

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA**  
**July 1, 2009 – 3:00 P.M.**  
**Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

**B. MID MONTH APPROVALS**

1. **Applicant: Susan Colson**
  - a. Property Address: 273 Dauphin St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/11/09
  - c. Project: Reroof using same materials.
2. **Applicant: Barbara Hamilton**
  - a. Property Address: 1110 Savannah St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/09/09
  - c. Project: Install automatic gate in driveway to match existing fencing. Construct handicap ramp leading from back door to driveway. Paint handicap ramp black to match trim on house.
3. **Applicant: Bill Host**
  - a. Property Address: 1661 Dauphin St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/08/09
  - c. Project: Install temporary wheelchair ramp. Ramp approved for ninety day. Ramp sits on boots so easily removed.
4. **Applicant: Montdrakgo Caldwell**
  - a. Property Address: 1064 Palmetto Street.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/11/09
  - c. Project: Remove deteriorated portions of wood soffit. Repair and Replacement to match existing in profile, scale, dimension, and material (Painting approval granted in an April 1, 2009 COA. See April 15, 2009 Agenda).
5. **Applicant: Ryan Jensen**
  - a. Property Address: 1413 Monroe St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/09/09
  - c. Project: Repaint body of house sage green. Repaint trim white.
6. **Applicant: Douglas Kearley for Martha Locicero**
  - a. Property Address: 1158 Church St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/10/09
  - c. Project: Install two iron handrails to either side of front steps.
7. **Applicant: Barry Wiseman**
  - a. Property Address: 12 Common St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/16/09
  - c. Project: Remove existing siding. Replace siding with Hardiplank. Paint house white. Replace roofing with 3-tab onyx shingles.
8. **Applicant: Bill Demouy**
  - a. Property Address: 105 Levert Ave.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/15/09
  - c. Project: Replace rotten wood. Paint to match existing color scheme.
9. **Applicant: Katherine Morrisette**
  - a. Property Address: 12 Common St.

- b. Date of Approval: 06/17/09
  - c. Project: Paint body of house per existing color scheme.
- 10. Applicant: Katherine Morrisette**
- a. Property Address: 12 Common St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/0017/09
  - c. Project: Paint house body house either Fire on the Mountain, Amaretto, Rough Terrain, or Desert Rouge..
- 11. Applicant: Jim Alston for Cecily Kaffer**
- a. Property Address: 1559 Fearnway
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/18/09
  - c. Project: Construct 4' wood picket interior lot privacy fence.
- 12. Applicant: Devereaux Bemis**
- a. Property Address: 167 State St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/17/09
  - c. Project: Paint rear stair with Behr solid stain, Sunset Gray. Paint the rear wing doors green to match windows.
- 13. Applicant: Terry Mannion**
- a. Property Address: 11 North Dearborn St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/18/09
  - c. Project: Replace trim and carpentry to match existing. Prim and caulk exterior woodwork. Replace porch columns to match existing.
- 14. Applicant: Cameron Pfeiffer**
- a. Property Address: 204 Michigan Ave.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/19/09
  - c. Project: Remove and replace rotten wood, all replacements in kind. Work to match the existing in profile, dimension, and material. Remove later wood balustrade. Repaint per existing color scheme.
- 15. Applicant: Tony W. Havard**
- a. Property Address: 263 South Monterey St.
  - b. Date of Approval: 06/22/09
  - c. Project: Replace rotten boards around base of house. Repair columns. Replace rotten fascia boards. All repair and replacement is to match existing in profile dimension and material. Paint house per existing color scheme.

## C. APPLICATIONS

1. 062-09: 114 St. Emanuel St.
  - a. Applicant: Nicholas H. Holmes, II
  - b. Project: Install railing on front portico. Install lighting fixtures across site.
2. 063-09: 607 Saint Francis Street
  - a. Applicant: Katina Collins
  - b. Project: Replace front door. Rear Deck Approval.
3. 064-09: 1160 New Saint. Francis St.
  - a. Applicant: Marvin L. Pryor
  - b. Project: Remove tongue and groove decking. Replace decking with 5 ¾" treated decking.
4. 065-09: Leinkauf Historic District.
  - a. Applicant: Melissa M. Thomas for the Leinkauf Neighborhood Association
  - b. Project: Sign Approval.
5. 066-09: 1562 Blair Avenue.
  - a. Applicant: Greg Dreaper

- b. Project: Amend COA to allow fiberglass front door, alternate garage doors, and vinyl windows.

