

CITY OF MOBILE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

Minutes of the Meeting
January 24, 2005

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Cindy Klotz called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

Ed Hooker, MHDC Architectural Engineer, called the roll as follows:

Members Present: Lynda Burkett, Douglas Kearley, David Tharp, Bunky Ralph, Cindy Klotz, Joe Sackett, Tilmon Brown, Cameron Pfeiffer constituting a quorum.

Members Absent: Michael Mayberry, Harris Oswalt, Robert Brown.

Staff Members Present: Ed Hooker, Anne Crutcher, Devereaux Bemis, Wanda Cochran

<u>In Attendance</u>	<u>Mailing Address</u>	<u>Item Number</u>
Brian Doyle	1752 Hunter Avenue	017-04/05-CA
Jeanelle Cala	1553 Fearnway	019-04/05-CA
Tony Reinhardt	735 Lakeside Drive	017-04/05-CA
Tissa Hans	201 S. Dearborn St.	011-04/05-CA
Enoch Aguilera	1118 Government St.	018-04/05-CA
Don Williams	6300 Piccadilly Square Drive	018-04/05-CA
Mack Lewis	158 S. Jefferson St.	016-04/05-CA

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

Bunky Ralph moved to approve the minutes as mailed. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved.

APPROVAL OF THE MID-MONTH CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

David Tharp moved to approved the mid-month Certificates of Appropriateness approved by staff. The motion was seconded by Cameron Pfeiffer and approved.

MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Reeves Construction
Property Address: 1156 Church Street
Date of Approval: 12/13/04 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house with Timberline shingles, driftwood in color
2. Applicant's Name: William & Robin Strickland
Property Address: 303 South Ann Street
Date of Approval: 12/13/04 weh
Work Approved: Install 3' picket fence in front yard as per submitted fence and site plan. Repaint house following colors:
Body – Ralph Lauren Rhododendron
Trim – Ralph Lauren Deep Cream
Window Sash - Ralph Lauren Embassy Purple
Porch Deck – Charcoal Gray

3. Applicant's Name: Marjorie Bell
Property Address: 1315 Springhill Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/15/04 weh
Work Approved: This COA replaces coa dated 7-18-03 for re-roof to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Repaint house in existing white color scheme.
4. Applicant's Name: Bailey DuMont
Property Address: 162 Roberts Street
Date of Approval: 12/15/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair hurricane damage to carport: replace fascia, soffit and shingles as necessary; repair/replace columns to match existing. Paint new materials white to match existing.
Repairs to main house: caulk and repaint steel casement windows; repaint portico to match existing.
5. Applicant's Name: Saenger Theatre
Property Address: 6-8 S. Joachim Street
Date of Approval: 12/21/04 jdb
Work Approved: Remove canopy over entrance damaged by storm. Remove canopy from Conti Street side, damaged by trucks. Replacements to be submitted at a future date.
6. Applicant's Name: Dr. Atkinson Lt., LTD.
Property Address: 1306 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/10/04 asc
Work Approved: Remove existing signage. Install new signage measuring approximately 49.94 sf. as per submitted designs.
7. Applicant's Name: Stark Irvine
Property Address: 803 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/20/04 asc
Work Approved: Install signage as per submitted design. Sign to be double sided, painted to match trim of building.
8. Applicant's Name: A. Brooks Roofing and Interior
Property Address: 1215 Elmira
Date of Approval: 12/27/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, Autumn brown in color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension.
9. Applicant's Name: G & L Demolition and Construction
Property Address: 200 S. Washington Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/21/04 asc

