

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
February 13, 2006 – 3:00 P.M.
Mayor’s Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID-MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant’s Name: Chuck Dixon Home Improvements
Property Address: 307 Chatham Street
Date of Approval: 1/10/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace rotten porch decking with materials matching existing in materials, profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing. Repair or replace as necessary column and railing to match existing in material, profile and dimension.
2. Applicant’s Name: David Tharp
Property Address: 809 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/11/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair to damaged windows with materials matching existing in material, profile and dimension. Prime and paint exterior woodwork. Remove plywood from front doors and reglaze door glass.
3. Applicant’s Name: Myong Sun Yu (Roberson)
Property Address: 1113 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 1/12/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof building with materials matching existing in profile, dimension, color and material.
4. Applicant’s Name: Jeff Deen
Property Address: 207 Church Street
Date of Approval: 1/12/06 asc
Work Approved: Install Timberline roof using Slate Blend shingles. Repaint building in existing color scheme.
5. Applicant’s Name: Ronald A. Suggs
Property Address: 354 Regina Avenue
Date of Approval: 1/12/06 weh
Work Approved: (This CoA replaces CoA dated 2/22/05) Replace rotten floor on upstairs rear porch with materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Replace missing shingles with roofing matching existing in profile, dimension and color. Repair or replace trim around

cornice & fascia with materials matching existing in profile and dimension.

6. Applicant's Name: Charlie and Catherine McLeod
Property Address: 18 Common Street
Date of Approval: 1/12/06 weh
Work Approved: Repaint house in existing color scheme. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension.
7. Applicant's Name: Barbara Giddens
Property Address: 200 South Dearborn Street
Date of Approval: 1/13/06 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damage to privacy fence with materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material.
8. Applicant's Name: Sea Corp Holdings
Property Address: 1111 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 1/12/06 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile, dimension and material.
Repaint house in the following BLP color scheme:
Body – Monterey Street Dark Blue
Trim - White
9. Applicant's Name: A. R. McMorris Incorporated
Property Address: 208 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/17/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair to damaged stucco to match existing in material, profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing color scheme.
10. Applicant's Name: Jaime Betbeze
Property Address: 1210 Selma Street
Date of Approval: 1/17/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair or replace rotten wood to match existing in materials, profile and dimension. Prep for painting. Re-roof with 3 tab shingles, black in color. Remove collapsed and deteriorated outbuilding in back yard.
11. Applicant's Name: Jean Lott/Lee Roofing
Property Address: 960 Palmetto Street
Date of Approval: 1/18/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab shingle roof, Dove Gray in color, to match existing.
12. Applicant's Name: Shelter Roofing Company
Property Address: 1707 Hunter Avenue
Date of Approval: 1/18/06 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, Oxford Gray in color.

13. Applicant's Name: Shelter Roofing Company
Property Address: 400 Wisconsin Avenue
Date of Approval: 1/18/06 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, black in color.
14. Applicant's Name: Gaillard Builders
Property Address: 753 St. Francis Street
Date of Approval: 1/18/06 weh
Work Approved: Install copper eave flashing. Install cold adhesive modified roll roofing.
15. Applicant's Name: Elizabeth Edwards/Trinity Roofing
Property Address: 20 South Hallett Street
Date of Approval: 1/19/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab gray shingle roof to match existing.
16. Applicant's Name: O.C. Wiggins
Property Address: 24 McPhillips Street
Date of Approval: 1/19/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof with 3 tab shingle roof, black in color.
17. Applicant's Name: Watson Realty
Property Address: 2 South Water Street
Date of Approval: 1/19/06 weh
Work Approved: Replace existing downspouts with new downspouts. Paint new downspouts to match building color.
18. Applicant's Name: Ryan Stukas
Property Address: 8 LeBaron Street
Date of Approval: 1/19/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair loose and damaged siding. Paint exterior the following colors:
Body – SW Colonial Revival Stone Green
Trim – SW Roycroft Vellum
19. Applicant's Name: Delzak Builders
Property Address: 1106 Montauk Street
Date of Approval: 1/23/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof with 30 year dimensional shingle roof, Charcoal in color.
20. Applicant's Name: Miller Contracting and Remodeling
Property Address: 1461 Monroe Street
Date of Approval: 1/23/06 weh
Work Approved: Install architectural shingles, black, charcoal grey or weathered wood in color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension, materials and color. Paint new materials to match existing color scheme.

