

AGENDA
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

May 07, 2007 – 3:00 P.M.
Mayor's Pre-Council Chamber – Mobile Government Plaza
205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER – Chair

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Approval of Mid-Month Requests Approved by Staff

B. MID-MONTH APPROVALS

1. **Applicant's Name:** Patrick Thistlewaite
Property Address: 1654 Hunter Avenue
Date of Approval: April 9, 2007
Reroof porte-cochere to match existing in material, color and profile. Repaint in the following colors:
 - Body – Paper Brown
 - Trim – White
 - Porch Deck – Black Green
2. **Applicant's Name:** John Klotz
Property Address: 354 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: April 10, 2007
Prep and paint building in the existing colors.
3. **Applicant's Name:** Travis Foote
Property Address: 153 Houston Street
Date of Approval: April 11, 2007
Remove the non-historic vinyl siding to re-expose the original wood siding underneath. Repair/replace rotted/damaged wood siding as necessary with new wood that matches the existing in profile and dimension. Replace the rotted wood front door with a new Craftsman-style wood door that is similar in design to the existing door. Replace two of the three existing non-matching windows on the non-historic bathroom addition at the southeast corner of the residence with wood sashes that match the windows throughout the rest of the exterior. Remove the non-historic rear awning and trellis. Prep and paint the exterior in Sherwin-Williams historic palette (colors to be determined later).
4. **Applicant's Name:** Alex and Bethany Kraft
Property Address: 1219 Texas Street
Date of Approval: April 11, 2007
Repaint in the following Sherwin Williams colors:
 - Body – Meditative, 6227
 - Trim – White
 - Shutters – Rainstorm, 6230
 - Porch Ceiling – Light Blue
 - Porch Deck, Steps and Brick Caps – Refuge, 6208
5. **Applicant's Name:** Christian Hendricks
Property Address: 961 Savannah Street
Date of Approval: April 12, 2007
Install a new wood rail per MHDC stock plans. Install a new door sympathetic to the residence.
6. **Applicant's Name:** Heavenly Body
Property Address: 10-12 St. Emanuel Street
Date of Approval: April 12, 2007
Replace the existing rotted 2/2 wood sash windows with new 2/2 wood-clad sash windows with true divided lights that will fit within the existing window openings. Repair and repaint the exterior in neutral tan or beige with white trim. Replace the rusted gutters with new similar gutters. Repair the first floor storefront with materials that match existing. Replace the single storefront door with a double door.

7. **Applicant's Name:** M and A Publishing
Property Address: 467 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: April 13, 2007
Reboard second-story north windows on the exterior and paint to match building.
8. **Applicant's Name:** Your Handyman
Property Address: 1413 Brown Street
Date of Approval: April 13, 2007
Repair/replace rotted wood as necessary throughout the exterior with materials to match existing. Repaint the residence in the following Sherwin-Williams colors:
 - Body – Inspired Lilac, SW6820
 - Trim – White
 - Accents – Potentially Purple, SW6821
9. **Applicant's Name:** Mack Lewis
Property Address: 11 Common Street
Date of Approval: April 16, 2007
Replace rotted wood on the exterior with materials to match existing. Repaint in the existing colors.
10. **Applicant's Name:** Carol Barrios
Property Address: 312 Chatham Street
Date of Approval: April 17, 2007
Replace rotted wood on the exterior with materials to match existing. Repaint in the existing colors.
11. **Applicant's Name:** Norman Figures/Global Roofing
Property Address: 850 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: April 17, 2007
Install new 3-tab Weathered Wood color shingles.
12. **Applicant's Name:** William Gadd
Property Address: 206 Marine Street
Date of Approval: April 18, 2007
Prep and repaint the residence white with green trim.
13. **Applicant's Name:** Sue Woener
Property Address: 15 McPhillips Avenue
Date of Approval: April 18, 2007
Repaint house in the existing Sherwin Williams colors:
 - Body – Renwick Heather
 - Trim – Dark Brown
 - Awnings – White
14. **Applicant's Name:** Mary Bryant
Property Address: 1006 Caroline Avenue
Date of Approval: April 18, 2007
Paint body in custom yellow per the sample on file. Trim will be Bellingrath Green to match existing.
15. **Applicant's Name:** Darrell Anthony
Property Address: 1212 Government Street
Date of Approval: April 18, 2007
Install new 3-tab Charcoal color shingles.
16. **Applicant's Name:** Neese Properties LLC
Property Address: 21 North Julia Street
Date of Approval: April 19, 2007
Replace rotted wood on the exterior with materials to match existing. Repaint in the existing colors.
17. **Applicant's Name:** Pete's Foundation
Property Address: 1120 Dauphin Street
Date of Approval: April 19, 2007
Repair foundation to level two brick columns.

