

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA**  
**June 20, 2012 – 3:00 P.M.**  
**Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

**B. MID MONTH APPROVALS**

**1. Applicant: Chuck Weems**

- a. Property Address: 1653 Government Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/30/12
- c. Project: Repaint the building per the existing color scheme.

**2. Applicant: Kyle Taylor**

- a. Property Address: 357 Charles Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/29/12
- c. Project: Install an 8' by 10' storage shed (per the submitted brochure). The shed will be minimally visible from the public view.

**3. Applicant: City of Mobile**

- a. Property Address: 104 South Lawrence Street
- b. Date of Approval: 5/31/12
- c. Project: Paint the house in the same color scheme. Repair/replace rear steps and rails matching the existing in profile, dimension and materials. Repair fence, replacing pickets as needed matching the existing in profile, dimension and materials. All repairs to be painted to match existing color scheme.

**4. Applicant: Conley Reilly**

- a. Property Address: 15 North Reed Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 5/31/12
- c. Project: Repaint the house per the submitted Valspar color scheme. The body will be Woodlawn Colonial Gray. The trim will be Woodlawn Bedroom White. The door will be La Fonda Midnight. Repair and when necessary replace deteriorated woodwork to match the existing with regard to materials, profile, and dimension.

**5. Applicant: Chris Huff**

- a. Property Address: 11 Semmes Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 5/29/12
- c. Project: Repair and replace deteriorated woodwork and siding when and where necessary to match the existing in profile, dimension, and material. Replace porch columns to match the existing. Repaint the house per the existing color scheme. Repair sections of roofing. The shingles will match existing.

**6. Applicant: Janie Dunlap**

- a. Property Address: 55 North Georgia Avenue
- b. Date of Approval: 6/1/12
- c. Project: Install a six foot high privacy fence along the southern lot line, one which will not extend beyond the front plan of the house. A three foot high section of fencing will extend between the sidewalk and the aforementioned fence.

7. **Applicant: Terry Lamb**
  - a. Property Address: 20 McPhillips Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/4/12
  - c. Project: Reroof the house.
8. **Applicant: Ben Cummings for the Oakleigh Garden District Society**
  - a. Property Address: across district
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/4/12
  - c. Project: Replace historic district signage.
9. **Applicant: Nancy Henken**
  - a. Property Address: 163 Roberts Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/5/12
  - c. Project: Reroof the house with architectural shingles.
10. **Applicant: Susan Rhodes**
  - a. Property Address: 22 South Ann Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/5/12
  - c. Project: Remove and install concrete walkways and drives.
11. **Applicant: Debra Cary**
  - a. Property Address: 22 South Conception Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/12
  - c. Project: Suspend a hanging metal sign from the underside of the building's balcony. The double-faced sign will be a total of 12 square feet and will meet overhead restrictions. The sign will feature the name of the business establishment.
12. **Applicant: Brian Weeks**
  - a. Property Address: 350 Michigan Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/12
  - c. Project: Remove existing roof and reroof Timberline dimensional shingle in Pewter Grey.
13. **Applicant: Michael Strickland**
  - a. Property Address: 255 McDonald Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/12
  - c. Project: Reroof with charcoal gray shingles and paint house white with gray trim.
14. **Applicant: Sara Hoeb**
  - a. Property Address: 251 Dexter Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/12
  - c. Project: Replace asphalt roof shingles to match and replace chimney flashing. Repair rotten wood on porch to match.
15. **Applicant: Chris Bowen**
  - a. Property Address: 129 Bush Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/6/12
  - c. Project: Replace rotten wood as necessary and paint to match.
16. **Applicant: Philip Nabb**
  - a. Property Address: 104 Bradford Avenue
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/8/12
  - c. Project: Repair and replace deteriorated woodwork to match the existing in profile, dimension, and material. The work will match the existing.
17. **Applicant: Downtown Mobile Alliance**
  - a. Property Address: 260 Dauphin Street
  - b. Date of Approval: 6/7/12
  - c. Project: Correct previous COA allowing a three month temporary banner. Banners are restricted by ordinance to 30 day. Applicants have permission install a 30 day banner at the site.

**18. Applicant: Mack Lewis**

- a. Property Address: 158 South Jefferson Street
- b. Date of Approval: 6/8/12
- c. Project: Repair / replace porch decking as needed and remove non-conforming plate glass window at rear of house and replace with a 2-over-2 double hung window to match existing.

