

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD AGENDA
April 18, 2018 – 3:00 P.M.
Multi-Purpose Room, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of MidMonth COAs Granted by Staff

B. MIDMONTH APPROVALS

1. **Applicant: Ellen Marler**
 - a. Property Address: 17 Common Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/9/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with charcoal black architectural shingles.
2. **Applicant: Marion Overbey**
 - a. Property Address: 2256 Ashland Place
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/9/2018
 - c. Project: Repair and replace to match existing on playhouse located in rear yard.
3. **Applicant: John and Laurie Kilpatrick**
 - a. Property Address: 63 Fearnway
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/12/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with slate architectural shingles.
4. **Applicant: Scott Rowe of Rogers and Willard, Inc.**
 - a. Property Address: 966 Texas Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/12/2018
 - c. Project: Repair wood to match existing in dimension, profile and material. Reroof with asphalt shingles. Replace windows with aluminum clad, extruded aluminum, or wood to match existing in dimension and profile. Replace existing siding with wood lapsiding.
5. **Applicant: Luci Ladd**
 - a. Property Address: 1558 Blair Avenue
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/14/2018
 - c. Project: Repaint in approved color scheme.
6. **Applicant: Allen Johnson**
 - a. Property Address: 1006 Selma Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/16/2018
 - c. Project: Construct wood shed according to MHDC examples.
7. **Applicant: Stephen Hand**
 - a. Property Address: 702 St. Francis Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/16/2018
 - c. Project: Renew COA issued on June 10, 2016 to repaint and repair woodwork to match existing (siding, decking, and rails). Reroof wings.
8. **Applicant: Phil Witter**
 - a. Property Address: 159 S. Dearborn Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/20/2018
 - c. Project: Repair/replace exterior siding, underpinning, columns, railings, stairs, porch decking, doors, windows all to match existing in profile and dimension. Reroof with standing seam metal. Repaint exterior, body blue, trim white, stain front door and kitchen door, and decks. Replace fence palings same height. Replace canvas awning over courtyard entrance.

9. **Applicant: Scott Tindle**
 - a. Property Address: 150 Royal Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/21/2018
 - c. Project: Make site improvements to allow for temporary vehicle (foodtruck).
10. **Applicant: Arthur Tonsmire**
 - a. Property Address: 2 S. Water Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/21/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with white membrane system.
11. **Applicant: D&D Properties**
 - a. Property Address: 1309 Azalea Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/22/2018
 - c. Project: Replace six feet wooden privacy fence.
12. **Applicant: Stephen Shortridge**
 - a. Property Address: 601 Church Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/26/2018
 - c. Project: Construct steps and metal railing to side porch, and 3' aluminum fence across front and down both sides of house; and remove: 2 nonfunctional doors on the 2nd story rear addition to be re-sided and construct an opening in existing brick wall brick in rear of house for vehicular access.
13. **Applicant: Lesleigh Smith on behalf of KCUFA Consulting, Inc.**
 - a. Property Address: 127 Dauphin Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/29/2018
 - c. Project: Repaint to match existing. Gently powerwash. Repair Window trim to match existing. Reroof building & canopy to match existing.
14. **Applicant: Wayne McKathan**
 - a. Property Address: 508 Monroe Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 3/29/2018
 - c. Project: Construct 6x8 shed. The roof will be a gable sheathed with architectural shingles. Hardiplank siding will be employed to match lapsiding on the main house. Install six panel door on front elevation and small window on rear. Paint to match existing main building.
15. **Applicant: Charles Heyer of Heyer Enterprises on behalf of Mr. and Mrs. William Knauf**
 - a. Property Address: 958 Augusta Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 4/2/2018
 - c. Project: Repair and replace to match existing railing and porch deck. Repaint to match existing.
16. **Applicant: Philip Davenport**
 - a. Property Address: 556 Eslava Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 4/3/2018
 - c. Project: Reroof with charcoal architectural shingles.
17. **Applicant: Noel Robert**
 - a. Property Address: 1221 Elmira Street
 - b. Date of Approval: 4/3/2018
 - c. Project: Remove window from rear elevation of enclosed porch over carriageway to front elevation. In opening, install window to match in configuration and material. Repair and replace deteriorated wood to match existing. Repair existing windows to make operable. Repaint to match existing.
18. **Applicant: Ronald Emmorey**
 - a. Property Address: 960 Old Shell Road
 - b. Date of Approval: 4/4/2018

- c. Project: Add wood lattice around foundation piers where needed, build rear deck to meet setback requirements.

