

CITY OF MOBILE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

Minutes of the Meeting

June 26, 2006

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair, Bunky Ralph.

Ed Hooker, MHDC Architectural Engineer, called the roll as follows:

Members Present: Tilmon Brown, Douglas Kearley, Harris Oswald, Cameron Pfeiffer, Bunky Ralph, Joe Sackett, David Tharp, Jim Wagoner.

Members Absent: Robert Brown, Cindy Klotz, Michael Mayberry.

Staff Members Present: Ed Hooker, Anne Crutcher.

<u>In Attendance</u>	<u>Mailing Address</u>	<u>Item Number</u>
----------------------	------------------------	--------------------

No applicants or members of the public were present.

Harris Oswald moved to approve the minutes of the last meeting as emailed. Cindy Klotz suggested two amendments to the minutes: a disclosure on 412 Dauphin St. and the removal of “numerous” from the discussion on circular drives. The Board accepted the disclosure modification. Harris Oswald moved to approve the minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Cameron Pfeiffer and unanimously approved.

Tilmon Brown moved to approve the mid-month Certificates of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by David Tharp and unanimously approved.

MID-MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant’s Name: Ken McElhaney Jr.
Property Address: 1220 Elmira Street
Date of Approval: 5/30/06 jdb
Work Approved: Paint house the following Sherwin Williams colors:
Body – Colonial Yellow
Trim - White
2. Applicant’s Name: Caldwell and Osborn Home Improvement &
Construction Co.
Property Address: 1009 Elmira
Date of Approval: 5/30/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new architectural shingles, black in color.
3. Applicant’s Name: Caldwell and Osborn Home Improvement &
Construction Co.
Property Address: 364 Marine Street
Date of Approval: 5/30/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new architectural shingles, onyx black in color.
4. Applicant’s Name: Stair Depot
Property Address: 1059 Elmira
Date of Approval: 5/31/06 weh
Work Approved: Extensive repair to enclosed rear porch. Repoint brick piers; install intermediate piers not to be visible from the street. Repair/replace deteriorated wood siding with materials to match existing in material, profile and dimension. Prep for painting.

5. Applicant's Name: Paul Brown and Art Powell
Property Address: 918-920 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 5/31/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair brick columns and arches damaged by automobile collision. Install fixed louvered blinds over storefront window on right side of front elevation.

6. Applicant's Name: Hubbard Properties
Property Address: 1254 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 6/1/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof with 3 tab fiberglass shingles, charcoal in color.

7. Applicant's Name: Jeff Medlin
Property Address: 1258 Texas Street
Date of Approval: 6/1/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace deteriorated siding with materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Repair or replace second floor porch columns with materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Prep new materials for paint.

8. Applicant's Name: Jason Dudley/A-1 Roofing Company
Property Address: 1504 Brown Street
Date of Approval: 6/2/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab shingles, autumn brown in color.

9. Applicant's Name: Gulf Coast Roofing
Property Address: 55 South Julia Street
Date of Approval: 6/5/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new Timberline shingles, cedar in color.

10. Applicant's Name: AME Pentecostal Church
Property Address: 306 North Joachim
Date of Approval: 6/5/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Repaint church body and trim – white, steps gray.

11. Applicant's Name: AME Pentecostal Church
Property Address: 308 North Joachim
Date of Approval: 6/5/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace porch handrails as per MHDC photographs and MHDC stock design number 1.

12. Applicant's Name: Mauvilla Court Apartments
Property Address: 15 North Ann Street
Date of Approval: 6/7/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new roof on laundry room with materials to match existing materials. Paint trim to match existing.

13. Applicant's Name: Chris Bowen
Property Address: 1010 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 6/7/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood around windows with materials to match existing in profile and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing color scheme.
14. Applicant's Name: Kimberly Harpring/Bay Flowers
Property Address: 452A Government Street
Date of Approval: 6/8/06 weh
Work Approved: Install metal letter signage in existing sign band of building. Letters to be 18" high by 5' long, or 7.5 sf. Letters to be white.
15. Applicant's Name: Alabama School for Math & Science/ TAG Architects
Property Address: 1255 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 6/9/06 asc
Work Approved: Renovation of the existing first floor lobby, recreation area, and second floor library with an adjacent addition to provide space for an expanded lobby, recreation and library. Erect a monument sign at Caroline Street elevation. Rework existing parking lot. Undertake landscaping as per submitted landscape plan.
16. Applicant's Name: Harold Rummel
Property Address: 961 Selma Street
Date of Approval: 6/9/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new roof using charcoal asphalt shingles.
17. Applicant's Name: Harold Rummel
Property Address: 1005 Selma Street
Date of Approval: 6/9/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new roof using charcoal asphalt shingles; repair/replace wood siding as necessary with new wood siding to match existing in profile and dimension. Rework front porch – new foundation, 1x4 t&g decking, repair/replace columns as necessary. Install new railing, steps and stair rail as per MHDC designs. Paint exterior (colors to be submitted at a later date.)

NOTICES OF VIOLATION and MUNICIPAL OFFENSE TICKETS:

No NoVs or MoTs were written during this time period.

OLD BUSINESS:

1. **012-05/06-CA** 110 Ryan Avenue
Applicant: Norman E. Wood
Nature of Request: Alter historic residence as per submitted plans.

WITHDRAWN. Item to be placed on 7-10-06 agenda.

