

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA

December 21, 2016 – 3:00 P.M.

Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. **Applicant:** William Apling
 - A. Property Address: 9 S. Joachim Avenue
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/25/2016
 - C. Project: Repaint door to Buff Yellow, Repaint Paneling to light tan.
2. **Applicant:** K.I.M. Kearley on behalf of Restoration Society
 - A. Property Address: 911 Dauphin Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/25/2016
 - C. Project: Construct an outdoor fireplace and patio about it per submitted plans.
3. **Applicant:** Tim Bullock
 - A. Property Address: 603 St. Francis Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/27/2016
 - C. Project: Repair and replace balustrades on front porch to match existing in exact profile, material and dimension. Repaint to match.
4. **Applicant:** Allan Gustin with Dunn Building Company on behalf of the American Legion
 - A. Property Address: 607 Government Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/28/2016
 - C. Project: Instigate mothballing efforts within a window on the house's West (Dearborn Street-facing) Elevation. Remove a temporary overhang below said window and deteriorated wooden handicap access ramp.
5. **Applicant:** James Christiansen
 - A. Property Address: 1416 Brown Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/28/2016
 - C. Project: Remove existing sections of six foot fence located in rear of lot. Replace with six foot dogeared wooden fence.
6. **Applicant:** First Choice Painting and Roofing
 - A. Property Address: 260 S. Broad Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/28/2016
 - C. Project: Replace front porch decking to match existing. Repaint in existing color scheme.
7. **Applicant:** Jason Cospers
 - A. Property Address: 251 Tuttle Avenue
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/28/2016
 - C. Project: Construct 6' dog-eared wooden privacy fence on rear perimeter of lot, not to extend beyond front plane of structure.

- 8. Applicant:** Summers Roofing
 - A. Property Address: 31 Hannon Avenue
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/31/2016
 - C. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles in black.
- 9. Applicant:** Modern Signs on behalf of Wet Willie's
 - A. Property Address: 200 Dauphin Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 10/28/2016
 - C. Project: Install diagonal corner sign to be 3' x 2.34', screen painted metal.
- 10. Applicant:** Ben Stewart of Stewart and Whatley Builders
 - A. Property Address: 37 Blacklawn
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/1/2016
 - C. Project: Paint body in Benjamin Moore Coventry Gray; Trim in Benjamin Moore Stone White
- 11. Applicant:** Ben Stewart on behalf of Stewart and Whatley Builders
 - A. Property Address: 37 Blacklawn
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/1/2016
 - C. Project: Revise plan to remove previously approved gable window.
- 12. Applicant:** Adam Kerian on behalf of St8 (State) Permits
 - A. Property Address: 13 Hannon Avenue
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/3/2016
 - C. Project: Replace and repair lapsiding, fascia, trim, and rafters to match existing in dimension, profile, and material. Reroof and repaint to match existing. All work performed on detached garage.
- 13. Applicant:** Terry Warren
 - A. Property Address: 1107 Elmira Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/4/2016
 - C. Project: Paint Porch Ceiling Haint Blue and Paint Lattice work Grizzle Gray.
- 14. Applicant:** Leroy Anderson
 - A. Property Address: 1412 Government Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/7/2016
 - C. Project: Replace a small non-historic window, repair/replace damaged siding to match original in profile and dimension; caulk windows and paint trim existing color, paint exterior doors existing.
- 15. Applicant:** Timothy Turner on behalf of Karen Cassidy
 - A. Property Address: 504 Church Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/7/2016
 - C. Project: Repair and replace lapsiding, fascia, trim to match in dimension, profile and material. Repaint to match existing.
- 16. Applicant:** Kevin Green
 - A. Property Address: 953 Dauphin Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/8/2016
 - C. Project: Repave existing parking lot behind building in asphalt.
- 17. Applicant:** Terry Warren
 - A. Property Address: 1107 Elmira Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/7/2016
 - C. Project: Paint Brackets, top of handrails, and treads grizzle gray.