**C. APPLICATIONS**

**1. 2012-41-CA: 1009 Augusta Street**

- a. Applicant: Ben Cummings for Mr. & Mrs. Bay Haas
- b. Project: New Construction - Construct a garden shed.

**2. 2012-42-CA: 254 Saint Anthony Street**

- a. Applicant: Thomas Latham with Clark, Geer, Latham and Associates for the Society of 1868
- b. Project: New Construction - Construct an outdoor fireplace.

**3. 2012-43-CA: 11 North Lafayette Street (Staff files list the address as 1450 Dauphin Street.)**

- a. Applicant: Thomas Latham with Clark, Geer, Latham and Associates for McGill-Toolen Catholic High School
- b. Project: Fencing – Install fencing around additional areas of the school complex.

**D. OTHER BUSINESS**

- 1. 20 South Catherine Street
- 2. Discussion

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2012-41-CA: 1009 Augusta Street**  
**Applicant: Ben Cummings for Bay Haas**  
**Received: 6/4/12**  
**Meeting: 6/20/12**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: New Construction - Construct a garden shed.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This Italianate residence dates from 1871. It is one of three wooden side hall houses with recessed wings that that line southern side of Washington Square.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on June 11, 1998. At that time, the Board approved the construction of a rear porch. This application calls for the construction of an ancillary structure.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “An ancillary structure is any construction other than the main building on the property. It includes, but is not limited to garages, carports, pergolas, decks, pool covers, sheds and the like. The appropriateness of ancillary structures shall be measured by the guidelines applicable to new construction. The structure should complement the design and scale of the main building.”
- C. Scope of Work (per submitted plans):
  - 3. Construct a wooden garden shed.
    - a. The garden shed will measure 12’ in width and 12’ feet in depth.
    - b. A 4’ deep pergola supported by four square section post will front the gabled roofed building. Lattice panels will connect the two posts.
    - c. The building will rest atop a concrete slab.
    - d. Wooden siding will sheath the building.
    - e. A 5-V crimp metal roofing sheets will cover the roof.
    - f. The North Elevation will feature a pair of wooden, six light French doors (located behind the pergola).
    - g. A circular window will punctuate the North Elevation’s gable.
    - h. The East Elevation will feature an open fenestrated bay.

- i. The South Elevation will feature a four light wooden window.
- j. The West Elevation will not feature fenestration

### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

This application involves the construction of a garden shed. The garden shed would be minimally visible from the public and would meet setback requirements.

The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state that ancillary construction should complement the design of the property's principal building. Employing traditional materials and adopting a traditional form, the proposed building will add to the character of this historic residential ensemble.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on B (1), Staff does not believe this application will impair the architectural or the historical character of the building or the district. Staff recommends approval of this application.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2012-42-CA: 254 Saint Anthony Street**  
**Applicant: Thomas Latham with Clark, Geer, Latham & Associates for the Society of 1868**  
**Received: 5/30/12**  
**Meeting: 6/20/12**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: De Tonti Square  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-B  
Project: New Construction – Construct an outdoor fireplace

**BUILDING HISTORY**

Constructed in 1868, this house is one of Mobile’s finest surviving side hall with wing houses. The Italianate residence features some of the City’s finest iron work.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on August 6, 2008. At that time, the Board approved alterations to the old service wing. The application at hand calls for the construction of an outdoor fireplace.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Historic Rehabilitation state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy the historic materials that characterize a property.”
  - 2. “New additions and alterations shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Construct an outdoor fireplace (per submitted plans):
    - a. The fireplace will be located along the western lot and will be engaged into the existing brick wall.
    - b. The fireplace will be located approximately 5’ 6” from the rear courtyard’s western entrance and will extend slightly into the adjacent parking lot located to the west of the property.
    - c. The raised hearth, chimney breast, and chimney stack will be made of Old Mobile brick.
    - d. The hearth will surround will wrap around the chimney breast.
    - e. A flat arch will surmount the firebox.

- f. The chimney stack, one measuring 18' 6" in height, will be centered atop the chimney breast.
- g. Repoint existing brickwork when and where necessary using the appropriate mortar.

### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

This application involves the construction of an outside fireplace.

The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts do not specifically address outdoor fireplaces. The proposed fireplace would be set back into the lot and engaged into a brick wall; thereby independent of the historic residence. In accord with Secretary of the Interior's Standards, original historic features and elements that characterize the property would not be impacted. The fireplace would be made bricks matching those employed in the wall.