- Work Approved: Install new 30 year Timberline roof, charcoal black or gray, install new flashing. Add wood vents in gable ends (design to be determined at a later date.)
10. Applicant's Name: Shelia Gerhardt
Property Address: 1750 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/28/04 weh
Work Approved: Install 6' wood dog-eared privacy fence between apartment complex and commercial strip center as per submitted plans. Install 8' wide fence at driveway.
11. Applicant's Name: Jennifer Clark/Darryl Martin
Property Address: 222 S. Dearborn Street
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Renewal of previously issued CoA. Repair fire damage at rear of building including the reproduction of the porch to match the original design. All new materials to match the original in profile and dimension. Paint exterior to match existing color scheme.
12. Applicant's Name: Mel Showers/Tordan Construction
Property Address: 350 S. Ann Street
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab shingle roof, Satin Black in color.
13. Applicant's Name: Wendell Quimby
Property Address: 916 Charleston
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Reroof using black shingles to match existing. Repair/replace rotten/damaged siding with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile. Paint all repairs to match existing.
14. Applicant's Name: Al McMorris
Property Address: 110 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Remove existing glass storefront. Replace with new storefront, matching existing in pane divisions, using new anodized aluminum and tempered glass to meet code requirements.
15. Applicant's Name: Slate and Tile Roofing Company
Property Address: 1664 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged slate roof with materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension.

16. Applicant's Name: Ramona Willis
Property Address: 1721 Fearnway
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with materials matching existing in profile, material, dimension and color. (charcoal blend)
17. Applicant's Name: Dale Halladay
Property Address: 1570 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Continue repair to wooden deck. Install stairs and handrail matching existing in profile and dimension.
18. Applicant's Name: Cheryl Thompson
Property Address: 1118 Elmira (Previously 1150)
Date of Approval: 1/4/05 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, matching existing color. In kind repairs to storm damaged privacy fence. Prep for painting. Replace storm damaged window to match existing.
19. Applicant's Name: Bill Christian
Property Address: 510 Monroe Street
Date of Approval: 1/5/05 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile and materials and dimension. Repaint in the existing color scheme.
20. Applicant's Name: Elon Maintenance and Construction
Property Address: 253 Tuttle
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 asc
Work Approved: Reroof house with 3 tab shingles, Onyx black in color.
21. Applicant's Name: JTB Group
Property Address: 1058 Church
Date of Approval: 1/6/04 asc
Work Approved: Replace storm damaged wood siding with materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing.
22. Applicant's Name: Creola Ruffin
Property Address: 1400-1404 Church Street
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 weh
Work Approved: Spot paint and touch up paint on exterior as needed, matching existing color scheme.
23. Applicant's Name: U.S. Agencies, Tenant, Thompson Electric Sign Co., Fabricator
Property Address: 1500 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 weh

Work Approved: Install signage, measuring 11' long by 28" high, containing approximately 26.4 square feet.

OLD BUSINESS:

- 1. 011-04/05-CA** Mobile Revolving Fund/David Tharp, Architect
Property Address: 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Nature of Request: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. 1108 to be relocated to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residence

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

NEW BUSINESS:

- 1. 016-04/05-CA** 1154 Palmetto Street
Applicant: Dick & Judy Wellington, owners, Mack Lewis, contractor, Douglas Kearley, architect.
Nature of Request: Build 21' x 25' bedroom and bath addition to rear of house, as per submitted plans.

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

- 2. 017-04/05-CA** 1752 Hunter Avenue
Applicant: Brian Doyle
Nature of Request: Install aluminum storm shutters on east & west sides of house. East side shutters to be Colonial as per submitted design, west to be Bahama, as per submitted design. Install hurricane panel hardware on front & back window areas.

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

- 3. 018-04/05-CA** 1112 Government Street
Applicant: Enoch Aguleria, Owner, Don Williams, Engineer
Nature of Request: Relocate historic Bellingrath Garage to vacant lot adjacent to existing bed & breakfast. Install 8 parking spaces as required by City of Mobile Zoning Ordinance. Landscape site, all as per submitted plans.

APPROVED. Certified Record attached.

- 4. 019-04/05-CA** 1553 Fearnway
Applicant: Jeanelle Millet Cala
Nature of Request: Construct a circular concrete driveway in front yard as per submitted plans.

APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS. Certified Record attached.

OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Deveraux Bemis announced the MHDC Leadership Class that will begin after Mardi Gras. It is free to ARB members who register in advance.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

011-04/05-CA 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Historic Development Commission/Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 01/10/05 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 12/27/04 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Relocate 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

Conflicts of Interest: Cameron Pfeiffer, David Tharp recused themselves from discussion and voting on the application.

