

**CITY OF MOBILE**  
**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD**

Minutes of the Meeting  
November 13, 2006

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

Bunky Ralph, Chair, called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m. Anne Crutcher called the roll as follows:

- **Members Present:** Tilmon Brown, Douglas Kearley, Michael Mayberry, Harris Oswalt, Cameron Pfeiffer, Bunky Ralph, Joe Sackett, David Tharp, Jim Wagoner.
- **Members Absent:** Robert Brown
- **Staff Members Present:** Aileen de la Torre, Anne Crutcher, John Lawler

**In Attendance:**

Don Williams  
Kirk Barrett

**Mailing Address:**

6300 Piccadilly Square Drive  
226 General Canby Loop

**Item Number:**

118-06-CA  
118-06-CA

David Tharp moved to approve the minutes of the last meeting as emailed. The motion was seconded by Douglas Kearley and unanimously approved.

David Tharp moved to approve the mid-month Certificates of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Douglas Kearley and unanimously approved.

**B. MID-MONTH APPROVALS**

1. **Applicant's Name:** Ronald Leslie/Teresa Powe  
**Property Address:** 1009 New St. Francis Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 19, 2006  
Install handicap accessible ramp to rear of house per submitted plans.
2. **Applicant's Name:** Robert Bassett  
**Property Address:** 302 South Monterey Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 20, 2006  
Repair to rotten wood as necessary with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile. Paint exterior in existing color scheme.
3. **Applicant's Name:** Kittrell & Middlebrooks LLC/M&A Stamp  
**Property Address:** 459 Dauphin Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 23, 2006  
Install window sign on glass. Sign to have white letters and is less than 5 square feet.
4. **Applicant's Name:** David Rasp  
**Property Address:** 72 South Royal Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 24, 2006  
Install wall sign totaling 25 square feet. Sign to be constructed of black poly-metal letters applied to the façade. Sign to be illuminated by 3-4 gooseneck lights.
5. **Applicant's Name:** Dean Watson  
**Property Address:** 1355 Old Shell Road  
**Date of Approval:** October 25, 2006  
Install 16x14 foot rear deck to replace former rotted deck. Install handrail per MHDC design.
6. **Applicant's Name:** S&E Construction LLC  
**Property Address:** 956 Elmira Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 25, 2006  
Restructure roof rafters as necessary. Install new decking and match shingles to existing.

7. **Applicant's Name:** Kimberly Tew  
**Property Address:** 9 Semmes Avenue  
**Date of Approval:** October 27, 2006

Replace rotten wood as necessary on main house to include siding with materials matching existing in profile, dimension and material. Paint house in the existing color scheme.

8. **Applicant's Name:** Ruby Pettway  
**Property Address:** 303 Marine Street  
**Date of Approval:** October 27, 2006  
Install new 3-tab shingle roof, black in color.

#### **C. NOTICES OF VIOLATION and MUNICIPAL OFFENSE TICKETS**

1. No NoVs or MoTs were written during this time period.

#### **D. NEW BUSINESS**

1. **118-06-CA:** 201 North Jackson Street  
**Applicant:** Bar Pilots Association/Don Williams  
**Request:** Construct a two-story, commercial, brick building (1200 SF per floor) with a parking lot for twelve vehicles.

#### **Application Denied.**

#### **E. OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

1. The Board of Adjustment approved the Holiday Inn sign as submitted, including the material of the sign. The Board had expressed concern over the sign material.
2. David Rasp received a temporary Certificate of Occupancy for 72 South Royal. Staff will revert it to a permanent certificate once Mr. Rasp hides the concrete block seams of the exterior courtyard wall with stucco or an acceptable alternative material.

**There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:00 p.m.**

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**118-06-CA:** 201 North Jackson Street  
**Applicant:** Bar Pilots Association/Don Williams  
**Received:** 10/31/06 (+45 Days: 12/15/06)  
**Meeting:** 11/13/06

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

**Historic District:** DeTonti Square  
**Classification:** Non-Contributing  
**Zoning:** R-B  
**Project:** Construct a two-story, commercial, brick building (1200 SF per floor) with a parking lot for twelve vehicles.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This is currently an empty lot that formerly had a number of residences.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. Build Two-Story Charleston Single House Per Submitted Plans
1. Currently, 201 North Jackson Street is an empty lot on the corner of North Jackson and St. Anthony in a commercial area of the DeTonti Square Historic District. The lot retains some minor elements of the former landscape.
  2. The Guidelines for New Residential and Commercial Construction state “the goal of new construction should be to blend into the historic district but to avoid creating a false sense of history...by using historic examples as a point of departure it is possible for new construction to...fit into the historic district.”
  3. The property owner is proposing to build a Charleston Single House for commercial use on the lot. The front façade will face North Jackson and the side porch will face St. Anthony. The plan includes the following:
    - a. Build a 2400 SF, two-story, brick Charleston Single House on a 29” continuous brick on concrete foundation. Brick and mortar samples must be provided.
    - b. Maintain a building setback of 25’ from St. Anthony and 5’ from North Jackson.
    - c. Install six-over-six, vinyl clad windows with operable wood shutters and one round window at the second story porch facing toward the front.
    - d. Install four-panel, wood exterior doors with 2030 transoms. There is a discrepancy between the drawings and the door schedule; however, the drawings are correct.
    - e. Install a decorative cast iron guardrail with iron columns at the side porch. The design will be submitted.
    - f. Paint. A paint schedule will be submitted once the building is near completion.
- B. Install Twelve-Space Parking Lot Per Submitted Plans
1. Currently, 201 North Jackson Street is an empty lot on the corner of North Jackson and St. Anthony in a commercial area of the DeTonti Square Historic District. The lot retains some minor elements of the former landscape.
  2. The Design Review Guidelines state that parking areas should have a “design, location and materials [that are] compatible with the property. The appearance...should be minimized through good site planning and design [and] screened from view by the use of low masonry walls, wood or iron fences or landscaping.”

