

**AGENDA**  
**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD**

August 25, 2003 – 3:00 P.M.

Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza  
205 Government Street

**A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff
4. Approval of Agenda

**B. MID MONTH APPROVALS**

1. Applicant's Name: Chris Bowen  
Property Address: 110 North Julia Street – Garage Apartment  
Date of Approval: August 19, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Re-roof with 20 year fiberglass 3 tab shingles, weathered wood in color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new to match existing in profile and dimension. Repair rear staircase with materials to match existing in profile and dimension. Repaint in the following Sherwin Williams color scheme: Body: Hubbard Squash  
Trim: Classic Light Buff  
Doors and Decks: Morris Room Grey
2. Applicant's Name: Chris Bowen  
Property Address: 110 North Julia Street  
Date of Approval: August 19, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Re-roof with 20 year fiberglass 3 tab shingles, weathered wood in color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new to match existing in profile and dimension. Repair rear staircase with materials to match existing in profile and dimension. Repaint in the following Sherwin Williams color scheme: Body: Hubbard Squash  
Trim: Classic Light Buff  
Doors and Decks: Morris Room Grey
3. Applicant's Name: Kimberly Tew  
Property Address: 9 Semmes Avenue  
Date of Approval: August 8, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Replace damaged wood on porch with new matching existing in profile and dimension. Paint matching existing color scheme.  
(This COA replaces COA dated 10-02-2000)
4. Applicant's Name: Kenneth Palmertree  
Property Address: 1114 Old Shell Road  
Date of Approval: August 8, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Repair shed. Replace rotten wood as necessary to match existing in profile and dimension. Paint exterior shed white or to match existing color of house.

5. Applicant's Name: Art Green  
Property Address: 1738 Hunter Avenue  
Date of Approval: August 5, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Paint wood portions of house white; paint shutters-Bellingrath Green.
6. Applicant's Name: John C. Bell  
Property Address: 122 Ryan Avenue  
Date of Approval: August 19, 2003 weh  
Work Approved: Resurface asphalt driveway with concrete. Construct new concrete sidewalk from street to house, as per submitted plan.
7. Applicant's Name: Decora Smith  
Property Address: 302 Congress Street  
Date of Approval: August 19, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Repair damages wood on main building and garage apartment to match existing wood in profile and dimension. Paint to match existing color scheme. Re-roof with charcoal gray architectural shingles.
8. Applicant's Name: Palmetto Properties/Graham Roofing  
Property Address: 258 Congress Street  
Date of Approval: August 19, 2003 asc  
Work Approved: Install new black 20 yr. 3-tab shingles to match existing. Replace decking as necessary.
9. Applicant's Name: Greg Daoust Construction  
Property Address: 1358 Dauphin Street  
Date of Approval: August 5, 2003 weh  
Work Approved: Install handicapped ramp as per submitted design. Ramp to tie into existing rear deck and be constructed using materials matching existing rear deck. Handrail to match existing.  
Repair and/or replace deteriorated wood with new wood matching existing in profile and dimension.
10. Applicant's Name: Virginia S. McClinton  
Property Address: 108 Charles Street  
Date of Approval: August 1, 2003  
Work Approved: Construct wood handicapped ramp on south side of house as per submitted design.
11. Applicant's Name: David Thomas, Sr.  
Property Address: 263 South Cedar Street  
Date of Approval: August 1, 2003 weh  
Work Approved: Alternations to rear elevation, including new lattice pergola, as per submitted designs.

12. Applicant's Name: A. R. McMorris  
 Property Address: 204 Government Street  
 Date of Approval: July 30, 2003 jss  
 Work Approved: Re-mill shutters at second story. Board first story windows.  
 Paint boards.
13. Applicant's Name: John and Melanie Friend  
 Property Address: 10 N. Monterey  
 Date of Approval: July 28, 2003 jss  
 Work Approved: Replace rotten wood with new matching existing in profile  
 and dimension. Paint to match existing color scheme.

**C. Old Business:**

1. 054-02/03-CA 219 Dauphin Street  
 Applicant: Banana Joe's Island Party  
 Nature of Request: Retain existing unapproved and unpermitted  
 signage as per submitted application.

