

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA**  
**September 1, 2010 – 3:00 P.M.**  
**Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

**B. MID MONTH APPROVALS**

1. **Applicant: Charles Weems for Thomas Rue**
  - a. Property Address: 124 Ryan Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/9/10
  - c. Project: Replace the front door unit. The work will match the existing in profile, dimension, and material. The door and frame will have a natural finish. The existing hardware will be reused.
2. **Applicant: Colin Rutledge**
  - a. Property Address: 16 Macy Place
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/12/10
  - c. Project: Replace rotten wood as necessary to match original in profile and dimension, repaint house in existing color scheme.
3. **Applicant: Jimmie Lignos for Ladas Construction**
  - a. Property Address: 50 South Ann Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/10/10
  - c. Project: Install 6' high, dog-eared, wood privacy fence along southern lot line. This is an interior lot line fence. Fence must stop at the plane of the house at 67 Bradford Avenue.
4. **Applicant: Tony Atchison**
  - a. Property Address: 1104 Dauphin Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/12/10
  - c. Project: Repaint the Bakery Restaurant portion of building. The body will be white dove and the sashes will be Overt Green (Benjamin Moore chart).
5. **Applicant: Tamara Taylor**
  - a. Property Address: 1252 Government Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/12/10
  - c. Project: Place one inch white lettering for signage on front door.
6. **Applicant: Virginia Edington**
  - a. Property Address: 1058 Old Shell Road
  - b. Date of Approval: 10/16/10
  - c. Project: Renew a COA of February 7, 2008 authorizing the installation of 6' interior lot privacy fence and a 3' privacy fence per the submitted plans. The plan will be altered to bring western fence in line the west side of the house (as opposed to abutting the fence). A sliding gate will be located over the drive. Construct a deck off the rear elevation. The deck will measure 25' in length and 10' in depth. It will feature a north facing flight of stairs with an MHDC stock railing to match that on the deck. Paint per a color scheme to be submitted at a later date.
7. **Applicant: Jerry Deas for the Mobile Archdiocese**
  - a. Property Address: 400 Government Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 8/17/10
  - c. Project: Remove the collapsed carport from the property.

**8. Applicant: Anne Read for Stella and Ray Hestor**

- a. Property Address: 1007 Palmetto Street
- b. Date of Approval: 8/18/10
- c. Project: Remove the existing wooden front steps. Construct a new flight of wooden steps. The railings will match the porch's balustrade.

**9. Applicant: Nancy Seibt**

- a. Property Address: 112 Beverly Court
- b. Date of Approval: 8/18/10
- c. Project: Install a six foot high interior lot wooden privacy from the northwest corner of the lot 21 feet along the west lot line.

**C. APPLICATIONS**

**1. 2010-64-CA: 207 Lanier Avenue**

- a. Applicant: Lucy Barr for Mr. & Mrs. Angus Cooper
- b. Project: Construct a rear addition off the main house. Construct a connector between the main house and the old garage. Install interior lot fencing. Make repairs and alterations to the old garage.

**2. 2010-64-CA: 957 Dauphin Street**

- a. Applicant: Mr. Scott Phillips
- b. Project: Install an etched glass panel in the front door.

**D. OTHER BUSINESS**

- 1. Midmonth Approvals
- 2. Discussion

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2010-64-CA:** 207 Lanier Avenue  
**Applicant:** Lucy Barr for Mr. and Mrs. Angus Cooper  
**Received:** 8/16/10  
**Meeting:** 9/1/10

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Ashland Place  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Construct a rear addition off the main house. Construct a connector between the main house and the old garage. Install interior lot fencing. Make repairs and alterations to the old garage.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This Mediterranean influenced house was built in 1912 according to the plans of C. L. Hutchisson, Sr.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on September 3, 2008. At that time the Board approved alterations to a chimney located on the south elevation. The applicants propose the construction of rear additions, the installation of interior lot fencing, and the renovation of old the garage.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Historic Rehabilitation state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”
  - 2. “New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential forma and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Construct an addition off the northwest corner of the house.
    - a. The addition will be minimally visible from the public right of way.
    - b. The addition will be located behind an addition approved on September 27, 2007.
    - c. The addition’s first floor will measure 25’ 3” in length and 8’ 6” in depth.

