

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA**  
**May 3, 2017 – 3:00 P.M.**  
**Multi Purpose, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

**B. MID MONTH APPROVALS**

- 1. Applicant: Kelly Smith**
  - a. Property Address: 1658 Laurel Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/12/2017
  - c. Project: Repaint exterior.
- 2. Applicant: Mark Perea of Skyline Home Improvements Inc.**
  - a. Property Address: 1751 Dauphin Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/13/2017
  - c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles in slate gray.
- 3. Applicant: David Buchannan**
  - a. Property Address: 252 Church Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/13/2017
  - c. Project: Install 3' aluminum fence around the south and east perimeter sides of lot. Install a vegetative buffer on same sides. Landscape and repave lot.
- 4. Applicant: Robert DeMouy of DeMouy General Contracting Inc.**
  - a. Property Address: 412 Dauphin Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/17/2017
  - c. Project: Replace one door to match existing. Replace three front, two sides, and five rear, wood balcony decks to match existing in profile dimension, and material. Repaint to match.
- 5. Applicant: Mari Muscat**
  - a. Property Address: 56 S. Hallett Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/19/2017
  - c. Project: Remove and replace existing fence around the back half of the house to match existing. Replace rotten back wall of garden shed in the back yard. Replace all rotten balusters on front porch railing with custom to match in profile, material and dimension. Exterior paint for entire structure including the back garden shed in approved colors. Add outer shutters to façade of home in the correct proportion to the existing windows. Replace existing concrete driveway entrance from the sidewalk to the street. Replace existing wood steps at front entrance with concrete steps finished in such a way to keep original historic character of the home.
- 6. Applicant: Roger Franklin**
  - a. Property Address: 205 Marine Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 4/20/2017
  - c. Project: Landscape front yard to include gravel path and water feature. Brick pavers will be installed from sidewalk to front door.

**7. Applicant: Elique Guerra**

- a. Property Address: 1104 Selma Street
- b. Date of Approval: 4/20/2017
- c. Project: Construct 6' wooden dogeared fence.

**8. Applicant: Chris Menke**

- a. Property Address: 208 Dexter Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 4/21/2017
- c. Project: Reconstruct balustrade using MHDC stock design and similar turned post which are period appropriate. Paint to match existing color scheme.

**9. Applicant: Duane Myers**

- a. Property Address: 1052 New St. Francis
- b. Date of Approval: 4/24/2017
- c. Project: Reroof dwelling with architectural shingles in weatherwood. Replicate kneebrace located on West gable in East gable. Construct and install four perkins to surmount eaves on each gable to be spaced equidistant.

**10. Applicant: Elizabeth Rossi**

- a. Property Address: 1157 Old Shell Road
- b. Date of Approval: 4/24/2017
- c. Project: Repaint Color - Hazy Purple Color. Repair and replace damaged wood siding as needed with matching existing siding, Profile, & Dimension. Reglaze Windows as necessary. Replace existing damaged Lattice skirting with square lattice, set back from face of brick piers.

**11. Applicant: Fred South of Renovations by Fred South LLC**

- a. Property Address: 17 S. Lafayette Street
- b. Date of Approval: 4/24/2017
- c. Project: Remove broke concrete tile porch deck (later) and replace with tongue and groove wood.

**12. Applicant: Tim Maness**

- a. Property Address: 258 Michigan Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 4/25/2017
- c. Project: Repaint exterior of residence in the following color scheme:  
Body: Rare Grey  
Trim: Ivory  
Shutters, Door, Porch Deck: Pewter Green

**13. Applicant: Gale Slaton**

- a. Property Address: 153 Levert Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 4/25/2017
- c. Project: Install black iron handrails on either side of porch steps.

**C. APPLICATIONS**

**1. 2017-21-CA: 8 LeMoyne Place**

- a. Applicant: David Daughenbaugh with the City of Mobile
- b. Project: Demolition – Demolish an extremely deteriorated single family residence.

**D. OTHER BUSINESS**

- 1. Discussion – Rules and Regulations

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2017-18-CA: 8 LeMoyné Place**  
**Applicant: City of Mobile, David Daughenbaugh**  
**Received: 4/12/17**  
**Meeting: 5/3/17**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Demolition- Demolish an extremely deteriorated single family residence.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This classically detailed foursquare type dates circa 1910.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

The Historic Preservation Ordinance (Article IV, Chapter IV; Section X) states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on February 17, 2016. At that time, the Board heldover an application calling for the demolition of the building. The dwelling situated on the property, one which has been on the City’s Nuisance List for a number of years, is in extremely advanced state of structural decay. If granted demolition approval, the derelict house would be demolished, the site would be cleared and grass would be planted.
- B. With regards to demolition, the Guidelines read as follows: “Proposed demolition of a building must be brought before the Board for consideration. The Board may deny a demolition request if the building’s loss will impair the historic integrity of the district.” However, our ordinance mirrors the Mobile City Code, see §44-79, which sets forth the following standard of review and required findings for the demolition of historic structures:
  - 1. *Required findings; demolition/relocation.* The Board shall not grant certificates of appropriateness for the demolition or relocation of any property within a historic district unless the Board finds that the removal or relocation of such building will not be detrimental to the historical or architectural character of the district. In making this determination, the Board shall consider:
    - i. The historic or architectural significance of the structure;

