

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
December 27, 2004– 3:00 P.M.
Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Sarah Helmer
Property Address: 950 Government Street
Date of Approval: 11/29/04 weh
Work Approved: Install GAF timberline, either weathered wood or slate in color.
2. Applicant's Name: Terry Osborne/Langan Construction
Property Address: 71 Etheridge Street
Date of Approval: 11/30/04 asc
Work Approved: Install new modified bitumen roof on flat section of roof at rear.
3. Applicant's Name: Robert Dobson
Property Address: 455 George Street
Date of Approval: 12/1/04 asc
Work Approved: Reroof using charcoal 3 tab shingles; replace to rotten wood as necessary with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile; repaint to match existing.
4. Applicant's Name: Robert Dobson
Property Address: 252 S. Georgia Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/1/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair to roof as necessary matching the existing material;
Paint to match existing color scheme.
5. Applicant's Name: David Wilkins/O.C. Wiggins
Property Address: 262 ½ McDonald Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/1/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair storm damage to include: replace roof decking, install new shingles to match existing, repair to fascia and soffit with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile; paint new materials to match existing.
6. Applicant's Name: Gray Arnold
Property Address: 154 Cedar Street
Date of Approval: 12/1/04 weh
Work Approved: Construct picket fence as per submitted drawings. Construct 4' wood privacy fence as per submitted plans.

7. Applicant's Name: Construction Affiliates
Property Address: 1558 Bruister Street
Date of Approval: 12/3/04 jdb
Work Approved: Replace storm damaged wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Re-roof house with architectural shingles, granite in color.

8. Applicant's Name: Bailey Slaton
Property Address: 2254 Ashland Place Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/3/04 weh/kfm
Work Approved: Repair storm damaged siding, porch deck and columns with materials matching existing in profile, dimension and materials. Repaint house in the following Sherwin Williams color scheme:
Body: SW2064 Outer Banks
Trim: SW1900 Luminous White

9. Applicant's Name: Jo Ann Yarborough
Property Address: 1150 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 12/3/04 jdb
Work Approved: Replace asbestos shingle roof with GAF Timberline Ultra roof: Slate Blend in color.
Repaint house: body-Burnt Toast; Bellingrath Green accents; and white trim.

10. Applicant's Name: Lucky Pannu
Property Address: 302 & 304 Michigan Avenue
Date of Approval: 12/6/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair exterior siding with materials matching existing in profile and dimension.

11. Applicant's Name: Hutchisson Construction Services
Property Address: 1702 Laurel Street
Date of Approval: 12/06/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof to match existing materials in profile and dimension.

12. Applicant's Name: Jane Parker
Property Address: 1560 Bruister
Date of Approval: 12/6/04 asc
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials on porch deck and ceiling. Paint new materials to match existing color scheme.

13. Applicant's Name: Rhoda Pickett
Property Address: 1316 Old Shell Road
Date of Approval: 12/7/04 weh
Install concrete ribbon driveway in existing driveway location.

14. Applicant's Name: Jeb Schenk

- Property Address: 157 Houston Street
 Date of Approval: 12/7/04 weh
 Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in material, profile and dimension. Repaint house and shed in the following Sherwin Williams color scheme:
 Body: Roycroft Suede SW2842
 Trim: Roycroft Brass SW 2843
 Accent: Polished Mahogany, SW 2838
15. Applicant's Name: Gulf Construction
 Property Address: 206 S. Ann Street
 Date of Approval: 12/7/04 asc
 Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials to match existing in profile, dimension and materials. Prime new materials. Repair roof with rigid asbestos shingles to match existing.
16. Applicant's Name: David and Elizabeth Sanders
 Property Address: 202 George Street
 Date of Approval: 12/7/04 weh
 Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile, dimension and material. Repaint house in the existing color scheme.
17. Applicant's Name: Coulson Roofing Company
 Property Address: 255 N. Joachim Street
 Date of Approval: 12/8/04 asc
 Work Approved: Re-roof house with charcoal colored 3 tab shingles.
18. Applicant's Name: Waterfront Rescue Mission
 Property Address: 208 State Street
 Date of Approval: 12/9/04 weh
 Work Approved: Repair deteriorated porch decking with new decking matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing. Repair existing stair. Replace handrail with MHDC stock rail Number 1.

C. OLD BUSINESS:

1. **011-04/05-CA** Mobile Revolving Fund/David Tharp, Architect
 Property Address: 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
 Nature of Request: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Either move or dismantle 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

D. NEW BUSINESS:

1. **012-04/05-CA** 62 North Monterey Street
Applicants: Stan and Marsha Lewis
Nature of Request: Alter existing rear addition. Add additional 8' in depth to existing addition and construct 7' deep back porch. Construct hipped roof over entire rear addition, all as per submitted plans.