- 18. Applicant:** Daniel Gray
A. Property Address: 208 Tuttle Avenue
B. Date of Approval: 11/9/2016
C. Project: Replace rotten fascia boards and knee braces to match, and paint white.
- 19. Applicant:** Dobson Roofing
A. Property Address: 208 Government Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/10/2016
C. Project: Reroof flat surface with single ply system, not visible from street.
- 20. Applicant:** Camilos Contracting
A. Property Address: 312 N. Claiborne Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/10/2016
C. Project: Asphalt shingle roof, charcoal gray; replace any rotten wood as needed to match.
- 21. Applicant:** Kari Servold
A. Property Address: 109 Parker Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/10/2016
C. Project: Erect six foot privacy fence down north side.
- 22. Applicant:** Joe Tarver Construction
A. Property Address: 113 Ryan Avenue
B. Date of Approval: 11/10/2016
C. Project: Repair and replace soffit, fascia and frieze to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Reroof in architectural shingles.
- 23. Applicant:** Matt LeMond
A. Property Address: 562 and 564 Dauphin Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/15/2016
C. Project: Paint exterior in following approved colors: Trim-SW7503 Sticks & Stones and Door- SW0030 Colonial Yellow.
- 24. Applicant:** Marcio Simao
A. Property Address: 961 Selma Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/16/2016
C. Project: This COA updates one of January 4, 2016 at which time owner was approved to roof with 5V Crimp metal. This certificate approves reroofing with asphalt shingles.
- 25. Applicant:** Ben Stewart on behalf of Stewart and Whatley Builders
A. Property Address: 37 Blacklawn
B. Date of Approval: 11/16/2016
C. Project: Alter columns on front porch to be 12" square with 6" base and capital box trim.
- 26. Applicant:** Damien Langan
A. Property Address: 909 Government Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/17/2016
C. Project: Install aluminum constructed freestanding sign per MHDC Guidelines.
- 27. Applicant:** John Knott
A. Property Address: 65 Houston Street
B. Date of Approval: 11/17/2016
C. Project: Remove window and install siding to match existing on North elevation located in rear of lot, not in public view.

- 28. Applicant:** Thomas L. Waldrop
- A. Property Address: 959 Church Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/21/2016
 - C. Project: Repair and replace wood siding as needed to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Replace and replicate front columns to match existing in profile, dimension, and material. Repair wooden doors. Repair existing wood windows. Install appropriate porch lights. Repair wooden steps. Paint house in following scheme: Body: Sherwin Williams Agreeable Gray. Trim and Decorative: Sherwin Williams Egret White. Porch Deck: Sherwin Williams Passive. Install 6' dogeared wooden privacy fence around rear perimeter of lot per plans. Replace metal roof on ancillary building. Install wooden lapsiding on exterior.
- 29. Applicant:** Jeff Davis
- A. Property Address: 957 Selma Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/21/2016
 - C. Project: Remove the remains of a chimney (internal) for a fire damaged chimney previously approved for removal in advance of a restoration of the larger building.
- 30. Applicant:** Jeff Davis on Behalf of Restore Mobile
- A. Property Address: 1114 Caroline Avenue
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/21/2016
 - C. Project: Remove roofing. Add additional rafters. Reroof the building with asphalt shingles.
- 31. Applicant:** Edward Adams on behalf of Ruth Rye
- A. Property Address: 1110 New Saint Francis Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/22/2016
 - C. Project: Repair woodwork per profiles, dimensions, and materials. Repaint per submitted color scheme. Possibly remove later concrete steps and construct period appropriate wooden steps with railings.
- 32. Applicant:** Kristi M. Esses on behalf of Vascular Associates of Mobile
- A. Property Address: 1151 Dauphin Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/22/2016
 - C. Project: Remove later iron railings on steps and plaza. Install iron bollards with suspended chains.
- 33. Applicant:** Fred Bauer
- A. Property Address: 1410 Old Shell Road
 - B. Date of Approval: Nov. 29, 2016
 - C. Project: Remove aluminum siding from façade and restore wood beneath and paint to match existing house color; restore attached front porch and stairs, rebuild columns and replace porch to match original but in brick without stucco.
- 34. Applicant:** Sydney Betbeze on behalf of Restore Mobile
- A. Property Address: 464 George Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 11/29/2016
 - C. Project: Repoint foundation piers with the appropriate mortar when and where required. Repair and when necessary replace deteriorated woodwork (siding, decking, detailing, etc...) to match the existing as per profile, dimension, and material. Reroof is necessary with asphalt shingles. Repaint per color with color scheme to be reviewed when determined.