**D. New Business:**

1. 082-02/03-CA 116 South Georgia Avenue  
 Applicant: Gil and Bettie Champion  
 Nature of Request: Construct wood deck as per submitted plans.
2. 083-02/03-CA 151 Levert Avenue  
 Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Jerry Bramlett/Lipford Construction  
 Nature of Request: Replace existing deteriorated wood casement  
 windows in porch enclosure with new wood  
 casement windows as per submitted information.
3. 084-02/03-CA 21 South Lafayette Street  
 Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Hunter Compton  
 Nature of Request: Construct a picket fence in front yard as per  
 submitted plans.
4. 085-02/03-CA 1211 Selma Street  
 Applicant: Brent Ericson  
 Nature of Request: Construct rear addition as per submitted plans.
5. 86-02/03-CA Northwest Corner of State and Conception Streets  
 Applicant: Wanda Cochran  
 Nature of Request: Construct a one story stucco-covered frame  
 residence as per submitted plans.

**D. Other Business and Announcements:**

**E. Adjournment**



## Design

- A. The Guidelines state that “The overall design of all signage including the mounting and framework shall relate to the design of the principal building on the property.”
1. Historically, Woolworth’s signage was an integral design of the art deco canopy.
  2. The Woolworth’s signage was rectilinear, located along the face of the canopy.
  3. Signage of previous tenants, Bumpers Billiards, being the last tenant, has been required to respect the rectilinear design of the canopy, and has fit within the requirements of the Ordinance.

## Materials

- A. The Guidelines state that “The structural materials of the sign should match the historic materials of the building. Wood, metal, stucco, stone or brick is allowed. Plastic, vinyl, or similar materials are prohibited. Neon, resin used to give the appearance of wood, and fabric may be used as appropriate.”
1. The design of the proposed signage is yellow neon mounted on a darker yellow-colored plastic background.
  2. Neon signage is appropriate based on the art deco design of the building.
  3. Solid plastic is appropriate because the signage is not internally lit and the sign is inside the building.

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

That the existing signage be reduced to 64 square feet, to comply with the ordinance.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - STAFF COMMENTS**

082-02/03 – CA            116 South Georgia Avenue  
Applicant:                Bettie Champion  
Received:                 7/31/03                                Meeting Date (s):  
Submission Date + 45 Days:    9/15/03                                1) 8/25/03            2)                                3)

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District:        Old Dauphin Way Historic District  
Zoning:                     R-1, Single Family Residential  
Classification:         Contributing  
Additional Permits Required: (2) Building, Fence  
Nature of Project:      Build 15’ x 20’-6” deck adjacent to back of house with concrete slab at base. Repair siding on back of house and anywhere else necessary. Repaint house in existing color scheme. Repair gate and repair other fencing as necessary. Remove existing fencing located between two separate lots of record. Install new 6’ wood privacy fencing along north property line as per site plan.

The property is located on the west side of the 100 block of South Georgia Avenue between Government and Caroline Streets . The irregularly-shaped lot measures 48’ in the front, 80’ in the rear, 233’ on the south side and 223.56 on the north side.’

The proposed deck measures 15’ x 20’-6” and is located on the west side/rear of the residence. The deck will be constructed of 2x6 flooring with skirt board to match that of the existing residence. The proposed deck to be at a height 25” above grade. The proposed concrete slab adjacent to the deck measures 16’-10 x 15’.

The existing wood fence to be removed separates two separate lots of record. 116 South Georgia Avenue is located on the lot adjacent to the street; the second lot is directly behind the main residence, and is land-locked. The proposed new 6’ wood privacy fence runs along the north property line of the rear lot, as noted on the site plan.

**NOTE:**                    The original application included a request to construct a carport with storage room. The applicant requested to construct the carport on the adjoining parcel. Current code does not allow accessory structures on lots that do not have a principal structure. The applicants will have to work with Urban Development to combine the parcels. In addition, the applicant wished to construct the carport within 5’ of the property line. This will require a variance. Therefore, the request to construct a carport is not being considered as part of this application.

