

CITY OF MOBILE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

Minutes of the Meeting
December 13, 2004

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Cindy Klotz at 3:00 p.m.

Ed Hooker, MHDC Architectural Engineer, called the roll as follows:

Members Present: Lynda Burkett, Bunky Ralph, David Tharp, Tilmon Brown, Douglas Kearley, Harris Oswald, Joe Sackett, Cindy Klotz.

Members Absent: Michael Mayberry, Cameron Pfeiffer, Robert Brown,

Staff members present: Ed Hooker, Anne Crutcher, Devereaux Bemis.

<u>In Attendance</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Item Number</u>
Ben Cummings	1011 Augusta St.	009-04/05-CA
Felix Vereen	1750 Dauphin St.	011-04/05-CA
John Dendy	501 Government St.	011-04/05-CA

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

David Tharp moved to approve the minutes as mailed. The motion was seconded by Bunky Ralph and approved.

APPROVAL OF THE MID-MONTH CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Douglas Kearley moved to approved the mid-month Certificates of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Joe Sackett and approved.

MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: USA Signs, Inc./ Saad-Vallas Realty
Property Address: 1500 Government Street – Shoppes of Midtown
Date of Approval: 11/09/04 weh/jdb
Work Approved: Install “Check into Cash” sign on sign band as per submitted design. Sign to measure 20” x 14’-3”. Sign to be red and green in color, mounted on a raceway. Signage to be backlit. Sign to measure approximately 24 square feet.
2. Applicant's Name: Kevin Cross
Property Address: 1567 Luling Street
Date of Approval: 11/10/04 weh
Work Approved: Remove existing deteriorated concrete block garage. Construct MHDC stock garage as per submitted plans. Paint to match main residence.
3. Applicant's Name: Pauline Neese/Gulf Construction
Property Address: 1002 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 11/12/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged roof on house and storage shed to match existing roof material in profile and dimension.

4. Applicant's Name: Robert Peck
Property Address: 200 Rapier Avenue
Date of Approval: 11/12/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged garage as per plans provided to MHDC. Repair storm damage to house matching materials in profile and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing paint scheme.
5. Applicant's Name: Earl Ponquinette
Property Address: 963 Selma Street
Date of Approval: 11/12/04 asc
Work Approved: Rebuild front porch to include tongue & groove decking, four box columns with capital and railing details # 1, provided by MHDC, prime and paint house – color to be determined at a later date. Install 3’ wood picket fence in front yard. Fence to have pointed or square picket.
6. Applicant's Name: Emanuel Roberts
Property Address: 244 South Warren Street
Date of Approval: 11/12/04 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house in architectural grade shingles, sable wood or charcoal gray in color.
7. Applicant's Name: J. Lowe Roofing & Construction
Property Address: 207 South Cedar Street
Date of Approval: 11/15/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house to match existing in profile, color and dimension.
8. Applicant's Name: Stacey Burnette
Property Address: 100 Herndon Avenue
Date of Approval: 11/15/04 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood with materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Prep for painting. Paint colors to be submitted at a later date.
9. Applicant's Name: Steve Guerin
Property Address: 210 Rapier Avenue
Date of Approval: 11/16/04 asc
Work Approved: Install 6 ft. high stucco covered masonry wall with 7 ft. high piers. Fence to have masonry cap. Fence to be placed on the south property line.
Applicant has obtained a setback variance in order to construct the fence in this location.
10. Applicant's Name: Tuan Titlestad
Property Address: 1569 Fearnway
Date of Approval: 11/16/04 weh/kfm
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with materials to match existing in profile, material and dimension.
Repaint house in the Sherwin William’s color scheme:

Body: Roycroft Suede SW 2842
Trim: Roycroft Brass, SW 2843
Accent: Polished Mahogany, SW 2838
Porch Ceiling: Copen Blue, SW 0068