Additional Information:

The Mobile Revolving Fund acquired these two abandoned and derelict historic properties for the purpose of rehabilitating the structures and selling them to preserve the streetscape along Old Shell Road. Currently 1108 OSR is situated at the rear of the lot. Plans call for the structure to be moved forward 30' and for the two structures to be connected and restored as one single family residence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate two historic structures

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Application History: This application was Tabled pending the Board’s visit to the site to examine the structure proposed to be either moved or dismantled. A copy of the Certified Record from the project’s first review is attached.

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment, the proposed restoration will not impair the historic integrity of the structures or the district.

- A. The following is a list of proposed changes to the structures:
 - 1. move 1108 OSR forward 30’
 - 2. construct a connector between 1108 and 1110 OSR
 - a. connector to resemble glassed-in porch
 - 3. rehabilitate the structures as follows:

- a. stabilize foundations and repair any structural damage
- b. repair/replace rotten siding as necessary
- c. repair/replace deteriorated windows
- d. repair/replace deteriorated exterior doors
- e. repair/replace deteriorated soffit, cornice and fascia
- f. repair/replace deteriorated or missing porch details
- g. re-roof entire structure
- h. install new concrete ribbon drive and gravel parking as per site plan
- i. landscape property to meet City of Mobile's Landscape Ordinance

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Front steps to be more historic in nature with handrail to match new porch rail.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Tissa Hans and John Dendy, members of the Revolving Fund Board, appeared to answer questions regarding the application.

Staff explained on request of Board member Lynda Burkett to explain why the application was held over. Staff explained that the language used in the application, specifically "demolition" posed problems for the Board.

John Dendy explained that demolition of 1108 Old Shell Road was not the intent of the MRF. He explained that 1108 will be moved forward and that a connector between 1108 and 1110 will be constructed. This connector will have a built-up roof with a low slope and be contemporary in nature, thus distinguishing it from the historic houses—a classic design approach to differentiate old from new.

John Dendy also stated that MRF is in agreement with the staff recommendation to construct a more historic stair at 1108.

Staff explained that a more historic stair would mean entrance steps placed between the two middle columns with handrail to match porch railing.

No one else spoke in favor of or in opposition to the application.

There was no public comment to enter into the record.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no additional Board discussion.

FINDING OF FACT

Lynda Burkett moved to find the facts in the staff report. The motion was seconded by Joe Sackett and approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Bunky Ralph moved that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Board finds that the proposed work which included incompatible stairs impairs the character of the building and the historic district. Bunky Ralph also moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the stairs at 1108 be altered to be more historic in character.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 01/24/06.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

016-04/05-CA 1154 Palmetto Street
Applicant: Dick & Judy Wellington, owners, Mack Lewis, contractor, Douglas Kearley, architect.
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Conflicts of Interest: Douglas Kearley recused himself from discussion and voting on the application.
Nature of Project: Build 21' x 25' bedroom and bath addition to rear of house, as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Additions	Construct rear addition

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a two story ca. 1899 frame vernacular Victorian residence with a two story front porch and an end gable roof.
 - 2. There is currently no rear addition.
 - 3. The proposed addition measures 25' long by 21' wide.
 - 4. The first floor rear porch is glassed in with 3 equal glazed bays.
 - 5. The proposed addition continues this glassed-in area with an additional six bays.
 - 6. Site coverage and setbacks are within the parameters allowed by the zoning ordinance.
 - 7. The proposed addition contains a gallery space and a master suite.
 - 8. An end gable roof will be constructed over the whole rear addition.
 - 9. A half-round deck with two sets of steps leading to the back yard and drive to be constructed at rear of addition.
 - 10. The Materials List and Design Details are appropriate for this structure.
 - a. siding to match existing;
 - b. salvaged windows to match existing;
 - c. brick piers with framed lattice infill to match existing;
 - d. cornice, soffit, fascia, corner boards to match those of the main house;
 - e. replication in gallery space of existing gallery glazing.

11. The proposed addition will not be visible from public view.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Contractor Mack Lewis appeared before the Board. He had no additions to the application. Board members asked if the addition would continue the windows on the east elevation. Mack Lewis responded by saying that the windows will be wood frame and fixed glass to match the existing.