19. Applicant: Doney White of Wrico Signs

- a. Property Address: 260 St. Anthony Street
- b. Date of Approval: 4/4/2018
- c. Project: Install one individual storefront sign. Sign will be a total of 6'8" om width and 8" in height and comprised of individual metal letters painted black to say "Flambeaux Hall".

C. APPLICATIONS

1. 2018-11-CA: 400 Charles Street

- a. Applicant: Douglas Kearley of DBK, Inc. on behalf of 400 Charles, LLC
- b. Project: Rehabilitation and Ancillary Related: Repair and replace to match existing; construct small rear addition. Construct one story ancillary building. Install new driveway.

2. 2018-12-CA: 1055 Elmira Street

- a. Applicant: Mr. Leroy Anderson
- b. Project: Alterations and Addition Related: Construct new roof system; alter fenestration; Construct additions on front façade and rear of single family residence.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

- 1. Deas Millwork

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF REPORT

2018-07-CA: 400 Charles Street
Applicant: Douglas Kearley of DBK, Inc. on behalf of 400 Charles, LLC
Received: 4/3/2018
Meeting: 4/18/18

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Rehabilitation and Ancillary Related: Repair and replace to match existing; construct small rear addition. Construct one story ancillary building. Install new driveway.

BUILDING HISTORY

This three bay shotgun plan residence was constructed in 1866 with Greek Revival details. Over the years unsympathetic alterations and additions have slightly changed the appearance.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property has not appeared before the Architectural Review Board according to the MHDC vertical files. The proposed scope of work includes alterations of secondary elevations, and an addition to the rear of the building.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in physical character and durability.”
 - 2. “Composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities should appear similar to the original material.”
 - 3. “Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence.”
 - 4. “Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the material.”
 - 5. “Consider removing later covering materials that have not achieved historic significance.”
 - 6. “Maintain the original pitch.”
 - 7. “Preserve decorative elements, including crests and chimneys.”

8. "Original doors and openings, including their dimensions, should be retained along with any moldings, transoms or sidelights."
9. "Replacements (of doors) should reflect the age and style of the building."
10. "Document the location of a historic feature that must be removed and repaired so it may be repositioned accurately."
11. "Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material."
12. "In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration."
13. "Where a rear or side porch is enclosed, preserve the original configuration of columns, handrails and other important architectural features."
14. "Preserve the original piers, foundations, and foundation infill wherever possible."
15. "Design an addition so there is the least possible loss of historic fabric and so the character-defining features of the historic building are not destroyed, damaged or obscured."
16. "Design an addition so that the overall characteristics of the site (site topography, character-defining site features, trees, and significant district vistas and public views) are retained."
17. "Design the building components (roof, foundation, doors and windows) of the addition to be compatible with the historic architecture."
18. "Differentiate an addition from a historic structure using changes in material, color and/or wall plane. Alternative materials, such as cement fiberboard, are allowed when the addition is properly differentiated from the original structure."
19. "Design an accessory structure to be subordinate in scale to that of the primary structure."
20. "Locate a new accessory structure in line with other visible accessory structures in the district."
21. "Design a garage door to be simple and compatible with the primary building."
22. "If a wood garage door is infeasible, choose a door with a look and finish that is appropriate to the style of the house."
23. "Locate a parking area at the rear or to the side of a site whenever possible."

C. Scope of Work (per submitted site plan):

1. Conduct repairs to the residence.
 - a. Reroof the house with architectural shingles in "Sienna."
 - b. Repair and repoint chimneys with appropriate mortar.
 - c. Install new drip edge.
 - d. Repair and replace wood elements including siding, fascia, soffits, and decking to match as per profile, dimension and material.
 - e. Repair when necessary wooden windows to match existing as per material, light configurations and moldings.
 - f. Repair foundation piers and install new fill between piers.
 - g. Wooden fill between piers will match that existing.
 - h. East (Front Façade) Elevation
 - i. Repair existing masonry stairs.
 - ii. Remove existing columns and install repaired original boxed columns.