- 35. Applicant:** Laurence and Associates
- A. Property Address: 210 State Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 12/1/2016
 - C. Project: Install attic vent on hip roof located at east elevation of building
- 36. Applicant:** Brooks Conkle
- A. Property Address: 215 Scott Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 12/1/2016
 - C. Project: Repair rotten siding and repaint to match, redeck porch with tongue and groove, repair stucco steps.
- 37. Applicant:** Optera Creative on behalf of Inspire Salon
- A. Property Address: 412 Dauphin Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 12/1/2016
 - C. Project: Install 3' x 2.5' wood and metal composite hanging blade sign per submitted design.
- 38. Applicant:** Jeff Davis
- A. Property Address: 1110 New St. Francis Street
 - B. Date of Approval: 12/2/2016
 - C. Project: Remove shed roof on westernmost additions located off of main dwelling. Rebuild shed roof extending over new porch built to submitted plans. Reroof to match existing metal roof. Repair and fill in siding to match existing in dimension, profile and material. Porch not visible from public view.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2016-28-CA: 957 Selma Street

A. Applicant: Jeff Davis

B. Project: Restoration & Addition – Restore a fire-damaged residence, Renew an approval of a Demolition of a Later Rear Addition, and Construct a new Rear Addition.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Discussion.
2. Happy Holidays!

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF REPORT

2016-2-CA: 957 Selma Street
Applicant: Jeff Davis
Received: 11/21/2016
Meeting: 12/21/2016

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Restoration & Addition – Restore a fire-damaged residence, Renew an approval of a Demolition of a Later Rear Addition, and Construct a new Rear Addition.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to the MHDC files, this shotgun with side wing dates circa 1904. A rear addition was added in the late 1970's.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. According to MHDC vertical files, this property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on July 15, 2015. At that time, the Board approved the demolition of a later fire-damaged rear addition. In addition to the re-approval of the demolition of a later rear wing, the application up for review calls for the restoration of the shotgun with side wing core and the construction of a new rear addition.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “Preserve an original porch or gallery on a house.”
 - 2. “Repair a porch in a way that maintains the original character.”
 - 3. “Use elements that are appropriate to the style, texture, finish, composition and proportion of the historic structure.”
 - 4. “Differentiate an addition from a historic structure using changes in material, color, and/ or wall plane.”

5. "Design an addition to be compatible with the character of the property, neighborhood and environment."
6. "Design the building components (roof, foundation, doors, and windows) of the addition to be compatible with the historic architecture."
7. "Maintain the relationship of solids to voids of an exterior wall as established by the historic building."
8. "Place an addition so that it is subordinate next to the historic residential structure."
9. "Place or design an addition to the rear or side of a historic building, wherever possible."
10. "Design an addition to be compatible in massing or scale to the historic structure."
11. "Use exterior materials and finishes comparable to those of the original historic residential structure in profile, dimension, and composition."
12. "Design doors and windows to or onto an addition so to be compatible with the existing structure."
13. "Design the scale and proportion and character of a porch addition, including columns, corner brackets, railings and pickets to be compatible with the existing historic structure."
14. "Use details that are similar in character to those on the historic structure."
15. "Design a window in an addition to be compatible to those in the historic building."
16. "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."
17. "Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."
18. "Construct an addition in such a matter that, if the addition were to be removed, the essential form and integrity of the historic structure would be unimpaired."

C. Scope of Work (per submitted plans):

1. Restore the original shotgun with wing main dwelling.
 - A. Reroof the dwelling with architectural shingles.
 - B. Repair and where necessary replace deteriorated woodwork to match the existing in profile, dimension, and material.
 - C. Remove an existing non-historic balustrade.
 - D. Instate wooden porch balustrades between turned porch posts.
 - E. Replicate turned posts on porches of both the shotgun and recessed wing on front porch fronting the shotgun portion of the house.
 - F. Repair existing wooden windows and transoms.
 - G. Where wooden windows are beyond repair replace them with either salvaged or aluminum clad wood windows that match the existing in profile, dimension, and light configuration.
 - H. Alter fenestration on the West (a side) Elevation by removing single window unit and installing two equidistant double window units.
 - I. The aforementioned single window unit will be salvaged if repairable.

