

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
October 25, 2004– 3:00 P.M.
Mayor’s Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Barbara Jarvis
Property Address: 106 Garnett
Date of Approval: 9/29/04 jss
Work Approved: Make hurricane repairs to roof and porch. Re-roof to match existing shingles, repair damaged porch columns to match original condition in dimension and profile.
2. Applicant's Name: Margaret Pate
Property Address: 1717 Conti Street
Date of Approval: 9/30/04 asc
Work Approved: Roof repair to match existing in profile, material and dimension. Porch repairs to match existing in profile, material and dimension. Install polyurethane material under house attached to decking.
3. Applicant's Name: John Moore
Property Address: 310 Charles Street
Date of Approval: 10/1/04 jdb
Work Approved: Replace current non-original aluminum windows on front of house with 6 over 9 wood double hung windows painted white to match trim. Install four panel wood front door to replace existing modern door.
4. Applicant's Name: William Carroll
Property Address: 205 Everett Street
Date of Approval: 10/4/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair fire damage to include: roof, fascia and soffit, doors and windows (aluminum will be replaced with wood if possible). Repaint to match existing color scheme.

5. Applicant's Name: Robert A. Williams, Jr.
Property Address: 1760 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 10/4/2004 weh
Work Approved: Repaint house in existing color scheme:
Body – Old Dauphin Way Gold
Trim – Super White
Window Accent – Claiborne Street Red
Front Porch Deck and Ceiling – Perdido Blue

6. Applicant's Name: Mack Lewis Construction
Property Address: 158 South Jefferson Street
Date of Approval: 10/12/04 weh
Work Approved: Remove existing inappropriate aluminum window and replace with new wood window matching existing in profile and dimension. Re-size existing kitchen window to accommodate new cabinetry. Re-sized window to match existing in pane size and material.

7. Applicant's Name: Arby's Restaurant
Property Address: 659 Government Street
Date of Approval: 10/12/04 weh
Work Approved: Replace storm damaged fence to match existing in material, profile and dimension.

C. NEW BUSINESS:

1. **01-04/05-CA** John Moore
Property Address: 310 Charles Street
Work Requested: Reconfigure enclosed porch by adding framed lattice panels between pilasters as per submitted design.

2. **02-04/05-CA** William and Emily Hearin Carnival Museum
Property Address: 355 Government Street
Work Requested: Construct 1,475 sf addition to provide entry/gift shop. Remove existing condenser yard. Relocate existing equipment to parapet-screened roof. Install galvanized iron fence around existing parking lot, all as per submitted plans.

3. **03-04/05-CA** Rollin C. Broughton
Property Address: 1220 Selma Street
Work Requested: Replace existing chain link fence with new iron fence painted black as per submitted site plan and design.

D. OTHER BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS:

1. Discussion of Rules and Regulations

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - STAFF COMMENTS

001-04/05 – CA 310 Charles Street
Applicant: John and Anne Moore
Received: 10/8/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/23/04 1) 10/25/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Additional Permits Required: (1) Building
Nature of Project: Remove existing windows and reconstruct exterior walls to resemble enclosed porch with lattice panels between chamfered posts as per submitted plans.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Porches	reconfigure existing infilled porch

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:… Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district…”

STAFF REPORT

- A. The Guidelines state that “Historic porches should be maintained and repaired to reflect their period. Particular attention should be paid to handrails, lower rails, balusters, decking, posts/columns, proportions and decorative details… Where rear or side porches are to be enclosed, one recommended method is to preserve the original configuration of columns, handrails, and other important architectural features.”
1. The house is a one story frame Victorian cottage with a side ell.
 2. The area of proposed work is a later shed porch addition as evidenced by a filled-in window in the south wall of the main residence.
 3. At some point in the house’s evolution, the shed porch was enclosed to accommodate an additional bathroom.
 4. The proposed alteration calls for the removal of six windows and construction of a solid wall of framed lattice panels placed between chamfered posts.
 5. This treatment is typical for enclosed porches.
 6. Examples of this type of construction can be found at 1062 Church Street, the northeast corner of Church and George Streets, and at 351 Charles Street, the southeast corner of Charles and Savannah Streets (diagonally across the street from the subject property.)

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - STAFF COMMENTS

002-04/05 – CA 355 Government Street
Applicant: William and Emily Hearin Carnival Museum
Received: 10/12/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/27/04 1) 10/25/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Church Street East Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4, General Business
Additional Permits Required: (1) Building
Nature of Project: Construct 1,475 sf addition to provide entry/gift shop. Remove existing condenser yard. Relocate existing equipment to parapet-screened roof. Install galvanized iron fence around existing parking lot, all as per submitted plans.

Additional Information:

The 1872 Bernstien-Bush House, former Museum of the City of Mobile, is soon to be permanent headquarters of the Mobile Carnival Association.

The house served as a private residence until 1922, when Mayor John Bush’s widow Ruth sold the property to Frank L. Roche for use as a funeral home. 1925 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps show the garage addition with a concrete floor. The garage was constructed between existing historic outbuildings.

The proposed addition is to occur at the rear of the property, attached at the east side of the carriage house.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3		Construct addition
3	Fences, Walls and Gates	Install iron fence

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:… Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district…”

STAFF REPORT

- A. The Guidelines state that “The appropriateness of additions shall be measured by the guidelines applicable to new construction. The addition should compliment the design and scale of the main building.”
 - 1. The main structure is two story load bearing masonry with a hipped roof.
 - 2. The proposed addition is one story painted brick veneer to match existing,

3. The addition occurs at a point approximately 50' from the front of the residence.
 4. The proposed 1,475 sf addition measures approximately 32' – 8" x approximately 55'.
 5. The proposed addition repeats the design of the existing structure by utilizing the following elements:
 - a. Brick veneer painted to match the existing structure;
 - b. Black timberline roof to match that of the main structure, constructed behind main parapet facing Government Street, matching the slope of the existing parapet wall;
 - c. Wood six-over-six, true divided light, windows matching those in the main residence;
 - d. Painted wood French entry doors;
 - e. Lead coated copper concave half-hip awnings over window and entry facing Government Street;
 - f. Decorative ironwork columns and brackets to match that on main structure;
 - g. Relocation of existing carriage lanterns to new addition.
- B. The Guidelines state that Fences “should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement, and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.”
1. The main structure is one a two story load bearing masonry structure.
 2. The proposed fencing is approximately 7' – 6" high, installed in 10' sections.
 3. The 10' sections have crown inserts occurring at the top rail on 5' centers.
 4. The proposed fence is iron painted black.
 5. The Guidelines state that fences may not exceed 6' in height, however, given the scale of the property associated with the proposed fence, 7'-6" is proportionate.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - STAFF COMMENTS

003-04/05 – CA 1220 Selma Street
Applicant: Rollin C. Broughton
Received: 10/14/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/29/04 1) 10/25/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Additional Permits Required: (1) Fence
Nature of Project: Replace existing chain link fence with new iron fence painted black as per submitted site plan and design.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Fences, Walls & Gates	Install iron fence

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:… Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district…”

STAFF REPORT

- A. The Guidelines state that Fences “should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement, and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.”
1. The main structure is one story frame vernacular residence.
 2. The existing fencing is chain link.
 3. The proposed fencing is 5’ high iron painted black.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted.