

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
January 24, 2005 – 3:00 P.M.
Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Reeves Construction
Property Address: 1156 Church Street
Date of Approval: 12/13/04 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof house with Timberline shingles, driftwood in color

2. Applicant's Name: William & Robin Strickland
Property Address: 303 South Ann Street
Date of Approval: 12/13/04 weh
Work Approved: Install 3' picket fence in front yard as per submitted fence and site site plan. Repaint house following colors:
Body – Ralph Lauren Rhododendron
Trim – Ralph Lauren Deep Cream
Window Sash - Ralph Lauren Embassy Purple
Porch Deck – Charcoal Gray

3. Applicant's Name: Marjorie Bell
Property Address: 1315 Springhill Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/15/04 weh
Work Approved: This COA replaces coa dated 7-18-03 for re-roof to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Repaint house in existing white color scheme.

4. Applicant's Name: Bailey DuMont
Property Address: 162 Roberts Street
Date of Approval: 12/15/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair hurricane damage to carport: replace fascia, soffit and shingles as necessary; repair/replace columns to match existing. Paint new materials white to match existing.
Repairs to main house: caulk and repaint steel casement windows; repaint portico to match existing.

5. Applicant's Name: Saenger Theatre
Property Address: 6-8 S. Joachim Street
Date of Approval: 12/21/04 jdb
Work Approved: Remove canopy over entrance damaged by storm. Remove canopy from Conti Street side, damaged by trucks. Replacements to be submitted at a future date.
6. Applicant's Name: Dr. Atkinson Lt., LTD.
Property Address: 1306 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/10/04 asc
Work Approved: Remove existing signage. Install new signage measuring approximately 49.94 sf. as per submitted designs.
7. Applicant's Name: Stark Irvine
Property Address: 803 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/20/04 asc
Work Approved: Install signage as per submitted design. Sign to be double sided, painted to match trim of building.
8. Applicant's Name: A. Brooks Roofing and Interior
Property Address: 1215 Elmira
Date of Approval: 12/27/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, Autumn brown in color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension.
9. Applicant's Name: G & L Demolition and Construction
Property Address: 200 S. Washington Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/21/04 asc
Work Approved: Install new 30 year Timberline roof, charcoal black or gray, install new flashing. Add wood vents in gable ends (design to be determined at a later date.)
10. Applicant's Name: Shelia Gerhardt
Property Address: 1750 Government Street
Date of Approval: 12/28/04 weh
Work Approved: Install 6' wood dog-eared privacy fence between apartment complex and commercial strip center as per submitted plans. Install 8' wide fence at driveway.
11. Applicant's Name: Jennifer Clark/Darryl Martin
Property Address: 222 S. Dearborn Street
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Renewal of previously issued CoA. Repair fire damage at rear of building including the reproduction of the porch to match the original design. All new materials to match the original in profile and dimension. Paint exterior to match existing color scheme.

12. Applicant's Name: Mel Showers/Tordan Construction
Property Address: 350 S. Ann Street
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Install new 3 tab shingle roof, Satin Black in color.
13. Applicant's Name: Wendell Quimby
Property Address: 916 Charleston
Date of Approval: 12/29/04 asc
Work Approved: Reroof using black shingles to match existing.
Repair/replace rotten/damaged siding with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile. Paint all repairs to match existing.
14. Applicant's Name: Al McMorris
Property Address: 110 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Remove existing glass storefront. Replace with new storefront, matching existing in pane divisions, using new anodized aluminum and tempered glass to meet code requirements.
15. Applicant's Name: Slate and Tile Roofing Company
Property Address: 1664 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged slate roof with materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension.
16. Applicant's Name: Ramona Willis
Property Address: 1721 Fearnway
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with materials matching existing in profile, material, dimension and color. (charcoal blend)
17. Applicant's Name: Dale Halladay
Property Address: 1570 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 1/3/05 weh
Work Approved: Continue repair to wooden deck. Install stairs and handrail matching existing in profile and dimension.
18. Applicant's Name: Cheryl Thompson
Property Address: 1118 Elmira (Previously 1150)
Date of Approval: 1/4/05 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof house with 3 tab shingles, matching existing color. In kind repairs to storm damaged privacy fence. Prep for painting. Replace storm damaged window to match existing.