**D. OTHER BUSINESS**

- 1. Guidelines
- 2. Election of a Vice-Chair
- 3. Discussion

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**062-09-CA: 114 Saint Emanuel St.**  
**Applicant: Nicholas H. Holmes, II for Christ Church**  
**Received: 06/03/09**  
**Meeting: 07/01/09**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Church Street East  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: B-4  
Project: Install railing on front portico. Install lighting fixtures across site.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

The building is one of the most significant structures in the City. Built between 1838-1840, the church reflects the influence of the mature Greek Revival style. The building suffered severe damage in the 1906 hurricane. The exterior restoration and reconstruction were carried out in a manner in keeping with original design.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property last appeared before the Board on April 15, 2009. The applicant submitted fencing and landscape proposals. The Board granted approval both submissions. The landscaping plan has been executed. The applicant returns to the Board with a lighting plan and a railing proposal.
- B. The state Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts in pertinent part:
  - 1. “The porch is an important regional characteristic of Mobile architecture. Historic porches should be maintained and repaired to reflect their period. Particular attention should be paid to the handrails, lower rails, balusters, decking, posts/columns, proportions and decorative details.”
  - 2. “Lighting can be an important element in the historic districts. Therefore, where lighting impacts the exterior appearance of a building or of the district in which the building is located, it shall be reviewed for appropriateness any other element.”
  - 3. “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.”
- C. Scope of Work (per submitted plan):
  - 1. East Elevation
    - A. Remove flagstone pavers in walkway adjacent to front steps
    - B. Install two iron handrails
      - 1. excavate substrate and pour concrete in walkway before portico (location of removed pavers) to secure lower iron pickets to ground
      - 2. secure intermediate iron pickets to treads of portico steps (one in the third step and two in the sixth step)

- a. drill holes to be 4” in depth
    - b. pour an epoxy to secure pickets within holes
  - 3. screw handrail brackets to either side of two portico columns to secure upper portion of railings
  - C. Reset flagstone pavers before the front steps
  - D. Attempt to repair flagstone pavers in walkway (those not adjacent to the portico)
  - E. Install 2 can lights in portico roof
- 2. South Elevation
  - A. Install seven 6’ tall brass upright poles with 100W-MH bulbs before each window
  - B. Mount one 50W MH mini flood light to chancel window
- 3. North Elevation
  - A. Install two 6’ tall brass upright poles with 100W-MH bulbs before the two northwest windows of the nave
  - B. Set three 3’ tall brass upright poles in concrete within sills of the three northeast windows of the elevation
  - C. Mount one 100W MH mini flood light above canopy of handicap entrance
  - D. Place one Can STK 4-sided SHLD to side north of handicap ramp
- 5. Lighting on grounds
  - A. Place seven 175W MV R40-down lights in trees
  - B. Place one 70W MH R40-down light in tree

## STAFF ANALYSIS

Christ Church is not only one of the most important Greek Revival buildings in Mobile, but also one of the most significant buildings in the state. The front portico has two existing railings, one affixed to each of the flanking [ante podia](#). The proposed railings would require invasive drilling into the columns. Staff does not recommend approval of the proposed railings.

The proposed lighting program is intended to provide illumination of the church’s remarkable stained stain glass windows and recently landscaped grounds. According to the applicant, the upright poles are the most satisfactory means to accomplish those ends while at the same time avoiding drastic intervention with the historic building fabric. While this objective is commendable the proposed plans do not fully accomplish the desired objective.