1. This house dates circa 1910. The building is listed as a contributing structure in the Old Dauphin Way National Register Historic District. A grandly proportioned dwelling of the American Foursquare typology it is among the finest and oldest houses located on LeMoyne Place.
- ii. The importance of the structures to the integrity of the historic district, the immediate vicinity, an area, or relationship to other structures;
  1. The dwelling contributes to the built density, rhythmic spacing, and historical character of the surrounding Old Dauphin Way Historic District.
- iii. The difficulty or the impossibility of reproducing the structure because of its design, texture, material, detail or unique location;
  1. The building materials are capable of being reproduced. Of the exterior facings and elements, almost all those which are still in place would have to be replaced. The building's structure is an even more periled condition than the exterior cladding and detailing. The roof has collapsed.
- iv. Whether the structure is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region or is a good example of its type, or is part of an ensemble of historic buildings creating a neighborhood;
  1. Foursquare dwellings are located within all of Mobile's seven locally designated National Register Historic Districts. Old Dauphin Way contains a large number of this uniquely American residential typology. Examples are found across the United States. Several foursquares are found on the subject street and block.
- v. Whether there are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and what effect such plans will have on the architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological, social, aesthetic, or environmental character of the surrounding area.
  1. If granted demolition approval, the house would be demolished, debris would be removed, the lot would be leveled, seed would be planted, and a lien placed on the property.
- vi. The date the owner acquired the property, purchase price, and condition on date of acquisition;
  1. The estate was conveyed to Miloyd Murphy, one of two heirs to an estate, in February of 2016. Ms. Murphy intended to restore the property. Plans did not materialize. Several potential purchasers considered buying and restoring the property.
- vii. The number and types of adaptive uses of the property considered by the owner;
  1. The property has stood vacant for well over a decade.
- viii. Whether the property has been listed for sale, prices asked and offers received, if any;
  1. The property has been listed for sale.
- ix. Description of the options currently held for the purchase of such property, including the price received for such option, the conditions placed upon such option and the date of expiration of such option;
  1. N.A.
- x. Replacement construction plans for the property in question and amounts expended upon such plans, and the dates of such expenditures;
  1. N.A.
- xi. Financial proof of the ability to complete the replacement project, which may include but not be limited to a performance bond, a letter of credit, a trust for completion of improvements, or a letter of commitment from a financial institution.

- xii. Application submitted by the City of Mobile.
- xiii. Such other information as may reasonably be required by the Board.
  - 1. Application submitted by the City of Mobile.
- 2. *Post demolition or relocation plans required.* In no event shall the Board entertain any application for the demolition or relocation of any historic property unless the applicant also presents at the same time the post-demolition or post-relocation plans for the site.”

C. Scope of Work (per submitted materials and communications):

- 1. Demolish a contributing residence.
- 2. Remove debris from the property.
- 3. Stabilize site.
- 4. Plant seed.

## STAFF ANALYSIS

This application concerns the demolition of an extremely deteriorated residential building which is listed as a contributing building in the Old Dauphin Way National Register Historic District. The property has for several years been listed on the City of Mobile’s Nuisance Abatement list. The Nuisance Abatement allows for either the City to repair/secure vacant buildings which are salvageable or remove of vacant buildings that are in such an extreme state of disrepair as to pose a life safety issue.

When reviewing demolition applications, the Board takes into the account the following considerations: the architectural significance of the building; the condition of the building; the impact the demolition will have on the streetscape; and the nature of any proposed redevelopment.

8 LeMoyne Place is a contributing building located within the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The dwelling is a fine example of the American Foursquare residential typology. This uniquely American typology came into being in the 1890s and remained a popular housing choice into the 1920s. Examples of this building type are found within and without Mobile’s National Register and locally designated National Register historic districts. Several additional examples are found on LeMoyne Street itself. Some of Mobile’s most notable instances of the typology line Dauphin Street.

This building is in an extremely advanced state of disrepair. Conditions extend far beyond cosmetic concerns. Sills are rotten and the roof structure has collapsed. Sizable portions of walls are in jeopardy of collapsing. The house plays host to a rodent infestation plaguing the house.

The house contributes to the built density, rhythmic sequencing, historic character, physical experience of LeMoyne Place. An inner block dwelling in an intact expanse of a block, the building is only viewed from head on or an oblique angle.

If granted demolition approval, the building would be demolished, debris would be removed, site would be leveled, ground would be stabilized, and seed would be planted. Work would be done by a firm contracted by the City. A buyer would be obligated to redevelop the site in manner fully in keeping with Mobile’s Historic District Guidelines.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

This building has lost much of its architectural and historical character on account of demolition by neglect. Based on B (1-2), Staff believes this application would impair the property, but taking into account loss of architectural/history character caused by the building's physical condition, life safety concerns created for other buildings/neighboring property owners, and the design requirements for new construction, Staff does not believe the application would impair the overall historic district. Staff recommends approval of the application for reasons of the considerations cited herein.