19. Applicant's Name: Bill Christian
Property Address: 510 Monroe Street
Date of Approval: 1/5/05 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile and materials and dimension. Repaint in the existing color scheme.
20. Applicant's Name: Elon Maintenance and Construction
Property Address: 253 Tuttle
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 asc
Work Approved: Reroof house with 3 tab shingles, Onyx black in color.
21. Applicant's Name: JTB Group
Property Address: 1058 Church
Date of Approval: 1/6/04 asc
Work Approved: Replace storm damaged wood siding with materials matching existing in profile, material and dimension. Paint new materials to match existing.
22. Applicant's Name: Creola Ruffin
Property Address: 1400-1404 Church Street
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 weh
Work Approved: Spot paint and touch up paint on exterior as needed, matching existing color scheme.
23. Applicant's Name: U.S. Agencies, Tenant, Thompson Electric Sign Co., Fabricator
Property Address: 1500 Government Street
Date of Approval: 1/6/05 weh
Work Approved: Install signage, measuring 11' long by 28" high, containing approximately 26.4 square feet.

C. OLD BUSINESS:

1. **011-04/05-CA** Mobile Revolving Fund/David Tharp, Architect
Property Address: 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Nature of Request: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. 1108 to be relocated to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residence

D. NEW BUSINESS:

1. **016-04/05-CA** 1154 Palmetto Street
Applicant: Dick & Judy Wellington, owners, Mack Lewis, contractor, Douglas Kearley, architect.
Nature of Request: Build 21' x 25' bedroom and bath addition to rear of house, as per submitted plans.

2. **017-04/05-CA** 1752 Hunter Avenue
Applicant: Brian Doyle
Nature of Request: Install aluminum storm shutters on east & west sides of house. East side shutters to be Colonial as per submitted design, west to be Bahama, as per submitted design. Install hurricane panel hardware on front & back window areas.
3. **018-04/05-CA** 1112 Government Street
Applicant: Enoch Aguleria, Owner, Don Williams, Engineer
Nature of Request: Relocate historic Bellingrath Garage to vacant lot adjacent to existing bed & breakfast. Install 8 parking spaces as required by City of Mobile Zoning Ordinance. Landscape site, all as per submitted plans.
4. **019-04/05-CA** 1553 Fearnway
Applicant: Jeanelle Millet Cala
Nature of Request: Construct a circular concrete driveway in front yard as per submitted plans.

E. OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

F. ADJOURN

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

011-04/05-CA 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Historic Development Commission/Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 12/27/04 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Relocate 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

Additional Information:

The Mobile Revolving Fund acquired these two abandoned and derelict historic properties for the purpose of rehabilitating the structures and selling them to preserve the streetscape along Old Shell Road. Currently 1108 OSR is situated at the rear of the lot. Plans call for the structure to be moved forward 30' and for the two structures to be connected and restored as one single family residence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate two historic structures

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Application History: This application was Tabled pending the Board’s visit to the site to examine the structure proposed to be either moved or dismantled. A copy of the Certified Record from the project’s first review is attached.

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment, the proposed restoration will not impair the historic integrity of the structures or the district.

- A. The following is a list of proposed changes to the structures:
1. move 1108 OSR forward 30’
 2. construct a connector between 1108 and 1110 OSR
 - a. connector to resemble glassed-in porch
 3. rehabilitate the structures as follows:
 - a. stabilize foundations and repair any structural damage
 - b. repair/replace rotten siding as necessary
 - c. repair/replace deteriorated windows

- d. repair/replace deteriorated exterior doors
- e. repair/replace deteriorated soffit, cornice and fascia
- f. repair/replace deteriorated or missing porch details
- g. re-roof entire structure
- h. install new concrete ribbon drive and gravel parking as per site plan
- i. landscape property to meet City of Mobile's Landscape Ordinance

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Front steps to be more historic in nature with handrail to match new porch rail.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

016-04/05-CA 1154 Palmetto Street
Applicant: Dick & Judy Wellington, owners, Mack Lewis, contractor, Douglas Kearley, architect.
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Build 21' x 25' bedroom and bath addition to rear of house, as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Additions	Construct rear addition