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT**  
*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Accessory Structures and Site Considerations	Construct wood deck & concrete slab
3	Fences, Walls and Gates	Remove & Construct new 6’ wood privacy fence

## **STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

## **STAFF REPORT**

- A. The Guidelines state that “The appropriateness of accessory structures shall be measured by the guidelines applicable to new construction. The structure should compliment the design and scale of the main building.”
  - 1. The proposed deck will incorporate design elements of the main house, including skirt board and stair design.
  - 2. The concrete slab will be at grade.
  - 3. The deck and slab are located at the rear of the property and will not be visible from the street.
  
- B. The Guidelines state that fences “...should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.”
  - 1. The residence is a one story wood frame late-Victorian structure
  - 2. The proposed fence is 6’ wood privacy fence

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF COMMENTS**

**083-02/03 – CA**            151 Levert Avenue  
**Applicant:**            Mr. and Mrs. Jerry Bramlett  
**Received:**            7/31/03                            **Meeting Date (s):**  
**Submission Date + 45 Days:**    9/15/03                            1) 8/25/03            2)                            3)

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

**Historic District:**        Ashland Place Historic District  
**Zoning:**                R-1, Single Family Residential  
**Classification:**        Contributing  
**Additional Permits Required:** (1) Building  
**Nature of Project:**    Replace existing deteriorated and inoperable wood casement windows in rear second floor sunroom addition as per submitted plans.

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:...Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

- A. The Guidelines state that “Original window openings should be retained as well as original window sashes and glazing.”
  - 1. Proposed plans call for the existing deteriorated wood casement windows to be removed.
  - 2. The existing wood casement windows are not original to the structure.
  - 3. The enclosed sun porch is located on the rear of the residence and is not visible from public view.
  
- B. The Guidelines state that “Where windows cannot be repaired, new windows must be compatible to the existing.”
  - 1. Proposed replacement windows are wood casement windows matching the original in profile and dimension.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.



**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF COMMENTS**

084-02/03 – CA                    21 South Lafayette Street  
Applicant:                    Mr. and Mrs. Hunter Compton/Don Bowden, Architect  
Received:                    8/12/03                                    Meeting Date (s):  
    **Submission Date + 45 Days:** 9/26/03                                    1) 8/25/03    2)  
    3)

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

Historic District:            Old Dauphin Way Historic District  
Classification:            Contributing  
Zoning:                      R-1, Single Family Residential  
Additional Permits Required: (1) Fence

Nature of Project:        Construct a wood picket fence at front of yard as per submitted site. Fence to begin at north corner of house, and run west to property line/sidewalk, then turn south and run to south property line; then run east approximately 35.5’; at that point, fence turns north and dies into the front wall of the house. Matching gates located at the northwest corner of the yard, at the main sidewalk, and at the southeast corner of the yard in line with the front wall of the house, as per submitted site plan.

The picket fence design features alternating 36” and 32” 1x6 pickets mounted on 2x4 stringers, mounted on 4x6 posts spaced at 8’ on center.

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT**  
*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Fences, Walls and Gates	Install picket fence

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:…Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district…”

**STAFF REPORT**

- A. The Guidelines state that fences “...should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.
  - 1. The residence is a one story wood frame bungalow with a front porch and end-gabled roof.
  - 2. The proposed fence is wood picket designed to compliment the bungalow residence.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF COMMENTS**

**085-02/03 – CA**            1211 Selma Street  
**Applicant:**                Mr. and Mrs. Brent Ericson  
**Received:**                 8/12/03                        **Meeting Date (s):**  
**Submission Date + 45 Days:**    9/26/03 1) 8/25/03        2)                                3)

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

**Historic District:**        Oakleigh Garden Historic District  
**Classification:**         Contributing  
**Zoning:**                    R-1, Single Family Residential  
**Additional Permits Required:** (4) Building, Plumbing, Mechanical, Electrical  
**Nature of Project:**     Construct rear addition, measuring 17’-6” x 23’ as per submitted plans.