3. The property owner is proposing to install a parking lot for twelve vehicles at the rear of the building, the entrance of which will be from St. Anthony. The plan includes the following:
    - a. Install an asphalt parking lot 22' from the rear façade of the building to cover 5200 SF of hard surface area.
    - b. Create twelve parking spaces, including one handicapped space, within the lot. The minimum allowable number of spaces for this building size is four.
    - c. Allocate 10'x20' for each parking space with a 25' aisle. The minimum allowable space size is 9'x18' with a 23' aisle.
    - d. Locate a handicapped access ramp between the building and the parking lot leading to the rear entrance.
    - e. Surround the lot with a low shrub buffer.
- C. Other Elements
1. The proposal highlights a number of additional items that include:
    - a. Replace the existing driveway entrances along St. Anthony with grass, a concrete sidewalk and a granite curb.
    - b. Install a 4' wide concrete sidewalk along North Jackson.
    - c. Relocate the existing light pole at the proposed curb cut.
    - d. Remove the existing 5" oaks at the proposed sidewalk.
  2. These items will need to be addressed by Right-of-Way and/or Urban Forestry once the Architectural Review Board has reviewed them.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff feels there are a number of items in this proposal that will negatively affect the integrity of the DeTonti Square Historic District. In order to better fit into the district, staff recommends the following changes:

- Relocate the building to maintain a setback on St. Anthony that is more in line with the setbacks of the district, which range from 0' to 10'.
- Retain and expand the existing masonry retaining wall at the Right-of-Way boundary. The vast majority of buildings with a greater than 0' setback have a landscape element such as a fence, retaining wall or border at the boundary between the property and the Right-of-Way. The wall is not addressed in the proposal.
- Minimize the impact of the parking lot by
  - Relocating the lot closer to the building;
  - Reducing the number of spaces to the minimum required;
  - Paving any overflow spaces with an alternative material, such as grasspave or grasscrete;
  - Using the minimum required sizes for the parking spaces and aisle.
- Retain the oak trees at the rear of the property by the proposed parking lot. The trees are addressed in the proposal, but the property owner does not indicate their intention.

The proposal highlights elements along the Right-of-Way. Those elements that will be altered are referred to in Item C; however the proposal does not indicate what the property owners intend with the rest. Staff recommends retaining and repairing those elements that conserve the historic integrity of the district, such as the cast-iron streetlights.

Staff recommends approval of the application if these provisos are met. The applicant will need to receive additional approval from Right-of-Way and/or Urban Forestry for Item C.

## **PUBLIC TESTIMONY**

Don Williams and Captain Kirk Barrett were present to discuss the application. Mrs. Barrett arrived later. Staff had an objection to the application by the Order of Myths read into the record. The Board then questioned Don Williams and the Barretts about unclear points in the application.

Mr. Williams and the Barretts explained that the building originally had a 5' setback, but they moved it to 25' per staff's suggestion. The area between the street and the building would have landscape buffering. Mr. Williams agreed to relocate the building to a setback more amenable to the district.

Mr. Williams and the Barretts explained although there is a minimum four-space parking requirement, there are twelve owners. Therefore, they were requesting twelve spaces with one handicapped accessible space. The

parking lot must have a 28' ramp for handicapped access per code. The parking spaces are 9'x20' with a 24' aisle for comfortable driving. The Board asserted that the area must remain residential and to soften the parking lot with alternative materials. Mr. Williams said they can either pave with an alternative material or have six hard spaces and six grass spaces, but it will be January before they can get approval from the Board of Adjustment.

Mr. Williams and the Barretts explained that the columns would be iron. The closed shutters are false windows placed on the façade to create a better balance. The other shutters are operable. The doors and transoms on the drawings (front and left side elevations) are not to scale. The small window on the right side elevation is over a kitchen sink.

Mr. Williams and the Barretts explained the building will be a beige-colored Boral brick (painted brick) and all the architectural elements, such as the columns, guardrail, roof, doors and shutters, will be black. The Board was concerned that the building looked more commercial than residential.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board discussed the application at length, suggesting a number of design alternatives. The Board felt that perhaps changing the bond of the brick would soften the harsh look of the building. The Board also mentioned that Charleston houses typically have hipped roofs with parapets instead of a gable.

### **FINDING OF FACT**

Cameron Pfeiffer moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Board finds the facts in the Staff report. The motion was seconded by David Tharp and unanimously approved. Harris Oswald moved that the new building would impair the integrity of the historic district. The motion was seconded by Douglas Kearley and unanimously approved.

### **DECISION ON THE APPLICATION**

The Board felt that there were too many problems with the design of the building and how it would fit into the district. Tilmon Brown moved to create a Design Review Subcommittee to meet with the applicants with in the next few days. The motion was seconded by Jim Wagoner and unanimously approved. David Tharp moved to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Douglas Kearley and unanimously approved.

The volunteers for the Design Review Subcommittee are Tilmon Brown, Douglas Kearley and David Tharp.