18. **Applicant's Name:** Paul McCaffrey
Property Address: 205 Dexter Avenue
Date of Approval: April 20, 2007
Replace missing wood railing/spindles on the front porch with railing/spindles that match existing in material, profile and dimension. Repair/replace as necessary rotted wood throughout the exterior with materials that match existing in material, profile and dimension. Repaint in the existing color scheme. Construct a small storage shed in the rear of the property per stock plans that match the style of the residence. Pave the drive with light-colored cement.
19. **Applicant's Name:** Bayside Remodelers LLC
Property Address: 1257 Government Street
Date of Approval: April 23, 2007
Repair/replace rotted wood as necessary throughout the exterior with materials to match existing in material, profile and dimension. Repaint in the existing colors.

C. NOTICES OF VIOLATION and MUNICIPAL OFFENSE TICKETS

1. No NOVs or MOTs were issued.

D. OLD BUSINESS

1. **012-02/03-CA:** 310 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Tony Moore
Request: Renew the Certificate of Appropriateness. Change the nameplate on the building.
2. **054-07-CA:** 13 Semmes Avenue
Applicant: Caroline Coker
Request: Multiple renovations.
3. **058-07-CA:** 709 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Holmes and Holmes, Architects
Request: Multiple renovations.

E. NEW BUSINESS

1. **063-07-CA:** 250 St. Anthony Street
Applicant: Johnna and Richard Rogers
Request: Install a balcony on the outbuilding.
2. **064-07-CA:** 106 St. Francis Street
Applicant: Knight Sign Industries
Request: Replace old Regions Bank signs/logos with new Regions Bank signs/logos.
3. **065-07-CA:** 1108 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Revolving Fund
Request: Install a privacy fence.

F. OTHER BUSINESS and ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. No other business.

G. ADJOURNMENT

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

012-02/03-CA: 310 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Tony Moore
Received: 11/05/02 (+45 Days: 12/20/02)
Meeting: 11/18/02
Resubmitted: **04/19/07 (+45 Days: 06/03/07)**
Meeting: **05/07/07**

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4
Project: Renew the Certificate of Appropriateness. Change the nameplate.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to previous records, this commercial building with a mansard roof was built in the late 19th century. In 1903, the Zoghby's opened a department store in it, which closed in 1985. It has been the Spot of Tea since the early 90s.

This building has undergone numerous changes throughout the years, some drastic. From the 1950s to 1997, the front façade had been covered with aluminum. The original brick was exposed after the aluminum was removed, but as the brick was badly damaged, the façade was stuccoed. The second-story gallery has been removed and replaced at least once before. The first floor storefronts have been significantly altered. A Zoghby nameplate was added to the building in the 90s.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF REPORT

- A. This building is currently the Spot of Tea. The proposed work is part of Mr. Moore's plan to keep the restaurant open in the evenings.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines call for renovations to be sympathetic to the age and style of the building.
- C. The proposed plan is to proceed with the work approved by the Architectural Review Board on November 19, 2002. The architectural blue prints and all permits are the same as when they were originally approved. Mr. Moore is also seeking to change the nameplate on the building from Zoghby to Moore.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information submitted in the proposal, staff feels that the renewal will not impair the historic integrity of the building or the district.

The proposed balcony will upgrade the existing reconstructed balcony, which is currently not strong enough to hold many people. The outdoor café will reopen the carriageway, which had been enclosed. And the sidewalk gallery will be only minimally attached to the building. In addition, the building has been significantly altered a number of times.