Staff recommends denial of both the upright poles to be set in the window sills, since their installation would harm the historic building materials, and the 6’ upright poles to be set in the ground, for their height would impair the architectural and historical character of the building. Staff advises the applicants to develop alternative plans to for those submissions. The remainder the lighting proposal, the lighting to be suspended from the trees, the floodlight to be located below the chancel window, and the floodlight to be located above handicap access entrance, do not impair the character of the building or district. Staff recommends their approval.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**063-09-CA:** 607 Saint Francis St.  
**Applicant:** Katina Collins  
**Received:** 04/20/09 revised 06/11/09  
**Meeting:** 07/01/09

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Commercial  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Replace front and Rear doors; replace rear and front porch decking; replace rear porch with a deck; Replace siding; construct new rear porch steps.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

The 1886, 1891, and 1904 Sanborn Maps all indicate a frame house occupying this lot. The structure occupied the same position and adopted the same street orientation as the present dwelling. This house was either demolished or substantially remodeled between 1906 and 1908 when the property's tax assessment increased dramatically. Therefore, this house with its overhanging eaves and broad porch should be seen as an early example of the Arts and Crafts approach to architectural design, not a late Victorian era house.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states "the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district..."

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. Staff issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for this property on October 15, 1999. The approved scope of work allowed the then applicant to "replace and install footings and foundation piers as needed, all foundation piers which are visible from the exterior to be brick; replace all rotten wood on exterior to match the existing in dimension and profile; replace rear steps with pressure treated wood and install black pipe handrail; install two white storm doors; replace decking as need." The work was only carried out March of 2009. Not only had the Certificate of Appropriateness expired, but the foundation piers were not face with brick, the rear handrail was not the specified type, and the doors did not comply with guidelines. A Notice of Violation was issued on March 24, 2009 for the unapproved work.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. "A building's base or foundation, gives the building a sense of strength and solidity, and serves to "tie" the structure to the ground. Traditionally, residential buildings were raised on piers."
  - 2. "Original doors and openings should be retained along with any moldings, transoms or sidelights. Replacement should respect the age of the building."
  - 3. "The porch is an important regional characteristic of Mobile architecture. Historic porches should be maintained and repaired to reflect their period. Particular attention

should be paid to the handrails, lower rails, balusters, decking, posts/columns, proportions and decorative details.”

4. “The form and shape of the porch and its roof should maintain their historic appearance.”
5. “The balustrade of the stairs should match the design and materials of the porch.”

C. Scope of Work:

1. North Elevation
  - A. replace front door with mahogany finished door with oval glazed panel above two solid panels
  - B. replace tongue and groove porch decking in kind
2. West Elevation
  - A. remove deteriorated siding within and around window infill
  - B. replace siding in kind
3. South Elevation
  - A. replace porch with wood deck
    1. deck to project roughly 3’ beyond the plane of the house
    2. deck to be supported by wood pilings and trusses
    3. treated boards to cover deck
    4. wood steps with matching decking and railings to be located off east side of deck
  - B. replace door with laminated four paneled door encompassing a glazed fanlight
  - C. replace brick foundation piers with concrete blocks

## STAFF ANALYSIS

The scope of work stems from and deviates from an expired Certificate of Appropriateness issued in 1999. Some of the executed work complies with the Guidelines, will some does not. The Guidelines require that original doors should be maintained. The replacement door is not appropriate to the style or date of the house, thus impairing the integrity of the house. Staff recommends that the front door be removed. The original door or one comparable to the appearance and age of the house should be used.

The in kind replacement of the front porch decking and west elevation siding is in compliance with the Guidelines. The concrete block foundation piers on the south elevation should be faced with stucco to match the foundation piers on the house’s west elevation.

Staff does not have documentation indicating the original configuration and appearance of the back porch. Staff recommends that the applicant be keep the decking and railing, but replace the wood pilings with stuccoed concrete piers like those on the north elevation.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**064-09-CA:** 1160 New Saint Francis St.  
**Applicant:** Marvin L. Pryor  
**Received:** 06/02/09  
**Meeting:** 07/01/09

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way  
Classification: Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Replace tongue-and-groove porch decking with treated decking.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This side hall house with prominent gable on hip roof was constructed was built circa 1909.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. On June 1, 2009, Staff was notified of a 311 call regarding this property. Upon visiting site visit, Staff issued a Stop Work Order for work done without a Certificate of Appropriateness. At that time half of the tongue-and-groove porch decking was replaced with treated wood decking.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “The porch is an important regional characteristic of Mobile architecture. Historic porches should be maintained and repaired to reflect their period. Particular attention should be paid to the handrails, lower rails, balusters, decking, posts/columns, proportions and decorative details.”
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Remove tongue-and-groove decking from front porch
  - 2. Replace tongue-and-groove decking with treated wood decking

