

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

October 12, 2004– 3:00 P.M.

Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID MONTH APPROVALS

1. Applicant's Name: Joanne Maceluch
Property Address: 1405-1409 Eslava Street
Date of Approval: 8/26/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair or replace existing deteriorated siding. Paint taupe with white trim.
2. Applicant's Name: Thomas Roofing Company
Property Address: 1609 Government Street
Date of Approval: 8/30/04 asc
Work Approved: Remove tile roof, replace underlayment, and reinstall tile.
3. Applicant's Name: Danny Woods
Property Address: 212 South Dearborn Street
Date of Approval: 8/30/04 jdb
Work Approved: Replace rotten wood as necessary with new materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Level front piers – appearance of brick to remain. Repaint house in the following Valspar or equivalent color scheme:
Body – Redstone Dakota Sandstone
Shutters – Lincoln Cottage Black
Trim – Gilded Linen
Accent – Fandango Red
4. Applicant's Name: Samuel Parker
Property Address: 1121 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 8/31/04 asc
Work Approved: Re-roof with dimensional shingles, black in color.

5. Applicant's Name: Qwuanyel Rodgers
 Property Address: 566-568 Dauphin Street
 Date of Approval: 8/31/04
 Work Approved: Install signage on building.
 556 Dauphin Street - Install 1 projecting sign, double-sided measuring 20 sf. Install transers on glass in door, one measuring 2' x 2' or 4 sf, and one measuring 2' x 1 1/2', or 3 sf.
 558 Dauphin Street - Install 1 projecting sign, double-sided measuring 20 sf. Install transers on glass in door, one measuring 2' x 2' or 4 sf, and one measuring 2' x 1 1/2', or 3 sf.
- Total signage for both buildings measures 57 sf.
- Wall signs to be painted wood, green border, blue text on white background. Transfer text to be green
- Signs to be mounted from existing projecting poles with chain supports, and lit by existing floodlights at bottom of pole.
6. Applicant's Name: Carl Jordan/Zafir Construction
 Property Address: 15 S. Reed Ave.
 Date of Approval: 9/1/04 asc
 Work Approved: Install new shingle roof, charcoal in color.
7. Applicant's Name: Malcolm Howell
 Property Address: 204 Roper Street
 Date of Approval: 9/8/04 weh
 Work Approved: Repaint house in existing Sherwin Williams color scheme:
 Body: Niagra Mist SW2094
 Shutters and porch: Black Forest SW 2238
 Trim: White
8. Applicant's Name: Jason Lowe/J.Lowe Roofing & Construction
 Property Address: 1010 Dauphin Street
 Date of Approval: 9/8/04 weh
 Work Approved: Re-roof with GAF 3 tab shingles, slate in color.
9. Applicant's Name: Allan & Christy Gustin
 Property Address: 251 South Georgia Avenue
 Date of Approval: 9/13/04 weh
 Work Approved: Remove deteriorated roof balustrade & replace with balustrade matching that on first floor porch. Install plinths over first floor columns recreating original second floor balustrade. Re-roof

with dimensional shingles. Replace existing aluminum windows with new wood one-over-one windows matching the original in profile and dimension. Remove existing vinyl shutters and install new operable wood shutters matching original in profile and dimension.

10. Applicant's Name: John Green/Terminix
Property Address: 160 Roberts Street
Date of Approval: 9/9/04 asc
Work Approved: Repair termite damage. Replace wood siding as necessary with new wood siding to match in dimension and profile. Paint new materials to match existing.
11. Applicant's Name: V&K Investments
Property Address: 207 S. Cedar Street
Date of Approval: October 4, 2004
Work Approved: Repair to rotten wood with new wood to match existing in dimension and profile; Paint in the existing color scheme.
12. Applicant's Name: Jeb Schrenk
Property Address: 157 Houston Street
Date of Approval: 9/10/04 weh
Work Approved: Repair roof leak
13. Applicant's Name: Martha Searcy
Property Address: 1059 Augusta Street
Date of Approval: 9/13/04 weh
Work Approved: Install wood louvered blinds matching existing on 3 exposed windows.
14. Applicant's Name: Debbie DeGuire
Property Address: 209 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: 9/20/04 weh
Work Approved: Replace existing awning with Sunbrella Sapphire/white, #4803, with "A&M Peanut" on valance. Repaint building as follows:
Body – Devoe Moth Gray 2H38F
Trim – Creamy Cream 1H28P
Accent – Bison 2038P
15. Applicant's Name: Larry John Construction
Property Address: 1213 New St. Francis
Date of Approval: 9/21/04 weh
Work Approved: Re-roof flat section of apartment buildings with torch-down roof.