11. Applicant's Name: A. P. Gomez
Property Address: 1156 New St. Francis Street
Date of Approval: 11/16/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damage with new materials to match existing in profile, material and dimension. Repaint house in the existing color scheme.
12. Applicant's Name: Jean Lankford/Marilyn Roberts
Property Address: 356 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 11/16/04 asc
Work Approved: Paint exterior in the existing scheme with the exception that Salem Night is changed to Spray (gray green) with Rookwood Red accents.
13. Applicant's Name: Melvin Koger
Property Address: 268 S. Lawrence
Date of Approval: 11/16/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damage to fence. Repaint eaves to match existing color scheme. Repaint house as necessary to match existing color scheme.
14. Applicant's Name: Robert Craft
Property Address: 163 Tuttle Avenue
Date of Approval: 11/17/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair concrete block storage building damaged by Hurricane Ivan. Repair roof to match existing.
15. Applicant's Name: Martin B. McCluer
Property Address: 59 Semmes Avenue
Date of Approval: 11/18/04 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten siding to match existing in profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing color scheme.
16. Applicant's Name: United Holiness Church
Property Address: 102 N. Pine Street
Date of Approval: 11/18/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged roof with materials to match existing in profile and dimension. Replace damaged wood with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Paint new materials to match existing.

17. Applicant's Name: Katherine Lubecki
Property Address: 1209 Selma Street
Date of Approval: 11/19/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair damage to west wall to include: wood siding as necessary with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile; replace 3 wood windows with new wood windows to match existing; paint new materials in existing color scheme.
18. Applicant's Name: Scott Phillips
Property Address: 18 S. Conception Street
Date of Approval: 11/22/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair rotten wood on storefront window with materials to match existing in profile, material and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing color scheme.
19. Applicant's Name: Lafayette Plaza Hotel
Property Address: 301 Government Street
Date of Approval: 11/23/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material.
20. Applicant's Name: Creola Ruffin
Property Address: 1400 Church Street
Date of Approval: 11/23/04 weh
Work Approved: Repaint house in the existing color scheme.
21. Applicant's Name: Amanda Bray
Property Address: 962 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 11/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house using Timberline shingles or similar in slate gray or weathered wood.
Paint house in the following Benjamin Moore color scheme:
siding-van alan green; trim- arcadia white; shutters and doors- black.

NEW BUSINESS:

1. **009-04/05-CA** David and Elizabeth Sanders/ Douglas Kearley, Architect
Property Address: 202 George Street
Nature of Request: Construct garage as per submitted plans.
Remove existing dilapidated garage and construct new garage/play house/work room. Existing 2' setback to be maintained on the north side. New garage will be 2' from west property line. Building to be wood frame with hardiplank siding.

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

2. **010-04/05-CA** Ralph Hargrove, Developer/Ben Cummings, Architect
Property Address: 210 South Washington Street
Nature of Request: Rehabilitate existing non-contributing structure for new use as an engineering office. Remove existing metal shed at rear. All as per submitted plans.
APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

3. **011-04/05-CA** Mobile Revolving Fund/David Tharp, Architect
Property Address: 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Nature of Request: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Either move or dismantle 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.
TABLED. Certified Record attached.

OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS:

1. Devereaux Bemis announced that the appeal to City Council over its denial to allow the demolition of 1157-1159 Old Shell Road scheduled for Tuesday, December 14, 2004 will probably be tabled.

2. Tilmon Brown questioned the progress of the committee formed to create a conservation district within the Hank Aaron Loop. He stressed that it is imperative that a conservation district be created to stop incompatible development. Ed Hooker responded that he would report on the status of the committee.