- iii. Install new handrail.
- iv. Remove later addition and porch infill on southern portion of the elevation.
 - a. Install wood lapsiding to match existing.
 - b. Install new wooden door and transom to match existing front door.
 - c. Install new wooden window to match existing.
- i. South (Side) Elevation
 - i. Install wooden window where original porch has been reinstated on eastern portion of elevation.
 - ii. Create opening and install wooden door and transom on recessed portion of elevation.
 - iii. A new set of wooden steps and with handrails and landing will access this door.
 - iv. Remove existing window on westernmost portion of elevation and install diamond window.
 - v. Replace siding with vertical tongue and groove board.
- 2. Construct a rear addition.
 - a. The addition will extend from/off of the Northwest portion of the West elevation of the house.
 - b. The addition will take the form of an enclosed space.
 - c. The addition will be 6'4" in depth and 21'6" in width.
 - d. The addition's foundation treatment will match that found on the body of the house.
 - e. The addition's walls will wooden lapsiding of the same profile and dimension as the wooden siding found on the body of the house.
 - f. A diamond window will be employed on the North elevation..
 - g. Shed roof forms will surmount the addition.
 - h. Architectural shingles will sheath the addition's roof.
- 3. Construct a new one story garage.
 - a. The garage will be located on the southwest corner of the lot.
 - b. The garage will be 26'0" in depth by 24'0" in width.
 - c. House will be constructed on concrete slab.
 - d. A hip roof will surmount the garage.
 - e. A cornice will be constructed to match the main house.
 - f. Corner boards will be employed.
 - g. Hardiplank to match in dimension and profile of the main house will sheath the garage.
 - h. The North elevation will feature two equidistant paneled vehicular doors.
 - i. The East elevation will feature a six-over-six aluminum clad window between a set of four paneled, painted metal doors.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This application calls for alterations and additions to informing the side and rear elevations of a residential building, as well as the construction of an ancillary building. In accord with the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts, neither the alterations, the construction of addition, nor the new ancillary construction would impair the overall site conditions (See B-16).

The alterations to the existing building will be minimal. Existing doors, windows, chimneys and other deteriorated features on the original portions of the house would largely be repaired (See B-4). Where new features are being installed (East and South elevations) they are based on the existing house (See B-1). A later addition and infilled porch will be restored to an open porch space. The new door and window is based mimic those found on the front elevation of the house (B-5).

A new addition would engage with and extend from the rear portion of the West elevation. By virtue of its situation on the lot and design the addition is subordinate to the contributing building (See B-16). The proposed addition is an enclosed space. The proposed addition is so designed as to afford compatibility with existing fabric (See B-17). Foundation elevation would be maintained. The proposed wooden siding would match the finish of the existing; however the changes in ceiling height differentiate the addition from the historic fabric (See B-18). Roofing form to match existing is proposed. The new fenestration on the addition is suitable for the period of the house and the neighborhood (See B-17).

Regarding the new construction of an ancillary structure, the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state that ancillary construction on contributing properties should be compatible with historic ancillary construction in the district. New ancillary construction involves review of considerations pertaining to placement, scale, massing, design, and material.

Placement takes into account setbacks. The proposed ancillary building's side and rear setbacks are authorized by the Historic District Overlay, a planning regulation that offers for reduced setbacks in Mobile's locally designated historic districts situated in eastern Midtown. As seen in surrounding properties and Midtown back lots in general, ancillary buildings were generally placed on or close to lot lines so the lot. In accord with The Design Review Guidelines, the building is in line with the specific and the same general location as traditional ancillary construction (See B-20).

With regard to scale, the Design Review Guidelines state that new ancillary construction should be subordinate in scale to the principle building (See B-19). The building is subordinate in scale to the main dwelling. Additionally, properties abutting and across the street possess buildings of comparable scale. While situated on a slab, many ancillary buildings adopt on grade or low foundations. The ceiling heights (9'4") are responsive to a historic context.

With regard to design, compatibility of features serves as a means to preserve the character of a property and district. The proposed ancillary building features cement fiber board siding that would match that on the body of the house in terms of profile and dimension. Said siding would be cement-based. Cementitious siding is authorized by the Design Review Guidelines for additions and new construction. The multi-light configuration of window and paneled nature of the doors match those found on the principle dwelling for reason of further compatibility with the historic dwelling which defines the property.