The proposed addition measures 17’-6” x 23’, in addition to the incorporation of approximately 5’-6” of the existing rear elevation. The proposed foundation is of brick piers with framed lattice infill to match existing. Exterior sheathing is to be wood lap siding to match existing. New wood 1-over-1 windows to match existing. Roof pitch to match existing, with matching fiberglass shingles. 3 pairs of new wood custom French doors, with ¾ length glass panes and raised panels below, to be installed on first floor of south elevation. Transoms above the doors to line up with existing window head heights. The 8’ deep rear, one story, 3 bay porch is supported by four 10” square wood built-up columns. The second floor bedroom addition extends out over the 8’ porch and is symmetrically-designed with three windows centered on the bays below. One window opening is false and is covered with fixed wood louvered blinds. The east elevation has 3 new wood one-over-one windows, two on the first floor, and one on the second, size matching existing, and one 2’ square hinged wood window. The west elevation has one 2’ square hinged wood window and a chimney measuring 1’-6” deep by 5’ wide. The chimney helps break up the massing of the west elevation.

**Existing Conditions:**    The existing rear elevation of the house measures 23’. Currently the south elevation has a series of rear additions and infills, including a cantilevered second story section. The existing rear elevation is predominantly lap siding with minimal fenestration.

**Additional Information:** The owners were issued a C of A in November 2001 for a larger and more extensive addition.

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT**  
*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<b><u>Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Topic</u></b>	<b><u>Description of Work</u></b>
3	General	
3	Piers, Foundations and Foundation Infill	Construct addition
3	Exterior Materials and Finishes	
3	Doors and Doorways	
3	Windows	
3	Porches and Canopies	
3	Roof	

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

## STAFF REPORT

### General

- A. The Guidelines state that “The standards listed and shown...illustrate elements that contribute to the architectural character of the buildings in Mobile’s historic districts. These define the architectural style of the buildings and establish a repetition of forms and details, which create harmony and character of the historic districts.
1. The existing structure is a two-story wood frame residence with Classical Revival detailing.
  2. The form of the proposed addition replicates the massing of a traditional open recessed porch with enclosed sleeping porch above.

### Work Item 1 –Rear Addition

- A. Piers, Foundations and Foundation Infill: The Guidelines state that “foundation screening should be recessed from the front of the foundation piers.”
1. The existing foundation is brick pier with lattice infill.
  2. The proposed addition is brick pier with framed lattice infill, matching existing.
- B. Exterior Materials: The Guidelines state that “ Replacement...must match the original in profile and dimension and material.”
1. The existing exterior sheathing is wood lap siding.
  2. The proposed exterior sheathing for the addition is wood lap siding.
- C. The Guidelines state that “ Original doors and door openings should be retained along with any mouldings, sidelights and transoms.”
1. Proposed plans call for the removal of the existing rear door.
  2. Proposed plans call for the installation of 3 pair of new wood custom French doors with  $\frac{3}{4}$  length pane and raised panel below, on the south elevation.
- D. The Guidelines state that “The size and placement of new windows for additions or alterations should be compatible with the general character of the building.”
1. Windows in the historic residence are wood 1-over-1 double hung.
  2. Windows in the main area of the addition are proposed to match the existing in profile, light configuration, and dimension.
  3. Windows in the bath areas of the addition are 2’ x 2’ square hinged wood windows.
- E. The Guidelines state that “ Porch materials should blend with the style of the building.”
1. The square wood 10” columns, their capitals and bases, are Classical Revival in nature.
  2. The porch cornice and soffit match that of the main residence.
- F. The Guidelines state that “...historic roof forms, as well as the original pitch of the roof, should be maintained.”
1. The predominant roof form is hipped.
  2. The roof for the proposed addition extends the existing hip over the subsequent rear additions.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF COMMENTS**

**086-02/03 – CA** Northwest corner of State and Conception Streets  
**Applicant:** Wanda Cochran  
**Received:** 8/12/03 **Meeting Date (s):**  
**Submission Date + 45 Days:** 9/26/03 1) 8/25/03 2) 3)

**INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION**

**Historic District:** DeTonti Square Historic District  
**Classification:** Non-Contributing (vacant lot/new construction)  
**Additional Permits Required:** (4) Building, Mechanical, Electrical, Plumbing  
**Nature of Project:** Construction of a 1 story, stucco-covered wood frame residence as per submitted plans.

