

**MOBILE HISTORIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION
CITY OF MOBILE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
Minutes of the Meeting
February 24, 2003**

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Cindy Klotz called the Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 3:05 p.m.

Ed Hooker, Architectural Engineer, called the roll as follows:

Present: Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken Bunky Ralph,
David Barr (alternate) Dennis Carlisle arrived late.

Absent: Karen Carr, Nick Holmes III, Douglas Kearley, Dan McCleave

A quorum was declared after the roll was called.

<u>In Attendance</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Item Number</u>
Allan Gustin	257 South Georgia Avenue	032-02/03-CA
Dianne Caylor	1308 Brown Street	035-02/03-CA
Jessie and Aaron Dortch	1561 Eslava Street	034-02/03-CA
Emily Willyard	960 Government Street	037-02/03-CA

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: January 27, 2003 Meeting

Bill Christian moved to approve the minutes as mailed. Buffy Donlon seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

APPROVAL OF THE MID-MONTH CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Buffy Donlon moved to approve the mid-month certificates as mailed. Bill Christian seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. 207 South Georgia Avenue: Ken McElhaney, Jr.
Repair or replace rotten wood as necessary with new matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint in existing color scheme.

APPROVED 1/29/03 asc

2. 1012 Caroline Street: Sheila Murray
Replace deteriorated materials with new materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing. Repair roof with materials matching existing.

(This CoA replaces CoA dated March 15, 2002)

APPROVED 1/30/03 asc

3. 1014 Caroline Street: Sheila Murray
Replace deteriorated materials with new materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing. Repair roof with materials matching existing.

(This CoA replaces CoA dated March 15, 2002)

APPROVED 1/30/03 asc

4. 160 Houston Street: William Singleton
Replace rotten wood as necessary with new matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint house in the following Devoe color scheme:
Body – Tumbleweed Trail 3W23-4
Trim – Champagne Tint 1W20-3
Accent – Cabernet 3WA25-4

APPROVED 1/31/03 weh

5. 20 South Lafayette Street: Ben Harris
Replace rotten wood as necessary with new matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint house in existing color scheme.

APPROVED 2/4/03 asc

6. 257 Georgia Avenue: Allan and Christy Gustin
Repaint house in the following color scheme:
Body – Fort Morgan Sand
Porch floor and foundation – Bellingrath Green
Trim – Classical White
Reroof with asphalt shingles to match existing

APPROVED 2/4/03 weh

7. 111 Herndon Avenue: Chris Bowen
Replace rotten wood as necessary with new matching existing in profile and dimension. Reroof with 3 tab fiberglass shingles charcoal gray in color. Remove metal building from rear of lot.

APPROVED 2/6/03 asc

8. 1105 Dauphin Street: MH3 Printing/Signs Now/ Carter-Brandyburg, Attorneys
Install pole sign measuring 3' x 5', set between two 6' tall 6" x 6" capped posts. Sign to be white with burgundy background and black lettering, as per submitted drawing.

APPROVED 2/5/03 weh

9. 1711 Hunter Avenue: Bill Hollis/Lipford Construction
Replace rotten wood siding and cornice with new materials to match original in profile and dimension. Prime new wood. Replace deteriorated wood louvered blinds with new louvered blinds to match existing.

APPROVED 2/6/03 weh

NEW BUSINESS:

032-02/03 – CA 257 South Georgia Avenue
Applicant: Allan and Christy Gustin
Nature of Project: Install wood balustrade on porch roof deck as per submitted plans. Install operable shutters to windows, French door at front, and single door on second floor front.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

033-02/03 – CA 38 McPhillips Street
Applicant: Frank Lott, III
Nature of Project: Request permission to retain 6' privacy fence erected without prior approval.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

034-02/03-CA 1561 Eslava Street
Applicant: Dennis Carlisle, Architect/ Mr. & Mrs. Aaron Dortch, Owners
Nature of Project: Construct rear addition measuring 29' x 28.5' as per submitted plans.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

035-02/03-CA 1308 Brown Street
Applicant: Dianne Caylor
Nature of Project: Construct 16' x 30' outbuilding using MHDC stock plans.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