2. **014-04/05-CA** 18 South Reed Avenue
Applicant: Cheryl & Ioannis Zafiris
Nature of Request: Repair roof damage from fallen tree. Remove aluminum siding. Construct addition, measuring 5' deep by 14'-6". Construct new garage, measuring 20' x 26' to replace garage destroyed during Hurricane Ivan.

3. **015-04/05-CA** 2254 Ashland Place Avenue
Applicant: Bailey & Sam Slaton
Nature of Request: Close in open porch at rear of house. Relocate windows on back of house and install false shutters. Build new single car garage at back of property, all as per submitted plans.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

011-04/05-CA 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Historic Development Commission/Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 12/27/04 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Either move or dismantle 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

Additional Information:

The Mobile Revolving Fund acquired these two abandoned and derelict historic properties for the purpose of rehabilitating the structures and selling them to preserve the streetscape along Old Shell Road. Currently 1108 OSR is situated at the rear of the lot. Plans call for the structure to be moved forward 30' and for the two structures to be connected and restored as one single family residence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate two historic structures

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Application History: This application was Tabled pending the Board’s visit to the site to examine the structure proposed to be either moved or dismantled. A copy of the Certified Record from the project’s first review is attached.

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment, the proposed restoration will not impair the historic integrity of the structures or the district.

- A. The following is a list of proposed changes to the structures:
 - 1. move 1108 OSR forward 30’
 - 2. construct a connector between 1108 and 1110 OSR
 - a. connector to resemble glassed-in porch
 - 3. rehabilitate the structures as follows:
 - a. stabilize foundations and repair any structural damage
 - b. repair/replace rotten siding as necessary
 - c. repair/replace deteriorated windows

- d. repair/replace deteriorated exterior doors
- e. repair/replace deteriorated soffit, cornice and fascia
- f. repair/replace deteriorated or missing porch details
- g. re-roof entire structure
- h. install new concrete ribbon drive and gravel parking as per site plan
- i. landscape property to meet City of Mobile's Landscape Ordinance

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Front steps to be more historic in nature with handrail to match new porch rail.
2. Construct a shallow gable roof between the two structures instead of the proposed flat roof.
3. Retain original window and door openings on front elevation.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD**

011-04/05-CA 1108-1110 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Historic Development Commission/Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/13/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Conflicts of Interest: David Tharp, architect on the project, recused himself.
Bunky Ralph who saw interior plans for the project and commented on them recused herself.
Devereaux Bemis, who is on the Board of the Revolving Fund, recused himself.

Nature of Project: Rehabilitate two historic properties for use as a single family residence. Either move or dismantle 1108 to connect with 1110, as per submitted plans. Construct a connector between the two residences.

Additional Information:

The Mobile Revolving Fund acquired these two abandoned and derelict historic properties for the purpose of rehabilitating the structures and selling them to preserve the streetscape along Old Shell Road. Currently 1108 OSR is situated at the rear of the lot. Plans call for the structure to be moved forward 30' and for the two structures to be connected and restored as one single family residence.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	General	Rehabilitate two historic structures

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment, the proposed restoration will not impair the historic integrity of the structures or the district.

- A. The following is a list of proposed changes to the structures:
 - 1. move 1108 OSR forward 30'
 - 2. construct a connector between 1108 and 1110 OSR
 - a. connector to resemble glassed-in porch

3. rehabilitate the structures as follows:
 - a. stabilize foundations and repair any structural damage
 - b. repair/replace rotten siding as necessary
 - c. repair/replace deteriorated windows
 - d. repair/replace deteriorated exterior doors
 - e. repair/replace deteriorated soffit, cornice and fascia
 - f. repair/replace deteriorated or missing porch details
 - g. re-roof entire structure
 - h. install new concrete ribbon drive and gravel parking as per site plan
 - i. landscape property to meet City of Mobile's Landscape Ordinance

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

John Dendy and Felix Vereen appeared on behalf of the Mobile Revolving Fund. John Dendy explained that the goal of this project is not to restore outstanding examples of architecture but to impact the neighborhood in a positive way. He summarized the thinking of the Board that thought it best to combine the houses into one living unit due to their small size. However, several things have contributed to making the project difficult: 1) 1108 Old Shell is in very deteriorated condition with numerous alterations made to the original structure; 2) There are no movers available as a result of Hurricane Ivan; 3) The structure is in such deteriorated condition it would be difficult or impossible to move. These factors make the project economically unfeasible. The MRF would like instead to dismantle the building saving any significant materials and rebuilding it further forward on the lot. Tilmon Brown asked how it had been determined that the house could not be rehabilitated. Felix Vereen responded that he, David Tharp and someone in the construction business had looked at it.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Tilmon Brown discussed that 1013 Selma Street had been in a similar state of deterioration but was rehabilitated.

Douglas Kearley commented that the dismantling of 1108 Old Shell would be against the guidelines.

Chair Cindy Klotz requested a motion to table the application until the next meeting on December 27, 2004 in order for Board members to visit the site and determine the condition of the structure for themselves.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Douglas Kearley moved that the application be tabled. The motion was seconded by Lynda Burkett and approved on a 5-1 vote with Joe Sackett abstaining. A time to meet on site will be set at a later date.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

012-04/05-CA 62 North Monterey Street
Applicant: Stan and Marsha Lewis
Received: 11/18/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/22/05 1) 12/27/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Alter existing rear addition. Add additional 8’ in depth to existing addition and construct 7.5’ deep back porch. Construct hipped roof over entire rear addition, all as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Additions	Construct rear addition

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment:

- A. The proposed construction is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a two story American Foursquare with a two story front porch and a monolithic hipped roof.
 - 2. The existing rear addition measures 10’ by the width of the rear of the residence.
 - 3. The proposed addition is the continuation of the existing one story rear addition.
 - 4. The proposed addition measures 8’, with a 7.5’ porch, for a total increase in depth of 15.5’.
 - 5. A hipped roof will be constructed over the whole rear addition.
 - 6. The Materials List and Design Details are appropriate for this structure.
 - a. siding to match existing;
 - b. salvaged windows to match existing;
 - c. brick piers with framed lattice infill to match existing;
 - d. cornice, soffit, fascia, corner boards to match those of the main house;
 - e. new wood door with transom;
 - f. new 6” wood columns with chamfered corners;
 - g. new porch rail.
 - 7. The proposed addition will not be visible from public view.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

014-04/05-CA 18 South Reed Avenue
Applicant: Cheryl and Ioannis Zafaris
Received: 12/13/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/27/05 1) 12/27/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Repair roof damage from fallen tree. Remove aluminum siding.
Construct addition, measuring 5’ deep by 14’-6”.
Construct new garage, measuring 20’ x 26’ to replace garage destroyed during Hurricane Ivan.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Additions	Construct rear addition
3	Accessory Structures	Construct 2 car garage

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment:

- A. The proposed addition is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The main structure is a one story bungalow with a monolithic hipped roof.
 - 2. The proposed addition measures 5’ deep by 14’-6” wide.
 - 3. The Materials List is appropriate for this structure.
 - 4. The proposed addition will not be visible from public view.

- B. The proposed two car garage is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The proposed garage measures 20’ x 26’.
 - 2. The proposed garage is constructed on a concrete slab.
 - 3. The proposed garage is wood frame with wood lap siding to match that on the main residence, painted to match.
 - 4. The proposed garage roof is hipped to match the main residence.
 - 5. The proposed garage is to replace a previous garage destroyed by a tree during Hurricane Ivan.

Staff recommends approval as submitted.

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS**

015-04/05-CA 2254 Ashland Place Avenue
Applicant: Bailey & Sam Slaton
Received: 12/13/04 Meeting Dates:
Submission Date + 45 Days: 1/27/05 1) 12/27/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Ashland Place Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Nature of Project: Close in open porch at rear of house. Relocate windows on back of house and install false shutters. Build new single car garage at back of property, all as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES AND DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Porches	Enclose existing rear porch
3	Accessory Structures	Construct 1 car garage

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change “...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district.”

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application, in Staff’s judgment:

- A. The proposed alterations are in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
 - 1. The Design Review Guidelines state that “where rear or side porches are to be enclosed, one recommended method is to preserve the original configuration of columns, handrails, and other important architectural features.
 - 2. In December 2003 the Review Board approved plans by the previous owner to enclose the upper portion of the rear porch and encapsulate the lower portion of the porch with a large rear addition.
 - 3. While the proposed plan does not retain original porch elements, it does not materially impair the historic integrity of the structure.
 - 4. The main structure is a two story residence constructed in 1909.
 - 5. The existing rear two story porch is inset under the main hipped roof.
 - 6. The existing rear porch is currently partially enclosed with lattice panels.
 - 7. Proposed alterations are to close the porch in for a laundry area on the first floor and master closet on the second floor.
 - 8. Proposed alterations include reuse of existing windows and installing fixed wood blinds to give the appearance of windows.

9. The Materials List is appropriate for this structure.
 - a. new wood siding feathered in to match existing
 - b. new wood half glass rear door
 - c. reused windows from interior wall
 - d. fixed wood louvered blinds
 10. The proposed porch in-fill will not be visible from public view.
- B. The proposed one car garage is in compliance with Section 3 of the Design Review Guidelines.
1. The proposed garage measures 17' x 25'.
 2. The proposed garage is constructed on a concrete slab.
 3. The proposed garage is wood frame with wood lap siding to match that on the main residence, painted to match.
 4. The proposed garage roof is hipped to match the main residence.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed rear porch enclosure with the following conditions:

1. Retain the existing corner board to distinguish between the original rear wall and the enclosed porch.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed garage as submitted.