16. Applicant's Name: Drake and Laura Williams
 Property Address: 1203 Government Street
 Date of Approval: 9/21/04 weh
 Work Approved: Replace destroyed porch balustrade on second floor roof deck with materials matching existing in profile and dimension. Repaint to match existing.
17. Applicant's Name: J. O'Brian Construction
 Property Address: 964 Palmetto Street
 Date of Approval: 9/23/04 asc
 Work Approved: Repair roof with new materials to match existing in material, profile, dimension and color. Replace rotten wood as necessary with new to match existing in material, profile and dimension.
18. Applicant's Name: Jason Estes
 Property Address: 110 Houston Street
 Date of Approval: 9/23/04 weh
 Work Approved: Repair storm damage to detached garage, including roof, soffit & fascia, siding, etc. New materials to match existing in profile and dimension. Paint to match existing.
19. Applicant's Name: Ace Roofing LLC
 Property Address: 456 Civic Center Drive
 Date of Approval: 9/23/04 weh
 Work Approved: Re-roof building with materials matching existing in profile, color and dimension.

C. NEW BUSINESS

1. **094-03/04-CA:** 208 Dauphin Street
 Applicant: Don Williams, Engineer
 Nature of Request: Remove existing Dauphin Street exterior elevation. Recreate 1930s storefront exterior from historic photographs as per submitted plans.
2. **095- 03/04-CA:** 210 Rapier Avenue
 Applicant: Steve Guerin, Owner/ Don Williams, Engineer
 Nature of Request: Remove existing 3' high wood fence and Replace with a 6'-6" stucco-covered masonry wall as per submitted design. Construct 20' x 27' carport with rear storage room, with materials matching main house in profile and dimension.
 NOTE: A Variance is required from the Board of Zoning Adjustment to allow this wall to be constructed on the property line at the sidewalk.

3. **096-03/04-CA:** 1160 Church Street
Applicant: Roy and Rebecca Burns
Nature of Request: Construct fence on property line as per submitted design. Wood fence to be 6’high, with cap. Two sets of driveway gates as shown on site plan. Fence either left to weather or be stained with an opaque stain.
NOTE: A variance is required from the Board of Zoning Adjustment to place this fence along the sidewalk.

4. **097-03/04-CA:** 1111 Government Street
Applicant: Saucy Q Bar-B-Q, Elbert Wingfield, Owner
Nature of Request: Install 2 rotisserie smokers into existing west wall of building behind an existing 8’wood privacy fence, as per submitted plans. Relocate existing signage from current location to new location.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REVIEW

094-03/04 – CA 208 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Don Williams, Engineer
Received: 9/27/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/07/04 1) 10/12/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4, General Business
Additional Permits Required: (1) Building
Nature of Project:
Remove existing Dauphin Street exterior elevation. Recreate 1930s storefront exterior from historic photographs as per submitted plans.

History of the Project and Current Condition:

208 Dauphin Street was constructed on the site of a former downtown building in 1885 as the Crescent Theater. Owner A. Pincus hired architect C. L. Hutchisson to design the new theater building. In 1936, Van Antwerp Realty hired J.F. Pate Construction to remodel the structure. Presumably at this time the façade of the building was altered to reflect a monolithic somewhat “Moderne” appearance.

The most recent occupant, Derry’s Olde Tyme Café, was destroyed by fire in May. All that remains of the structure are the exterior walls.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Lower Dauphin Street Commercial District Design Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
4	Rehabilitation/Restoration Guidelines for Existing Buildings	Reconstruct storefront

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

General

Building Condition Example 3: Original Design Significantly Altered

“These buildings generally have a plain front with no ornamentation or detail, and fail to relate well to adjacent historic buildings. For a situation in which the original detail has merely been hidden by a covering, the guidelines encourage removal of the covering and restoration of the original design. Where detailing has been removed, an entirely new design compatible with older adjacent buildings or a façade reconstruction based on photo-documentary evidence is encouraged. If removal of an applied modern

storefront will damage the underlying historic fabric of the facade, or the newer facade has achieved historic status (50 years or older), then removal is discouraged.”