CLARIFICATIONS

1. Clarify the garage door configuration.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1-5), Staff does not believe the application will impair either the architectural or the historical character of the properties or district. Staff recommends approval of the application in full.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF REPORT

2018-09-CA: 1055 Elmira Street
Applicant: Mr. Leroy Anderson
Received: 4/2/2018
Meeting: 4/18/2018

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden District
Classification: Non-Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Alterations and Addition Related: Construct new roof system; alter fenestration;
Construct additions on front façade and rear of single family residence.

BUILDING HISTORY

While listed as non-contributing in 2007 expansion of the local boundaries of the Oakleigh Garden Historic District, it is said that the core of this dwelling dates circa 1855. The house was altered circa 1925 and reflected in its outward form and motifs a later vein of Arts and Crafts Movement. The dwelling still maintains its antebellum shotgun and with side wing floor plan.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This property last appeared before the Architectural Review Board on January 3, 2018. On the aforementioned date, the Board approved the application for demolition. The application up for review calls for the alterations on the existing portions of the single family residence and an addition..
- B. Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
 - 1. “Non-contributing structures are addressed separately in the Design Review Guidelines document from contributing structures.”
 - 2. “Contributing structures are identified based on historic surveys conducted by professionals in accordance with the guidelines and standards adopted by the National Park Service. These surveys are updated from time to time, at which point the classifications of contributors and non-contributors may change within a given locally designated historic district.”
 - 3. “In order to ensure efficient administration of the guidelines and predictability for property owners, only properties classified as contributing should be reviewed as such in Mobile’s design review process.”
 - 4. “Preserving the integrity of a non-contributor is not a consideration. Instead compatibility with the character of the district is the focus, as it is with a new building in a historic district.”
 - 5. “Design an addition to respect the original orientation of the building and maintain the typical orientation of adjacent historic buildings.”

6. "Design an addition to a non-historic building to preserve setback distances and spacing between buildings to maintain setbacks and spacing typical of surrounding historic structures."
7. "Design the massing of an addition to be consistent with the massing of historic structures in the district."
8. "Design a roofline, bay, porch or other element associated with an addition to a non-historic building to be in keeping with the scale of surrounding historic structures."
9. "Design a cornice line, foundation line, window and door height, and floor and ceiling height of an addition to a non-historic buildings to be similar to those of the original building provided these elements on the original building blend harmoniously with the historic district."
10. "Use the alteration or addition to a non-historic building to improve the overall structure's appropriateness within the historic district."
11. "Use materials with a character compatible to those used historically and with proven durability."
12. "Design replacement roofs and roofs of additions to be compatible with the district."
13. "Locate and orient a new porch on a non-historic residential building similarly to those seen in the district."
14. "Size a front porch element to be at a similar proportion to the original structure as those seen in the district."
15. "Design a foundation to be consistent with those in the district and use a durable foundation material on all sides of a building."
16. "Design details and ornamentation at a scale that is consistent with details and ornamentation on historic buildings in the district."
17. "Design window alterations and windows on new additions to non-historic structures to be compatible with the neighborhood."
18. "Maintain original material wherever possible provided the material is durable and compatible with the surrounding historic district."

C. Scope of Work (per submitted site plan):

1. Conduct repairs, alterations, and additions to a non-contributing residence.
 - a. Alter existing roof system to that of a front gable roof form.
Roof will be sheathed in either architectural shingles or standing seam metal.
 - b. Residence will be clad in wood siding or hardiplank siding in 1"x6" or 1"x8" dimension.
 - c. Replace existing wood elements with either wood or hardiplank siding. (See drawing A-2 for more detail.) These elements include, but are not limited to, fascia, eaves, soffits, corner boards and trim. .
 - d. Replace existing windows with aluminum clad in multi-lite configuration.
 - e. Repair foundation piers. Repair ornamental concrete foundation.
 - f. Wood framed lattice fill between piers will be employed.
 - g. North (Front Façade) Elevation
 - i. Extend eastern portion of façade 6'0" from front plane of existing.
 - a. Install three-over-one aluminum clad window.
 - b. Install paneled and glazed wooden door west of window.
 - ii. Construct porch.
 - a. Porch will be 8'0" in depth and 16'0" in width.
 - b. Existing masonry steps with cheeks will access the front porch.
 - c. Construct wooden or hardiplank porch decking.
 - d. Three equidistant 6" x 6" columns will support the porch roof.
 - iii. Remove existing double window on western portion of elevation and install single three-over-one aluminum clad window.
 - iv. Construct kneebraces from 2"x4"s.