There was no one else to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

There were no comments given to staff to enter into the record.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no additional Board discussion.

FINDING OF FACT

Joe Sackett moved to find the facts in the staff report. The motion was seconded by Tilmon Brown and approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

David Tharp moved that the proposed work does not impair the building or the historic district. The motion was seconded by Bunky Ralph and approved.

Bunky Ralph moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 01/24/06.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

017-04/05-CA 1752 Hunter Avenue
Applicant: Brian Doyle
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Install aluminum storm shutters on east & west sides of house.
East side shutters to be Colonial as per submitted design, west to be Bahama, as per submitted design. Install hurricane panel hardware on front & back window areas.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Blinds, Shutters and Awnings	Install shutters and hurricane panel hardware

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a one story stucco-covered bungalow, vernacular in design, incorporating several different Craftsman/Arts & Crafts details combined with a Mediterranean influence, including an arched recessed porch under a monolithic hipped roof, multi-pane over single pane wood window sash, rough stucco exterior and attic dormer.
 - 2. The existing windows are Craftsman inspired nine-over-one wood windows, with a large pane in the center surrounded by rectangular panels and squares in the corners.
 - 3. Historically, shutters were not used on Craftsman-style bungalows because of deep overhangs and larger-sized windows than more traditional architectural styles; however, some examples do exist.
 - 4. Shutters, when used, were operable and oversized to cover double or triple windows (for utilitarian purposes) or fixed as decorative elements.

Staff recommends approval with the following condition:

That the shutters be decorative in nature but operable

That where Bahama shutters a proposed, smaller single shutters be used.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Doyle and his contractor appeared before the Board. He discussed that he would like to use operable Colonial shutters on the east side of the house. A non-operational rod would be placed on these shutters in order that they would appear operable. On the west side where there is a hedge, he would use Bahama shutters.

The staff suggestion of using a single shutter on the windows adjacent to the chimney will not work due to their weight. There is also not enough room between windows on that elevation to use operable Colonial shutters.

Staff concurred that there was not enough room for operable Colonial shutters.

There was no one else to speak in favor of or in opposition to the application.

Staff had no public comment to enter into the record.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board expressed concern over the request for two different shutter types on the house. In addition there was concern about adding shutters to a house that never had shutters.

FINDING OF FACT

Lynda Burkett moved to find the facts in the staff report and added the following facts:

5. the shutters are operable and 6. the shutters will have fixed louvers. Bunky Ralph seconded the motion which was approved

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Lynda Burkett moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing that that the application does not impair the historic building or the adjacent historic district. The motion was seconded by Joe Sackett and passed on a 5 to 2 vote.

Lynda Burkett moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by David Tharp and approved.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 01/24/06.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

018-04/05-CA 1114 Government Street
Applicant: Enoch Aguilera, Owner, Don Williams, Engineer
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Relocate historic Bellingrath Garage to vacant lot adjacent to existing bed & breakfast. Install 8 parking spaces as required by City of Mobile Zoning Ordinance. Landscape site, all as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3		Move Historic Building

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff’s judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is one and ½ story late Victorian vernacular residence, wood frame with a complex gable roof.
 - 2. The structure proposed to be moved is all that remains of the Walter Bellingrath property that once stood facing Ann Street.
 - 3. The garage structure was designed by architect George Rogers and contains a staircase identical to the service stair at the Bellingrath Home in south Mobile County.
 - 4. The garage is a two story L-shaped wood frame structure with wood lap siding and end gable roof.
 - 5. The proposed front setback for the garage is approximately 68’ from the sidewalk.
 - 6. The existing Victorian residence is set back approximately 37’ from the sidewalk.
 - 7. The garage structure will share a common drive with the Central Park development to the east.
 - 8. The garage structure will have 8 parking spaces of stamped asphalt in the rear of the property.
 - 9. Landscaping will be submitted with the rehabilitation plans for the garage structure at a later date.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Owner Enoch Aguilera and engineer M. Don Williams appeared before the Board. They explained their intention to relocate the Bellingrath Garage to this site. Since the lot is only 57 ft. wide, once the garage is relocated, there is not enough room to permit circulation to the rear. A solution to this problem will be shared access to the rear of the property from the development to the east.