1. The existing storefront is no longer extant.
2. The existing second floor above the storefront was severely damaged during the fire.
3. The proposed storefront is based on historic photographs.
4. The proposed storefront consists of an arch over a recessed vestibule, with single glazed entry doors on the extreme left and right sides of the storefront. A glass bay with marble bulkhead projects towards the sidewalk, making architectural reference to the original theater ticket booth.
5. The proposed storefront glazing system is anodized aluminum, bronze in color.
6. Detailing for the proposed second floor windows includes fluted arched atchitraves framing double hung wood windows. A painted fypon cornice in the Eastlake style completes the building cornice.
7. Fypon has been approved for use as decorative elements on a number of buildings on Dauphin Street, most notably the

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

The applicant provide a sample of the marble for the bulkhead.

Paint/color samples be submitted for approval.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REVIEW

095-03/04 – CA 210 Rapier Avenue
Applicant: Steve Guerin, Owner/ Don Williams, Engineer
Received: 9/27/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/07/04 1) 10/12/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Additional Permits Required: (1) Building
Nature of Project:

- Request 1: Remove existing 3’ high wood fence and replace with a 6’-6” stucco-covered masonry wall as per submitted design.
- Request 2: Construct 20’ x 27’ carport with rear storage room, with materials matching main house in profile and dimension.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT *Design Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Fences, Walls & Gates	Construct masonry wall
3	Accessory Structures & Site Considerations	Construct double carport

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change: . . . will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district. . . .”

STAFF REPORT

General

The Guidelines state that “The standards listed and shown . . . illustrate elements that contribute to the architectural character of the buildings in Mobile’s historic districts. These define the architectural style of the buildings and establish a repetition of forms and details, which create harmony and character of the historic districts.

- Request 1:** Construct 6’-6” high stucco-covered masonry wall with 8’ piers spaced equidistantly along the property line.
- A. The Guidelines state that Fences “should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement, and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.”

1. The main residence is a ca. 1908 two story wood frame Foursquare on the southwest corner of Rapier and Elmira Streets.
2. Currently there is a 3' high painted wood picket fence along the property
3. The previous owners removed the city sidewalk along the east elevation during the remodeling of the residence in the mid 1980s.
4. The proposed stucco-covered masonry fence is 6'-6" high, with 8' high piers, starting at a point 7' forward of the southeast corner of the house, and extending from the house approximately 8'-4" east to the sidewalk, then turning and running down the sidewalk a distance of approximately 55', and stopping 4' short of the double car driveway, turning west and running approximately 30' to the end of the proposed garage.
5. There is an existing 7' high masonry fence on the west property line.
6. Typically privacy fences are limited to 6' in height unless the property adjoins a commercially-zoned property.
7. The subject property and adjacent properties are zoned R-1, Single Family Residential.

Staff recommends approval of Request 1 with the following conditions:

1. The fence height be lowered to 6' and piers lowered to 7'.
2. The applicants receive a variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustment.

Request 2: Construct 20' x 27' carport with rear storage room, with materials matching main house in profile and dimension.

- A. The Guidelines state that "The appropriateness of accessory structures shall be measured by the Guidelines applicable to new construction. The structure should compliment the design and scale of the main building."
 1. The main residence is a ca. 1908 two story wood frame Foursquare.
 2. The proposed two car carport with attached storage room measures 20' x 27'.
 3. The setback of the proposed garage is approximately 9' from the property line.
 4. The hipped roof matches that of the main house.
 5. Six-over-one wood windows to match those on the main house.
 6. Square fiberglass columns match the wood columns on the front of the structure.
 7. Wood siding, corner boards, soffit, eave and fascia all to match that on the main house.

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

That a survey be done to determine the exact location of the City Right-of-Way and the subject property line, as there is no longer a city sidewalk.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REVIEW

096-03/04-CA: 1160 Church Street
Applicant: Roy and Rebecca Burns
Received: 9/27/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/07/04 1) 10/12/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1, Single Family Residential
Additional Permits Required: (1) Fence
Nature of Project: Construct fence on property line as per submitted design. Wood fence to be 6’ high, with cap. Two sets of driveway gates as shown on site plan. Fence either left to weather or be stained with an opaque stain.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Lower Dauphin Street Commercial District Design Guidelines

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Fences, Walls & Gates	Construct wood privacy fence

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:… Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district…”

STAFF REPORT

General

The Guidelines state that “The standards listed and shown…illustrate elements that contribute to the architectural character of the buildings in Mobile’s historic districts. These define the architectural style of the buildings and establish a repetition of forms and details, which create harmony and character of the historic districts.