3. Cindy Klotz commented that she would like the ARB to have input in future waterfront development.

4. David Tharp commented that additional work on the overlay district is desirable to address issues such as parking regulations, curb cuts, etc.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:40 p.m.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

009-04/05-CA 202 George Street
Applicant: David & Elizabeth Sanders
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Conflicts of Interest: Douglas Kearley recused himself from discussion and voting on the application.
Nature of Project: Construct garage as per submitted plans.
Remove existing dilapidated garage and construct new garage/play house/work room. Existing 2' setback to be maintained on the north side. New garage will be 2' from west property line. Building to be wood frame with hardiplank siding.
Additional Permits: None. Note: The Historic District Zoning Overlay negates the need for a rear yard variance. However, the applicant should verify with Urban Development prior to construction.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Accessory Structures	Construct new garage

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines requiring the proposed structure to compliment the design and scale of the main building.
 - 1. The main structure is a one and one-half story late Victorian residence with a brick pier foundation, wood lap siding and complex roof.
 - 2. The proposed structure is a one and one-half story frame with hardiplank siding, painted to match the main residence.
 - 3. The existing garage measures approximately 12' x 30'.
 - 4. The proposed garage measures 20' x 44'.
 - 5. The Materials List is appropriate for this structure.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

There was no one to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application. Staff had no public comments to enter into the record.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the height of the garage tower in comparison to the height of the main house and estimated that the height was approximately the same. Lynda Burkett asked about zoning restrictions on the building's use. Staff reported that if a kitchen were included in the project, the building would be considered an additional living unit.

FINDING OF FACT

David Tharp moved that based upon the evidence in the application and during the public hearing that the Board find that the proposed work is appropriate under the Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

David Tharp moved that the new garage does not impair the historic house or the adjacent historic district. The motion was seconded by Harris Oswald and approved with Tilmon Brown abstaining.

Harris Oswald moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Harris Oswald and approved.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 12/13/05.

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CERTIFIED RECORD

010-04/05-CA 210 South Washington Avenue
Applicant: Ralph Hargrove, Owner/ Ben Cummings, Architect
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Church Street East Historic District
Classification: Non - Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Demolish non-contributing lumber shed at rear of building.
Remove deteriorated canopy at entrance and construct new canopy as per submitted design. Alter facades to adaptively reuse structure for an engineering firm.

Additional Permits: A Use Variance or Rezoning will be necessary to use the property as proposed, as the site is currently zoned R-1.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate non-historic commercial structure

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed demolition of the lumber shed will not impair the structure or the district.
 - 1. The current structure is a modern, non-contributing commercial/industrial structure.

- B. The proposed renovation of the remaining structure is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. the existing south elevation has a series of metal roll-up garage doors
 - 2. proposed changes to the south elevation include:
 - a. the removal of the garage doors and the construction of stucco exterior walls with aluminum storefront windows repeating the pattern of existing windows

- b. installation of new aluminum storefront windows within existing masonry openings
 - c. installation of a metal awning over new windows on south wall
 - d. removal of the existing loading dock
3. Proposed changes to the east elevation include:
- a. installation of new aluminum storefront windows within existing masonry openings
 - b. construction of a new metal canopy consisting of cylindrical concrete columns with steel brackets supporting a metal roof
 - c. new metal roof, gutters and downspouts
 - d. installation of new metal roll-up door in location of existing metal roll-up door
 - e. construction of new metal canopy above existing roll-up door
 - f. stucco section of exposed concrete block and paint to match existing brick
 - g. installation of wall signage as per design.
4. Proposed changes to the north elevation include:
- a. replacement of existing solid metal doors with new solid metal doors
 - b. construction of new metal canopy above existing metal door opening
 - c. infill hole of former window a/c unit.
5. Proposed changes to the overall site include:
- a. removal of existing lumber shed at the rear of the property
 - b. upgrade existing parking lot
 - c. landscape property as per submitted landscape plan.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Ben Cummings, architect for the project, appeared on behalf of the applicant. He explained that the applicant had applied for a zoning change to B-1. He also noted that an iron or metal fence along Washington Avenue and a monument sign will be the subject of another submission to the Board. He also explained that he, in addition to Mr. Hargrove and Mr. Hargrove's realtor, had met with Margaret Pappas of the Urban Development Department to discuss the project. Mrs. Pappas indicated that UDD staff would be in agreement with the zoning change. David Daughenbaugh of Urban Forestry was also contacted to discuss trees on the site.