The Board asked about the use of the relocated building and were informed that it will be an independent Bed and Breakfast adjacent to the existing Bed and Breakfast at 1118 The owner stated that his application has not been heard by the Board of Zoning Adjustment or the Planning Commission at this time.

Mr. Aguilera asked the Board for help in maintaining the historic character of the building, both on the exterior and the interior, in the face of alterations required by the building department under the International Building Code

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion by the Board.

FINDING OF FACT

David Tharp moved to find the facts in the staff report. The motion was seconded by Bunky Ralph and approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

David Tharp moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and at the meeting that the proposal does not impair the integrity of the building or adjacent historic district and that a CoA should be issued for the site plan. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved. The applicant must return to the Board with elevation drawings and details since this approval was for the site plan only.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

019-04/05-CA 1553 Fearnway
Applicant: Jeanelle Millet Cala
Received: 1/10/05 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/25/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Conflicts of Interest: Cindy Klotz recused herself from discussion and voting on the application.
Nature of Project: Construct a circular concrete driveway in front yard as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Drives, Walks & Parking	Install circular drive

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is not in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a ca. 1927 Tudor Revival residence.
 - 2. The Design Review Guidelines state that “Circular drives and parking pads in the front yard are generally inappropriate in the historic districts.”
 - 3. The linear front footage of the lot is approximately 102'. Typical lots in the Fearnway sub-division are 75'-80' wide.
 - 4. The site situation is unique in that the house has a Fearnway address but the driveway is off Catherine Street.
 - 5. On the opposite side of the entrance to Fearnway, the residences at 56 and 1552 Fearnway share a common alley off Catherine Street, providing ample safety for ingress/egress.
 - 6. The circular drive is proposed to provide a safe means of access to the property.
 - 7. Heavy landscaping is proposed to minimize the effect of the circular drive.

Staff recommends denial as submitted with the following recommendation:

- That a parking pad be installed off the main drive close to the existing front entrance;
- That the concrete be stained and/or stamped to match the color of the brick on the main house.
- That the area in front of the parking pad be heavily landscaped to hide the cars.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Owner Jeanelle Cala appeared before the Board to explain the safety issues created by having to back out from her driveway onto Catherine Street. She stated that she had had an accident in December and stressed that parking on Fearnway is equally dangerous.

The Board asked about shifting the location of the drive to Fearnway. The applicant explained that there is an easement and piping on that side and she would prefer not to place a concrete drive over that easement.

She presented photographs of other circular drives in the area and stated that her submitted planting plan would hide the circular drive.

Lynda Burkett asked whether there were other circular drives in Fearnway. Ms. Cala responded that there were no circular drives but the lots were rectangular and there was room to drive behind the house, park and turn around. Her lot is an unusual pie shaped lot in the subdivision.

There was discussion about having an additional curb cut. The applicant has not contacted Traffic Engineering or the Right of Way Department to discuss that issue.

The owner considered the staff proposal to have parking spaces on the Catherine Street side shielded by plantings unworkable.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was discussion concerning the fact that circular drives are not permitted under the Guidelines.

FINDING OF FACT

Lynda Burkett moved to find the facts in the staff report and added the following facts:

8. there are no other circular drives in Fearnway and 9. no application to Traffic Engineering or Right of Way requesting two curb cuts has been made. The motion was seconded by Tilmon Brown and approved.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Lynda Burkett moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing that the proposed circular drive impairs the historic building and the neighborhood. The motion was seconded by Cameron Pfeiffer and approved. David Tharp and Douglas Kearley voted in opposition.

David Tharp moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness on condition that an alternative scheme with one curb cut and not circular in nature be submitted. The motion was seconded by Douglas Kearley and approved. The motion was opposed by Joe Sackett.

Staff will work with the applicant's landscape architect to revise the site plan.

Certificate of Appropriateness Expiration Date: 01/24/06.