- A. The Guidelines state that Fences “should compliment the building and not detract from it. Design, scale, placement, and materials should be considered along with their relationship to the Historic District.”
 - 1. The main residence is a ca. 1898 one and one-half story wood frame Victorian structure.
 - 2. The proposed capped wood privacy fence is 6’ high, with 8’ high piers, starting at a point 7’ forward of the southeast corner of the house, and extending from the house approximately 8’-4”

east to the sidewalk, then turning and running down the sidewalk a distance of 6', and stopping 4' short of the double car driveway, turning west and running to the end of the proposed garage.

3. Typically privacy fences are limited to 6' in height unless the property adjoins a commercially-zoned property.
4. The subject property and adjacent properties are zoned R-1, Single Family Residential.

Staff recommends approval of Request 1 with the following conditions:

1. The applicants receive a variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustment.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REVIEW

097-03/04-CA: 1111 Government Street
Applicant: Saucy Q Bar-B-Q/ Elbert Wingfield, Owner
Received: 9/23/04 **Meeting Date (s):**
Submission Date + 45 Days: 11/07/04 1) 10/12/04 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Oakleigh Garden Historic District
Classification: Non-Contributing
Zoning: B-2,
Additional Permits Required: (1) Building
Nature of Project: Install 2 rotisserie smokers into existing west wall of building behind an existing 8’ wood privacy fence, as per submitted plans.
Relocate existing neon sign from current location to new location.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
Lower Dauphin Street Commercial District Design Guidelines
Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts

<u>Sections</u>	<u>Topic</u>	<u>Description of Work</u>
3	Accessory Structures	Install 2 rotisserie ovens
	Signage	Relocate existing sign

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9, STANDARD OF REVIEW, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “ The Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change:... Will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

General

The Guidelines state that “The standards listed and shown... illustrate elements that contribute to the architectural character of the buildings in Mobile’s historic districts. These define the architectural style of the buildings and establish a repetition of forms and details, which create harmony and character of the historic districts.

Work Request 1 – Install Two Smokers

1. The subject structure is a one story brick veneer ranch-style restaurant, originally built for the Western Sizzlin Steak House chain.
2. The proposed construction is to occur at a point 60’ back from the sidewalk.
3. The proposed side setback from the west property line is 5’.
4. The proposed construction consists of a concrete slab, measuring 6’-6” wide by 14’ long. Two steel pipe columns support a shed roof which is 8’-5” high at the eave and 10’-3” high at the building.

5. Under this shed addition will be placed two smokers, whose faces pierce the west wall through a hole measuring almost 6' by 57", spaced 30" apart. Smoke stacks will extend up through the roof of the shed addition approximately 3'.
6. Currently there is a 6' high wood privacy fence along the property line between the subject property and the Taco Bell property to the west.
7. Currently there is a brick extension from the main west brick wall, which measures approximately 5' square, and houses a gas water heater.
8. At a point approximately two-thirds down the length of the west façade, a section of wood privacy fencing runs from the west wall to the wood privacy fence on the property line. Also at this point, the grade between the subject property and the Taco Bell Property to the west drops approximately 30".
9. This existing fence will screen the view of the smokers from the residences along Church Street.
10. The applicant is proposing to add a section of wood privacy fence between the west wall and the existing wood privacy fence at the property line to shield the shed addition the Government Street viewshed.

Staff recommends approval of Request 1 with the following conditions:

1. The shed addition be sheathed with framed lattice panels to conceal the ovens from Government Street view. However, Staff also suggests that the Board consider other screening alternatives.

Work Request 2 – Relocate Existing Saucy Q Bar-B-Q sign to New Location

A. Mounting and Placement:

1. The proposed building signage is to be mounted in the main gable facing Government Street.

B. Design:

1. The proposed design for the building signage is open face neon.

C. Size:

1. The Zoning Ordinance of the City of Mobile, Section 64-008, as amended, states the following:

4.3 Authority. The Review Board shall have the authority to adopt such rules and regulations consistent with law to carry out the duties under this Chapter. In exercising this authority, the Review Board shall consider:

- (a) The location of the signs (site plan), including size, mounting, placement, height, materials and illumination;
- (b) The impact of the sign in relation to the building;
- (c) The overall relationship of the sign to the district in which it is located or to be located.

D. Materials:

1. The Guidelines state that "Wood, metal, stucco, stone or brick is allowed. Plastic, vinyl or similar materials are prohibited. Neon, resin to give the appearance of wood, and fabric may be used as appropriate."
2. The signage material proposed for building signage is open channel aluminum.

E. Lighting:

1. Lighting for the building signage is red neon.

Staff recommends that the Board consider whether the existing open-channel neon Saucy Q Bar-B-Q sign is appropriate signage for the new restaurant location along Government Street.