037-02/03 – CA 173 South Georgia Avenue
Applicant: Augustine and Margaret Meaher/Dennis Langan Construction
Nature of Project: Request permission to remove existing Ludowici French-style clay tile roofing and replace with s-shaped clay tile roofing as per submitted sample.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

038-02/03 – CA

Applicant:

Nature of Project:

3-5 North Royal Street

Dan Michal, Architect/Henderson & Associates, Owners

Renovation of vacant and abandoned 2nd floor level into new offices for court-reporting firm. Restoration of existing 2nd level stucco façade and existing tall double hung wood windows. Construction of cast iron balcony to replicate original 1910 era balcony visible in historic photographs (extending current cast iron balcony reproduced in recent years at adjacent building). Renovation of ground level hot dog shop to include rework of existing storefront for new entrance and construction of fire-rated stair between tenants to provide street access to 2nd floor.

APPROVED as submitted. Copy of Certified Record attached.

OTHER BUSINESS and ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Cindy Klotz requested that staff recommendations continue to be included in Staff Comments and Analysis. Legal Counsel Wanda Cochran concurred with this request.

The Meeting Adjourned at 3:50 p.m.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

032-02/03 – CA

257 South Georgia Avenue

Applicant:

Allan and Christy Gustin

Received: 1/27/03

Meeting Date (s):

Submission Date + 45 Days: **3/13/03**

1) 2/24/03 2)

3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District

Classification: Contributing

Zoning: R1, Single Family Residential

Additional Permits Required: (1) Building

Nature of Project: Install wood balustrade on porch roof deck as per submitted plans.
Install operable shutters to windows, French door at front, and single door on second floor front.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Porches and Canopies	Replace deck balustrade over front porch
3	Blinds, Shutters and Awnings	Install operable shutters

STAFF COMMENTS

Based on information contained in the Application, in Staff's judgement:

1. Blinds, shutters and awnings were integral functional components of historic buildings. Operable units hung with appropriate hinges are encouraged.
 - a. there is evidence of hardware from the original shutters.
2. According to the Design Review Guidelines, blinds and shutters should be sized to precisely fit the reveal of the window opening.
3. Wood balustrades are a typical feature of the Colonial Revival Foursquare.
 - a. balustrades are typical along Georgia Avenue
 - b. balustrades are common on similar residences in the Oakleigh Garden Historic District
 - c. similar balustrades can be seen at 253 and 258 South Georgia Avenue
4. There is evidence that this residence originally had a wood balustrade.
 - a. there is an exterior door onto the porch deck and two floor-length walk-through windows
 - b. the file photo from 1984 shows a metal railing, possibly a replacement of the original wood system.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Support: Owner Allan Gustin was present to present the application to the Board. No one else was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Mr. Gustin noted that he had no further information to provide with respect to his application, but that he would like a copy of the file photo of his residence.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Buffy Donlon moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 4 to be acceptable as findings of fact.

The motion was seconded by David Barr, and passed 6/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Bill Christian moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. Buffy Donlon seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

033-02/03 – CA

38 McPhillips Street

Applicant:

Frank Lott, III

Received: 1/31/03

Meeting Date (s):

Submission Date + 45 Days: **3/17/03**

1) 2/24/03 2)

3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District

Classification: Non- Contributing (new construction)

Zoning: R1, Single Family Residential

Additional Permits Required: (2) Building, Electrical

Nature of Project: Request permission to retain previously-erected 6' wood dog-eared privacy fence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Fences, Walls and Gates	Retain 6' wood fence

STAFF COMMENTS

Based on information contained in the Application, in Staff's judgement:

1. The Guidelines state that fences should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement and materials should be considered along with the relationship to the historic district.
 - a. the main residence, a one story bungalow, is constructed of hardiplank siding resembling wood lap siding.
 - b. the fence, as constructed, is an unpainted solid wood fence constructed of 6" vertical dog-eared boards.
 - c. the Board typically requires a cap to provide a finished look.
2. The height of solid fences in historic districts is generally restricted to 6'.
 - a. the fence as constructed is 6' in height
 - b. the new 6' fence adjoins a 5' fence previously approved by the Board. This existing 5' fence overlaps the new 6' fence approximately 10'
 - c. the 6' fence also adjoins a 6' wood fence with a lattice panel top
 - d. there are a number of 6' wood dog-eared fences visible from public view within the block

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

No one was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Bunky Ralph moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 2 to be acceptable as findings of fact.