NEW BUSINESS:

- | | |
|------------------------|--|
| 1. 071-05/06-CA | 1510 Government Street |
| Applicant: | Anchor Signs/Starbucks Coffee |
| Nature of Request: | Install reverse channel backlit sign as per submitted plans. |

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

OTHER BUSINESS and ANNOUNCEMENTS:

1. Bienville Square Guard Building.

There was discussion concerning the inappropriateness of the both the location and design of the police building in the Square despite recent efforts to make it blend better with its surroundings. It was the consensus of the Board that Staff write the Mayor to discuss the inappropriateness of the design and its location at the entrance to the Square. The Board is of the opinion that there is no need for the building when there is a nearby precinct and bicycle and mounted patrols available.

2. Garage Apartments in Historic District

David Tharp expressed concern that garage apartments, that were once an integral part of the historic districts, are currently disallowed by Urban Development. He strongly urged that there be discussions with UDD about this issue.

3. Sidewalks in the Historic Districts

Cameron Pfeiffer asked for clarification on sidewalks in the historic districts, specifically whether certain patterns would be preferred by the Board. After some discussion, it was restated that sidewalk requests would be dealt with on a case by case basis

4. Request to revisit Midtown as a Local District

Bunky Ralph stated that there has been a request to look at making Midtown Historic District a local district which would introduce Review Board control in the area. Although the ordinance does not require a vote, Councilmen Copeland, Sullivan and Richardson required that 60% of residents agree to local district status in order for local district status to take effect. The area would benefit from the Zoning Overlay District in force in other local districts.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:40 p.m.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

071-05/06-CA 1510 Government Street
Applicant: Anchor Sign/Starbucks Coffee
Received: 6/09 /06 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 7/24/06 1) 6/26/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Non Contributing (new construction)
Zoning: LB-2, Limited Business
Nature of Project: Install reverse channel backlit signage as per submitted plans. Install height clearance pole and sign. Install single leaf pre-menu board and triple leaf menu board. Install directional signage.

STAFF REPORT

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF ANALYSIS

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work does not comply with the Design Review Guidelines and the Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts and will impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district.

- I. The Starbucks project was *Approved with Conditions* by the Architectural Review Board March 13, 2006.
 - A. Building Signage
 1. One of the conditions was the submission of a complete sign package.
 2. The applicants are requesting to install two letter signs, measuring 9'-8" long x 4.4' high.
 3. Sign A is located on the front or south façade of the building above the front entrance.
 4. Sign B is located on the east façade of the building above the side entrance.
 5. Each sign measures 22.6 sf, for a total of approximately 45 square feet.
 6. Proposed signage will be mounted to building face with ¼" lag bolts.
 7. Proposed signage is aluminum reverse channel letters.
 8. Aluminum faces to be in Starbucks Green color.
 9. Proposed signage lighting is backlit neon.

(NOTE: the application stated that the signage would be aluminum channel lettering with lexan faces, internally lit with neon. Staff checked with the applicants to

confirm the type of signage and was informed that the application was in error. The applicants intended to install reverse-channel backlit letters.)

B. Height Clearance Pole and Sign

1. Proposed pole is to be located in the drive thru lane to avert damage to the canopies over the drive thru windows.
2. Proposed pole measures 12'-6" high.
3. Proposed pole is 4" in diameter, painted green to match the previously-approved awning.
4. Clearance sign measures 12" x 5'-6".
5. Proposed clearance sign to be white with red vinyl letters.
6. Directional/height clearance signs do not count when figuring site signage.

C. Pre-menu and Menu Boards

1. The proposed pre-menu board measures approximately 4' tall by approximately 3' wide, supported by a 2 1/8" base, making the overall height approximately 6'.
2. The menu board measures approximately 7'-11.5" wide by approximately 4' tall, supported by a 2 1/8" base, making the overall height approximately 6'.
3. The proposed boards are to be painted dark brown and light brown.
4. Menu boards are to be internally lit.
5. No information was provided on the text of the menu boards (font, color, size).

D. Directional Signage

1. Three types of directional signs are proposed: 1) for the drive thru, 2) "exit only", and 3) "thank you".
2. The proposed directional signs measure 2'-6" in height, mounted on a 3' high base, for an overall height of 5'-6".
3. Signs to be painted grey, white and black.
4. Sign text to be on clear polycarbonate face.
5. Signs will not be lit.

Staff recommends approval of the request to install reverse channel backlit signage.

Staff recommends approval of the request to install the Height Clearance Pole

Staff recommends that the Board consider the appropriateness for internally-lit menu boards.

Staff recommends approval of the request to install directional signs.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Neither the applicant nor his representative was present to discuss the application.

There was no one else to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Staff had no comments from the public or city departments to read into the record.

The Board questioned Staff regarding whether the informational signs would be lit since submitted drawings indicated that they would be. Staff reported that he was informed that they would not be. Staff also stated that the Clearance pole would be adjacent to the drive thru.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no additional Board discussion.

FINDING OF FACT

Based upon comments made during the public hearing the Board modified several facts in the staff report:

C.4.: “Menu Board will be internally lit following the precedent of other menu boards in the historic districts.” And

D.5. Directional signs will not be lit in contrast to submitted drawings.

Tilmon Brown moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Board finds the facts in the Staff report as modified above. The motion was seconded by Harris Oswalt and unanimously approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

David Tharp moved that, based upon the facts found by the Board, that the application does not impair the historic integrity of the structure or the district according to the Guidelines and that a Certificate of Appropriateness be issued. The motion was seconded by Jim Wagoner and unanimously approved.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 06/26/07.