21. Applicant's Name: Fred South Construction
Property Address: 307 Chatham Street
Date Approved: 1/23/06 jss
Work Approved: replace rotten wood on fascia, siding and back porch as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and material.
22. Applicant's Name: Juanita Owens
Property Address: 1053 New St. Francis Street
Date Approved: 1/23/06 jss
Work Approved: Repair storm damage on garage with new materials matching existing in profile, dimension and material. Repairs to include roof, walls and repainting in existing color scheme.
23. Applicant's Name: Wintzells
Property Address: 605 Dauphin Street
Date Approved: 1/24/06 weh
Work Approved: (This CoA replaces an expired CoA dated 12/9/03) Construct wood deck, measuring 13' wide by 46'-6" long in parking space in front of the building as per submitted plans.
- Deck is to be constructed at a distance of 5' from the north wall of the existing restaurant. The deck is to be aligned with the existing building face, and extend out into the existing street/parking lane approximately 7'. Materials include pressure treated structure, railing, (Victorian cutwork balustrade, MHDC stock plan #3). Extend existing shed roof over sidewalk an additional 5' to cover portions of the deck. Existing decorative Victorian brackets to be replicated to support the overhang. Deck to be stained with railing to be painted white.
24. Applicant's Name: Chilton Coulson
Property Address: 16-22 South Conception Street
Date Approved: 1/24/06 asc
Work Approved: Install 30 year architectural shingles, Georgetown Grey in color, over new decking and felt. Install 4 new roof drains, new valleys and wall flashing.
25. Applicant's Name: Nicholas Vrakelos
Property Address: 56 LeMoyne Place
Date Approved: 1/24/06 weh
Work Approved: Repair and or replace damaged and deteriorated wood cornice, soffit and fascia. Re-roof with architectural grade shingles, either black, weathered wood or charcoal in color.

26. Applicant's Name: Cooner Roofing
Property Address: 302 South George Street
Date Approved: 1/24/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new roof, architectural shingles, charcoal in color.
27. Applicant's Name: Cooner Roofing
Property Address: 1163 New St. Francis Street
Date Approved: 1/24/06 asc
Work Approved: Install new roof, 3 tab shingle, charcoal in color.
28. Applicant's Name: Michael Purvis
Property Address: 1802 Old Government Street
Date Approved: 1/26/06 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood on porch with new materials to match existing in profile, material and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing color scheme. Repair storm damaged roof as necessary to match existing.
29. Applicant's Name: Buddy Bilt
Property Address: 22 McPhillips Street
Date Approved: 1/26/06 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof building with architectural shingles, weathered wood in color.
30. Applicant's Name: Diane Maiselle
Property Address: 252 West Street
Date Approved: 1/27/06 weh
Work Approved: Install Elk architectural shingles, antique slate in color.
31. Applicant's Name: Gary Barile
Property Address: 109 Bradford Avenue
Date Approved: 1/27/06 weh
Work Approved: Reconstruct rear porches on apartment building using two existing porches as examples. Materials to match existing in materials, profile and dimension.
32. Applicant's Name: City of Mobile
Property Address: 203 Claiborne Street
Date Approved: 1/27/06 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof building with architectural grade shingles, either weathered wood or aged wood in color.
33. Applicant's Name: Janice Phelps
Property Address: 906 Palmetto Street
Date Approved: 1/27/06 jss
Work Approved: Replace rotten siding and repair porch columns with materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Paint to match existing color scheme.

C. NEW BUSINESS:

- 1. 030-05/06-CA** 107 Ryan Avenue
Applicant: John & Allison Peebles
Nature of Request: Remove existing two story ca. 1970 addition at rear of residence and construct new two story addition as per submitted plans.
- 2. 031-05/06-CA** 1015 Savannah Street
Applicant: DeAngelo Parker
Nature of Request: Construct rear addition measuring 15' x 28' as per submitted plans.
- 3. 032-05/06-CA** 1563 Fearnway
Applicant: Duggan & Bessy Ellis
Nature of Request: Additions to rear outbuilding as per submitted plan. Add a porch to east elevation measuring 13'-4" x 45'. Add shop to south elevation measuring 31' x 20'-4".
- 4. 033-05/06-CA** 50 St. Emanuel Street
Applicant: Tilmon Brown, Contractor
Nature of Request: Construct balcony as per submitted plans.

D. OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

E. ADJOURNMENT

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

030-05/06-CA 107 Ryan Avenue
Applicant: John and Allison Peebles
Received: 1/11/06 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/25/06 1) 2/13/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Ashland Place Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Remove existing non-historic rear 2 story garage addition and construct new two story garage addition as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:… Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district. . .