- d. The west elevation's first floor window will be reused.
  - e. The foundation, fenestration, wall, and eave treatments will match the existing.
  - f. The roof pitch of the single story portion of the addition will match the existing.
  - g. The roof tiles will match the existing.
  - h. The second story of the addition will measure 11' 6" in length and 12' in depth.
  - i. The second story portion of the addition will extend from the northwest corner of the house.
  - j. The second story will feature a four-over-one wooden window on the west elevation.
  - k. The beltcourse will be continued around the addition.
  - l. A hipped roof with eaves and tiles matching the existing will surmount the second story of the addition.
2. Install interior lot fencing.
    - a. The HVAC units of the northwest corner of the house will be moved further to the west.
    - b. A 6' stucco-faced concrete block wall will enclose the mechanical units.
    - c. Remove the chain link fence extending along the North lot line.
    - d. A 6' stucco-faced concrete block wall will extend along the northern lot line.
    - e. A 3' wide iron gate located between wall and the northwest corner of the garage will provide access to and from the yard, as well as security and privacy.
3. Construct a connector between the house and the garage.
    - a. The connector will measure 18.2' feet in length and 18.2' in width.
    - b. The foundation, wall, fenestration, eave and roofing material will match the existing.
    - c. A truncated, flat-top gable roof will extend over the connector.
    - d. The North Elevation will feature a twelve-over-one window and a multi-light French door.
    - e. A flight of steps featuring Castlestone pavers matching the existing will allow for ingress and egress.
    - f. The South Elevation will feature a recessed porch accessed by a flight of steps featuring Castlestone pavers.
    - g. A pair of wooden French doors with sidelights and flanking twelve-over-one windows will comprise the South Elevations fenestration.
    - h. Castlestone pavers will be utilized on the porch floor.
  4. Make repairs to and alterations of the old garage.
    - a. Replace terracotta tiles on the roof to match the existing.
    - b. Paint the garage to match the main house.
    - c. Remove the five southernmost fenestrated bays on the east elevation.
    - d. Face the wall surfaces of 4 (c) with stucco to match the adjacent surfaces.
    - e. Remove a pair of windows from the West Elevation.
    - f. Face the wall surfaces of 4 (e) with stucco to match the adjacent surfaces.
    - g. Install a stucco-faced chimney that will slightly protrude from the South Elevation
    - h. Remove a door from the southwest corner of the South Elevation.
    - i. Install two pairs of wooden multi-light French doors to either side of the chimney.

## STAFF ANALYSIS

This application involves the construction of a small rear addition, the construction of a connector between the house and the old garage, the alteration of the old garage, and the construction of interior lot fencing.

The proposed rear addition would extend from a later rear addition approved on September 24, 2007. Given the depth of the lot and location of the addition, the view of proposed work would be minimal. Only the smaller second story portion of the addition would be visible from the public view. The wall, fenestration, and roofing treatments would match the existing.

The proposed connector will not be visible from the street. The wall, fenestration, and roofing treatment will match the existing.

The proposed interior lot fencing would require the removal of the existing nonconforming chain link fence. The proposed 6' high stuccoed fencing is keeping with style and character of the house. The fencing does not exceed the height requirements established by the Guidelines for Mobile's historic districts.

With regards to the old garage, the applicants wish to retain and renovate the old ancillary structure. In recent years, several of the older garages that typified the back lots of the Ashland Place Historic District have been demolished. The repairs constitute simple routine maintenance. The majority of proposed alterations to the fenestration would not be visible from the public view. The essential form of the building would remain intact.

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on B (1-2), Staff does not believe this application impairs the architectural or the historical character of the building or the district. Staff recommends approval of the application.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2010-65-CA: 957 Dauphin Street**  
**Applicant: Mr. Scott Phillips**  
**Received: 8/18/10**  
**Meeting: 9/1/10**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: B-1  
Project: Install an etched glass panel in the front door.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This apartment house was built in late 1940s according to the designs of Mobile architect Harry Inge Johnstone. The absence of historical ornamentation and the reliance upon geometric forms make this building one of the finest Modernist buildings in the City.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property has never appeared before the Architectural Review Board. The applicant proposes the installation of an etched glass panel in the front door.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “Often one of the most important decorative features of a building, doorways reflect the age and style of a building. Original doors and openings should be retained along with any moldings, transoms or sidelights. Replacements should respect the age and style of the building.”
  - 2. “Doors with leaded or art glass may be appropriate when documentation exists for their use, or when they are compatible with design and style of the structure.”
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Remove the existing glazed plain panel from the upper half of the front door.
  - 2. Repair and stabilize the door. The repair work will match the existing.
  - 3. Install an etched glass window per the submitted design.

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

This building is an exemplar of mid 20<sup>th</sup>-century Modern architecture. Few residential buildings of such high quality modern design and detailing were constructed in Mobile. The applicant proposes altering the front door.

The original door survives intact. The Guidelines state that art glass doors are only appropriate when documentation exists for their use or when their use is compatible with style of the building. This building neither featured glazing with etched figural motifs, nor was such glazing typically employed in Mobile's modern style residences.

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on B (1), Staff believes this application impairs the architectural integrity of the building and the district. Staff does not recommend approval of this application.