The building is sited on the northwest corner of State and Conception. The lot measures 95’ by 60’. The main façade faces Conception Street. The front porch of the building located at a distance of 5’ from the sidewalk. The south side of the house is set back 5’ from the sidewalk.. The proposed building is 1 story frame with traditional 3-part stucco exterior. The ground plan is L-shaped in design with an elevated rear courtyard. The proposed building has a 3’ finished floor above grade. The distance from grade to the roof ridge is 23’ at the highest point. The front porch measures 7’ deep; the rear screened porch measures 8’ deep. The proposed roof is an end gable over the main mass and a side gable over the garage. Proposed roofing material is standing seam metal.

The following are proposed building materials:

- a. foundation – solid stucco-covered masonry with metal foundation vents
- b. façade – true stucco
- c. doors – wood
- d. windows – wood double hung; wood casement
- e. porch details – wood columns, wood railing
- f. roof – standing seam metal

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT**  
*Guidelines for New Commercial and Residential Construction in Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>	<u>Topic</u>
3	Design Standards for New Construction	Construct new residence
3,I	Placement and Orientation	
3,II	Massing and Scale	
3,III	Façade Elements	
3,IV	Materials and Ornamentation	
3, IV, A	Appropriate Materials for New Residential Construction	

**STANDARD OF REVIEW**

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ In the case of a proposed new building, that such building will not, in itself, or by reason of its location on the site, materially impair the architectural or historical value of the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity and that such building will not be injurious to the general visual character of the Historic District in which it is to be located.”

## STAFF REPORT

### 3,I

- I. **Placement and Orientation:** The guidelines state that new construction should be placed on the lot so that setback and spacing approximate those of nearby historic buildings.
- A. Setbacks in DeTonti Square range from buildings constructed at the sidewalk to buildings with a 5'-15' setback.
  - B. This is a corner lot close to the center of the neighborhood.
  - C. The 3 story masonry townhouse to the north faces Conception Street and has a front setback within 3' of the property line.
  - D. The structure to the west faces State Street and has a front setback within 5' of the property line.
  - E. The proposed front setback for this building is 5' from the sidewalk/property line; the proposed side setback for this building is 5'.

### 3,II

- II. **Massing and Scale:**
- A. The guidelines state that new construction should reference the massing of forms of nearby historic buildings.
    1. 1, 1 ½ and 2 story wood frame and masonry structures are common in the DeTonti Square Historic District.
    2. The proposed building is a 1-story wood frame structure with true stucco exterior.
  - B. The guidelines state that new buildings should have foundations similar in height to those of nearby historic buildings.
    1. Historic buildings in DeTonti Square are constructed on piers, or are elevated above grade by a continuous foundation wall at a height of 2'-3', and some even taller given the topography of the lot.
    2. Property covenants require new construction to be 2'-6" above grade.
    3. The proposed foundation is designed using solid stucco-covered masonry, at a height 3' above grade.
  - C. The guidelines state that new construction should consider roof shapes, pitches and complexity similar to or compatible with those of adjacent historic buildings.
    1. A variety of roof shapes exist in the DeTonti Square Historic District, but the most common are simple end gables and hips.
    2. Side gabled roofs are common in the DeTonti Square Historic District.
    3. The proposed roof shape is end gable over the main mass and end gable over the garage.

### 3, III

- III. **Façade Elements:**
- A. The guidelines state that new construction should reflect the use of façade elements of nearby historic buildings.
    1. The use of a single half glass and wood panel door with transom above is a common design element found throughout the Historic Districts.
    2. The use of wooden columns and simple wood porch railing is common throughout the district.
    3. MHDC Stock Rail Design 1, 1" square wood pickets mounted between 2x4s and capped with a chamfered top rail, is proposed for the front and rear porch balustrade.

**IV. Materials and Ornamentation:**

- A. The guidelines provide a list of appropriate materials for compatible new construction.
  - 1. There are a number of examples of historic structures that have stucco exteriors in the DeTonti Square Historic District.
  - 2. There are a number of examples of new construction that have stucco exteriors in the DeTonti Square Historic District.
- B. The guidelines state that the degree of ornamentation used in new construction should be compatible with the degree of ornamentation found upon nearby historic buildings. Profiles and dimensions should be consistent with examples in the district.
  - 1. Examples of historic ornamentation include foundation vents, wood porch details, and a pronounced water table.
  - 2. The proposed design utilizes a simple transom over the single entry door and double-hung windows.
  - 3. The Board encourages use of modern materials and design methods in new construction.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.