- J. Infill a side window located on East Elevation of the recessed side wing with wooden siding to match the existing.
- K. Install replacement doors that will be four panel in design in either salvaged wood, new wood or aluminum clad in composition.
- L. Repair brick piers with salvaged brick and appropriate mortar.
- 2. Reapprove the demolition of a later fire-damaged rear addition.
- 3. Construct a new rear addition of the South side of the house.
 - A. The addition will be recessed or inset from the original residence on the West and East Elevations.
 - B. A gable roof will surmount the new construction.
 - C. The roof will be sheathed with architectural shingles.
 - D. Walls will be clad in hardiboard lap siding to match that found on the main house with regards to profile and dimension.
 - E. The windows will either be salvaged wood or aluminum clad wood so as to match existing in light configuration, profile, and dimension.
 - F. Multi-light glazed doors with surmounting transoms will be either wood or aluminum clad in composition.
 - G. Salvaged brick piers with appropriate mortar composition will be employed.
 - H. West (a side) Elevation
 - i. One six-over-six window will be installed on the northernmost end of the addition.
 - ii. A cornerboard will inform the beginning of a recessed porch.
 - iii. A multi-light glazed door with transom will access the aforementioned porch.
 - iv. A turned porch post matching that on the existing will inform the southernmost end of the elevation.
 - v. A railing matching that employed on the front porch porches extend between the porch post and corner board.
 - I. East (a side) Elevation
 - i. One six-over-six window will be installed on the northern portion of the elevation.
 - ii. The southernmost end of the East Elevation will be informed by a corner board.
 - K. South (Rear) Elevation
 - i. A recessed porch will inform the westernmost end of the South Elevation.
 - ii. The aforementioned porch will be accessed by a multi-light glazed door with transom.
 - iii. Flights of wooden steps will lead from porch to ground.
 - iv. One six-over-six window will be employed east of the porch.
 - v. One six-over six-window will be employed on eastern portion of the South Elevation.
 - vi. A rectangular transom-like window with a light configuration of three-over-three will be on the easternmost portion of the South Elevation.
 - vii. A corner board will inform the end of the elevation.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This application involves the following: restoration of earlier portions of a dwelling; alteration of fenestration; renewal of demolition approval of a later rear addition; and the construction of a rear addition. These rehabilitative and construction efforts would positively impact a contributing residential structure in disrepair. The scope work is sensitive to the design of the original dwelling, and its neighboring landscape.

With regard to the restoration of the main dwelling, the work falls into two categories - repair &/or replacement of existing features OR reinstatement of lost or period appropriate elements. Woodwork, windows, roofing shingles, brickwork, and other elements will either be repaired or replaced to match the existing as per profile, dimension, and material. The main dwelling's principle porch has lost its original columns and balustrades. The recessed side wing has columns which will be replicated on the front porch thereby creating a rhythmic and uniform sequence appropriate for the dwelling and in accord with the Secretary of Interior Standards and Mobile's Historic Districts Design Review Guidelines (B 1-3). In addition to the restoration of existing and reinstatement of lost features, the rehabilitation of the existing dwelling calls for the alteration of fenestration on the West and East Elevations. The affected areas are minimally visible from public view and not out of keeping with the building. Windows removed from said locations will be salvaged and reused on North elevation if they repairable (B 1-3).

When reviewing applications for demolition, the following criterion is taken into account: the architectural significance of the building; the condition of the building; the impact of demolition on the streetscape; and the nature of any proposed redevelopment.

The main shotgun dwelling was built circa 1904. A side wing addition was addition added shortly thereafter. These two older portions of the dwelling will be restored. The current rear addition requested for proposed demolition dates from the 1970's. Said addition is not of the same architectural and material quality as the older portions of the building. The Board has approved numerous demolitions of later rear additions.

The current rear addition is concealed from public view. The location of the main building, its setback, proximity to the lot line, and landscape features allow for minimal visibility from Selma Street.

The condition of the existing addition is a safety hazard. Due to neglect and fire, the existing addition is uninhabitable.

With regard to new development, the proposed addition to be located of the Rear Elevation would be responsive to the main dwelling in terms of scale, placement, materials, fenestration (See B 1-10). The footprint and elevation of the addition are subordinate to the principle building (See B 1-18) for the inset nature of the addition allows that new construction to "read" distinctly from the older fabric. The Design Review Guidelines also state the building components (roof, foundation, doors and windows) of an addition be compatible with historic architecture (See B 1-16). The hardiplank lap siding, architectural shingles, salvaged or

aluminum clad windows, and turned wooden column will match those on the existing historic building.

The rehabilitation of this dwelling will enhance the landscape of this neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

With regard to the restoration of main dwelling, as well as alterations to side fenestration thereon, Staff does not believe the proposed work will impair either the architectural or historical character of the property or district. Based on B (1-3) Staff recommends approval of that portion of the scope of work.

As to the demolition of the later rear addition, Staff recommends the renewal of the Certificate of Appropriateness on the account of said construction's lack of architectural significance, location on the lot, poor condition, and proposed replacement. The aforementioned work would not impair the architectural or historical character of the original portion of the building.

With regard to the final portion of the application - the construction of a new rear addition - Staff does not believe the construction of the proposed addition will impair the architectural or the historical character of the property or surrounding district. The addition is differentiated from yet compatible with principle dwelling and would not harm existing if it should be removed. Based on B (-18), Staff recommends approval of this application.