Cindy Klotz commented on the lack of color selections in the application. Mr. Cummings responded that the colors were Butler building colors.

There was no additional testimony in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Staff reported that there was no additional public comment to read into the record.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no Board discussion on the application.

FINDING OF FACT

Lynda Burkett moved to add the fact that the applicant has applied for a zoning change to B-1. The motion was seconded by Cindy Klotz and approved.

David Tharp moved that based on the evidence that had been presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Board finds that the work is appropriate according to the Guidelines citing the facts in the staff report with the addition of the fact discussing the zoning application.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Bunky Ralph moved that the application does not impair the district and that a Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted pending the approval of the zoning change. The motion was seconded by Harris Oswalt and approved.

A Certificate of Appropriateness will be issued once the zoning change has been granted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

011-04/05-CA 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Historic Development Commission/Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Conflicts of Interest: David Tharp, architect on the project, recused himself.
Bunky Ralph who saw interior plans for the project and commented on them recused herself.
Devereaux Bemis, who is on the Board of the Revolving Fund, recused himself.

Nature of Project: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Either move or dismantle 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

Additional Information:

The Mobile Revolving Fund acquired these two abandoned and derelict historic properties for the purpose of rehabilitating the structures and selling them to preserve the streetscape along Old Shell Road. Currently 1108 OSR is situated at the rear of the lot. Plans call for the structure to be moved forward 30' and for the two structures to be connected and restored as one single family residence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate two historic structures

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment, the proposed restoration will not impair the historic integrity of the structures or the district.

- A. The following is a list of proposed changes to the structures:
 - 1. move 1108 OSR forward 30'

2. construct a connector between 1108 and 1110 OSR
 - a. connector to resemble glassed-in porch
3. rehabilitate the structures as follows:
 - a. stabilize foundations and repair any structural damage
 - b. repair/replace rotten siding as necessary
 - c. repair/replace deteriorated windows
 - d. repair/replace deteriorated exterior doors
 - e. repair/replace deteriorated soffit, cornice and fascia
 - f. repair/replace deteriorated or missing porch details
 - g. re-roof entire structure
 - h. install new concrete ribbon drive and gravel parking as per site plan
 - i. landscape property to meet City of Mobile's Landscape Ordinance

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

John Dendy and Felix Vereen appeared on behalf of the Mobile Revolving Fund. John Dendy explained that the goal of this project is not to restore outstanding examples of architecture but to impact the neighborhood in a positive way. He summarized the thinking of the Board that thought it best to combine the houses into one living unit due to their small size. However, several things have contributed to making the project difficult: 1) 1108 Old Shell is in very deteriorated condition with numerous alterations made to the original structure; 2) There are no movers available as a result of Hurricane Ivan; 3) The structure is in such deteriorated condition it would be difficult or impossible to move. These factors make the project economically unfeasible. The MRF would like instead to dismantle the building saving any significant materials and rebuilding it further forward on the lot. Tilmon Brown asked how it had been determined that the house could not be rehabilitated. Felix Vereen responded that he, David Tharp and someone in the construction business had looked at it.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Tilmon Brown discussed that 1013 Selma Street had been in a similar state of deterioration but was rehabilitated.

Douglas Kearley commented that the dismantling of 1108 Old Shell would be against the guidelines.

Chair Cindy Klotz requested a motion to table the application until the next meeting on December 27, 2004 in order for Board members to visit the site and determine the condition of the structure for themselves.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Douglas Kearley moved that the application be tabled. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved on a 5-1 vote with Joe Sackett abstaining. A time to meet on site will be set at a later date.