

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA
September 19, 2012 – 3:00 P.M.
Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

- 1. Applicant: Richard Armstrong with Modern Signs for Atchison Home**
 - a. Property Address: 921 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 8/28/12
 - c. Project: Construct a new monument sign. The aluminum double-faced signage will be affixed to a 5' tall brick sign structure (per submitted plan). The signage will rely upon ground level illumination. The total square footage of the signage will not exceed 30 square feet.
- 2. Applicant: Modern Signs for LODA Bier Garten**
 - a. Property Address: 251 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 8/30/12
 - c. Project: Install signage within the existing armature of a wall suspended double-faced sign. The aluminum sign will feature neon graphics. This sign, one original to the building, has always featured neon signage.
- 3. Applicant: Jeremy Milling**
 - a. Property Address: 9 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 9/6/12
 - c. Project: Install a hanging sign from the underside of the building's marquee. The total square footage of the double-faced aluminum signage will be 24 square feet. The signage will feature the names of the occupying tenants and will meet (height) passage requirements.
- 4. Applicant: Mary Katherine Killam**
 - a. Property Address: 105 Houston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 9/7/12
 - c. Project: Install metal handrails on the front steps. This reversible intervention will be painted green to match the decking and other detailing of the house.
- 5. Applicant: Douglas Hunter**
 - a. Property Address: 261 North Joachim Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 9/7/12
 - c. Project: Paint the shutters and the front gate white.
- 6. Applicant: Archdiocese of Mobile**
 - a. Property Address: 352 Government Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 9/7/12
 - c. Project: Replace existing reflective film with a bronzed film providing 78% protection.

7. Applicant: Mobile Fence

- a. Property Address: 1702 Laurel Street
- b. Date of Approval: 9/7/12
- c. Project: Construct a picket fence enclosing the front lawn. Said fence will feature a gated entry. Construct a six foot interior lot privacy fence with a vehicular gate at the end to driveway enclosing the backyard.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2012-57-CA: 17 Blacklawn

- a. Applicant: Bob and Janie Windham
- b. Project: Reroofing – Reroof a house with metal roofing.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

- 1. Discussion

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF REPORT

2012-57-CA: 17 Blacklawn
Applicant: Bob and Janie Windham
Received: 8/14/12
Meeting: 9/19/12

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Reroofing – Reroof a house with metal roofing.

BUILDING HISTORY

This brick bungalow dates from 1930. The Arts and Crafts informed dwelling features a large porch and an impressive roof structure.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property has never appeared before the Architectural Review Board. The applicants propose the installation of a metal roof.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “A roof is one of the most dominant features of a building. Original or historic roof forms, as well as the original pitch of the roof should be maintained. Materials should be appropriate to the form and the pitch and the color.”
- C. **Scope of Work (per submitted materials):**
 - 1. Remove the existing asbestos roof.
 - 2. Install Max-Rib exposed fastener roofing panels.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This application involves the installation of a metal roof. Metal roofing is a traditional roofing material in Mobile. As the 19th Century progressed, the variety of metal roofing alternatives and their application increased though their use faded in the early part of the 20th Century. Both frame & masonry and

residential & commercial buildings featured metal roofs. Standing seam panels and individual shingles were the most common types of metal roofing. 5-V crimp was another alternative.

Metal roofs are reviewed on a case by case basis. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state that roofing materials should be appropriate to the form, pitch, and color of the roof (See B-1).

Assessing roof form or configuration involves evaluation of a roof's plan. This house is surmounted by a configuration of interlocking gable and one hipped roof structures. While not complex, the roof structure is more complicated than the fully encompassing gable or hipped roof structures that typically surmount most bungalows.

The roof pitch is not particularly steep.

The color of the roofing is historically appropriate.

This house features an asbestos shingle roof which provides a significant three dimensional aspect. The compartmentalization and the pattern created by the individual shingles serve to break the plan of the roof expanses. Higher end Arts and Crafts-influenced "bungalows" such as this brick example did not often feature metal sheet roofing. Staff recommends that the applicant consider a roofing alternative that is more in keeping with the style of the house. Said option should take into account the visual differentiation allowed by individual shingles.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1), Staff believes this application will impair the architectural and the historical character of the building. Staff does not recommend approval of this application.