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a two story ca. 1899 frame vernacular Victorian residence with a two story front porch and an end gable roof.
 - 2. There is currently no rear addition.
 - 3. The proposed addition measures 25' long by 21' wide.
 - 4. The first floor rear porch is glassed in with 3 equal glazed bays.
 - 5. The proposed addition continues this glassed-in area with an additional six bays.
 - 6. Site coverage and setbacks are within the parameters allowed by the zoning ordinance.
 - 7. The proposed addition contains a gallery space and a master suite.
 - 8. An end gable roof will be constructed over the whole rear addition.
 - 9. A half-round deck with two sets of steps leading to the back yard and drive to be constructed at rear of addition.
 - 10. The Materials List and Design Details are appropriate for this structure.
 - a. siding to match existing;
 - b. salvaged windows to match existing;
 - c. brick piers with framed lattice infill to match existing;
 - d. cornice, soffit, fascia, corner boards to match those of the main house;
 - e. replication in gallery space of existing gallery glazing.
 - 11. The proposed addition will not be visible from public view.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

017-04/05-CA 1752 Hunter Avenue
Applicant: Brian Doyle
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Install aluminum storm shutters on east & west sides of house.
East side shutters to be Colonial as per submitted design, west to be Bahama, as per submitted design. Install hurricane panel hardware on front & back window areas.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Blinds, Shutters and Awnings	Install shutters and hurricane panel hardware

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a one story stucco-covered bungalow, vernacular in design, incorporating several different Craftsman/Arts & Crafts details combined with a Mediterranean influence, including an arched recessed porch under a monolithic hipped roof, multi-pane over single pane wood window sash, rough stucco exterior and attic dormer.
 - 2. The existing windows are Craftsman inspired nine-over-one wood windows, with a large pane in the center surrounded by rectangular panels and squares in the corners.
 - 3. Historically, shutters were not used on Craftsman-style bungalows because of deep overhangs and larger-sized windows than more traditional architectural styles; however, some examples do exist.
 - 4. Shutters, when used, were operable and oversized to cover double or triple windows (for utilitarian purposes) or fixed as decorative elements.

Staff recommends approval with the following condition:

That the shutters be decorative in nature but operable

That where Bahama shutters a proposed, smaller single shutters be used.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

018-04/05-CA 1112 Government Street
Applicant: Enoch Aguleria, Owner, Don Williams, Engineer
Received: 12/29/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/12/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Relocate historic Bellingrath Garage to vacant lot adjacent to existing bed & breakfast. Install 8 parking spaces as required by City of Mobile Zoning Ordinance. Landscape site, all as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Blinds, Shutters and Awnings	Install shutters and hurricane panel hardware

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff’s judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is one and ½ story late Victorian vernacular residence, wood frame with a complex gable roof.
 - 2. The structure proposed to be moved is all that remains of the Walter Bellingrath property that once stood facing Ann Street.
 - 3. The garage structure was designed by architect George Rogers and contains a staircase identical to the service stair at the Bellingrath Home in south Mobile County.
 - 4. The garage is a two story L-shaped wood frame structure with wood lap siding and end gable roof.
 - 5. The proposed front setback for the garage is approximately 68’ from the sidewalk.
 - 6. The existing Victorian residence is set back approximately 37’ from the sidewalk.
 - 7. The garage structure will share a common drive with the Central Park development to the east.
 - 8. The garage structure will have 8 parking spaces of stamped asphalt in the rear of the property.
 - 9. Landscaping will be submitted with the rehabilitation plans for the garage structure at a later date.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

019-04/05-CA 1553 Fearnway
Applicant: Jeanelle Millet Cala
Received: 1/10/05 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 2/25/05 1) 1/24/05 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Construct a circular concrete driveway in front yard as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Drives, Walks & Parking	Install circular drive

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, and in Staff's judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is not in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a ca. 1927 Tudor Revival residence.
 - 2. The Design Review Guidelines state that “Circular drives and parking pads in the front yard are generally inappropriate in the historic districts.”
 - 3. The linear front footage of the lot is approximately 102'. Typical lots in the Fearnway sub-division are 75'-80' wide.
 - 4. The site situation is unique in that the house has a Fearnway address but the driveway is off Catherine Street.
 - 5. On the opposite side of the entrance to Fearnway, the residences at 56 and 1552 Fearnway share a common alley off Catherine Street, providing ample safety for ingress/egress.
 - 6. The circular drive is proposed to provide a safe means of access to the property.
 - 7. Heavy landscaping is proposed to minimize the effect of the circular drive.

Staff recommends denial as submitted with the following recommendation:

- That a parking pad be installed off the main drive close to the existing front entrance;
- That the concrete be stained and/or stamped to match the color of the brick on the main house.
- That the area in front of the parking pad be heavily landscaped to hide the cars.

