columns and handrails will be removed to allow the new construction to be built under the existing beam so that the fascia and soffit will remain. Half columns and half handrails would then be applied to the new construction exterior walls to continue the rhythm of the porch. The other changes proposed are at the rear of the structure where the existing non-original windows will be removed and replaced with windows to match the original design. Additionally, the gable vents on the north and south elevations will be replaced with French casement windows to meet egress. The roof will be replaced with dimensional architectural shingles.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Karrie Maurin asked for clarification about the corner treatment of the porch addition towards the east of the building.

Mr. Williams responded that there will be corner boards to match existing on the house and if there are any miters they will match profile of existing.

Ms. Maurin asked about the material for the French doors.

Mr. Williams replied that they would be wood.

Ms. Maurin then asked if the head heights for the doors would match existing.

Mr. Williams responded that all heights would match existing.

Mr. Stephen McNair asked about the utilization of gutters and downspouts along the rear elevation.

Mr. Williams said that they are looking at the possibility of using them because the majority of the water damage has occurred on that elevation and that any gutters and downspouts that may be proposed in the future would be half-round copper and full-round downspouts.

Mr. McNair then asked if the chimneys will be impacted by the reroof and if they will be using copper flashing.

Mr. Williams responded that no chimneys will be changed and copper flashing will be used on the reroof. However, they are looking for a spire to sit atop the existing turret.

Mr. McNair offered to connect Mr. Williams with buyers of the existing asbestos shingles if they are looking to dispose of them after they are removed.



Ms. Jennifer Roselius asked if the proposed French door shutters will be operable and what the color of the shingles will be.

Mr. Williams provided that the shutters will be operable, but a shingle color has not been selected yet.

FINDING FACTS

Mr. Cartledge Blackwell moved that, based on the evidence presented in the application, the Board finds the facts in the Staff's report as amended to note staff review of any finial to be installed atop the turret and the color of the shingles for the reroof.

Ms. Roselius seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Ms. Roselius moved that, based on the facts approved by the Board, the application would not impair the architectural or historic character of the property or the district and that the application should be granted a COA.

Ms. Wilson seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 3:22pm.