Staff recommends renewing the Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff also recommends approving the new nameplate. The current nameplate, which has already been partially removed, is a non-historic element. In addition, although the Zoghbys had a very long history in the building, they were not the original owners.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

054-07-CA: 13 Semmes Avenue
Applicant: Caroline Coker
Received: 03/30/07 (+45 Days: 05/14/07)
Meeting: 04/23/07
Resubmitted: **04/23/07 (+45 Days: 06/07/07)**
Meeting: **05/07/07**

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Reopen previous enclosures. Add a wheelchair ramp at the rear.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to previous records, this one-story frame Victorian cottage was built circa 1900.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This building is currently vacant. It has undergone a number of renovations and alterations throughout the years, including having the front porch partially enclosed and an addition put on the back. Ms. Coker received mid-month approval for some of the proposed restoration work on March 30, 2007.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines call for renovations to be sympathetic to the age and style of the building.
- C. The proposed work includes the following:
 - 1. Partially reopen the enclosed side porch approximately 10'-0" back.
 - 2. Add an appropriate wood door that will lead out to the front porch.
 - 3. Replace the wall added to the rear porch with a screen.
 - 4. Reopen the enclosed area at the southwest corner and add a small wheelchair ramp.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information submitted in the proposal, staff feels that the changes will not impair the historic integrity of the building or the district. The proposed work, which seeks to reconfigure later, unsympathetic alterations into something more appropriate and historically accurate, is mostly minor restoration.

Staff recommends approving the application.

In the previous meeting, the Board felt it did not have enough information to make an informed decision. They asked Ms. Coker to provide drawings of what the residence will look like with the proposed changes as well as the specifications of the door before installation.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

058-07-CA: 709 Dauphin Street
Applicant: Holmes and Holmes Architects
Received: 04/05/07 (+45 Days: 05/20/07)
Meeting: 04/23/07
Resubmitted: **04/23/07**
Meeting: **05/07/07**

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4
Project: Convert building into condominiums.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to previous records, this two-story masonry building, which is actually two buildings, was built in the late 1800s. It has housed a number of commercial ventures, most recently the Decorator's Market.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF REPORT

- A. This building is currently vacant and in fair to good condition. It has undergone a number of renovations and alterations throughout the years. Many of the existing windows have been boarded or enclosed.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines call for renovations to be sympathetic to the age and style of the building.
- C. In order to follow impact resistance guidelines, the applicants have proposed wood windows with mullions glued to the interior and exterior of the glass to simulate true divided lights. As this proposal does not conform to the Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts, the Board requires further investigation to find windows that will conform to both the building codes and historic guidelines (or a suitable compromise) before installation can occur. A Certificate of Appropriateness was issued for all other work on 23 April, 2007. The section of the application dealing with the proposed windows was tabled to give time for research.

RECOMMENDATION

Although they would prefer to have windows with multiple lights, the applicants have indicated that they would consider 1/1 sash windows. Staff recommends approving the application if a suitable compromise has been achieved.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

063-07-CA: 250 St. Anthony Street
Applicant: Johnna and Richard Rogers
Received: 04/16/07 (+45 Days: 06/01/07)
Meeting: 05/07/07

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: DeTonti Square
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-B
Project: Install a balcony on the outbuilding.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to previous records, this unusually large, three-story Italianate residence was built circa 1853 and incorporated part of a house that had been built circa 1833.

It was at one time the home of J.M. Withers, a mayor of Mobile and the person in charge of Mobile's defenses during the Civil War. It is said that Admiral Franklin Buchanan, commander of the *Merrimac* and the *Tennessee*, planned his strategy for Mobile Bay in this building. It also served as the headquarters for the Mobile County Chapter of the American Red Cross from 1947 to 1970.

The building remained in fair condition with only minor repair jobs until 2002, when Mr. and Mrs. Rogers purchased the property and began a complete sympathetic restoration.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district..."

STAFF REPORT

- A. Although there is currently a door on the second floor of the rear outbuilding, there is no balcony.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines call for new exterior materials, finishes and elements to reflect the age and style of the building.
- C. The proposed work will add a 0'-3" by 12'-0" cantilevered iron balcony with treated wood planks to the rear outbuilding. It will be held up by either four metal brackets or two 0'-3" diameter metal posts, depending on what the contractor feels is sufficient. The rail is a 5'-0" section of iron panel that matches the railing on the main building

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information submitted in the proposal, staff feels that the proposed work will not impair the historic integrity of the building or the district.

The materials and design of the balcony fall within the standards of the Design Review Guidelines. The work in question is also going to be done on a rear outbuilding.

Staff recommends approving the application.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

064-07-CA: 106 St. Francis Street
Applicant: Knight Sign Industries
Received: 04/19/07 (+45 Days: 06/03/07)
Meeting: 05/07/07

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Lower Dauphin Street Commercial
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: B-4
Project: Replace the old Regions Bank signs/logos with the new Regions Bank signs/logos.

BUILDING HISTORY

According to previous records, this building, originally the Merchants National Bank, was built in 1928. It is a 23-story skyscraper with Neo-Classical elements at the street, Corinthian columns, stepped upper stories, a pyramidal roof and dark brick accents to create Art Deco patterns at the upper levels.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This building is currently a Regions Bank, which has recently updated their logo. The signage has been altered a number of times throughout the years.
- B. The Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile state that signs shall “not obscure the architectural features or openings of a building...shall relate to the design of the principal building on the property...shall be in proportion to the building and the neighboring structures and signs...should match the historic materials of the building...[and] shall use focused, low intensity illumination.”
- C. The proposed sign package includes the following:
 - 1. Install two 56 SF aluminum wall signs with individually-mounted reverse channel backlit letters at location one, totaling 112 SF.
 - 2. Install one 92 SF non-illuminated aluminum wall sign with individually mounted letters at location two.
 - 3. Install seven 20 SF non-illuminated fiberglass wall signs at location three, totaling 140 SF.
 - 4. Install one 13 SF non-illuminated aluminum wall sign with individually mounted letters at location four.
 - 5. Install one 2 SF non-illuminated sticky vinyl door sign at location five.
 - 6. Place all of the new signs at the locations of the current signs per the submitted plans.
 - 7. The total sign package is approximately 359 SF; the Board cannot approve more than 64 SF.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information submitted in the proposal, staff feels that the proposed sign package will not impair the historic integrity of the building or the district.

The proposed signs are the new Regions logos that will be replacing the old ones at the same locations and with a similar square footage. The proposed materials and lighting fall within the standards of the Sign Design Guidelines for Mobile.

Staff recommends that the Board approve the sign materials and design, and support the total square footage. The applicant will need to receive a variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustment for the amount of signage.

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
STAFF COMMENTS

065-07-CA: 1108 Old Shell Road
Applicant: Mobile Revolving Fund
Received: 04/23/07 (+45 Days: 06/07/07)
Meeting: 05/07/07

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way
Classification: Contributing
Zoning: R-1
Project: Install a privacy fence.

BUILDING HISTORY

This residence is actually two different buildings – 1108 and 1110 Old Shell Road – that were recently combined into one. According to previous records, these residences were built circa 1900. However, during the renovation it was discovered that parts of both buildings are peg construction. This indicates a much earlier construction date for at least one of the buildings.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds that the proposed change...will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the historic district...”

STAFF REPORT

- A. This residence, which as mentioned above is two buildings that were combined into one, has been recently renovated. There is currently no fence around the property.
- B. The Design Review Guidelines say fences should "complement the building and not detract from it." Furthermore, the Guidelines state that a wood picket fence is an appropriate option.
- C. The proposed fence will be a 6'-0" tall wood privacy fence with dog-eared posts that will run along the rear property line from the northeast corner to the northwest corner of the lot.

RECOMMENDATION

This is a project of the Mobile Revolving Fund for Historic Properties, a committee of the Mobile Historic Development Commission. Two staff members of the ARB sit on this Board. Therefore in the interest of full disclosure and fairness, the staff will defer this opinion to the members of the ARB.