

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA
December 1, 2010 – 3:00 P.M.
Pre-Council Chambers, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid Month COAs Granted by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. **Applicant: Walter Reinhaus**
 - a. Property Address: 105 Michael Donald Boulevard
 - b. Date of Approval: 11/15/10
 - c. Project: Repair rotten wood as necessary to match original in profile and dimension, and repaint body pastel peach and trim white.
2. **Applicant: Kara Sebastian**
 - a. Property Address: 84 South Lafayette Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 11/15/10
 - c. Project: Reroof the house with asphalt shingles.
3. **Applicant: Chris McGough**
 - a. Property Address: 912 Charleston Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 11/15/10
 - c. Work approved: Level the foundations reusing old brick. Repair and replace rotten woodwork to match the existing in profile, dimension, and material. Reroof the house with asphalt shingles.
4. **Applicant: Bailey DuMont**
 - a. Property Address: 162 Roberts
 - b. Date of Approval: 11/17/10
 - c. Project: THIS COA REPLACES COA DATED 8/20/08--Replace the white steel casement windows with white aluminum sash windows as per the submitted plans approved by the ARB. And THIS COA REPLACES COA DATED 11 July 2007 and updated 8/20/2008--carport repair, repair/replace columns to match existing and replace veneered carport with panels to match doors on house, paint everything white. Repairs to main house: caulk and repaint wood awning windows; repair and repaint portico and shutters to match existing. Minor repair to chimney and paint white, paint exterior ductwork white.
5. **Applicant: Cameron Young**
 - a. Property Address: 457 Michigan Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 11/17/10
 - c. Project: Install a sixteen square foot storage shed in the backyard. The shed will be minimally visible from the street.

C. APPLICATIONS

1. **2010-82-CA:** 126 Government Street
 - a. Applicant: Kent McPhail with M.D.M., LLC
 - b. Project: Reroof the building.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Discussion

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF REPORT

2010-82-CA: 126 Government Street
Applicant: Kent McPhail with M.D.M., LLC
Received: 11/9/10
Meeting: 12/1/10

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Church Street East
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4
Project: Reroof the building.

BUILDING HISTORY

This two part building is known as the Eslava Building. The older two-and-one-half story gabled roof front portion dates from circa 1850. The rear portion dates from 1898.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on July 20, 1998. At that time, the Board approved alterations to the façade’s second story fenestration. The applicant proposes the installation of a metal roof.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “A roof is one of the most dominant features of a building. Original roofs and roof forms, as well as the original pitch of the roof should be maintained. Materials should be appropriate to the form and pitch and color.”
- C. **Scope of Work (per submitted site plan):**
 - 1. Reroof the Tuff-Rib metal panels.
 - a. The panels feature ¾” high ridges that alternate with ridges of a lower height. Every third ridge is ¾” in height.
 - b. The panels will be either Light Gray or Clay in color.

Clarifications

- 1. What will type roofing will be used to cover the rear portion of the building.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Metal roofs are reviewed on a case by case basis. When reviewing applications for metal roofs, the proposed metal roofing type, the particulars of the site and the building’s style are taken into account.

Metal roofing options vary in terms of their design and appropriateness. On May 5, 2009, the Board approved the installation of the proposed roofing type at 201 South Washington Street. The panels of the approved and proposed roofing feature ridges measuring ¾" in height. Lower ridges result in a more planar roof surface than roofing options using higher ridges. Roofs with lower ridges better approximate traditional standing seam metal roofs. The simple two-story wooden dwelling at Washington Street features a hipped roof; therefore the metal roof is visible from four elevations.

The two-story masonry Eslava Building is not only older than the Washington Street building, but also more sophisticated stylistically. This building has undergone numerous alterations over the course of the twentieth-century. That said the Government Street-facing roof form has remained intact. The low-pitched gable is flanked by side parapets which obscure a direct side elevation view of the roofing material. The roofing would only be visible from opposite the building or at oblique angles from it.

As a surviving example of the once ubiquitous two-and-one-half story 19th-century commercial building which formerly dotted the downtown area, this building is one of the oldest structures on lower Government Street. Metal roofs were employed on commercial buildings of this type.

Staff does not believe this application will impair the architectural or the historical integrity of the building or the district.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1), Staff does not believe this application impairs the architectural or the historical character of the building or the district. Staff recommends approval of this application.