- h. East (Side) Elevation
 - i. Construct porch 9'0" in depth from northernmost portion of elevation.
 - ii. Extend current wall plane on northern portion of elevation 6'0".
 - iii. Install three-over-one aluminum clad window.
 - iv. Remove existing double window and install one three-over-one aluminum clad window.
 - i. West (side) Elevation
 - v. Remove existing windows on elevation.
 - vi. Fenestration sequence will be as follows on existing portion: three-over-one, small two-over-one, three-over-one.
2. Construct a rear addition.
- a. The addition will extend from/off of the South elevation of the house.
 - b. The addition will take the form of enclosed and open spaces.
 - c. The addition will be 21'0" in depth and 28'0" in width.
 - d. The addition's foundation treatment will match the brick piers with lattice infill found on the body of the house.
 - e. The addition's walls will wooden or hardiplank siding.
 - f. Gable roof forms will surmount the addition.
 - g. The roof will be sheathed in architectural shingles or metal roof to match the existing house.
 - i. East (side) Elevation
 - a. The addition will continue from after the second window from the North.
 - b. A small three-over-one window will be constructed.
 - c. A recessed porch will be constructed south of the aforementioned window.
 - d. A set of wooden steps will access the porch.
 - e. Two equidistant 6" square columns will support the porch roof.
 - ii. West (side) Elevation
 - a. The addition will continue on the existing residence after the third window from the North.
 - b. A small two-over-one aluminum clad window will be installed..
 - c. A corner board will terminate the elevation.
 - iii. South (rear) Elevation
 - a. A three-over-one aluminum clad window will be installed on the eastern portion of the elevation.
 - b. An enclosed space and porch will be constructed in advance of the eastern portion of the elevation.
 - c. The porch will be accessed by a set of metal French doors.
 - d. On the western portion a double three-over-one window will be constructed.
 - e. Construct kneebraces.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The application for review involves the following: alterations and addition of a non-contributing single family residence. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts state that non-contributing buildings in historic districts are reviewed separately from contributing structures (See B-1). Alterations and additions to historic districts should respect the neighborhood landscape and improve the building's appropriateness (See B-4 and B-10).

With regard to alterations to the existing fabric, the Design Review Guidelines state original material should be maintained when compatible with district (See B-18). Existing foundation will be repaired and replaced to match. Fenestration alterations will match that of the existing three-over-one configuration on most elevations. Hardiplank or wooden siding will be employed. The roofline will be significantly altered to include the new addition.

Several factors are taken into consideration when designing an addition on a contributing building. These include: setback, scale, massing, materials and compatibility. Regarding setback, a large addition will be located on the rear of the property (See B-6). The scale of the addition and new roofline is in keeping with a neighboring Craftsman house on the street located at 1057 Elmira Street (See B-8 and B-12). The massing of the rear addition blends in with the surrounding building. The front porch scale is compatible to the district. However the massing and details of the porch needs clarification (See B-14). The hardiplank siding, wooden siding, aluminum clad windows, architectural shingles, wooden doors and metal doors are all approved materials for new construction and in certain cases existing buildings (See B-11).

Regarding compatibility, Arts and Crafts informed houses are found throughout the Oakleigh neighborhood (See B-16). In particular, the Craftsman bungalow had several variations. One subtype being the front gabled roof. Decorative elements often included kneebraces, exposed rafter tails, and either full or partial width porches with supporting columns. Kneebraces will be employed underneath gables on the front and rear elevations (See B-16). Floor to ceiling columns were more common on Craftsman houses before 1910. More common variations of porch supports include columns on piers. The most common wall cladding for Craftsman houses is wood clapboard. Hardiplank similar in dimension and profile of clapboard is approvable. Windows found on Craftsman houses in the neighborhood include the three-over-one configuration.(See B-17).

CLARIFICATIONS

1. Confirm the configuration of the front gables.
2. Explain the construction of the kneebraces.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Expose rafter tails on side elevations.
2. Consider either extending porch roof gable or having one gable for the front façade.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Pending clarifications, based on B (1-3) Staff does believe this application does not impair the landscape, Staff recommends approval of the application.