

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

May 22, 2006 – 3:00 P.M.

Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID-MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Western Mobile Roofing
Property Address: 54 Bradford Avenue
Date of Approval: 4/24/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab fiberglass shingles, black blend in color.
2. Applicant's Name: Dobson Sheet Metal and Roofing
Property Address: 111 South Royal Street
Date of Approval: 4/24/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace terne coated stainless steel on cupola. Paint to match in existing color scheme.
3. Applicant's Name: Building and Maintenance Company
Property Address: 312 South Monterey Street
Date of Approval: 4/25/06 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with materials matching existing in materials, profile and dimension. Repaint building in existing color scheme.
4. Applicant's Name: Kenneth Palmertree
Property Address: 1114 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 4/25/06 weh
Work Approved: Reconstruct roof system damaged by Hurricane Katrina to match existing in materials, profile and dimension.
5. Applicant's Name: Phyllis Boyd
Property Address: 110 Bush Avenue
Date of Approval: 4/27/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair or replace rotten wood on house and garage with materials matching existing in materials, profile and dimension. Repaint house in existing color scheme. Level foundation on both house and garage. Repair roof on house and garage with materials matching existing in materials, profile and dimension. Replace retractable awning on rear of residence.

6. Applicant's Name: Applied Marine Design
Property Address: 308 Congress Street
Date of Approval: 4/28/06 weh
Work Approved: Install 3' x 3' double faced sign, white with black letters, as per submitted information. Continue installation of framed lattice fence along rear property line as per submitted information.
7. Applicant's Name: Burrough's Roofing Company
Property Address: 263 Marine Street
Date of Approval: 4/28/06 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof building with 3 tab fiberglass shingles, black in color.
8. Applicant's Name: Haston Construction Company
Property Address: 1201 Springhill Avenue
Date of Approval: 5/1/06 weh
Work Approved: Paint exterior handrails to match existing color scheme.
9. Applicant's Name: Hoffman Furniture/Perry Coleman
Property Address: 661 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 5/1/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new black 3 tab asphalt shingle roof.
10. Applicant's Name: Rentz Home Maintenance
Property Address: 23 Lafayette Street
Date of Approval: 5/1/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab fiberglass roof, black or charcoal blend in color.
11. Applicant's Name: Liberty Roofing Company
Property Address: 1565 Blair Avenue
Date of Approval: 5/1/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof with 30 year architectural grade shingles, charcoal in color.
12. Applicant's Name: Laura Clarke
Property Address: 10 South Catherine Street
Date of Approval: 5/2/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new Timberline roof, weathered wood in color.
13. Applicant's Name: Emanuel Gazzier
Property Address: 153 South Monterey Street
Date of Approval: 5/2/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace existing fence across rear property line with new 6' wood privacy fence to match that on the side property lines.
14. Applicant's Name: Damon Lett
Property Address: 1110 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 5/2/06 jss
Work Approved: Re-roof built-up flat roof with materials matching existing in material, profile and dimension. Not visible from street.

15. Applicant's Name: Earl Snyder
Property Address: 64 Hannon Avenue
Date of Approval: 5/2/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair porch with materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension. Prime to paint. Colors to be submitted at a later date.
16. Applicant's Name: Gene Russell
Property Address: 204 Marine Street
Date of Approval: 5/2/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new wood front door with 2 wood panels beneath a large single light per submitted drawing.
17. Applicant's Name: Thomas Morris Roofing
Property Address: 20 Hannon Avenue
Date of Approval: 5/3/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new 30 year architectural shingle roof, black onyx in color.
18. Applicant's Name: Robert and Lari Arras
Property Address: 56 North Reed Avenue
Date of Approval: 5/4/06 weh
Work Approved: Repaint house in the following BLP colors:
Body – Conti Street Gray Green
Trim – White
Porch – Black
19. Applicant's Name: Popeye's
Property Address: 750 Government Street
Date of Approval: 5/4/06 jss
Work Approved: Tear off and replace hot tar roof with an insulated 3 ply hot tar roof and a modified cap sheet. Roof hidden behind parapet wall.
20. Applicant's Name: Albert Stafford
Property Address: 107 Macy Place
Date of Approval: 5/8/06 weh
Work Approved: Install new fiberglass roof, color matching existing.
21. Applicant's Name: Tissa Hans-Loehr
Property Address: 201 South Dearborn Street
Date of Approval: 5/9/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material. Repaint building. Paint colors to be submitted at a later date.
22. Applicant's Name: Betty Gibbons
Property Address: 18 South Ann Street
Date of Approval: 5/9/06 weh
Work Approved: Repaint exterior in existing color scheme. Remove fallen tree stump in back yard. Repair any fence damage resulting from tree root removal.

C. NOTICES OF VIOLATION and MUNICIPAL OFFENSE TICKETS:

No NoVs or MoTs were written during this time period.

D. OLD BUSINESS:

1. **001-5/6-CA** 412 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Real Source Holdings, Inc.
Nature of Request: Phase 2 of main project. Convert rear building into 3 residential units. Redesign front and west elevation doors and windows.

E. NEW BUSINESS:

1. **064-05/06-CA** 114 Lanier Avenue
Applicant: Warren Butler
Nature of Request: Addition to increase size of existing laundry room at rear of residence as per submitted plans.
2. **065-05/06-CA** 210 Government Street
Applicant: Sign Pro/ Springhill Medical Center
Nature of Request: Install signage as per submitted plans.