Similar outdoor features have been approved on other properties in the historic districts. Previously approved fireplaces have been located within porch additions. Though set back deep within the lot, the proposed freestanding chimney stack would be visible from the public view. Staff recommends that chimney be lowered in height to 8 to 12 feet.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff believes this application will impair the architectural and the historical character of the building or the district. Staff recommends that the chimney be lowered in height.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**2012-43-CA:** 11 North Lafayette Street (Staff files list the address as 1450 Dauphin Street.)  
And 1501 Old Shell Road  
1413 Old Shell Road  
**Applicant:** Thomas Latham with Clark, Geer, Latham and Associates for McGill Toolen  
Catholic High School  
**Received:** 6/1/12  
**Meeting:** 6/20/12

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way  
Classification: Non-Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Fencing – Install fencing around additional areas of the school complex.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

The CYO Gymnasium dates from 1989.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property, a part of McGill Toolen Catholic High School, last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on July 20, 1989. At that time, the Old Dauphin Way Review Board approved the property’s landscaping plan. McGill Toolen last appeared before the Board on October 1, 2009. On that occasion, the Board approved the construction of a New Student Center. This application calls for the installation of fencing on this property. The fencing would extend around two sides of the Gymnasium building and along the eastern and western sides of Lafayette Street onto other addresses of the McGill Toolen campus (1413 and 1501 Old Shell Road).
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. Fencing “should complement the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District. The height of solid fences in historic areas is generally restricted to six feet, however, if a commercial property or multi-family housing adjoins the subject property, an eight foot fence may be considered.”
- C. **Scope of Work (per plans):**
  - 1. Install aluminum fencing
    - a. The six foot high powder coated, black painted aluminum fence will match fencing installed elsewhere on the property. At 1418 Dauphin Street (northeast corner of Dauphin Street and Lafayette Streets) for instance.



- b. The fence fronting 11 North Lafayette Street (also known as 1450 Dauphin Street) will be set back from Dauphin Street, within the lot.
- c. The fencing will extend in an easterly direction from western lot line.
- d. The fence will extend along the western side of Lafayette Street onto 1501 Old Shell Road passing in front of the Field House.
- e. The existing chain link fencing will be removed.
- f. The fencing will stop at the stuccoed wall located south of St. Mary's.
- g. One inward opening pedestrian and gates will punctuate the fence.
- h. Remove chain link fencing extending around portions of the playing field located just south of the Old Toolen Building (1413 Old Shell Road). The fencing will commence at the corner of the rear portion of the Mobile Theater Guild Building.
- i. The fence will extend to and along North Lafayette Street.
- j. The fence will tie into the newer portion of the Toolen Building.
- k. One inward opening pedestrian gate and two sliding pedestrian gates will punctuate the fencing.

#### Staff Clarifications

1. What is the setback for the section of fencing extending along Dauphin Street?
2. Will a pedestrian gate be located at student cross walk?

#### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

This application involves the installation of fencing. The proposed fencing would be located on three lots of the McGill-Toolen complex. The six foot fence would match fencing installed elsewhere on the campus.

The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state that fencing designs should complement the principal building on a property. Ordinarily, the Board restricts the height of open fencing located beyond the front plan of a building to a height of four feet. Open fencing with a height exceeding four feet that is proposed for installation before the front of a building requires a variance from the Office of Urban Development.

Fencing of the same height and design has been installed elsewhere on the campus, notably the parking lots at 100 North Catherine Street, 1540 Old Shell Road, and 1418 Dauphin Street. The Board approved considerably taller fence that encloses part of the Alabama School of Math and Science.

The proposed fencing would be located on eastern and western sides of North Lafayette Street. A tunnel-like effect would be introduced by such expansive sections of fencing. To reduce the amount fencing and counteract a tunneling effect, Staff recommends that the fencing located to the south and east of the CYO Hall and to the east of Field House not be installed (See notations on the recommended site plan.). A section of fence could extend between the southwest corner of the CYO Hall and the lot line, as well as a between the northeast corner of the CYO Hall to the section of fence extending to the south of the Field House. By removing the fencing located around the CYO Hall and in front the Field House, security could be provided without sacrificing the visual integrity of the streetscape. The addition of recessed planting breakers within the fencing fronting the eastern ball field would further soften the impact of the fencing.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on B (1), Staff believes the application as proposed impairs the architectural and the historical character of the district. Staff recommends that the sections of fencing that would wrap around the CYO Hall and that would extend in front of the Field House not be installed and that planting indentations be employed in the fencing extending along the eastern side of Lafayette Street.