The motion was seconded by Bill Christian, and passed 7/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Dennis Carlisle moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. Bill Christian seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr, Dennis Carlisle

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04.

8. The pitch of the gable roof will match the existing roof of the main house. The fiberglass asphalt shingles will match existing.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Support: Owners Jesse and Aaron Dortch were present to present the application to the Board. No one else was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Jackie McCracken noted that there was no fenestration on the east wall. He recommended possibly a diamond-shaped window over the tub. Mr. Dortch noted that due to criminal activity, he did not want any additional windows on the east elevation.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Jackie McCracken moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 8 to be acceptable as findings of fact. It was further noted that the lack of windows in the addition on the east elevation would not materially impair the historic structure or the district.

The motion was seconded by Buffy Donlon, and passed 6/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Bunky Ralph moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. Buffy Donlon seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

036-02/03 – CA

1308 Brown Street

Applicant:

Dianne Taylor

Received: 1/31/03

Meeting Date (s):

Submission Date + 45 Days: **3/17/03**

1) 2/24/03 2)

3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District

Classification: Contributing

Zoning: R1, Single Family Residential

Additional Permits Required: (2) Building, Electrical

Nature of Project: Request permission to construct a storage building measuring 16' x 30' as per submitted information.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Accessory Structures	Construct storage building

STAFF COMMENTS

Based on information contained in the Application, in Staff's judgement:

1. The Guidelines state that accessory structures shall be measured by the guidelines applicable to new construction. The structure shall compliment the design and scale of the main building.
 - a. the main residence is a one story frame Victorian cottage constructed on a pier foundation
 - b. the proposed outbuilding will match the existing residence in terms of siding, soffit, eave and fascia
but the applicants are requesting to construct the building on a slab.
2. Stock designs provided by the MHDC range from 8' x 8' to 12' x 12'
 - a. the request is for a 16' x 30'
3. The outbuilding will be partially visible from public view.
 - a. the house sits at a grade above the sidewalk and street level
 - b. the back yard is completely enclosed with a 6' high wood privacy fence
 - c. the property adjoining the subject property directly to the north is the parking lot for the Greek Orthodox Church
 - d. the outbuilding will run parallel to the rear of the property line, 8' from the existing fence

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Support: Owner Dianne Caylor was present to present the application to the Board. No one else was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Mrs. Caylor stated that she resides in Mobile six months out of the year. Mrs. Caylor explained to the Board that she is in the antiques business and that security on her property is an issue. There have been 5 occasions that her current shed has been broken into, and personal property stolen.

Bill Christian noted that possible false windows might be an alternative to real windows. Cindy Klotz voiced a concern about the lack of rhythm on the 30' of blank wall. Mrs. Caylor stated that she did not want windows in the shed, but that she would be willing to install fixed shutters to break up the massing of the long expanse of wall.

Buffy Donlon inquired about the issue of zoning. The property is zoned R-1 and this shed is considered an accessory structure, therefore no zoning changes are necessary.

Bunky Ralph inquired whether there was an existing slab on which the building would be constructed. Mrs. Caylor stated there was not. The owner is requesting the slab because the current shed has a wood floor that has rotted from run-off from the Greek Orthodox Church property.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Bunky Ralph moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 3 to be acceptable as findings of fact.

The motion was seconded by Buffy Donlon, and passed 6/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Bill Christian moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that shutters would be added to the exterior walls. David Barr seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

037-02/03 – CA

173 South Georgia

Applicant:

Augustine and Margaret Meaher/Dennis Langan Construction

Received: 2/7/03

Meeting Date (s):

Submission Date + 45 Days: **3/24/03**

1) 2/24/03 2)

3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District:

Oakleigh Garden Historic District

Classification:

Contributing

Zoning:

R1, Single Family Residential

Additional Permits Required: (1) Building

Nature of Project:

Request permission to remove existing Ludowici French-style clay tile roofing and replace with s-shaped clay tile roofing as per submitted sample.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines

Sections

3

Topic

Roofs

Description of Work

Remove and replace existing roofing

STAFF COMMENTS

Based on information contained in the Application, in Staff's judgement:

1. The Guidelines state that a roof is one of the most dominant features of a building.
 - a. the 1910 structure designed by George Rogers reflects the Mediterranean style
 - b. the existing French clay tile is original to the structure
 - c. the MHDC file notes that the roofing material is a character-defining feature
2. The Guidelines state that materials should be appropriate to the form and pitch and color.
 - a. the proposed replacement tile does not have the same profile as the original
 - b. the existing tile is flat with concave ridges
 - c. the proposed replacement tile is a large convex shape

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Support: Owner representative Emily Willyard and Contractor Dennis Langan were present to present the application to the Board. No one else was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Ms. Willyard noted that the original tiles were installed in 1910. She further noted that the residence has suffered massive amounts of interior plaster damage from the leaking roof.

Ms. Willyard stated that to replace the tiles with identical Ludowici tiles would cost between \$600-\$700 per square. The alternative materials would cost between \$150-\$200 per square. The roof requires 45 squares.

Ms. Willyard further noted that the Board previously approved a similar request by the same owner for 960 Government Street.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Buffy Donlon moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 2 to be acceptable as findings of fact.

The motion was seconded by David Barr, and passed 6/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Buffy Donlon moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. Bill Christian seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

038-02/03 – CA

3-5 North Royal Street

Applicant:

Dan Michal, Architect/Henderson & Associates, Owners

Received: 1/10/03

Meeting Date (s):

Submission Date + 45 Days: **3/27/03**

1) 2/24/03 2)

3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District

Classification: Contributing

Zoning: B-4, General Business

Additional Permits Required: (2) Building, Electrical

Additional Variances Required: Right of Way Clearance

Nature of Project: Renovation of vacant and abandoned 2nd floor level into new offices for court-reporting firm. Restoration of existing 2nd level stucco façade and existing tall double hung wood windows. Construction of cast iron balcony to replicate original 1910 era balcony visible in historic photographs (extending current cast iron balcony reproduced in recent years at adjacent building). Renovation of ground level hot dog shop to include rework of existing storefront for new entrance and construction of fire-rated stair between tenants, to provide street access to 2nd floor.

History of the Project: The ARB granted Concept Approval in September 2002 for the renovation/rehabilitation of these buildings. A copy of the previous staff comments from the September 9, 2002 meeting is attached for review.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
Building Condition 2	Original Design Slightly Altered	Rehabilitate existing storefront
Section 5	Balconies, Galleries and Awnings	Reconstruct cast iron balcony

STAFF COMMENTS

Based on information contained in the Application, in Staff's judgement:

1. Condition 2 states that "restoration of the original design is preferred."
 - a. first floor entrances will be rehabilitated
 - b. the sill height of the window of the existing barber shop will be lowered to be compatible with new metal storefront
 - c. existing ceramic tile will be removed and replaced with stucco scored to match that on the second floor façade
 - d. existing transoms will be reworked and refitted with new glass (this to be carried out once materials are removed from transom area and existing transoms are assessed – see project summary provided by architect)

- e. second floor stucco façade to be restored
 - f. existing double hung windows to be restored
 - g. two wood French doors to be installed where previous balcony access was filled in
2. Section 5 states “ should documentation exist that a balcony or gallery was originally part of a building façade, the appropriate type of balcony or gallery may be added.”
- a. a photograph from 1910 shows 3-5 North Royal with a balcony continuous with the corner building
 - b. the proposed balcony will match the balcony of the building on the corner of Dauphin and Royal Streets.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

No one was present to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Buffy Donlon asked staff whether the application reflected the changes previously requested. ARB staff stated that the drawings reflected the requested changes.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Bunky Ralph moved that based upon the facts presented in the application and the public hearing, the Board finds staff comments 1 through 2 to be acceptable as findings of fact.

The motion was seconded by Bill Christian, and passed 7/0.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Buffy Donlon moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. Bill Christian seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Review Board Members voting on this application: : Buffy Donlon, Bill Christian, Cindy Klotz, Jackie McCracken, Bunky Ralph, David Barr, Dennis Carlisle

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 2/24/04.