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

The Guidelines clearly state the porches should be maintained and repaired. When materials such as porch decking cannot be repaired, they should be replaced in kind. The replacement decking is not appropriate to the age and style of this house, thus constitutes a historical and architectural impairment. Staff recommends that applicant remove the decking and replace it with tongue-and-groove decking matching that which was removed.



**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**066-09-CA: Leinkauf Historic District**  
**Applicant: Melissa M. Thomas Leinkauf Neighborhood Association**  
**Received: 06//09**  
**Meeting: 07/01/09**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Leinkauf  
Classification: National Register Historic District  
Zoning: various  
Project: Sign Approval.

**DISTRICT HISTORY**

Leinkauf is one of the City of Mobile's nine historic districts. The District was listed on the National Register in 1987.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states "the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district..."

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. In May of 2009, Leinkauf Historic District was expanded to encompass the blocks bound by Virginia, Houston, Government, and Pennsylvania Streets.
- B. The Design Guidelines for Mobile's historic districts, state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. "Signs may not be located in the right-of-way except for sandwich board signs in the Henry Aaron Loop."
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Suspend double-faced metal signage from various street signs bounding the district (see submitted design).
    - A. signs to be 22" in width and 19" in height in width
    - B. distance from ground to top of signs to be approximately 8' 6" height
    - C. distance from ground to bottom to signs to be approximately 6'9" in height
    - D. signs to be placed throughout the historic district

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

Freestanding signage or signage affixed to utility poles demarcates Mobile's historic districts. Leinkauf's existing signage falls into both categories. The Leinkauf Neighborhood Association proposal calls for subsequent signage that would be suspended from the street signs both bordering and within the District. The signs would be put in place as funds allowed. Staff does not believe the proposed signage will impair the character of the district, therefore recommends approval pending approval from the Board of Adjustment.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**STAFF COMMENTS**

**065-09-CA:** 1562 Blair Avenue  
**Applicant:** Greg Dreaper  
**Received:** 06/15/09  
**Meeting:** 07/01/09

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way  
Classification: Non-Contributing  
Zoning: R-1  
Project: Amend COA to allow fiberglass door, alternate garage door, and vinyl windows.

**BUILDING HISTORY**

This house, which is soon to be constructed, occupies the site of a single-story bungalow that burned in 2006.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. This property last appeared before the Board on January 7, 2009. The Board granted approval for the construction of the present house. The applicants would like to make substitutions in their approved plans.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for New Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
  - 1. “In new buildings, exterior materials – both traditional and modern can use surrounding historic examples as a guide.”
  - 2. “Often one of the most important decorative features, doorways reflect the architectural style of a building. The design of doors and doorways can help establish the character of a building and compatibility with adjacent facades.
  - 3. “The type, size and dividing lights of windows, and their location and configuration (rhythm) help establish the character of a building and compatibility with adjacent structures. Traditionally designed window openings generally are recessed on masonry buildings and have a raised surround on frame buildings.”
- C. Scope of Work:
  - 1. Amend COA to allow Prairie 6-Lite 2300 Series vinyl Coastal Windows instead of wood Craftsman Style Single Hung Windows
  - 2. Amend COA to allow fiberglass door with Wright-inspired glazing instead of wood Craftsman door with plain glazing
  - 3. Amend COA to allow Wayne Dalton Colonial steel fronted 16-paneled garage door with wood grain texture instead of paneled and glazed garage door.

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

While the proposed window substitutions are identical in design to the previously approved wooden windows, vinyl windows are not allowed in Mobile's historic districts. Staff does not recommend approval of the windows. The alternate garage door and front door are in keeping with the Arts and Crafts inspired design of this 21<sup>st</sup> Century bungalow. Staff does not believe these two submissions impair the architectural or historical integrity of the district, therefore recommends approval of those two substitutions.