STAFF REPORT

1. The ca. 1921 Denby House is a one story frame structure with wood clapboards and brick porch columns.
2. There is an existing two story garage addition located at the rear of the main house, adjacent to the alley.
3. The existing two story garage addition measures 25' x 30'.
4. The ridge line of the existing addition ties into the ridge line of the main house.
5. The lot measures 143' x 75'.
6. The proposed two story garage measures 30' deep x 36' wide and its ridge line is proposed to extend up 7' past the ridge line of the main house.
7. Typically, the Board requires that proposed additions maintain ridge lines equal to or lower than the existing historic structures.
8. Typically, the Board has denied requests for additions that exceed the existing historic ridge line.
9. The addition occurs at a distance approximately 101' from the street.
10. The addition occurs at a distance of approximately 65' from the front of the house.
11. The north property line setback is 4'-6".
12. The west property line setback is 6'-0".
13. The Historic District Overlay Ordinance will allow the proposed structure to be built following setbacks established by the main residence or properties within 150' of the proposed construction.

14. The proposed two story garage addition is to be constructed at slab on grade, with hardiplank siding installed in the Dutch Lap fashion, matching the profile of the main house.
15. Typically the Board requires that exterior materials match existing materials for additions to existing historic structures.
16. Windows for the proposed two story garage addition are predominantly paired six-over-one clad wood windows matching those in the main house.
17. Roofing for the proposed two story garage addition is Timberline shingles, matching those on the main house.
18. Garage doors are proposed to be flush insulated sectional doors.

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work does not comply with the Design Review Guidelines concerning materials. Also, staff could not determine the effect of the addition's higher roof line and leaves this to the judgment of the Board. Upon the resolution of these two items, Staff would recommend approval.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

031-05/06-CA 1015 Savannah Street
Applicant: DeAngelo Parker
Received: 1/30/06 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 3/16/06 1) 2/13/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Construct rear addition measuring 15' x 28' as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work complies with the Design Review Guidelines and will not impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district.

1. The subject structure is a ca. 1923 one story frame residence with vernacular Bungalow detailing.
2. The subject structure is on the southeast corner of Chatham and Savannah Streets.
3. The lot measures 50' x 120'.
4. The proposed addition measures approximately 15' x 28'.
5. The proposed addition occurs at the rear of the property.
6. Foundation piers to match those existing on the historic residence.
7. Wood siding to match that existing on the historic residence.
8. Windows to match that in the historic residence.
9. Roof pitch and materials to match that on the historic residence.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

032-05/06-CA 1563 Fearnway
Applicant: Duggan & Bessy Ellis
Received: 2/3/06 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 3/20/06 1) 2/13/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Additions to rear outbuilding as per submitted plan. Add a porch to east elevation measuring 13'-4" x 45". Add shop to south elevation measuring 31' x 20'-4".

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work complies with the Design Review Guidelines and will not impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district.

1. The main residence is a large frame and brick veneer bungalow.
2. The existing outbuilding is a one story frame structure.
3. The existing outbuilding is depicted on the 1925 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map.
4. The existing outbuilding measures 31' x 36'- 6".
5. A porch measuring 13'-4" x 45' is proposed for the east elevation.
6. A shop measuring 31' x 20'-4" is proposed for the south elevation.
7. Columns supporting the porch roof match those on the front porch of the house.
8. Wood windows in existing outbuilding to be removed & relocated to sections of new construction.
9. New wood & glass doors to be installed to provide access from existing outbuilding to new porch.
10. New wood & glass carriage-type doors to be installed in new shop area.
11. Roof to be asphalt shingle to match existing.
12. Building to be repainted in existing color scheme.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

033-05/06-CA 50 St. Emanuel Street
Applicant: Peter F. Burns, Owner/Tilmon Brown, Contractor
Received: 2/3/06 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 3/20/06 1) 2/13/06 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District
Classification: Non-Contributing (de-certified)
Zoning: B-4, General Business
Nature of Project: Construct balcony as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment, the proposed work complies with the Design Review Guidelines and will not impair the historic integrity of the structure and the district.

1. The ca. 1850 two story masonry building was considered non-contributing due to unsympathetic alterations over time.
2. There are actually two historic buildings with different second floor window heights, different cornice lines, and roof.
2. The proposed balcony is one story and begins on St. Emanuel Street, wraps around the Conti Street elevation and continues around to the end of the building.
3. The 1904 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map shows that originally the corner building had a balcony, but there was no balcony on the Conti Street elevation of the back building.
4. The original balcony had a shorter run down Conti Street than the one proposed.
5. The post collars and column capitals are standard Lawler designs used frequently in the Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District.
6. Plans call for four new doors where there are currently existing original historic windows, one on the St. Emanuel Street elevation and three on the Conti Street elevation.
7. While plans call for doors opening onto the proposed balcony, no information was provided regarding these doors, which will be made from existing original historic window openings.
8. The balcony as proposed creates a false sense of a single building.
9. Although the hand rail is continuous between the buildings, it does angle down at the intersection of the front and rear buildings.
10. The Board should request more information on how the alteration of existing original historic windows will effect the character of the building.

Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that the handrail be redesigned to suggest that there are two separate buildings with different façade elements and proportions.