F. OTHER BUSINESS and ANNOUNCEMENTS:

1. Baltimore Trip - July 27-30, 2006

G. ADJOURNMENT

**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

001-05/06 – CA 412 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Joseph Cleveland Architects/Real Source Holdings, Inc.
Received: 5/08/06 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 6/27/06 1) 10/17/05 2) 5/22/06 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4, General Business
Nature of the Project: Phase 2 of main project. Convert rear building into 3 residential units. Redesign front and west elevation doors and windows.

STAFF REPORT

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change: ... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff’s judgment, the proposed work is in compliance with the *Design Review Guidelines* and the *Lower Dauphin Street Commercial District Design Guidelines*.

Part 1 – Convert Rear Building into 3 residential units.

- A. FAÇADE ALTERATIONS – Windows** - The *Design Review Guidelines* state that “The type, size, and dividing lights of windows and their location and configuration (rhythm) on the building help establish the historic character of a building. Original window openings should be retained as well as original window sashes and glazing.
1. This area was originally constructed as a storage and warehouse facility for the main building. Currently there are 2 windows and one door on the south elevation and one garage door opening on the west elevation. The north and east elevations are solid brick.
 2. Plans call for the installation of double hung windows and doors.
- B. FAÇADE ALTERATIONS – Doors** – The *Design Review Guidelines* state that “Original doors and openings should be retained along with any mouldings, transoms, and sidelights. Replacements should respect the age and style of the building.”
1. The existing building’s primary façade faces west onto Hamilton Street.
 2. The proposed design respects the age and style of the building.
- C. ROOF ALTERATIONS – Parapet Wall and Sloped Roof** – The *Design Review Guidelines* state that “A roof is one of the most dominant features of a building. Original or historic roof forms, as well as the original pitch of the roof should be maintained.”
1. The existing roof is flat concealed behind a horizontal brick parapet.
 2. The proposed roof has sloped end parapets and a steeply pitched shingled roof.

Staff recommends approval of this portion of the application as submitted.

Part 2 – Redesign Front and West Elevation Windows

Project Background:

The ARB approved plans for this project in October 2005. At that time, 10' wood and glass doors with tall transoms above were proposed for the Dauphin Street elevation. During the course of construction, a large steel beam supporting the masonry above the first floor was discovered. This beam limits the height of the first floor doors and does not allow for a transom. The contractor installed 8' wood multi-light doors with narrow transoms above. The scale was determined inappropriate for the building and presented a material impairment to the structure and the district.

The applicants are now requesting permission to install 10' wood and glass doors with stucco panels above. Ironwork from the previous application will remain the same. The proposed design emphasizes the verticality of the original building elements, which is a significant character-defining feature of the building.

Staff Recommendation:

Due to Staff's involvement with the applicants on this issue, Staff has no comment or recommendation, other than to defer to the Board for the determination of appropriateness.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

064-05/06-CA 114 Lanier Avenue
Applicant: Warren Butler
Received: 4/26 /06 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 6/04/06 1) 5/22/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Ashland Place Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Increase size of existing laundry room at rear of residence as per submitted plans.

STAFF REPORT

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change: ... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF ANALYSIS

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work complies with the Design Review Guidelines and will not impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district.

1. The 1926 Wheeler House is a two story frame residence.
2. The subject structure is a contributing element within the Ashland Place Historic District.
3. The subject structure is located on a prominent corner, at the intersection of Lanier Avenue and DeLeon Avenue.
4. The applicants are proposing to extend an existing laundry room by squaring off the northeast corner of the residence.
5. The proposed addition will measure approximately 5'-7" wide by 8'-11" deep.
6. An existing wood casement window currently located in the kitchen and facing east will be relocated to the proposed north wall.
7. A 12" high by 3' wide fixed wood transom will be located in the proposed east wall.
8. Wood siding will be feathered in to match existing and painted to match existing.
9. A shallow pitched shed roof will slope from west to east, and shingles will match those on the existing roof.
10. The 3-d perspective of the rear of the residence depicts a shed roof over the addition running from south to north. However, the applicant has sketched in an alternate roof which runs from west to east.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

065-05/06-CA 210 Government Street
Applicant: Springhill Medical Clinic/Sign Pro
Received: 5/10 /06 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 6/06/06 1) 5/22/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Church Street East Historic District
Classification: Non-Contributing
Zoning: B-4, General Business
Nature of Project: Install signage as per submitted plans.

STAFF REPORT

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts and the Government Street Corridor

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change: ... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF ANALYSIS

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, three of the items requested comply with the Sign Design Guidelines, and one does not. Three of the items requested will not impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district. One item will impair the integrity of the structure and the district.

1. The two story masonry structure is a non-contributing structure within the Church Street East Historic District.
2. The property is under review for signage by the Architectural Review Board because of its location within the Historic District and also its location within the Government Street Sign Corridor.
3. Four sign designs were submitted by the sign contractor.
4. Of the four, three met the guidelines and one did not.
5. The first design measures 9' x 7', or 63 sf, and is constructed of a metal panel screwed to the wall above the entry door. Lettering is painted with the applicant's logo. The sign is lighted by flood/spotlights.
6. The second design measures 9' x 7', or 63 sf, and is installed on the existing wall over the entry door. Letters are to be metal dimensional letters, with painted wood logo. The sign is lighted by flood/spotlights.
7. The third design measures 9' x 7', or 63 sf, and is installed on the existing wall over the entry door. Letters are to be reverse channel metal lit from behind.
8. The fourth design measures 9' x 7', or 63 sf, and is a metal cabinet with a polycarbonate face with painted graphics. Lighting is internal.

Staff recommends approval of designs 1-3. Staff recommends denial of design 4 because the Sign Design Guidelines do not allow internally-lit plastic signage in the Historic Districts or along Government Street.